

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

STATED MEETING

----- X

TUESDAY, JANUARY 30, 2024

Start: 2:40 p.m.

Recess: 4:33 p.m.

HELD AT: COUNCIL CHAMBERS - CITY HALL

B E F O R E: Jumaane Williams, Public Advocate
Adrienne E. Adams, Speaker
Amanda Farías, Majority Leader

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Adrienne E. Adams
Joann Ariola
Alexa Avilés
Diana I. Ayala
Chris Banks
Joseph C. Borelli
Erik D. Bottcher
Justin L. Brannan
Gale A. Brewer
Selvena N. Brooks-Powers
Tiffany Cabán
David M. Carr
Carmen N. De La Rosa
Eric Dinowitz
Amanda Farías
Oswald Feliz
James F. Gennaro

NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING
Jennifer Gutiérrez

Council Members (CONTINUED)

Shahana K. Hanif
Kamillah Hanks
Robert F. Holden
Crystal Hudson
Rita C. Joseph
Shekar Krishnan
Linda Lee
Farah N. Louis
Kristy Marmorato
Christopher Marte
Darlene Mealy
Julie Menin
Francisco P. Moya
Mercedes Narcisse
Sandy Nurse
Chi A. Ossé
Vickie Paladino
Keith Powers
Lincoln Restler
Kevin C. Riley
Carlina Rivera
Yusef Salaam
Rafael Salamanca, Jr
Pierina Ana Sanchez
Lynn C. Schulman
Althea V. Stevens
Sandra Ung
Inna Vernikov
Nantasha M. Williams
Julie Won
Kalman Yeger
Susan Zhuang

NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

A P P E A R A N C E S

INVOCATION: None

2 SERGEANT PAYTUVI: This is a microphone check for
3 the Stated Meeting being held on January 30th, 2024;
4 recorded in Chambers by Nazly Paytuvi.

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Quiet on the floor please!
6 Quiet on the floor, please! Quiet on the floor,
7 please. Ladies and Gentleman, at this time, please
8 place all electronic devices, all electronic devices
9 to vibrate or silent mode.

10 Madam Majority Leader?

11 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS:

12 [NO GAVEL]

13 Good afternoon, and welcome to the 1:30 p.m.
14 Stated Meeting of January 30, 2024. I am Majority
15 Leader Amanda Fariás, and I would like to thank you
16 for joining us. If you would like to follow along,
17 the agenda for today's meeting is posted on our
18 website.

19 On behalf of the body, I welcome the members of
20 the public who have joined us here today. During
21 Stated Meetings, only members of the Council may
22 speak; members of the public shall remain silent. If
23 you wish to express your support for any remarks, you
24 may make the silent approval gesture.

2 Today we are continuing the consideration of
3 legislation that has been subject to controversy. I
4 want to remind my colleagues that decorum is to be
5 respected at all times; insulting each other is not
6 appropriate. All remarks are to be addressed to the
7 Chair and members shall not speak, unless recognized
8 by the Chair. It is essential that even if we
9 disagree, we treat each other with respect.

10 CITY CLERK: Please join us for the Pledge of
11 Allegiance.

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: All rise!

13 ALL: [PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE]

14 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Roll call?

15 CITY CLERK: Council Member Abreu?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ABREU: Present

17 CITY CLERK: Council Member Ariola?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Present

19 CITY CLERK: Council Member Avilés?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Presenté

21 CITY CLERK: Council Member Ayala?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Here

23 CITY CLERK: Council Member Banks?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BANKS: Present

25 CITY CLERK: Council Member Bottcher

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: Present

3 CITY CLERK: Council Member Brannan?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Here

5 CITY CLERK: Council Member Brewer?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Here

7 CITY CLERK: Council Member Brooks-Powers?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Present

9 CITY CLERK: Council Member Cabán?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Present

11 CITY CLERK: Council Member Carr?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Present

13 CITY CLERK: Council Member De La Rosa?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Present

15 CITY CLERK: Council Member Dinowitz?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Present

17 CITY CLERK: Council Member Feliz?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Presenté

19 CITY CLERK: Council Member Gennaro?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Here

21 CITY CLERK: Council Member Gutiérrez?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: Presenté

23 CITY CLERK: Council Member Hanif?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Here

25 CITY CLERK: Council Member Hanks?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER HANKS: Present

3 CITY CLERK: Council Member Holden?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Here

5 CITY CLERK: Council Member Hudson?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Present

7 CITY CLERK: Council Member Joseph?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Present

9 CITY CLERK: Council Member Krishnan?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KRISHNAN: Here

11 CITY CLERK: Council Member Lee?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LEE: Here

13 CITY CLERK: Council Member Louis?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Present

15 CITY CLERK: Council Member Marmorato?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: Present

17 CITY CLERK: Council Member Marte?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTE: Present

19 CITY CLERK: Council Member Mealy?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Present

21 CITY CLERK: Council Member Menin?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Here

23 CITY CLERK: Council Member Moya?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Here

25 CITY CLERK: Council Member Narcisse?

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

8

2 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Present

3 CITY CLERK: Council Member Nurse?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: [NO MIC] Present

5 CITY CLERK: Council Member Ossé?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Present

7 CITY CLERK: Council Member Paladino?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: Present

9 CITY CLERK: Council Member Powers?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Here

11 CITY CLERK: Council Member Restler?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Here

13 CITY CLERK: Council Member Riley?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: Present

15 CITY CLERK: Council Member Rivera?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Present

17 CITY CLERK: Council Member Salaam

18 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAAM: Present

19 CITY CLERK: Council Member Salamanca?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Present

21 CITY CLERK: Council Member Sanchez?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Presenté

23 CITY CLERK: Council Member Schulman?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER SCHULMAN: Here

25 CITY CLERK: Council Member Stevens?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Here

3 CITY CLERK: Council Member Ung?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER UNG: Present

5 CITY CLERK: Council Member Vernikov?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: Present

7 CITY CLERK: Council Member Williams?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I'm here.

9 CITY CLERK: Council Member Won?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER WON: Present

11 CITY CLERK: Council Member Yeger?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Here

13 CITY CLERK: Council Member Zhuang?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ZHUANG: Here

15 CITY CLERK: Council Member Borelli?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Present

17 CITY CLERK: Council Member Farías?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER FARÍAS: Present

19 CITY CLERK: Speaker Adams?

20 SPEAKER ADAMS: Present

21 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Invocation?

22 CLERK: None

23 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Adoption of Minutes?

24 CLERK: None

25

2 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Messages and Papers from
3 the Mayor?

4 CLERK: None

5 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Communications from City,
6 County and Borough Offices?

7 CLERK: None

8 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Petitions and
9 Communications?

10 CLERK: None

11 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Land Use Call-Ups?

12 CLERK: None

13 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Thank you. We will now
14 have Communication from Speaker Adrienne Adams.

15 SPEAKER ADAMS: Thank you, Madam Majority Leader,
16 and good afternoon everyone.

17 Before we begin, I want to acknowledge the
18 passing of my friend and former council member, Paul
19 Vallone. Paul served in this legislative body from
20 2014 to 2021, and he continued his public service as
21 Deputy Commissioner of the New York City Department
22 of Veteran Services over the past two years. Paul
23 stood here in these chambers with me as I was sworn
24 in just a few weeks ago to start this session. He was
25 a beloved colleague and well-respected in Queens and

1
2 New York City. His contributions have benefited
3 countless New Yorkers and will continue to have an
4 impact for generations. Most importantly, Paul was
5 kindhearted, compassionate and caring, and we will
6 never forget him. My thoughts and prayers are with
7 his wife, his beautiful children, and the entire
8 Vallone family during this difficult time.

9 I want to thank the democratic members of the New
10 York Congressional Delegation who sent the Council a
11 letter reaffirming their unanimous support to end
12 solitary confinement: House Democrat Leader, Hakeem
13 Jeffries, Congressman Adriano Espaillat, Congressman
14 Gregory Meeks, Congresswoman Alexandria Ocasio-
15 Cortez, Congresswoman Nydia Velázquez, Congresswoman
16 Grace Meng, Congresswoman Yvette Clarke, Congressman
17 Jamaal Bowman, Congressman Jerry Nadler, Congressman
18 Ritchie Torres, and Congressman Dan Goldman, thank
19 you very much for your unrelenting work to secure
20 justice for all New Yorkers.

21 Now, I would like to take a moment to acknowledge
22 the families of those who have been killed by the
23 NYPD, who recently sent the mayor and the Council a
24 letter in support of the How Many Stops Act: Gwen
25 Carr, mother of Eric Garner; Kadiatou Diallo, mother

1 of Amadou Diallo; Valerie Bell, mother of Sean Bell;
2 Iris Baez, mother of Anthony Baez; Mercy Baez, cousin
3 of Anthony Baez; Samy Feliz, brother of Allan Feliz;
4 Gladys Williams, stepmother of Antonio Williams,
5 Shawn Williams, father of Antonio Williams;
6 Constance Malcolm, mother of Ramarley Graham; Ellen
7 Trawick, mother of Kawaski Trawick; Rickie Trawick,
8 father of Kawaski Trawick; Angie Hicks, aunt of
9 Shantel Davis, Hertencia Petersen, aunt of Akai
10 Gurley, Hawa Bah, mother of Mohamed Bah, Natasha
11 Duncan sister of Shantel Davis; Victoria Davis sister
12 of Delrawn Small, Carol Gray, mother of Kimani Gray,
13 Margarita Rosario, mother of Anthony Rosario and aunt
14 of Hilton Vega.
15

16 Our communities are safer because of their work,
17 their courage and decades-long struggle for justice,
18 not despite their pain, but because of it, is what
19 brought us to this moment of progress. I thank you
20 all for your work to improve police transparency and
21 accountability for all New Yorkers.

22 For some of us in this room, and for New Yorkers
23 across the City, the killing of Black and Latino
24 people in our own communities at the hands of police
25 officers, who are supposed to protect us, have become

1 flashpoints in our lives. These are moments when we
2 remember exactly where we were, who we were with, and
3 how we felt when we heard about the death of one of
4 our own neighbors. For me and my community in South
5 East Queens, it was certainly the killing of Sean
6 Bell, not too far from where I live in the district I
7 now represent. It's been nearly two decades since
8 Sean's life was taken from his family, his friends,
9 his loved ones, but the impact of his killing still
10 reverberates throughout our community. He was killed
11 the night before his wedding in a hail of 50 shots by
12 officers. Sean's killing was a reminder to Black
13 fathers, brothers, mothers, and grandmothers about
14 the risks we still face even in moments of joy that
15 others may take for granted like the night before
16 wedding. That is the history we must always seek to
17 change. The How Many Stops Act is a part of these
18 efforts. Like communities throughout the City, in
19 Southeast Queens we respect our local precincts and
20 police officers. We've worked so hard to forge
21 stronger relationships because that is important for
22 public safety. But, we need greater transparency and
23 accountability, because that will only help us build
24 upon the community trust we've developed which is a
25

1 prerequisite to building safe communities. In honor
2 of Sean Bell, and the many other families who have
3 lost loved ones, we must advance this legislation
4 forward.

