

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

-----X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

-----X

August 25, 2010
Start: 10:36 am
Recess: 11:11 am

HELD AT: Hearing Room
 250 Broadway, 14th Fl.

B E F O R E: LEROY G. COMRIE, JR.
 Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:
 Maria del Carmen Arroyo
 Charles Barron
 Inez E. Dickens
 Daniel R. Garodnick
 Sara M. Gonzalez
 Robert Jackson
 Rosie Mendez
 Annabel Palma
 Diana Reyna
 Joel Rivera
 James Sanders, Jr.
 Larry B. Seabrook
 James Vacca

A P P E A R A N C E S

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Albert Vann
Brad S. Lander
Stephen T. Levin
Mark S. Weprin
Jumaane D. Williams
Daniel J. Halloran III
Vincent M. Ignizio
Peter A. Koo

1
2 CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: We're going to
3 start the Land Use Committee meeting for August
4 25th, 2010. We have Council Member Williams,
5 Council Member Mendez, Council Member Garodnick,
6 Council Member Koo, Council Member Barron, Council
7 Member James, Council Member Seabrook, Council
8 Member Vann, Council Member Arroyo, Council Member
9 Rivera, Council Member Palma, Council Member
10 Vacca, Council Member Ignizio, Council Member
11 Levin, Council Member Weprin and Council Member
12 Lander. I believe we have quorum.

13 Again, we are here to vote on all
14 of the items related to the 15 Penn Plaza project
15 in Manhattan Community 5. It's Land Use items
16 number 159-163. There are restrictive
17 declarations and amendments to the zoning to be
18 considered. It's items C 100047 ZMN, N 10048 ZRM,
19 C 100049 ZSM, C 100050 ZSM, and C 100237 PQM.

20 Again, as I had stated earlier, for
21 the committee, I would recommend that we actually
22 vote the project. I think the issues that I
23 raised; I did get a letter from Vornado last
24 night. Their individual policy for MWBE to have a
25 45 percent personnel, women and minority owned,

1
2 women to consider themselves in MWBE category.
3 Their management level is 33 percent MWBE
4 identified as minorities as women.

5 The reasons that I was hesitating
6 is because members who I respect and trust and
7 actually agree with were raising issues regarding
8 opportunities that should be delineated in this
9 project, not just for the contracting and the
10 construction phase but in the procurement phase
11 and the actual issues regarding affordability for
12 the project once it's built for people that would
13 want to have office space there or hold meetings
14 there, for opportunities for procurement across
15 the board.

16 The reason I'm recommending a yes
17 vote is because of Vornado's record of MWBE. It's
18 above the normal numbers. I think that as a major
19 plan in the city, they will have a commitment to
20 working with us to get the project done so we can
21 create opportunity for all city residents.

22 I think, again, on the project, I
23 personally think that this city is ever evolving
24 and ever changing. I think that this project will
25 be a unique and iconic addition our ever evolving

1
2 city. So therefore, I recommend an aye vote.

3 Councilman Barron has a comment.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: First, Mr.
5 Chair, let me say that a development in a city is
6 really not about buildings, it's not about the
7 skyline, it's not about what view you can have
8 physically, it's about people. With 65 percent of
9 this city being people of color now, this project
10 represents the continuing vision of the mayor to
11 continue to develop this city for the rich and
12 particularly for white, wealthy developers.

13 When you look at the end product of
14 this project, I will guarantee you, although
15 they're not guaranteeing people of color much, I
16 will guarantee you that not a single black or
17 Latino business will be able to afford the rent in
18 that building.

19 I will guarantee you there will be
20 no commercial space available, no office space
21 available for blacks and Latinos and Asians and
22 struggling women that can afford to be in that
23 building. That's the end product, even if they
24 give you something for building, even if they
25 provide jobs for building it. Even if you have

1

2

some unionized jobs for the security.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

For them to come to the Council at the last minute with this new Vornado agreement, a goal of 15 percent for minority and women contracting, and that's just a goal. They have to meet certain criteria, what would be the capacity for that. And then to shove this in committee members' faces at the last minute while we're voting is bogus, it's nonsense.

11

12

13

14

15

But our committee members, blacks and Latinos and Asians in particular, we can't just be upset. You have the power to vote it down. We can't be pushed by no time limit. Vote it down.

