

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

STATED MEETING

----- X

November 14, 2019

Start: 1:22 p.m.

Recess: 4:18 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: Corey Johnson
Speaker

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Adrienne E. Adams
Alicka Ampry-Samuel
Diana Ayala
Inez D. Barron
Joseph C. Borelli
Justin Brannan
Fernando Cabrera
Margaret S. Chin
Costa Constantinides
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
Laurie A. Cumbo
Chaim M. Deutsch
Ruben Diaz, Sr.
Daniel Dromm
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.
Mathieu Eugene
Vanessa L. Gibson
Mark Gjonaj
Barry Grodenchik
Robert Holden

Ben Kallos
Andy King
Peter Koo
Karen Koslowitz
Rory I. Lancman
Brad Lander
Stephen T. Levin
Mark Levine
Farah Louis
Alan N. Maisel
Steven Matteo
Carlos Menchaca
I. Daneek Miller
Francisco Moya
Bill Perkins
Keith Powers
Antonio Reynoso
Donovan J. Richards
Carlina Rivera
Ydanis Rodriguez
Deborah Rose
Helen K. Rosenthal
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.
Ritchie J. Torres
Mark Treyger
Eric A. Ulrich
Paul Vallone
Jimmy Van Bramer
Kalman Yeger

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

1 HERONE DOLTE: Test, test. This is the
2 Stated Meeting. Today's date is November 14, 2019.
3 This recording is being recorded by Herone Dolte.

4 FERNANDO CABRERA: Well, ladies and
5 gentleman, what a joy to introduce to you alongside
6 with our Majority Leader I the house, Council Member
7 Cumbo. Thrive Collective research has proven that
8 art and music programs help keep young people in
9 school, make them more committed, enhanced
10 collaboration, strengthen ties to their peers and to
11 their community, and improve motor, spatial, and
12 language skills. At-risk students involved in art
13 are significantly more likely to stay in school and
14 ultimately get college degrees. Yet more than 400
15 public schools in New York City's lowest income areas
16 have no art program at all. Thrive Collective, the
17 nonprofit organization, formerly known as 20/20
18 Vision for School, has garnered support from numerous
19 City Council members to restore art programs in many
20 public schools city. Thrive Collective offers
21 programs in instrumental, vocal music, mural
22 painting, and filmmaking through the expertise of
23 teaching artists, mentors, volunteers, and interns,
24 as well as mentorship programs. In fiscal year 20 a
25

2 dozen council members have provided 18 awards that
3 are collectively funding two art festivals, 18
4 murals, two media programs, and two music programs at
5 18 schools, one senior center, and one business
6 district. Thrive has leveraged City Council
7 investment to directly serve 13,000 students in
8 nearly 100 schools in 36 council districts, and I
9 believe mine was the first one, right? The very
10 first one. Mobilize 2500 volunteers from 120 partner
11 organizations and businesses completed 145 murals,
12 totaling 60,000 square feet of public art produced
13 over 150 festivals, assemblies, and events and Jeremy
14 Del Rio, you've been a true champion, you've been a
15 leader. I remember when you first got started. You
16 started with a dream and literally with 20/20 vision
17 and just to see it grow to the level it is today is
18 simply amazing. And with that I want to turn it over
19 now to the City Clerk for the reading of the
20 proclamation.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Council City of New York
22 Proclamation. The New York City Council is proud to
23 honor Thrive Collective for its exceptional work
24 creating hope and opportunity through arts and
25 mentoring in New York City public schools. And

2 whereas research has prove that art and music
3 programs help keep young people in school, make them
4 more committed, enhance collaboration, strengthen
5 ties to their peers and to their community, and
6 improve motor, spatial, and language skills. At-risk
7 students involved in art are significantly more
8 likely to stay in school and ultimately to get
9 college degrees. Yet more than 400 public schools in
10 New York City's lowest-income areas have no arts
11 program at al. Thrive Collective, the nonprofit
12 organization formerly known as 20/20 Vision for
13 Schools, has garnered support from numerous City
14 Council members to restore arts programs in many
15 schools citywide. And whereas Thrive Collective
16 offers programs in instrumental and vocal music,
17 mural painting, and filmmaking through the expertise
18 of teaching artists, mentors, volunteers, and
19 interns, as well as a mentorship program. These
20 programs connect artists and youth workers with local
21 schools as teaching artists, art directors, and
22 mentors, project-based learning, and accredited
23 curriculum integrate life and art skills for in-
24 school electives, after-school clubs, seasonal
25 intensives, and weekend warriors. And whereas since

2 2014 18 New York City Council members have helped
3 Thrive Collective bring the arts back to underserved
4 students and neighborhoods by sponsoring Thrive's
5 murals, music, and media programs at 42 schools and
6 community spaces in all five boroughs. To date the
7 council has directly invested in students and seniors
8 completing 46 murals, 45 student films, seven film
9 festivals, 10 concerts and recitals, and over 60
10 ribbon-cutting events in school assemblies and the
11 annual Queens Heartburn Festival. And whereas in
12 fiscal year 20 a dozen council members have provided
13 18 awards that are collectively funding two art
14 festivals, 18 murals, two media programs, and two
15 music programs in 18 schools, one senior center, and
16 one business district. Thrive Collective has
17 leveraged City Council investments to directly serve
18 3000 students in nearly 1000 schools and 36 council
19 districts, mobilize 2500 volunteers from 120 partner
20 organizations and businesses, complete 145 murals
21 totaling 60,000 square feet of public art, produce
22 over 150 festivals, assemblies, and events. And
23 whereas for Thrive Collective, however, art education
24 is less about murals, music, and media than the
25 offering a creative process to help students find