5
6 Today, the Council will be voting to override the
7 mayor's vetoes of Introduction 586-A of the How Many
8 Stops Act and Introduction 549-A to ban solitary
9 confinement in City jails. Public safety is a
10 collective effort, but it can only be achieved when
11 there is transparency and accountability in policing.
12 Transparency fosters the community trust that is
13 necessary to make our neighborhoods safer.

14 Introduction 586 of the How Many Stops Act came
15 out of the 2013 Floyd v City of New York federal
16 court decision that found the NYPD's use of stop-and-
17 frisk unconstitutional. Through the court's joint
18 remedial process, Black and Latino communities most
19 impacted by stop-and-frisk provided their input about
20 the transparency needed for level one and level two
21 stops. Simply put, the origin of this bill is
22 feedback from communities and families most affected
23 - mothers, fathers, daughters, and sons, teachers,
24 healthcare workers, and essential workers who were
25 stopped - and city council members. The court

1
2 appointed federal monitor in that decision recently
3 found one of every four stops made by the mayor's
4 reconstituted police unit was unconstitutional, and
5 that Black and Latino New Yorkers make up 97% of
6 those stopped despite being approximately half of the
7 City's population.

8 I want us to sit with those numbers, because they
9 tell us something very important. They tell us that
10 we have work to do when Black and Latino New Yorkers
11 are disproportionately targeted by police stops, and
12 many are unconstitutional and under reported. But,
13 because of the gaps in reporting by the NYPD, the
14 public is kept from seeing the full picture. It's the
15 same lack of data that allowed stop-and-frisk to
16 worsen years ago, which did not become clear until
17 the public had the data. That is why the Council
18 advanced the How Many Stops Act to address the lack
19 of transparency in these investigative stops.

20 The need for basic transparency is clear, Black
21 and Latino New Yorkers continue to be
22 disproportionately subjected to unconstitutional
23 stops that go under reported. Civilian complaints of
24 misconduct are at their highest levels in a decade.
25 These stops can no longer happen in the shadows,

1 because the pain and trauma they inflict on
2 communities have long lasting impacts.

3 Solitary confinement is globally recognized as
4 torture. The isolation of solitary confinement by any
5 name has been proven to cause physical,
6 psychological, and emotional harm, and its use has
7 contributed to continued violence and deaths on
8 Rikers Island.

9 Here in New York City, solitary confinement is
10 almost exclusively inflicted on Black and Latino
11 people who are awaiting their day in court and don't
12 have the money to avoid pre-trial detention.

13 Introduction 549-A will improve safety for staff
14 and those detained while allowing the Department of
15 Correction to separate people for safety purposes.
16 This bill has been crafted with the input of
17 stakeholders, including corrections experts, impacted
18 families, and the labor unions that represent many
19 workers in the City's jails.

20 The humanitarian crisis on Rikers Island cannot
21 continue, and we must no longer rely on failed
22 policies that maintain the status quo. It is
23 imperative that City jails are made safer for people
24 who are detained and for the staff who work there. We
25

2 must meet this moment with moral clarity and the
3 commitment to progress, because that is how we move
4 forward as a city.

5 Our focus on police transparency and the
6 rejection of inhumane practices that exacerbate
7 violence are important steps that advance safety.
8 Both bills were passed by this body with a veto-proof
9 majority, because we believe that all New Yorkers
10 deserve transparency and safety. For these reasons,
11 and many more, I look forward to our overriding the
12 mayor's vetoes and working together to successfully
13 implement these laws that will make our communities
14 and city safer for all.

15 I now recognize Public Advocate Jumaane Williams
16 for comments.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you, Madam
18 Speaker for your leadership on this and the entire
19 council. Thank you to Council Member Alexa Avilés,
20 Council Member Carlina Rivera, Council Member Crystal
21 Hudson, and all of the chairs. Thank you to the
22 families, in particular, who turned their pain to
23 purpose. I want to just also thank the advocates and
24 my staff including Jeffrey Severe, Solomon Acevedo,
25 Nick Smith, Elizabeth Guzmán, Gwen Safran, the entire

1 Policy Team, and a special shoutout to Veronica Aveis
2 and Rosaura Mendez who really carried this on their
3 backs for many years. I also want to just thank Dr.
4 Tracie Keese, former NYPD Deputy Commissioner;
5 Zachary Carter, former Corporation Counsel; and
6 Lieutenant Edwin Raymond who added their voice of
7 support to the How Many Stops Act recently.
8

9 This always weighs very, very heavily on me. I
10 think people don't realize how heavy that I try to
11 make sure that I'm striking the right balance. I was
12 concerned many, many times about the Community Safety
13 Act and all the things that were being said then, and
14 we were proven correct after many years, and I
15 believe we will be proven correct again.

16 I do want to - just in case you haven't seen an
17 example of what we have been asking people to do -
18 Madam Speaker, you appear to be a Black woman between
19 the ages of 20 and 65, this is a level one stop from
20 a 9-1-1 call that did not raise to another level
21 stop. However many seconds that took, that is
22 information we are asking for. I assume it will be
23 even quicker once to dropdown menus are there and
24 once people are used to it. This does not have to be
25 done at the moment of a stop. Police officers do not

2 have to stop what they're doing if it doesn't make
3 sense to do so. There's also the opportunity to do
4 it at the end of the tour when they are already
5 tagging videos.

6 Unfortunately, there has been so much
7 disinformation about paperwork and officers not being
8 able to do their job. There is much fear in the City,
9 and there's much concern with police officers who are
10 hearing they have to do so much additional work.

11 Finally, I think, uh, yesterday I started hearing
12 the administration say they will begin to have a
13 conversation about implementation, the conversation
14 that many of us have been trying to have for such a
15 long time. I'm looking forward to that conversation,
16 because it's information that is needed and is
17 necessary. We also worked off the Patrol Guide to
18 make sure we can put it in a way that is already in
19 the existing framework.

20 When it comes to dealing with the last vestiges
21 of solitary confinement and using isolation as a way
22 to change behavior, that has not been changing
23 behavior and has been causing more harm. We want to
24 make sure that we are doing what's best for the
25 safety of people on Rikers on both sides of those

1
2 aisles. We have lost two detainees already this year,
3 and it is not even February. We know the long-
4 standing effects of using isolation, that is not
5 working and causing harm. We want to make sure that
6 that stops.

7 I also want to lift up the concerns I've heard
8 from correctional officers, who I know are also in
9 the room, many of whom are working there - cell doors
10 that don't lock; bathrooms are not working; Black
11 women who are being sexually assaulted. It is not a
12 safe place for anyone to be right now. This bill
13 would not fix everything that goes on at Rikers
14 Island. It is to address one concern that people have
15 been talking about for many, many, many years, it
16 creates another housing unit that we can use to
17 separate people and try to address their behavior. It
18 is well thought out. I am also looking forward to the
19 implementation of how we're going to do what we must
20 do.

21 So thank you again to everyone. I also want to
22 just give a shoutout to former council member Danny
23 Dromm, who worked so hard on this. I also want to say
24 rest in peace to Paul Vallone. Thank you

2 SPEAKER ADAMS: Thank you, Public Advocate. I will
3 just make a little bit of an adjustment to the way
4 that you began your remarks, "Madam Speaker, you look
5 like someone who appears to be 25 and 25 and a half."
6 [LAUGHTER] I think that is what you meant.

7 Thank you, Public Advocate.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you, my deepest
9 and sincerest apologies.

10 [LAUGHTER]

11 SPEAKER ADAMS: Thank you so much. I now turn it
12 back over to our majority leader.

13 MAJORITY LEADER FARIAS: Thank you speaker Adams.
14 We will now move into Discussion of General Orders,
15 and I'd like to call on my colleague, Council Member
16 Kalman Yeger.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you. We're still
18 here, sorry about that.

19 I'm not going to reiterate the entirety of what I
20 said earlier, and obviously as I recognize I have a
21 clock on me, I'm not going to make a motion. But, I
22 just do want to note for the record, as I've
23 discussed earlier at the previous Stated, Section 42
24 of the Charter requires that at least 36 hours prior
25 to a meeting of the Council, the Council has publish

2 and make publicly available a proposed agenda for a
3 meeting. It's not a notice that a meeting is going
4 happen, that's actually a proposed agenda. We do it
5 all the time, it looks a little bit like this. We get
6 it in our inboxes. In this occasion, and in for the
7 previous Stated, we did not receive that. And it's
8 different from the email that was sent at 4:50 p.m.
9 on Friday. That was a notice that a meeting is
10 happening. That's the same notice that goes to the
11 press and to anybody else who signs up for our list.
12 That's different from a proposed agenda. In this
13 case, that agenda did not occur, it was not sent out.
14 I don't know if it was prepared or not, but it was
15 not here.

16 The rules of the Council don't supersede the
17 Charter's provision. The Charter itself has this
18 language, and it's there for a reason, it's so that
19 the Council doesn't do things like this - set up
20 meetings, not tell the world, even though we knew
21 what was going to be on the agenda. But that's... We
22 have rules for a reason. One of the rules we have is
23 that there's a proposed agenda. Let the world know
24 what it is we are going to be doing in a formalized
25 way. And that was not done. And for that reason, I do

2 move that the matters on today's agenda be laid
3 aside, and that a notice be properly made to the
4 members of the Council and to the public, and that we
5 reconvene at such later time as the speaker
6 determines when the speaker reconvenes the meeting,
7 thank you very much.

8 Oh, in addition, since I have the floor, and why
9 not, let's not do this again, to the extent that my
10 motion is denied, as I expect it will be, I move to
11 separate the questions on the General Order Calendar
12 and to decouple them. Thank you.

13 [PAUSE]

14 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Council Member Yeger,
15 could you please state your point of order and the
16 amendments you are making?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you, Madam President.
18 The point of order is that, uhm, as a matter of
19 order, we are required to have an agenda - a proposed
20 agenda - published and made publicly available -
21 those are the words of the Charter - a proposed
22 agenda for the meeting. This is a Stated Meeting,
23 it's not a special meeting. And that was not done at
24 this meeting, that was not done at the prior meeting.
25 And I know that the discussions on the dais earlier,

2 uh, focused around the question of whether or not an
3 email sent out at approximately 4:15 constituted an
4 agenda. But, that's not an agenda, that's simply a
5 meeting notice. It's just to let everybody know ,you
6 know, block off some time on your schedule Tuesday,
7 come on down to City Hall, we're gonna have some fun.
8 That's not what an agenda is. An agenda, as we have
9 always done, it looks like this. It shows up on your
10 inbox. It shows up typically a day or two before a
11 Stated. For this Stated and for the one held earlier
12 this morning, such a document did not arrive. The
13 only document that arrived... [CROSS-TALK]

14 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Sorry, Council...