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

This is a project for the rich. This is a project that excludes us. These goals here are bogus. Most of the develop in this city, whether it was Columbia University and all of their promises, Yankee Stadium and the promises of jobs never came through. The Nets arena, promises never came through.

23

24

25

Now we're sitting here allowing them to erect a 67-story building that none of us people of color will be able to afford to do

1
2 anything in that building, rent office space or
3 commercial space, and then they don't even want to
4 give you the respect to have something decent for
5 the building of it and permanent jobs in it.

6 We have to learn to use the power
7 we have in our hands. We're representing the
8 majority of the people in this city. Sixty-five
9 percent of this city is black, Latino and Asian.
10 And we're supposed to have a progressive caucus
11 looking out for working class families, but we
12 continue to complain about these projects and then
13 give them your vote and say we will try to work
14 with them afterwards.

15 Once you give up your power, it is
16 over. Once you give up your power, it is over.
17 Now is the time to act. We should vote this
18 project down and make them come in with some
19 guarantees that this project is going to benefit
20 not only during the building period, but after
21 it's built it will benefit the new majority in
22 this city and that's people of color.

23 So, you know, when it comes to my
24 turn to vote, I'm definitely voting this down and
25 I would encourage my colleagues don't get upset,

1

2 get strong and vote it down.

3

CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Council

4

Members have to leave. Council Member Lander

5

needs to vote. Did anyone else want to make a

6

comment? Council Member Vacca and Council Member

7

Lander have to vote right now. We all have other

8

meetings we need to be at.

9

Again, I just want to reemphasize

10

what I said and maybe even make it clearer. This

11

committee needs to hold a hearing on the issues

12

that have been raised. I will charge myself at

13

fault for not having it done before this vote was

14

done. Again, I'll apologize for dropping the ball

15

and making sure that I didn't.

16

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Well vote

17

it down. Vote it down.

18

CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Again, let me

19

finish.

20

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Don't give

21

them the vote and then hold hearings.

22

CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: I think that

23

this company will be able to do everything we need

24

it to do if we sit down and work on it together.

25

They have shown a record of higher percentages of

1
2 compliance and it's not a company that's going
3 away.

4 On the merits, on the individual
5 project, we have not brought these standards. So
6 it's really part of our fault too that we have not
7 had these discussions in this committee before in
8 raising the level. That's something that I'll
9 charge myself at fault for not making it earlier.
10 I had planned to make it part of our fall agenda,
11 frankly, to deal with MWBE, to deal with community
12 benefits.

13 Council Member Lander has to vote
14 and Council Member Vacca because he's chairing a
15 meeting. Council Member Lander, go ahead.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: With deep
17 reservations and appreciation for your leadership
18 on this issue, aye.

19 CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Council Member
20 Vacca.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I vote aye.

22 CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Who else had
23 to vote? Council Member Ignizio and Council
24 Member Barron?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: Council

1

2 Member Ignizio voting aye.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Council

4 Member Rivera voting aye.

5 CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: I agree with

6 you. I just know that I think we still have

7 opportunities to impact and affect this project

8 once we think about it and work together seriously

9 on it. We still have power on this issue. With

10 that, I recommend an aye vote by the committee.

11 CAROL SHINE: Carol Shine, Counsel

12 to the committee. Chair Comrie?

13 CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Aye.

14 CAROL SHINE: Council Member Reyna?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: I vote aye

16 and I have received the document and I'm reviewing

17 it. We hope to continue this discussion.

18 Chairman Comrie, concerning MWBE

19 and employment practices, not just with this one

20 project. We're not referring to one project or

21 picking on a project. But we have significant

22 development happening throughout the city of New

23 York and there needs to be further transparency on

24 all of these projects so that it can benefit all

25 New Yorkers throughout the city of New York.

1

2

That's the discussion that is way overdue.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

I look forward to being a part of that discussion as opposed to finding out or trying to create last minute agreements that perhaps may or may not work. Right now, this particular document has certain provisions but we still don't know what monitoring mechanisms will guarantee that this will be followed through.

This, unlike other projects that have public subsidies, this is a private application with private commitments and we want to make sure that they honor that private commitment of MWBE contacting opportunities as well as employment opportunities, especially within chronically unemployed zip codes. Thank you very much.