15 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: that was anything... Yes,
16 ma'am?

17 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Can you pause for a
18 minute?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Sure... (CROSS-TALK)

20 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Thank you... [CROSS-TALK]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you, Madam.

22 [PAUSE]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Madam President, I can
24 provide additional clarity if it seems to be unclear.
25 I see there's some conversation... [CROSS-TALK]

MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Not needed, please hold.

COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Okay.

[PAUSE]

MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Thank you. Your motion is not well take... sorry, point of order, your motion is not well taken. The Charter requires that a proposed agenda be posted. A proposed agenda was posted on Friday as mentioned prior. There's no requirement that a proposed agenda contain all items to be considered. We will... Further, Section 42 of the Charter provides that such proposed agenda be published as soon as practical. Your point of order, again, is not well taken. What motions do you propose?

COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Well, I rose for a point of order. The point of order was for the items on the agenda. It wasn't a motion. The point of order was the for the items on the agenda to be stricken, as they were not properly noticed in a proposed agenda, and there was no proposed agenda for this meeting posted. It was simply a notice that a meeting was happening. In other words, it didn't even have that there would be an invocation or that there would be a roll or adoption of minutes. It didn't have any of

2 the things that we typically have. I know this may
3 sound esoteric to those who are not familiar with
4 Council process, but those are [INAUDIBLE]... [CROSS-
5 TALK]

6 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Council Member Yeger, you
7 are conflating... [CROSS-TALK]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Madam... [CROSS-TALK]

9 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: a point of order right
10 now. We... [CROSS-TALK]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Yes?

12 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: We need to know what the
13 motion on the floor is.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: It's not... it's not a
15 motion, I'm rising for a point of order regarding the
16 order of the agenda [INAUDIBLE]... [CROSS-TALK]

17 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: The point of order is not
18 well taken.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Okay, very good... [CROSS-
20 TALK]

21 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Do you have a motion?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: My motion is that the items
23 on today's agenda be stricken from the calendar, as
24 the calendar is not properly done in accordance with
25 the Charter of the city of New York. And, thus, we

2 should not be meeting until such time as the agenda,
3 or a proposed agenda, is sent out 36 hours prior to
4 the meeting.

5 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: That is not a valid
6 motion.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Sorry, Madam President, it
8 is not a valid motion to propose that matters that
9 are on the agenda be stricken from the calendar?

10 [PAUSE]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Sorry, let me use the words
12 laid aside.

13 [PAUSE]

14 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: There is a motion on the
15 floor to lay the item on the agenda on the table.

16 [PAUSE]

17 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: There is a motion to lay
18 the items on the agenda on the table. Clerk, can you
19 call a roll call vote?

20 [PAUSE]

21 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Okay, folks, there was a
22 motion on the floor from Council Member Yeger to lay
23 the items on the table, and a vote is to lay the
24 items aside. A no vote is to proceed with the General

2 Order Calendar. We will now call for a roll call
3 vote.

4 CLERK: Council Member Abreu?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ABREU: No

6 CLERK: Council Member Ariola?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Aye

8 CLERK: Council Member Avilés?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: No

10 CLERK: Council Member Ayala?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: No

12 CLERK: Council Member Banks?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BANKS: No

14 CLERK: Council Member Bottcher

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: No

16 CLERK: Council Member Brannan?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Nope

18 CLERK: Council Member Brewer?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: No

20 CLERK: Council Member Brooks-Powers?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Nope

22 CLERK: Council Member Cabán?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: No

24 CLERK: Council Member Carr?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Aye

2 CLERK: Council Member De La Rosa?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: No

4 CLERK: Council Member Dinowitz?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: No

6 CLERK: Council Member Feliz?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: No

8 CLERK: Council Member Gennaro?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: No

10 CLERK: Council Member Gutiérrez?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: No

12 CLERK: Council Member Hanif?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Nope

14 CLERK: Council Member Hanks?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER HANKS: No

16 CLERK: Council Member Holden?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Aye

18 CLERK: Council Member Hudson?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: No

20 CLERK: Council Member Joseph?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: No

22 CLERK: Council Member Krishnan?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER KRISHNAN: No

24 CLERK: Council Member Lee?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER LEE: No

2 CLERK: Council Member Louis?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: No

4 CLERK: Council Member Marmorato?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: Aye

6 CLERK: Council Member Marte?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTE: No

8 CLERK: Council Member Mealy?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: No

10 CLERK: Council Member Menin?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: No

12 CLERK: Council Member Moya?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: No

14 CLERK: Thank you

15 Council Member Narcisse?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: No

17 CLERK: Council Member Nurse?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: [NO MIC] No

19 CLERK: Council Member Ossé?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: No

21 CLERK: Council Member Paladino?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: Aye

23 CLERK: Council Member Powers?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: No

25 CLERK: Council Member Restler?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: No

3 CLERK: Council Member Riley?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: No

5 CLERK: Council Member Rivera?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: No

7 CLERK: Council Member Salaam

8 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAAM: No

9 CLERK: Council Member Salamanca?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: No

11 CLERK: Thank you

12 Council Member Sanchez?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: No

14 CLERK: Council Member Schulman?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER SCHULMAN: No

16 CLERK: Council Member Stevens?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Nope

18 CLERK: Council Member Ung?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER UNG: No

20 CLERK: Council Member Vernikov?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: Yes

22 CLERK: Council Member Williams?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: No

24 CLERK: Council Member Won?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER WON: No

2 CLERK: Council Member Yeger?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Aye

4 CLERK: Council Member Zhuang?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ZHUANG: Aye

6 CLERK: Council Member Borelli?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: [NO MIC] Aye

8 CLERK: Council Member Farías?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIÁS: No

10 CLERK: Speaker Adams?

11 SPEAKER ADAMS: No

12 [PAUSE]

13 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: The motion is defeated
14 with 9 in the affirmative, 42 in the negative, and 0
15 abstentions.

16 Council Member Yeger... [CROSS-TALK]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Madam... Madam President, I
18 request pursuant to Rule 9.6 of the Rules of the
19 Council, that the General Orders Calendar be
20 decoupled and that each matter be voted on separately
21 today.

22 [PAUSE]

23 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Okay, there is a motion
24 on the floor to decouple. It... Decouple Introduction
25 549-A and Introduction 586-A as separate questions.

2 All those in favor, say aye?

3 COUNCIL MEMBERS IN FAVOR: Aye

4 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: All those not in favor,
5 say nay?

6 COUNCIL MEMBERS NOT IN FAVOR: Nay

7 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Any abstentions?

8 ALL: [SILENT]

9 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: The ayes have it.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: The nays have it.

11 [BACKGROUND NOISE]

12 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: The nays have it.

13 [LAUGHTER]

14 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Thanks, ya'll. The nays
15 have it.

16 [PAUSE]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Madam President, how you
18 doing? I rise for...

19 [LAUGHTER]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: We get paid for a full day
21 here. Madam President, I rise for a point of
22 parliamentary inquiry. Thank you, Mr.

23 Parliamentarian, how are you doing? In the past, in
24 this body, we have never, to my knowledge, six years
25 and 28 days here, uh, we have never subjected a

2 request under Rule 9.6 to a vote. That is a request.
3 It is privileged, it is a request being made by a
4 member has to be abided by, and it has always been
5 abided by without a vote.

6 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: We will be holding, one
7 second.

8 [PAUSE]

9 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Thank you. Rule 9.60
10 allows a member to make a request, it is not
11 debatable pursuant to Rule 9.190, the request is
12 denied by the body.

13 [PAUSE]

14 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Report of Special
15 Committees?

16 CLERK: None

17 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Reports of Standing
18 Committees?

19 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Criminal
20 Justice, Introduction 549-A, solitary confinement.

21 SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled on General Orders.

22 CLERK: M 12, Mayor's veto message?

23 SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled to be Filed.

24 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Public Safety,
25 Introduction 586-A, How Many Stops Act?

2 SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled on General Orders.

3 CLERK: M 13, Mayor's Veto Message?

4 SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled to be Filed. I would now
5 ask that a clerk take a roll call vote on all of the
6 items coupled on today's General Orders Calendar.

7 CLERK: Council Member Abreu?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ABREU: Are we voting for real now?

9 [LAUGHTER] I vote aye.

10 CLERK: Thank you, Council Member, for real.

11 Council Member Ariola?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Permission to explain my
13 vote?

14 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Permission granted.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Thank you.

16 Overriding the Mayor's veto and allowing
17 Introductions 586-A and 549-A to pass, will make this
18 city and our correctional facilities less safe. I've
19 spoken with numerous current and retired members of
20 law enforcement about this subject, and the response
21 was virtually all of them... from all of them have
22 been the same. Introduction 586 will needlessly tie
23 down our already overstretched police department, and
24 Introduction 549 will remove one of the last

2 remaining tools that our correction officers have to
3 enforce rules within their facilities.

4 Both of these things equate to less safety, less
5 safety for the average New Yorker on the street, less
6 safety for correction officers and staff - less and
7 less safety from other inmates - who can now be
8 attacked at will with no repercussions or too low of
9 a repercussion available to deter their assailants.

10 I'm proudly voting no on this override, and I
11 implore my colleagues in the City Council to do the
12 same. The public safety of entire our city is at
13 risk, and right now this is an opportunity to prevent
14 unnecessary injury or loss of life, losses which
15 could be easily avoided if we vote down this override
16 and allow our law enforcement to do their jobs as
17 effectively as they possibly can. Thank you for the
18 time. I vote no.

19 CLERK: Council Member Avilés?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: I vote aye. Permission to
21 explain my vote?

22 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Permission granted.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: I'm proud to have co-
24 primed Introduction 586-A, a component of the How
25 Many Stops Act, aimed to deliver more transparency to

1
2 our communities. I want to extend my sincere thanks
3 to Speaker Adams for holding firm in her commitment
4 to not only passing this legislation, but now
5 delivering this veto. I want to also acknowledge the
6 families who have lost loved ones to police violence,
7 who have not only worked tirelessly to get this
8 legislation passed, but again to assert their
9 commitment to justice by standing with all of us
10 today as we override this veto.