CAROL SHINE: Council Member Barron?

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Well, you know, we keep giving away the city to the rich and when you complain and then give it up and give up your power, they don't have to do anything after this. If they're not doing anything now, not having a vote, what makes you think they're going

1

2

to do something after you give it to them? The only time they're going to understand us and respect us is when we stand up and use the power we have and say no. We can still do that at the Stated Meeting. I hope you change your mind.

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

A progressive caucus of 13 blacks and Latino and Asians, 27, and we can't stick it to folks sometimes and say no, you're not going to disrespect us. We're not going to allow you to have a discriminatory practice and promise us things that never come through with these developers. Stop giving up your power. Say no. I vote no.

15

16

17

CAROL SHINE: Council Member Jackson? Not here. Okay. Council Member Sanders?

18

19

20

COUNCIL MEMBER SANDERS: Pass.
CAROL SHINE: Council Member Seabrook?

21

22

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER SEABROOK: Pass.
CAROL SHINE: Council Member Vann?
COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: I'd like to explain my vote. Council Member Comrie, I don't think you are the blame. You're taking some

1
2 responsibility. There's some things you felt that
3 you could have done and perhaps you could. But
4 the first cause is not your cause.

5 The first cause is that an entity
6 as large as Vornado, as experienced as Vornado
7 came before this body, this City Council, which is
8 primarily black and Latino in number, came before
9 committee. We'd had significant representation of
10 the black and Latino and Asian community in the
11 city.

12 They presented a plan that the
13 magnitude of this plan rivaling, if you will, the
14 iconic Empire State Building and there was no
15 thought of how black and Latino people will be
16 involved in this project in any dimension. Forty-
17 five percent of your employees you say are
18 minority; three of the nine in top leadership you
19 say are either women or minority. You mean you
20 don't know which those three are.

21 There is no influence in the whole
22 Vornado organization you say coming before the
23 City Council there must be some sensitivity to
24 those of us who happen to be African American,
25 Latino and so forth. If someone came in from

1
2 another planet and was here without
3 representation, they wouldn't know that we existed
4 in New York City. There's something wrong with
5 that. I raised the issue yesterday. I was really
6 dumbfounded. I didn't really know what to say
7 because I just couldn't believe that this was
8 happening in New York City.

9 Then I was told that there would be
10 a response. I saw a letter yesterday that said
11 hardly anything. Then I was told that they were
12 going to come with something more comprehensive
13 and perhaps more concrete. Maybe this is it. I
14 don't read that fast, I must admit. I'm sorry. I
15 have no idea what this really does.

16 So therefore, there's no way I
17 could in good conscience represent not just my
18 community, the city of New York, and I don't think
19 they would want me to vote aye on something that I
20 have no knowledge of what's in it. So because of
21 that, I abstain. I hope that there will be
22 something that will give me some confidence that
23 everybody is going to be included in this
24 prosperity.

25 We're in a recession. People don't

1
2 have jobs. People are losing their homes. We're
3 going to come with a major project which I would
4 support. I'm not caught up in the iconic struggle
5 between the Empire State Building and this
6 proposed building. No, I don't have a problem
7 with that. We need jobs. We need commerce. We
8 need to improve the economy of New York City and
9 so forth. I'm down with that.

10 But everybody has to share and
11 there has to be something in the plan that
12 guarantees that everybody's going to be a part of
13 it. Based on that, I abstain.

14 CAROL SHINE: Council Member
15 Gonzales?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GONZALEZ: I vote
17 aye. But also, I'm just adding that there be
18 further discussion in respect to contracting with
19 MWBE and employment opportunities, in respect to
20 the economy and the state that we're in. So many
21 people are out of work in the city of New York.
22 So for a project of this scale, it's really
23 important that on record it stand that yes, I'm
24 voting aye, understanding that there will be
25 further discussions on that issue. Thank you.

1

2

CAROL SHINE: Council Member Palma?

3

COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: I vote aye.

4

CAROL SHINE: Council Member

5

Arroyo?

6

COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Aye.

7

CAROL SHINE: Council Member

8

Garodnick?

9

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

10

CAROL SHINE: Council Member

11

Mendez?

12

COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Thank you

13

for anticipating my question, Mr. Chair.