11 Another round of thank yous goes to those who
12 have turned their publicly lived trauma into a
13 concerted effort for reform and accountability. This
14 legislation we are talking about today is a baseline
15 level of transparency that all New Yorkers deserve -
16 quite frankly from any city agency. This veto will be
17 for every person who has had an unlawful encounter
18 that took away some of their dignity; for every young
19 person, especially young Black men, who are
20 consistently made to feel like a suspect rather than
21 a scholar; for every person who experienced violence
22 and harm for stops that were never recorded; for all
23 of those who lost their life, my sincere hope is that
24 this veto will move us closer to ending the need for
25

2 the dreadful "talk" that families of color have to
3 have with their children to save their lives.

4 Racially biased and unlawful stops are an
5 ongoing problem that we must address with
6 intentionality. I can't understand why the mayor and
7 the NYPD do not want to do this work. The mayor
8 should be focused on ensuring that the NYPD follows
9 the law, just like every other agency, and should be
10 focused on the enormous scale of misconduct lawsuits
11 and rising complaints. True public safety includes
12 putting [TIMER CHIMES] an end to solitary and an end
13 to discriminatory and unconstitutional policing.
14 Thank you.

15 CLERK: Council Member Ayala?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I vote aye.

17 CLERK: Council Member Banks?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BANKS: Permission to explain my
19 vote?

20 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Permission granted.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BANKS: Dr. King once said life
22 begins to end when we become silent on things that
23 matter. And I'm asking my colleagues to summon the
24 courage of Dr. King and not be silent.

25

2 How many stops, how many stops, Mr. Mayor, how
3 many times will you stop or attempt to stop and
4 obstruct the Council? How many times? Well, summon
5 the courage of Dr. King; summon the courage of
6 Malcolm X, speak truth to power, and let's get on
7 with the peoples' business.

8 This is a body, a co-equal branch of government,
9 and I think - and I know for sure, that the folks who
10 sent me to represent them from the 42nd Council
11 District didn't send me here to be silent. So, I
12 refuse to be silent. I'm standing up for
13 transparency. I'm standing up for accountability. And
14 I'm voting to override this mayor.

15 CLERK: Council Member Bottcher

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: Aye on all.

17 CLERK: Council Member Brannan?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Aye

19 CLERK: Council Member Brewer?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Aye

21 CLERK: Council Member Brooks-Powers?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Permission to
23 explain my vote?

24 MAJORITY LEADER FARIAS: Permission granted.

25

1 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: For the last
2 several weeks, I've witnessed the unfortunate
3 spreading of disinformation around these two bills.
4 And I ask the question why? Why would we want to
5 continue to divide communities in a time when we must
6 be united? I represent District 31, which I always
7 say represents the best of New York City with its
8 diversity. We have Black, brown, Asian folks, we have
9 one of the most vibrant Jewish communities, and we
10 live side-by-side.

11 The language that continues to be portrayed in
12 the media has been widely inaccurate. This past
13 weekend, I joined my colleague, Council Member
14 Williams, for a ride along in the 105th precinct
15 where I got to spend time with my commanding officer,
16 and our foot patrol, and other officers. And a lot of
17 what has been shared publicly is just not true. There
18 is no paperwork, the only paperwork that's being
19 filled out is when there's an arrest. The officers
20 fill out - each night - reports either on their
21 phones or on the computer. Each night when they are
22 about to get off, they go into the precinct and they
23 tag their device. Most officers turn on their device
24 at a level one because they do not know if it's going
25

2 to escalate to a level two or three. That means this
3 information is already being tagged. We want to work
4 with the administration to implement this as
5 seamlessly as possible, because the police officers
6 are the ones protecting our community. Many of them
7 are our brothers and our sisters, and we know them
8 too. We cannot continue to alienate this council,
9 this body, with our community. And, so we have to do
10 better. And with that, I vote aye on these [TIMER
11 CHIMES] pieces of legislation to override the vetoes.
12 Thank you.

13 CLERK: Council Member Cabán?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Permission to explain my
15 vote?

16 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Permission granted.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Thank you.

18 First off, I just want to shoutout and give
19 flowers to the Jails Action Coalition who has worked
20 for over a decade to get this work done. I want to
21 honor all those who have suffered in solitary
22 confinement in New York City jails, or who live in
23 fear that a low level police stop may quickly
24 escalate to extreme danger. These conditions are

1
2 oppressive and inhumane, and they make all New
3 Yorkers less safe.

4 To all those who have fought to win these vital
5 protections, I vote to override these vetoes in your
6 honor. [speaking foreign language]

7 Second, let me say that the mayor's disrespect
8 for this council and our speaker is shameful. He
9 vetoes our legislation, and then when we override his
10 veto, he simply refuses to meet his obligation to
11 implement the law. He pretends to negotiate budget
12 restorations, and then unilaterally opposes new cuts.
13 He has proven that he cannot be trusted. This city
14 deserves so much better. [speaking foreign language]

15 And lastly, I want to thank you, Madam Speaker,
16 Public Advocate Williams, Chairs Nurse and Salaam,
17 and the rest of the body, for your undaunted
18 fortitude in the face of such disrespect. New York
19 will be a safer, more just city because of what we
20 are doing here today. So, thank you and I proudly
21 vote aye on all.

22 CLERK: Council Member Carr?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Permission to explain my
24 vote?

25 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Permission granted.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Thank you.

3 I'll be opposing the overrides today, because I
4 believe that the enactment of these two bills will
5 have the effect of making the uniform and non-uniform
6 personnel of some of our agencies, as well as members
7 of the public, less safe.

8 The bill with respect to punitive segregation is
9 mistaken, because there's only so many options that
10 our corrections officers and staff have to maintain
11 order and discipline in a City jail. Unlike our
12 police who, when they address a problem, they have
13 the ability to take someone out of that situation and
14 bring them to a jail to await punishment and trial,
15 that option has already been utilized by those who
16 are in the jail awaiting trial. And, so, having
17 punitive segregation is an important disciplinary
18 tool to ensure that we have order in our City jails.
19 And that is why I'm opposing this particular piece of
20 legislation.

21 And with respect Introduction 586-A, I think
22 we've come a long way since I first came here to this
23 body as a staffer in 2014; at that time, progressive
24 leaders of this body were pushing for civilization of
25 positions in the NYPD in order to get our uniform

1
2 personnel off of desks, out of desks, and out of the
3 precincts and into the streets doing real police
4 work. And now we seem to be undoing that good work by
5 placing an undue administrative burden on our
6 officers that would be taking their attention away
7 from their jobs and creating a perverse incentive not
8 to engage in the basic encounters that further
9 investigations, which makes all of us less safe. And,
10 so, for those reasons, I'm opposing both of these
11 bills today, and I vote no on all. Thank you.

12 CLERK: Council Member De La Rosa?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Permission to explain
14 my vote?

15 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Permission granted.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Thank you so much.
17 First of all I want to thank Madame Speaker, and our
18 colleagues, our Public Advocate for their brave
19 leadership today. I want to say a few you words in
20 Spanish, because I think it is important as we
21 highlight diversity of our city that our communities
22 understand what is a stake today. [speaking foreign
23 language]

24 With agencies given that much power, taxpayer
25 funding, and responsibility we hold them to a higher

1 standard and should be able to hold them accountable
2 when necessary, not to weaken the checks and balances
3 built to ensure that our city runs smoothly. This is
4 not the first time in our city's history that the
5 police have been vehemently against accountability
6 measures. But, accountability measures are far
7 overdue for those sworn to protect all New Yorkers.
8 The way we build stronger ties is by bringing
9 sunlight and transparency, which is what we will do
10 here today.

12 On solitary, I simply want to say that I am proud
13 to vote on the bill to ban solitary confinement. I
14 was proud to vote as a member of the state legislator
15 to undo this torture in state jails, and today I am
16 proud to vote in honor of those who have lost their
17 lives in our New York City jails. Torture by any
18 other name is still torture. And evoking Dr. King,
19 [TIMER CHIMES] we all know that the time is always
20 right to do the right thing, and the time is now. I
21 vote aye.

22 CLERK: Council Member Dinowitz?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Permission to explain my
24 vote?

25 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Permission granted.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Thank you, Madam
3 Majority Leader.

4 You know, our job as council members is to
5 provide oversight of all of our city agencies, and
6 that includes the NYPD. And transparency is one of
7 the tools we have to do that.

8 I'll be honest, when I when I first heard about
9 this bill, I was very concerned about administrative
10 burdens. Then I read the bill. And then I read the
11 NYPD Patrol Guide. And I spoke with our officers -
12 our officers right now, without the bill already, are
13 going back to their stations after the tours, they
14 are docking their body worn camera footage, and
15 tagging level one and two encounters - and in many
16 cases, they are logging the apparent race and gender
17 of the people they encounter. This work is already
18 being done. But, for reasons you heard earlier, it is
19 critical that we get this information. For the most
20 part, this bill asks for information that is already
21 being recorded.

22 I am sympathetic to any concerns about
23 administrative burden. I went on the mayor's ride
24 along this Saturday night, and the officers were
25 sharing with us all of the paperwork they had to do.

1
2 And one of the officers said, you know, in some
3 instances we fill out two, three documents for a
4 single incident, and in those documents there is
5 duplicative information. In some instances they're
6 writing information by hand, and then going back to
7 the station and transcribing those handwritten notes
8 to a computer. One officer shared with me that, as
9 recently as 2012, he was using a typewriter. And for
10 those of you who don't know what a typewriter is,
11 just Google it. [LAUGHTER] I mean, the point is, I
12 think all of us, or myself especially, want to make
13 sure our officers are on the street doing the work
14 that they signed up to do, and that is to keep us
15 safe, to prevent crime, to fight crime, to solve
16 crime, not sitting back at the station doing
17 paperwork. This bill does not significantly add to
18 their administrative task, but if we want to take
19 that seriously, if the administration [TIMER CHIMES]
20 wants to take the administrative tasks seriously,
21 they should conduct an audit, and we should... all of
22 council, should take that seriously and work together
23 on this bill - or any of the other paperwork they do
24 - to ensure it's as streamlined as possible so that

2 they're on the streets keeping us safe. I vote aye on
3 both bills.

4 CLERK: Council Member Feliz?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Permission to explain my
6 vote?

7 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Permission granted.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Thank you Majority Leader.

9 I vote aye on the override. As a young Latino
10 from the Bronx, I know very well the importance of
11 police transparency and accountability. As a young
12 Latino from the Bronx, who as a teenager growing
13 up... growing up on Fordham Road in the Bronx during
14 the Bloomberg era, I know the importance of police
15 transparency and accountability. At the same time, I
16 know very well as a representative of 15th Council
17 District in the Central Bronx, the important role
18 that police officers play in helping improve public
19 safety. Public safety is obviously very complex. It
20 requires many different pieces, putting them together
21 the correct way, including, and obviously
22 opportunity, good schools, etcetera. But, in the
23 Bronx, I've seen these police precincts, these police
24 officers, play a very important role on the issue of
25 public safety and deterring crime - and of course

2 deterring harm - so that if our youth do you want to
3 take advantage of opportunity, for example, playing
4 in a local park - playing baseball, basketball,
5 football, so they could do so without having to worry
6 about other people coming to harm them - as we've
7 seen far too often in the borough of the Bronx and in
8 the city of New York.

9 I vote aye on the override. Police officers play
10 a very important role in safety, but of course,
11 transparency and accountability are crucial. So I
12 vote aye. But, I hope we can take a hard look at how
13 the bill is implemented, to make sure that it is
14 properly implemented and to make sure there are no
15 unintended consequences. Thank you, I vote aye on all
16 on the override.

17 CLERK: Council Member Gennaro?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Madam Leader, I wish to
19 speak on my vote.

20 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Permission granted.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Thank you, I would like
22 to thank the speaker and the council leadership for
23 working with people all across the political spectrum
24 and engaging moderates like me for... in order to
25 make common sense clarifications ,you know, common

2 sense modifications, to make sure the bill was...
3 that both bills were fair, so I certainly appreciate
4 that. I appreciate the public advocate for engaging
5 me personally. I had a lot of conversations with
6 Rosie Mendez also, and I appreciate the collaboration
7 and the outreach to moderates in the Council, and
8 with that, I vote aye.

9 CLERK: Council Member Gutiérrez?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: Permission to explain
11 my vote?

12 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Permission granted.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: Thank you.

14 [speaking foreign language]

15 And I will say it in English, real briefly for
16 you all, [TIMER CHIMES] I'll switch it up. That once
17 again, I'm so proud today of my colleagues, of
18 Council Member Avilés, our speaker, our public
19 advocate for showing up and uplifting these stories.
20 These are not dramatizations, they are real. They
21 really tear families apart. What is this
22 administration trying to hide by making the NYPD be
23 transparent and report on the stops? The truth that
24 many of us that look like me and many of my
25 colleagues, [TIMER CHIMES] already know is that a

2 system that will more readily invest in the carceral
3 system then housing, than food access, than mental
4 health, is a broken system, it is a broken
5 institution, and is breaking our communities apart.
6 And for all of the names that I mentioned in my
7 Spanish remarks... [CROSS-TALK]

8 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Council Member... [CROSS-
9 TALK]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: I once again recognize
11 all of you as survivors... [CROSS-TALK]

12 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Council Member, please
13 cast your vote... [CROSS-TALK]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: and advocates... and I
15 vote aye on the override, thank you.

16 CLERK: Council Member Hanif?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Permission to explain my
18 vote?

19 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Permission granted.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: [speaking foreign language]

21 I emphatically vote aye to override the mayor's
22 misguided vetoes of both Introduction 549 and
23 Introduction 586. I thank Speaker Adams, Public
24 Advocate Williams, Criminal Justice Chair Nurse,
25 Public Safety Chair Salaam, and the Jails Action

1 Coalition, CPR, and all directly impacted New
2 Yorkers, for their clear and principled leadership on
3 these critical bills. As co-chair of the Progressive
4 Caucus, I am proud that our membership has championed
5 these bills as core priorities of our legislative
6 agenda. Solitary confinement is torture. It causes
7 people to physically and mentally deteriorate and
8 exacerbates violence. The Council must do more to end
9 senseless deaths in our jails.
10

11 Regarding Introduction 586, the NYPD must provide
12 the public with basic data on who it stops and why.
13 Doing so is not a distraction from police work - it
14 is police work. The NYPD's long history of
15 disproportionately stopping Black and brown New
16 Yorker necessitates increased transparency. With
17 these vetoes Mayor Adams has shown that his
18 regressive policy positions align with Republicans,
19 COBA and the PBA. The failure of his misinformation
20 campaign shows that these positions do not align with
21 the majority of New Yorkers. I am proud to stand with
22 the diverse and representative council that
23 overwhelmingly believes that humane conditions in
24 jails and common sense police accountability measures
25 are essential to public safety. [TIMER CHIMES]

2 CLERK: Council Member Hanks?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER HANKS: Permission to explain my
4 vote?

5 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Permission granted.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER HANKS: Thank you, Majority Leader.

7 Depending on what district you represent, it will
8 inform your feelings about what this bill means. For
9 people who do not live in neighborhoods where there
10 is an excess and a history of violence, the How Many
11 Stops bill may seem counterproductive. Unfortunately,
12 in neighborhoods like mine, the neighborhood I live
13 in and raise my four children in, statistically we
14 will have more interactions with police whether we
15 are the bad actors or not. This reporting bill is
16 aimed at aiding the hard-working families who endure
17 both the violence in their communities and the
18 enforcement measures applied by NYPD.

19 While I endorse the spirit and the intent behind
20 Introduction 586-A for its increased transparency, I
21 do have concerns about the requirement to report on
22 level one encounters. Attending the mayor's ride
23 along, it gave us a sneak peek into the complexities
24 of how officers use level one encounters to garner
25 important and time sensitive information. And, so, as

1 we move forward in passing Introduction 586-A, let's
2 make sure as council members, as legislators, that we
3 keep a close eye on the implementation. And should
4 any challenges arise, that we work together for any
5 amendments, so we can continue to make this the best
6 bill for all New Yorkers.

8 Having said that, I vote aye on all in support of
9 this reporting bill for the benefit of the hard-
10 working families in our community who, again, endure
11 both the internal violence and NYPD's enforcement
12 measures, and these are the folks that everyone here
13 is standing by and voting for today. Thank you,
14 Majority Leader.

15 CLERK: Council Member Holden?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Uh, permission to explain?

17 MAJORITY LEADER FARIAS: Permission granted.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: I am going to vote no on
19 the override. And I'm just going to go over a couple
20 of things.

21 First, we're asking fewer police officers to do a
22 lot more. That makes no sense. That makes no sense
23 whatsoever. And the most mundane stops, we're asking
24 them to report on. It's not even a stop, first of
25 all, level one, it's an encounter, and they're asking

1 questions like, "Did you witness this?" "Did you see
2 something?" "Did you see that person harass that
3 person?" That's what we're asking. So, we want
4 reports if the police officer stopped 10 people, or
5 at least questioned 10 people - asked them if they
6 witnessed something - and all 10 say no, they still
7 have to report. That makes no sense whatsoever. That
8 will delay critical response. Stands to reason if
9 police are filling out... whether you want to call it
10 paperwork or digital work, they're still going to
11 have to answer questions, and up to... and on the
12 level one, up to 11 questions, and some could be
13 complicated like, "What happened?", and you have to
14 describe what happened. So, this, again, is going to
15 tie the hands of the police officers, which is the
16 intent here. This is the intent to tie the officers'
17 hands even further. Again, critical response, seconds
18 count. You will see the critical response time go up
19 which will cost lives. You will see the response time
20 in general go up. People will complain. Your
21 constituents will complain. They don't care about
22 mundane level one encounters. They care about
23 critical response, that's key here.

2 And on the punitive seg by the way, it's not
3 called solitary confinement, we haven't had that in
4 the city of New York for 10 years, everybody says
5 that, but nobody listens. If there's punitive seg,
6 there's a reason... that's why the federal monitor
7 disagrees with the body here saying, you know what,
8 we need it as a tool to keep our correctional
9 officers safe.

10 So, again, let's start looking at common sense
11 bills. And really, we're shooting ourselves in the
12 foot on Introduction 586, [TIMER CHIMES] because that
13 will, again, cost lives, you'll see, in critical
14 response.

15 CLERK: Council Member Hudson?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Permission to explain my
17 vote?

18 MAJORITY LEADER FARIAS: Permission granted.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Thank you so much.

20 If solitary confinement doesn't exist, then we
21 should have no problem overriding the veto and
22 setting it into law...

23 UNKNOWN: That's right!

24 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: just one point. Another
25 point I'd like to make is that NYPD data from 2022

1 shows that out of 15,102 recorded stops, almost 90%
2 of all stops were Black and Latinx folks -
3 specifically 59% were Black and 30% were Latinx, 65%
4 of them resulted in no arrest and no summons. And
5 that is exactly why we need the How Many Stops Act.
6 The passage of this legislative package, and
7 Introduction 586 in particular, will bolster the
8 civil liberties of New Yorkers across the five
9 boroughs and help cultivate a stronger relationship
10 between the NYPD and our communities - one predicated
11 on trust and integrity.

13 This bill will provide the public and lawmakers
14 alike with a complete and honest accounting of the
15 way the police interact with our neighbors, helping
16 us target and address the ugly vestiges of stop-and-
17 frisk policing that are once again appearing in the
18 communities we represent.

19 I'm proud to be a part of this council to have
20 cast my vote for this historic package. It is an eye
21 on both, and I look forward to ensuring that these
22 laws are implemented and upheld faithfully. And I'd
23 like to thank the speaker, this body, and the
24 families, the many, many families of the victims of
25 police violence that have to share their stories over

1 and over again. And to my council members, to my
2 colleagues, to our one colleague Council Member
3 Salaam, who has himself experienced solitary
4 confinement, to my colleagues who have family members
5 who have experienced solitary confinement, thank you
6 for sharing your stories, thank you.
7

8 CLERK: Council Member Joseph?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Permission to explain my
10 vote?

11 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Permission granted.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Thank you.

13 I am a council member from Brooklyn, also the
14 chair on the Committee on Education in the Council,
15 but more importantly, I am a mother of four Black
16 young men. The real life experiences of everyday New
17 Yorkers are why we are here today.

18 As a mom, I've dealt with my son being stopped by
19 New York NYPD. My son was racially profiled and
20 questioned. And what I know for certain is that my
21 story is too familiar around the City. As an educator
22 in our public school system for over two decades, I
23 know the trauma that our youth face after horrific
24 encounters with law enforcement does not go away.
25 More than ever, transparency and accountability are

2 needed, especially for young Black and brown New
3 Yorkers who have been victims of racial profiling.

4 The How Many Stop Act is about accountability
5 and transparency, and if the Adams' administration
6 says they believe in that, the How Many Stop Act
7 should not be an issue. Instead, Mayor Adams is
8 simply misleading the public, but this council
9 remained committed to honest dialogue about policies
10 that can make us safer.

11 When we have public safety data, it will make New
12 Yorkers and their communities much safer. We owe it
13 to New Yorkers, especially those who have been
14 impacted the most, to stand on the right and truthful
15 side of history.

16 The moment is now for us to deliver for New
17 Yorkers who have been forgotten for far too long. And
18 this council remained firm in standing up for what is
19 right.

20 Today I stand for my students and my four boys in
21 Flatbush, so I vote aye on all.

22 CLERK: Council Member Krishnan?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER KRISHNAN: I vote aye, thank you
24 Speaker Adams for your leadership.