14

Permission to explain my vote. I'd like to be

15

associated with the comments of my colleagues in

16

the subcommittee, Daniel Garodnick and Diana

17

Reyna. I have major concerns and I will be voting

18

in favor, having faith in my chair and in the

19

members of the City Council to go back and make

20

this MWBE better than what it is.

21

Just to my colleague, Robert

22

Jackson, I am a Christian, but Mother Theresa does

23

not persuade me as a reason. And actually I'd

24

probably vote against this project because I

25

thought the owners of the Empire State Building

1
2 did the correct thing by not putting Mother
3 Theresa and lighting it up for her. I don't think
4 religious figures should be honored in a building
5 in that way. But anyway, I vote aye. Thank you.

6 CAROL SHINE: Council Member Levin?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Permission
8 to explain my vote. I just want to associate my
9 comments with the comments of my colleagues
10 regarding MWBE. It is my sincere hope that
11 Vornado will be keeping to its word and doing
12 everything within its ability. It's my
13 understanding that its abilities are great and
14 they have the financial capacity to make
15 significant concessions and engage very deeply in
16 a full discussion on minority and women owned
17 businesses.

18 So it's my sincere hope that these
19 discussions continue past this vote, that they
20 don't walk away from commitments that they are
21 making. With that, I vote aye.

22 CAROL SHINE: Council Member
23 Weprin?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Aye.

25 CAROL SHINE: Council Member

1

2 Williams?

3

4

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: May I be
excused to explain my vote?

5

CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Yes.

6

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I'm
blessed and highly favored because I have a very
good job. But I do not forget that a lot of
people who look like me are not as blessed and
highly favored, to the tune about 52 percent, much
higher than the national average. That concerns
me.

13

14

15

16

17

I've only been elected for a few
months, but I do know that this issue has come up
more than once, twice, 12, 15 times and not much
has been done about it. I've seen the most recent
MWBE report. It is atrociously abysmal, period.

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

That means nothing has been done
about it. I do know that each time 1, 2, or 12
times it's come up, it has been said we will do
something about it. The hearings have been held.
We vote it through and we'll try to work on it
after. I'm very concerned that that hasn't
worked.

25

I'm even more concerned now that

1

2

the people who have these issues and whose communities are affected are now in the majority of the City Council and for some reason still can't get it done. That concerns me very, very, very, very much.

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

I haven't had an opportunity to read this. So I'm going to abstain and take a look and see what's going on. But it concerns me if the same rhetoric continues while the people who have the concerns and the people whose communities have the concern are in the majority. It makes absolutely no sense. This is something we have to take seriously and make sure it happens. I abstain.

16

CAROL SHINE: Council Member

17

Jackson?

18

COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Thank you.

19

I reiterate what I said earlier in the Zoning

20

Committee concerning all of the issues that I

21

raised. My position is the same. With that, I

22

vote yes.

23

CAROL SHINE: Council Member

24

Halloran?

25

COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN: Can I be

1

2 excused to explain my vote? Let me say that I am
3 going to vote aye because it's a project that I
4 think the city needs. But I am incredibly moved
5 by the statement of, believe it or not, Charles
6 Barron who quite eloquently indicated what the
7 problem is in the City Council as a whole. We
8 don't exercise our abilities and our prerogatives
9 preemptively and we don't put sufficient pressure
10 on City Hall to make sure that the concessions are
11 given upfront.

12 While I am voting aye on this, I
13 would strongly encourage my friends on the other
14 side of the aisle to start to look to do that
15 because I think you have an ability right now to
16 really press some issues, to make the city more
17 responsive to your needs and to actually get
18 things accomplished in a whole different light. I
19 think if you did that preemptively, I think our
20 chairman is an incredible example of leadership
21 but I think that we could do a lot more. I think
22 that in the future we should be looking to do
23 those kinds of things.

24 You're right; we do have the power
25 here to hold these things up. We do have the

1
2 power to put pressure on only before our vote, not
3 after our vote. While this is a private
4 enterprise I support, I understand exactly what
5 you're saying and I agree with you wholeheartedly
6 that our power is best used when it's exercised
7 preemptively and not post-emptively.