25 CLERK: Council Member Lee?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEE: Uhm, I'm sorry, my Korean is
3 not good enough, so I can't translate what I'm about
4 to say in Korean, but kudos, shoutout, sorry,
5 parents. [LAUGHTER]

6 I just wanted to say I vote aye on all, and I
7 look forward to working with our colleagues on the
8 Council and the admin to ensure a very transparent
9 implementation that will benefit all of our
10 communities, thank you.

11 CLERK: Council Member Louis?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Permission to explain my
13 vote?

14 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Permission granted.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Thank you, Madam Majority
16 Leader.

17 The How Many Stops Act went from being a bill
18 about transparency and accountability to a public
19 spectacle about our lack or ability to lead,
20 negotiate, and compromise on legislative matters to
21 address existing public safety policies that impact
22 Black and brown people, particularly men, our sons,
23 cousins, uncles, fathers, guardians, and so on.
24 Therefore, I'm not shocked by the pushback, because
25 historically in this city, there's a notion that

1
2 Black and brown men are better at being statistics
3 and incarcerated. I am not shocked by the fear
4 mongering and fragmented information being shared
5 with my Jewish constituents and AAPI constituents in
6 communities, in Flatbush and in Midwood, and the
7 fragmented messaging in the press.

8 It's clear that we have different opinions, and
9 that's okay, but what concerns me is the fact that we
10 are being asked to retain an existing system that
11 lacks transparency. This is extremely problematic.
12 The NYPD is a necessary force. It is a group of
13 practitioners to provide public safety services to
14 New Yorkers, and our goal is not to deter them from
15 being and doing their jobs as we understand NYPD
16 response times are critical. That's why 586-A
17 provides an implementation process that can be
18 designed to ensure NYPD personnel have the time to
19 conduct every part of their job - that includes
20 reporting.

21 I want to acknowledge the mothers and family
22 members that have lost loved ones to police violence
23 in my district: Natasha Duncan; Carol Gray, who is
24 the mother of Kimani Gray; and the family of Dwayne
25 Jeune.

2 Thank you, Madam Speaker, for your leadership
3 throughout this process, I know it was not easy, as
4 well as you, Public Advocate, Council Member Hudson,
5 and Council Member Avilés, I saw you on every news
6 station. Thank you for your leadership. I look
7 forward to the administration working with you, Madam
8 Speaker, to ensure this is done the right way.

9 I vote aye on all, thank you. [TIMER CHIMES]

10 CLERK: Council Member Marmorato?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: Permission to explain
12 my vote?

13 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Permission granted.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: Thank you.

15 While recognizing the importance of law
16 enforcement transparency, today I will be casting my
17 vote against overriding the mayor's veto of the How
18 Many Stops Act.

19 While I value the intention behind the bill, my
20 concerns lie in operational challenges and the need
21 to strike a balance between public disclosure and
22 safeguarding sensitive information.

23 We must work collaboratively to find solutions
24 that address accountability without compromising the
25 effectiveness of our police force.

2 In casting my vote, I take in to consideration
3 the existent attrition within our police department
4 and the strain placed on our officers.

5 While the How Many Stops Act aims to enhance
6 transparency, we must also acknowledge the small
7 increments in administrative tasks that can have
8 cascading effects on our already stretched resources.

9 In a time where we grapple with budget a deficit,
10 it's imperative to assess the potential impact of
11 operational efficiency and allocate resources
12 judiciously to maintain both transparency and fiscal
13 responsibility.

14 Simultaneously, I commend the intentions behind
15 the second bill which seeks to implement reform and
16 enhance due process of those in the Department of
17 Correction custody. But, to completely abolish this
18 provision that keeps both are officers and inmates
19 safe, is not a safe or responsible decision. I will
20 also be voting to not override this veto. So, I vote
21 no on both.

22 CLERK: Council Member Marte?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTE: Aye

24 CLERK: Council Member Mealy?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye on all.

1 CLERK: Council Member Menin?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Permission to explain my
3 vote?
4

5 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Permission granted.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: I vote aye. I think it's
7 imperative to ensure that with implementation of
8 Introduction 586, that the Council and the
9 administration work collaboratively to engage on the
10 best way to achieve the purposes of transparency and
11 accountability, and, at the same time, achieve public
12 safety.

13 I've heard from many of my constituents on this
14 bill, and I strongly believe that there is a path
15 forward to achieve the bills' objectives, and at the
16 same time, keep communities safe. I firmly believe
17 that these two ideas are in no way mutually
18 exclusive. Thank you.

19 CLERK: Council Member Moya?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Permission to explain my
21 vote?

22 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Permission granted.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Thank you, Madam Majority
24 Leader. Today's vote is not one that I take lightly.
25 It is not often that the legislation that we pass in

2 the Council is vetoed by the mayor, and even more
3 rare that this body overrides that veto. It goes to
4 the strong opinions and concerns that both sides hold
5 for transparency and public safety expressed by
6 elected officials and New Yorkers across the city.

7 I will be voting in support of the override, but
8 I hope that conversations continue over the next
9 month before implementation to address the very real
10 concerns over public safety. Thank you to Madam
11 Speaker for your leadership on this. And thank you, I
12 will be voting in the affirmative.

13 CLERK: Council Member Narcisse?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Permission to explain my
15 vote?

16 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Permission granted.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: I'm so happy to be here
18 with all my colleagues. Difficult time, difficult
19 moment for us.

20 When it comes to solitary confinement, this for a
21 mother of four, and being a registered nurse, and
22 working in the reentry program, listening to the
23 young folks in our community suffering... in my
24 Creole language, like I'm hearing all the people
25 talking [speaking foreign language] especially when

1 the [INAUDIBLE] is on your [INAUDIBLE], you can press
2 on it. But if your family is suffering dealing with
3 what we are seeing in solitary confinement when you
4 come out, is it difficult. [speaking foreign
5 language] So, what I'm saying is just that you
6 cannot function when you come back to your community.
7 It's hard. So, for those that said it's not... It's
8 supposed to protect the officer, even the
9 correctional officers said it themselves [speaking
10 foreign language] Those are human beings. This is
11 inhumane around the world, we should take information
12 and process it, how the results come out when you
13 rehabilitate folks when they go to jail. They're not
14 supposed to come out not being able to function. So,
15 my money [speaking foreign language] I hold immense
16 respect for the respect of the officers in my
17 community. When that bill comes and I'm so happy that
18 we... I had to process it, because all the lies that
19 come [speaking foreign language] No, that's not true
20 at all. Because, if you take time, you are a great
21 officer, you take an oath to serve, to respect, to
22 protect. So, the little step that you have to take,
23 now we're in the technology era, so all the pressing,
24 it's not taking extra. [TIMER CHIMES] You go back to
25

2 your precinct and you're able to process that. So,
3 for that, I'm saying [speaking foreign language]
4 thank you very much, everyone, and Madam Speaker,
5 [speaking foreign language] ... [CROSS-TALK]

6 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Council Member, please
7 wrap up your comments... [CROSS-TALK]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: [speaking foreign
9 language] Aye, and I am going to vote aye for all of
10 those folks that are suffering, thank you... [CROSS-
11 TALK]

12 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Thank you, Council Member
13 Narcisse.

14 CLERK: Council Member Nurse?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: Why do I always have to go
16 after Council Member Narcisse?

17 [LAUGHTER]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: First and foremost I just
19 want to also congratulate you, Majority Leader, on an
20 excellent job today in facilitation.

21 I want to thank Speaker Adams and Public Advocate
22 Jumaane Williams for leading the charge on these
23 bills. I want to uplift the leadership of Council
24 Member Avilés and Council Member Hudson, and the
25 Council central staff, who did exceptional internal

1
2 organizing work this week around these bills, and
3 Council Members Rivera and Hanks, who moved these
4 bills into passage last session. I am proud that my
5 first vote as chair of the Criminal Justice Committee
6 was to override an unnecessary mayoral veto. And I am
7 proud to be part of this council today.

8 A lot has been said about these transformational
9 bills. I won't repeat everything, but I do want to
10 take a moment to express my gratitude with those of
11 you who stood by these bills and stood by each other
12 as colleagues, despite the challenges of
13 misinformation and, unfortunately, the lies that
14 resulted in pressures placed upon you. I recognize
15 and acknowledge that this was not easy for every
16 member, and I am thankful for those of you today who
17 are stepping up to do what is right.

18 Thank you to every single New Yorker who shared
19 their gut wrenching stories, who fought back tears at
20 rallies, who were vulnerable in public hearings, and
21 who kept in the fight to pass these bills. A special
22 shoutout to the Jails Action Coalition, the Halt
23 Solitary Coalition, and Communities United for Police
24 Reform, for your resolve and love for our people. I'm
25 really proud that we are ending solitary confinement

2 today, and I'm looking forward to working to close
3 Rikers tomorrow.

4 I vote aye on all, thank you.

5 CLERK: Council Member Ossé?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Permission to explain my
7 vote?

8 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Permission granted.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: [speaking foreign language]

10 I just wanted [speaking foreign language] to my
11 Chinese siblings for my miss pronunciation on
12 anything, but I wanted to address any Mandarin
13 speaking communities who have been fed a lot of
14 misinformation about what this bill does.

15 As a Black New Yorker, I remember taking the
16 subway to school and being stopped by police. You
17 know, first of all, let me paint you a picture: I was
18 a gay, nerdy, Black kid who was no threat to anyone,
19 but the sole threat that these police officers saw
20 was the color of my skin. And I know that's not an
21 isolated incident for young Black men, for Black
22 people, not only within New York, but across the
23 country. And this bill that we are passing today is
24 going to set the record on what Black families have
25 been teaching and asking for when it comes to their

2 relationship with the police, and that's a level of
3 accountability of transparency and safety. The
4 numbers don't lie. We see that our communities are
5 most impacted and policed based off of the color of
6 our skin. So, I want to thank all of the bill
7 sponsors, the public advocate, the speaker for really
8 keeping me safe - for keeping my colleagues in the
9 City Council, as well as all Black New Yorkers,
10 especially young Black men, who have been targeted
11 without any levels of accountability safe. So, thank
12 you, and I vote aye on all.

13 CLERK: Thank you

14 Council Member Paladino?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: Permission to explain my
16 vote?

17 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Permission granted.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: This is a very sad, sad
19 day. It's sad day because it's no longer about the
20 issue of 586 and 549. What it's become as a racial
21 issue. It's really terrible. We were talking here
22 about division. It's constant division. Division is
23 not what is going to bring us together. I sit here as
24 a 69-year-old white woman. My mother worked in a
25 factory making buttonholes. She watched her son, at

2 15 years old, get arrested for stealing a car. He was
3 then sentenced to upstate New York at 16. We were
4 told he went away to college. My brother was then
5 arrested again, because he was a drug addict, and he
6 was in Rikers Island for three years. He got out in
7 1974. He served in solitary confinement. I don't wear
8 anything on my sleeve, because I have dignity and I
9 have respect for my mother and what we come from.
10 Please don't make this a racial issue, it's not. I'm
11 sorry you feel that.