8 I think you have some legitimate
9 concerns for both the employment condition in the
10 city and the level to which private industry and
11 the city has paid attention to the needs of
12 certain groups in our community. For that, I may
13 be one of those people in a community that is
14 doing a little bit better, but that doesn't mean I
15 don't understand. So I'll vote aye.

16 CAROL SHINE: Council Member Koo?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Permission to
18 explain my vote? Being a minority myself and a
19 first generation immigrant, I fully understand my
20 colleagues' different positions. I think if we're
21 here all day long, there's no use now. We
22 understand every project they agreed to give
23 minority women business a 15 percent chance. But
24 in reality very few minority companies get
25 contracts in big projects. Why? Because we

1

2 didn't do enough.

3

4 All the minority companies, when
5 they apply for these big jobs, they don't fulfill
6 the requirements because they're too small. So at
7 the city level, we have to make sure we do some
8 fundamental changes at the basic level. Like the
9 building trade have to open up their systems and
10 let more minority get into the program. Right now
11 in the city there are very few minority members.
12 You can name only a few. There are 2,000 licenses
13 but how many of them belong to minority
14 businesses? None, or maybe a very few, I can't
15 say none.

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

25 But we have to do fundamental
changes at the city level to help minority
construction people to get licenses, to teach them
how to apply for these big projects or even be a
part of these big projects. For a long time we
just talked. All these other big projects, when
they go to the City Council, they promise us this
but at the end I don't see any minority companies
being hired to do the work.

So I encourage my colleagues, from
now on we find ways to encourage the building

1
2 trade, the unions to open up the systems and let
3 more minority people in the union as licensed
4 plumbers, electricians and then that way we have
5 more minority companies having contracts. That is
6 my concern. I vote yes for this.

7 CAROL SHINE: Council Member
8 Dickens?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Permission
10 to explain my vote.

11 CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Your mike's
12 not on.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Thank you.
14 I apologize for my lateness. But I did want to
15 read an MWBE plan that has been submitted by
16 Vornado because of the issues that I had and my
17 colleagues had concerning MWBE and the inclusion
18 of minority businesses. I realize that Vornado
19 had originally discussed the staffing, which I'm
20 not interested in that. We're interested in who
21 the contractors are.

22 As part of this plan, the MWBE,
23 there is a minimum award of 15 percent of the
24 total value of the construction trade contracts,
25 which will include subcontracts and material

1
2 suppliers. So that's a very important component
3 because that was the issue that my colleague and
4 the chair, Leroy Comrie as well as Council Member
5 Al Vann had raised. That had not been addressed.
6 But now I've got something in writing that
7 addresses that particular issue.

8 Now, in saying that, and I am going
9 to vote yes for this. But in so saying that, I'm
10 going to ask the chair to continue to work with
11 Vornado that aside from the construction, which is
12 very important, the permanent jobs that might come
13 out of this as well as there are other soft costs
14 that will be a part.

15 I realize that it's such a large
16 firm, but there are legal services, there are
17 architectural and engineering as well as, a very
18 important, is insurance. A piece could be broken
19 off for minority insurance brokers to get a piece
20 of this. This is very important.

21 This is a large project. The 15
22 percent is commendable, but there are some
23 additional things that must be incorporated that
24 are usually not taken into consideration when the
25 City Council votes on projects of this size. So I

1
2 do vote yes and I did want apprise my colleagues
3 in case it had not come out about the fact that we
4 now have from Vornado, who I don't always have the
5 best relationship with, I will admit, but with
6 this they have put this in writing. Thank you and
7 I vote aye.

8 CAROL SHINE: Council Member
9 Sanders?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER SANDERS: Permission
11 to explain my vote. As an aside, let me say that
12 it's sad that we couldn't get life for Mother
13 Theresa. There's something wrong with this
14 fundamental conversation that we're having.
15 There's something wrong that we even have to have
16 this conversation.

17 May I remind people that New York
18 City is a majority minority city? Meaning that
19 we're close to 70 percent people of color and
20 we're setting a goal of 15 percent, a goal,
21 meaning that we may not get there, meaning that we
22 may get to 2 percent. A goal.

23 I've looked at the document as
24 quick as I could. May I remind people that I am
25 the prime author of New York City's MWBE program?

1
2 I know this stuff. This is a tepid response to a
3 need, a very tepid response. We can't go on like
4 this. That we even have to have this conversation
5 means that dialogue needs to take place. The we
6 have to understand that New York City has changed
7 and there is a new New York here and that
8 greatness comes in every color.