12 I hear you in the background, and that's okay.
13 But, I just want you to know... [CROSS-TALK]

14 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Sorry, one second...
15 [CROSS-TALK]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: raising... Raising
17 children... [CROSS-TALK]

18 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: One second, Council
19 Member Paladino. As I mentioned in the beginning of
20 this meeting, the public shall remain silent. There
21 will be no interruptions... [CROSS-TALK]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: Thank you, thank you for
23 that...

24 You know, when... I raised two children, they're
25 grown men today. I gave, not my 46-year-old, but my

2 36-year-old the same lecture you've given yours. "Be
3 careful when a cop pulls you over, make sure two
4 hands are around the wheel." See, he could be
5 profiled also. He likes tattoos, he likes earrings,
6 he's a little different than his older brother. And I
7 too told him, "Be very careful when they go over to
8 your trunk, [TIMER CHIMES] they may drop something in
9 your trunk and you don't know it." So, it's not like
10 I'm blind, in any way shape or form, to that fact
11 that there's good and there's bad. I never judge a
12 person by their color. I never judge a person by
13 their religion...

14 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Council Member, please
15 wrap up your point... [CROSS-TALK]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: Okay...

17 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: and cast your vote...

18 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: And in... I just want to
19 say, in that... in saying all of what I just said,
20 the reason behind my vote is because I understand the
21 importance today more than ever, I don't like
22 profiling, but there is a certain amount of things
23 that are happening here today that doesn't involve
24 transparency at all. It's just about color... [CROSS-
25 TALK]

2 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Council Member, please
3 cast your vote... [CROSS-TALK]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: and it should not be.
5 So, I vote no. I want this veto to stick. Thank you
6 very much, everybody.

7 CLERK: Council Member Powers?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: I vote aye. I'll let
9 others speak on that, thank you.

10 CLERK: Council Member Restler?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Permission to explain my
12 vote?

13 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Permission granted.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Thank you both for you,
15 Madam Majority Leader.

16 I would firstly like to be associated with the
17 remarks of our speaker and our public advocate. Thank
18 you both for your moral clarity, leadership, and
19 courage. The people of New York City are indebted to
20 each of you and to the extraordinary campaigns that
21 have been fought over many years, during many
22 mayoralties, and many speakerships, to get us to the
23 point today where we are overriding the vetoes of
24 Mayor Adams. I have been deeply disturbed by *his*
25 misinformation campaign. And I am deeply disturbed by

1 some of the comments that I've heard on the floor
2 today. I have news that I'd like to share, racism
3 exists. While less than 50% of the people in New York
4 City are Black or Latino, 97% of the people who face
5 level one stops are Black and Latino. About 90% of
6 the people on Rikers Island are Black and Latino.
7 This is urgent, this is necessary. The reforms that
8 we are putting into law today will bring greater
9 oversight and accountability to the NYPD, and it will
10 end torture in our jails. I am proud, deeply proud to
11 vote aye.

12
13 CLERK: Council Member Riley?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: Permission to explain my
15 vote?

16 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Permission granted.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: I have to get up for this
18 one. So, uhm, I have to apologize to my staff who
19 prepared remarkable remarks for me today, but I
20 always get inspired when I'm in here hearing
21 messages on the floor.

22 So, I'm just going to say this really clear. We
23 didn't make this a race thing. This is a race thing.
24 This is what we have to deal with on a daily basis.
25 And I'm speaking to you as a Black man who still has

1
2 to deal with this on a daily basis. We didn't make
3 this a race thing. Earlier today, Council Member
4 Banks, Council Member Ossé, Council Member Salaam,
5 and myself put out an op-ed where we explained why
6 we're going to support this overriding veto today.
7 But, what you did not hear is our personal
8 experiences that we have to deal with on the daily
9 basis. You see my mother too had to witness her son
10 being throwing it a holding cell. But, guess what? I
11 had just graduated from college. I was just looking
12 for parking for work, and I got pulled over and got
13 thrown into holding cell, just because I was Black on
14 the Upper West Side looking for parking - because
15 they thought I was casing houses. This is something
16 that we deal with on a daily basis. So, when y'all
17 say this is not a racial thing, have y'all ever
18 stepped in our shoes? I feel like I'm a reasonable
19 person. I try to talk to everyone in this council
20 here today, but when we see those red and blue lights
21 behind us, our hearts drop to our stomachs. This is
22 reality. This is something we have to deal with on
23 the daily basis. So, to the mayor, that's my brother
24 right there, a Black man, I'm never gonna be here to
25 tear him down, but we have to make sure that we're

1 working to improve our districts. But, I'm gonna tell
2 you one thing, titles and roles, we're gonna lose
3 this. We ain't never gonna lose our blackness. Ever.
4 So, we're gonna actually address the transparency and
5 accountability that's happened with the injustices in
6 the criminal justice system, with solitary
7 confinement. When you're bringing in Black people
8 back in the community worse than when they went in,
9 when you're treating them like animals, by calling
10 them animals when they're doing animal things in our
11 communities, this is why we want to address it. So, I
12 proudly vote aye to override this veto. And, thank
13 you, to all my colleagues, especially those from the
14 BLAC [TIMER CHIMES] who advocated for this. Thank you
15 so much.

17 CLERK: Council Member Rivera?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Permission to explain my
19 vote?

20 MAJORITY LEADER FARIAS: Permission granted.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: I am very proud to be a
22 member of this body today. I'd like to commend
23 Speaker Adams for her steadfast commitment for
24 defending the passage of these historic and important
25 public safety bills. I have to thank Public Advocate,

1 Williams, of course my colleagues for their
2 clarifying points and personal stories, and of
3 course, all the groups: Communities United For Police
4 Reform, Jails Action Coalition, Freedom Agenda, Halt
5 Solitary, and there are many, many others who came
6 here who wore their hearts on their sleeve and shared
7 real, harrowing stories of what they have faced. And
8 I just want to highlight that this council values our
9 partners in the NYPD and in Correction, and we
10 understand the role they play in our streets and
11 institutions. However, today we're confronting the
12 reality that our overreliance on policing and
13 incarceration to keep community safe is
14 counterproductive. And, though, comments today,
15 they've been both to empathize and antagonize, this
16 Council as a body has approached this exercise now
17 twice - with facts and with a coalition of advocates,
18 experts, and impacted people in the room at all
19 times. This council takes our holistic approach to
20 these issues very thoughtfully. We've heightened
21 investments in community based solutions to ensure
22 true public safety.

24 Over my time here, [INAUDIBLE] so acutely seen
25 and shared of criminal justice the past two years,

1
2 it's clear we have to couple funding for evidenced
3 based programming with legislative measures to
4 comprehensively implement reform. That's our duty,
5 and that is our obligation. So, while these vetoes
6 are not surprising amidst a misinformation campaign,
7 what's shocking is how we've heard from so many very
8 few facts to make their point.

9 The New York Times reported that the NYPD's Anti-
10 Crime Units are still stopping, frisking, and
11 searching too many people unlawfully - almost all of
12 them people of color - A quarter of those stops found
13 unconstitutional by a federal monitor, and again
14 because it bears repeating, [TIMER CHIMES] almost all
15 of the people are Black and Latino.

16 And with solitary, I'll just say it's archaic,
17 it's a practice that should no longer exist, it leads
18 to recidivism and even death. It's time to build a
19 better, safer, more equitable city, and I proudly
20 vote aye.

21 CLERK: Council Member Salaam

22 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAAM: Permission to explain my
23 vote?

24 MAJORITY LEADER FARIAS: Permission granted.
25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAAM: Today, I do not plan to
3 step down, but rather to step up. I vote aye, because
4 today the New York City Council is fighting for the
5 implementation of two bills that would bring
6 generational change in our criminal justice system.

7 Firstly, Introduction 586-A, also known as the
8 How many Stops Act, detractors of this bill would
9 tell you that it would create a rift between our
10 police and the communities they serve by discouraging
11 casual conversations. According to the Patrol Guide
12 published by NYPD, and language in this current bill,
13 casual conversations that build trust are encouraged.
14 Your hellos and goodbyes and requests for directions,
15 are all the very casual conversations that build
16 trust. The bill language very clearly states that
17 these sort of conversations have no need for
18 reporting. Only investigative conversations tied to
19 the possibility of crime are required to be reported.

20 If these laws were in place in 1989... [PAUSE] I
21 vote aye.

22 CLERK: Council Member Salamanca?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye on all.

24 CLERK: Council Member Sanchez?

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Permission to explain my
3 vote?

4 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Permission granted.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: [speaking foreign
6 language] [TIMER CHIMES] I vote aye on all, because
7 my community and all New Yorkers deserve public
8 servants who strive for better.

9 CLERK: Council Member Schulman?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER SCHULMAN: Permission to explain my
11 vote?

12 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Permission granted.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER SCHULMAN: Before I say what I want
14 to say, I want to thank my colleagues who have shared
15 their personal experiences today. I know it wasn't
16 easy, and I'm sure it was difficult. So, I want to
17 thank you.

18 The first tenant of government is to make people
19 feel safe, and I've always been a proponent of public
20 safety and supportive of the NYPD, especially around
21 strengthening community policing. I also understand
22 the need for accountability and transparency. I want
23 to acknowledge the speaker for her fierce advocacy
24 around this.

2 Introduction 586 will not take effect until later
3 this year, and I believe there is an opportunity for
4 the Administration and Council to work together on
5 the implementation to ensure that the important
6 transparency that is being sought occurs without
7 public safety being impeded.

8 This past weekend, I joined other Council
9 colleagues in a ride along with the NYPD, and learned
10 that separate from Introduction 586, police officers
11 are inundated with other paperwork - as was mentioned
12 by my colleague, Council Member Dinowitz - that all
13 of us should be looking to address how to digitize,
14 so our officers spend more time on the streets
15 keeping us safe. And I want to say that some of that
16 is internal to the NYPD, but a lot of it is cross-
17 systems. The officers I spoke to said that sometimes
18 their systems don't link up the DA's offices, and
19 that's something that has to be fixed, and I am
20 making a commitment to work with people to do that.
21 And with that, I vote aye on all.

22 CLERK: Council Member Stevens?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Permission to explain my
24 vote?

25 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Permission granted.

1 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Well, the beautiful thing
2 is when your name starts with an S, you have all your
3 colleagues who say things that already needed to be
4 said. So, I do want to be associated with the remarks
5 of my good friend and colleague, Kevin Riley, who as
6 people who were saying their remarks, really got
7 emotional, because the things that are being said
8 sometime hit home - like myself.

9 I want to reiterate racism does exist. We can
10 pretend that it doesn't, but it's easier when it's
11 not you who are being victimized. It's easy to say
12 those things when your community isn't the one that's
13 been being brutalized and victimized and continuously
14 having to see the struggles.

15 So, today I am happy to vote aye on all of these
16 bills, because it is not going to fix any of things
17 that we had to endure, and probably won't fix a lot
18 of the things moving forward, but it is sending a
19 signal that we as a council hear those struggles that
20 often don't get heard. We hear the people who often
21 are not the ones that we are legislating for. It
22 sends the signal that we understand our communities.
23 It sends a signal to the Police Department that this
24 is not against you or to Corrections - this is not

2 against you. This is about making sure everyone is
3 safe. It's about making sure that we all feel safe,
4 and transparency and accountability are part of that.
5 And I'm really concerned that they're going so hard
6 to not have transparency. That's what we should be
7 thinking about. Why is it that they don't want these
8 numbers recorded? Because, the reality is, is after
9 the stop-and-frisk, and they weren't underreporting
10 level threes, we wouldn't need to go down to one. So,
11 I vote aye on all.

12 CLERK: Council Member Ung?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER UNG: I vote aye on all.

14 CLERK: Council Member Vernikov?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: No on all.

16 CLERK: Council Member Williams?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I vote aye on all.

18 CLERK: Council Member Won?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER WON: Permission to explain my
20 vote?

21 MAJORITY LEADER FARIAS: Permission granted.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER WON: I just want to give a great
23 big thanks to my colleagues, Majority Leader Farias,
24 to Speaker Adams, Public Advocate Jumaane Williams,

25

1 all the cosponsors, and for those who just spoke in
2 favor of the override.
3

4 For the members of the press that are here, there
5 couldn't be a starker contrast in what has been
6 spoken in this room or in the press by the mayor. As
7 lawmakers, we are called here to legislate on behalf
8 of people, of constituents. And my constituents are
9 people who live in Queensbridge Houses, Ravenswood
10 Houses, Woodside Houses where the facts show that
11 level one stops disproportionately target our Black
12 and Latino neighbors - 97% of the stops made by the
13 mayor's new NYPD unit were of Black and brown New
14 Yorkers in 2022.

15 It is clear here who came here to make laws for
16 people and who came here to make laws in convenience
17 of the NYPD. We are not here to make your lives
18 easier as NYPD officers or any government agent. We
19 are here to make the lives safer and easier for the
20 people we represent, especially our Black and brown
21 neighbors, and especially our siblings who are
22 sitting here in this very room with fathers who have
23 been incarcerated, with brothers who have been
24 incarcerated, especially Black and brown brothers.
25 As an AAPI woman, as an immigrant, as a mother, I

2 will never ever, ever allow my lighter skin, and the
3 shape of my eyes, and the co-opting of the model
4 minorityment to weaponize AAPIs against my Black and
5 brown neighbors. It is not acceptable, and we are
6 going to continue to stand here in solidarity. And
7 I'm proud to vote aye on both to make sure that we
8 end solitary confinement as well as How Many Stops,
9 so that we have transparency and accountability,
10 because I did not come here to make NYPD officers'
11 lives easier. I came here to keep them accountable.
12 Thank you.

13 CLERK: Council Member Yeger?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: No

15 CLERK: Council Member Zhuang?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ZHUANG: No, but I want to explain
17 my vote.

18 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Permission granted.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ZHUANG: I want to thank my
20 coworkers here who worked on this bill, but for my
21 district, I happen to have knocked on thousands of
22 doors last year, the first priority in my district is
23 the public safety. In my district, people want to
24 support police officers. In my district, one out of
25 three people have experienced hate. And as an Asian,

1 I have experienced hate crimes in my district also.
2
3 When we talk about lives we lost, we forget to talk
4 about the lives of policer officers that were lost.
5 In 2024 (sic), December 20th, we lost two fathers,
6 two brothers, Detective Wenjian Liu, who is Asian,
7 and Detective Rafael Ramos, who is Latino. Their
8 lives were lost in the line of duty. No one ever
9 mentioned that. I have helped their families ever
10 since; I know how much they went through in their
11 lives. No one gave them a chance to fill out their
12 paperwork. Rather than require more paperwork, we
13 should focus on increasing NYPD's budget to hire more
14 police officers, which is a call to action support by
15 the overwhelming majority of my constituents.

16 Therefore, I am supporting the mayor's veto. And I
17 also, I want to say that in Chinese. (speaking
18 foreign language) [TIMER CHIMES] Thank you

19 CLERK: Council Member Borelli?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: I vote no.

21 CLERK: Council Member Farías?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIÁS: The How Many Stops Act
23 does not get in the way of police work, nor is it a
24 hindrance to our safety. Rather, it is an essential
25 part of keeping our communities safe for years to

1
2 come. I hear consistently from New Yorkers in my
3 district, and across all five boroughs, about how
4 they want good police officers as well as strenuous
5 and objective oversight. I, along with the majority
6 of my colleagues, truly believe this bill satisfies
7 both of those requirements, and this is why I will be
8 voting yes today. And in Español [speaking foreign
9 language] I vote aye on all.

10 CLERK: Speaker Adams?

11 SPEAKER ADAMS: I vote aye.

12 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: All items on today's
13 General Order Calendar are adopted by a vote of 42 in
14 the affirmative, 9 in the negative, and 0
15 abstentions, so the ayes do have it this time.

16 Introduction and Reading of Bills?

17 CLERK: None

18 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Thank you, there are no
19 resolutions on today's calendar, so we will now move
20 into General Discussion. And I am calling on my
21 colleague, Council Member Powers.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Thank you. I know it's
23 been a long day, so I will keep it brief. I just did
24 want to say a few words about my former colleague,
25 and a very good friend of mine, Paul Vallone, who we

1 lost this Sunday. For those who served with him, he
2 was an extraordinary guy, a great colleague, and
3 somebody who I think is a great model for a lot of us
4 as we do this job, very difficult job every day. I've
5 known Paul even before I got a chance the serve with
6 him. I've known his family for years, I know the
7 speaker and others also had the privilege to serve
8 with him, and the loss of him is a loss to the city.
9 Obviously he was serving this city in a job in the
10 Department of Veteran Affairs, but is a person that I
11 think many of us could look to for a good laugh, for
12 a great colleague, and somebody who really cared
13 deeply about this city and his district. And, of
14 course, that goes all the way back to his father in
15 the service - and actually his grandfather and the
16 service they provided to this city. So, he was a gem
17 of human being. I keep using that term, because it's
18 really true, and it's the one thing that I really
19 think it encapsulates Paul. And I want to send my
20 condolences out to his entire family, the Vallones,
21 and the Constantinoples, and everyone that had the
22 opportunity, the special opportunity, to get to know
23 Paul. He'll be deeply, deeply missed, and I hope all
24 us can carry a little bit of his spirit into this job
25

1 every single day, so we will miss you, Paul, thank
2 you.
3

4 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: I now call on Public
5 Advocate Jumaane Williams.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you so much. By
7 the way, I don't know if I'm the only surprised that
8 Council Member Ossé speaks Mandarin, that really blew
9 me away, and everybody seemed like they were just
10 cool with it, but that was pretty dope.

11 Congratulations to everyone. I did want to just
12 say, uh, to some of my colleagues who I heard speak
13 today, and particularly colleagues who have less
14 melanin in their skin and described their individual
15 experiences. I don't and cannot take away from those
16 individual experiences, I believe them to be real,
17 but what I need folks to stop doing is trying to use
18 individual experiences to try to take away community
19 affect from other people. I really need you to stop
20 doing that and to understand the impact that many of
21 these policies are trying to undo have on Black and
22 brown communities. Those community impacts are just
23 as real, and understand that what you are describing
24 is such... the impact of us having the same
25 experience is multiplied. I need you to understand

1 that, because of being Black and brown - it is just
2 true - from solitary to stops, to a Black woman
3 giving birth. It is just a true statement, so please
4 understand that. Yes, our communities often ask for
5 additional law-enforcement to feel safe. One, they
6 ask for many other things, and nobody seems to hear
7 like housing, like better food, like better... just
8 nurses in school... they ask for a lot of things that
9 we seem not to hear. But, the trauma of being Black
10 in America means that when they ask for those things,
11 they also ask for their nephews, sons, and folks they
12 know to not be stopped incessantly, to not be treated
13 unfairly. All of those things we hold, and all of
14 those things we are trying to address, and they are
15 complex. But, when we are trying to address them,
16 please do not pretend somehow we don't [TIMER CHIMES]
17 understand what our own constituents and all our
18 families are asking us. We very much do and it is
19 difficult. So, please believe us when we explain who
20 we are, what we're going through in our experiences.

22 Lastly, unless I just want to associate myself
23 with Council Member Powers in the words he spoke
24 about Council Member Paul Malone, he may have voted
25 against us, but he would've done it with an awesome

1
2 smile, and I'm gonna miss that smile. Thank you so
3 much.

4 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Council Member Mealy?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Yes, I too want to send my
6 condolences to Paul Vallone's family. He served with
7 me also, and that's one thing our public advocate
8 said, he would do it but you have a beautiful smile,
9 and that's what I'm going take back always from him.
10 And I want to also... One of my mentors, Howard
11 Golden, an American lawyer, and a politician in the
12 Democratic Party of Brooklyn who has served as the
13 borough president of... the 16th borough president of
14 Brooklyn, and was a chair of the Democratic party in
15 Brooklyn, and I must say, Honorable Howard Golden
16 always served... and he served on the New York City
17 Council just as well. So, we have to honor him. And
18 I wanted to just let you know that was a mentor to me
19 when I... when he gave me a proclamation, right after
20 he gave me the proclamation, I asked for funding and
21 that was the first funding I got in the city. And
22 that helped my basketball team, that helped my
23 community garden. So, I hope we continue being
24 servants like that, to give, to make sure that we can
25 keep our young people safe and off the streets, and

2 my condolences to both of these families. And
3 congratulations, Speaker, and this body on the
4 passing of this legislation, thank you.

5 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Seeing no one else in
6 line to speak, I will now call on Speaker Adrienne
7 Adams to close out today's Stated Meeting.

8 SPEAKER ADAMS: Thank you, Majority Leader. The
9 1:30 p.m. Stated Meeting of January 30, 2024 is
10 hereby adjourned, thank you, colleagues. (NO GAVEL
11 HEARD)

12 [APPLAUSE]

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date February 8, 2024