9 Now we're not asking for anyone to
10 take a loss on any contract. We're saying that
11 everybody black, white or whatever has to get to
12 the same starting point, has to be able to do the
13 job, has to be able to do it as well as anyone
14 else; an even playing field, no more, but no less.
15 We are talking about something that the goal of 15
16 percent reveals that we may not be as committed as
17 we need to be in New York to a diverse city.

18 However, I've had the opportunity
19 to do dialogue with some of the people around this
20 issue of Vornado. I've been assured that this
21 conversation is not the end of this conversation
22 and that they are willing to go and grow and build
23 beyond what we are simply speaking here.

24 In the hope that this is true and
25 the desire that this is true and with the great

1
2 respect that I have of the people of Vornado and
3 of the people who are advocating in favor of them,
4 I'm going to vote yes. But I am going to do my
5 utmost to ensure that New York is New York for
6 everybody. That the days that there was only one
7 New York and if you weren't that type it was over.
8 New York has to be New York for everybody.

9 That's all we're asking for, an
10 even playing field, an honest day's work for an
11 honest day's pay. That sounds like American ideas
12 to me. So why don't we practice American ideas in
13 New York City too. It's sad when our contractors
14 can do better in Selma, Alabama than they can do
15 in New York City. Something is wrong here and we
16 shouldn't continue this. With a step towards
17 solving this, I vote yes and let the dialogue
18 begin, a real dialogue. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

19 CAROL SHINE: Council Member
20 Seabrook?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER SEABROOK: Thank
22 you, Mr. Chair. To explain my vote, as I
23 indicated that we look at the level of
24 unemployment in this city and the level of
25 unemployment for African American and Latino males

1
2 in this city, it's atrocious. But I think that
3 this discussion that we're having around MWBE is
4 very important and I want to thank the chair and I
5 want to thank Council Member Al Vann for really
6 bringing this to light to have a discussion around
7 this issue. This is probably the lengthiest
8 discussion that we've had around this issue.

9 I think that one of the things that
10 I would hope, and having the opportunity to talk
11 to a person who is affiliated with the group and
12 knowing him and knowing what he stands for and the
13 commitment that I know that he has in terms of
14 dealing with these issues that we discuss, gives
15 me a sense of hope.

16 But I think that there's a point
17 that people need to understand that's most
18 important of what Councilwoman Inez Dickens has
19 raised. In many cases, we associate the jobs and
20 the union jobs with MWBE. That's not MWBE.
21 That's employment for people and everybody who
22 needs a job should get a job. That's employment
23 for people. MWBE is how you're going to deal with
24 minority and women owned businesses, who in most
25 cases employ minority people and therefore giving

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

them and opportunity.

She raised the issue, and I would hope that people will understand, about when you're doing this as it relates to business, insurance and all those areas, architectural work, the electrical work and all of those things where this development takes place and there are zero opportunities that exist for minority participation. Let me remind you that zero is a quota too. So we need to understand that. It's important that we understand when we talk about minority and women owned business how best do we deal with that.

I understand this is a private entity, but there's a responsibility that we all have because we use public sewers and we use public sidewalks and we use public lighting. So it's private in one sense but the use of our dollars in another sense.

So I would hope that in this dialogue that Councilman Vann and yourself be an instrumental part in making his happen to allow this to exist. So therefore, I will vote aye and I will continue to raise these issues. As you

1
2 know, Mr. Chairman, I've been raising these issues
3 for eight years at this committee level. Every
4 time that these projects have come up, I've said
5 the same thing for eight years and I will continue
6 to say that as long as I'm here. Thank you very
7 much, Mr. Chair.

8 CAROL SHINE: By a vote of 19 in
9 the affirmative, one in the negative and two
10 abstentions, LU 159, 160, 161, 162, and 163 are
11 approved. Please sign the reports.

12 CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: With that, we
13 will now close the Land Use meeting. I appreciate
14 all of the comments made by all the members.
15 There will be direct follow up with Vornado before
16 the full council meeting later today. Meeting is
17 adjourned.

C E R T I F I C A T E

I, Donna Hintze certify that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

Signature 

Date September 9, 2010