2 their voice, cultivate their vision, and develop the
3 art and life skills to bring that vision to life in
4 collaboration with others. Thrive Collective has
5 truly excelled in this important mission and we wish
6 it continued success in the years ahead. Now
7 therefore be it known that the New York City Council
8 gratefully honors Thrive Collective for its
9 outstanding commitment and contributions to arts
10 education in New York City public schools. Corey
11 Johnson, speaker for the entire council, Laurie A.
12 Cumbo, council, I'm sorry, Majority Leader, New York
13 City Council, Fernando Cabrera, Council Member 14th
14 District, the Bronx.

15 FERNANDO CABRERA: Thank you so much to
16 our clerk. With that, I want to invite also our
17 Majority Leader to say some words.

18 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you,
19 Council Member Cabrera, for always sharing the
20 spotlight with me, you're so generous. Thank you so
21 much for bringing Thrive Collective here today. You
22 all are an extraordinary organization and to hear
23 about all the work you're doing is just
24 inspirational. And part of the reason why we do
25 ceremonials, particularly for our young people, is

2 because for so many of us, I had not come to City
3 Hall until I was maybe in my late thirties. So we
4 want to get you all in the door as quickly so that
5 you will know that this is your City Hall and that
6 each of you have the opportunity one day to be
7 elected and to sit in these seats, and with a
8 cultural background behind you and all of this
9 artistic programming you can create legislation and
10 ideas that we have never thought of before. So we
11 are so happy to welcome you here today. But I also
12 just want to instill upon you how important it is for
13 all of the young people that are part of the Thrive
14 Collective to really go on and do extraordinary
15 things so that we can continue to make a stronger
16 case and argument for why this programming is so
17 important and why every single child needs to have
18 cultural and artistic programming, because
19 essentially it saves lives. So I want to thank all
20 of you. I want to thank all of you for bringing this
21 important programming to the City of New York.
22 You're doing extraordinary work. I know it's for the
23 love of the youth and not for the money. So we
24 really appreciate you. Although the money is nice
25 and we're going to continue to do our best. But I

2 thank you for your leadership and for believing in
3 our youth and giving them the energy and the
4 creativity and the environment to be all that they
5 can be, because that's our role, to make sure that we
6 allow our young people to find their passions that
7 God has given us. And when we're not allowed to
8 follow those passions or those ideas, there's often a
9 path that is not as favorable. So we really
10 appreciate the work that you're doing. Thank you.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so
12 much, and thank you for being such a champion for the
13 arts. I know prior to you coming to the council you
14 worked in the arts, and thank you for your
15 leadership, again. With that, I'll turn it over to
16 Jeremy Del Rio, the founder and the brain, I want to
17 say brainchild, you're not a child, but you
18 understand what I'm saying that you, you've done an
19 amazing job and just to see it grow to the way it is
20 today, from the early days when we sat down together,
21 it's been amazing.

22 JEREMY DEL RIO: Thank you so much. On
23 behalf of all of us at Thrive Collective, I want to
24 thank Speaker Johnson, Majority Leader Cumbo, you, of
25 course, Council Member Cabrera, and all the other

2 council members that have seen the power of art to
3 awake creative imagination in our young people. We
4 know that the very people that most require the
5 skills to see beyond our current circumstances to
6 creative lives that don't exist yet are those who
7 live in low-income situations, right, who need that
8 imagination to envision a world that doesn't yet
9 exist to make it so. It is the arts and those
10 creative experiences that awaken that imagination,
11 and yet there are over 400 schools in the lowest-
12 income school districts of our five boroughs that
13 lack these experiences. And so it's our passion to
14 bring art back to those kids and it's your visionary
15 leadership that has propelled us to the point.
16 Fernando Cabrera, it has been such a joy and a
17 delight to have your trust. You're one of the first,
18 along with my own personal Congressman, ah, council
19 member where I live that saw the potential and
20 invested in 2014 the 13,000 students, the 65,000
21 square feet of public art, is a consequence of that
22 investment. And to you, Council Member Cumbo, Art a
23 Catalyst for Change helped to propel us beyond a few
24 discretionary grants. It was the first initiative
25 and since then it's been such a delight to work with

2 your office and your team as well, and to all of you.
3 Thank you. Let's bring art back to schools. It's
4 one of the injustices that is totally inexcusable in
5 the art capital of the world. We can fix this
6 problem overnight with the will and your leadership,
7 so thank you so much. And thank you to the team
8 that's with us. We have some of our students, some
9 of our teaching artists, some of our partners that
10 have joined us as well and our team, and so thank you
11 for being here to celebrate with us. God bless.
12 [applause] Alrighty.

13 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Ladies and gentlemen,
14 quiet on the floor please, quiet on the floor please.
15 Council members, please take your seats so we can get
16 an accurate count. At this time please place all
17 electronic devices, all electronic devices to
18 vibrate. Will all non-council employees, all non-
19 council employees please leave the main floor of the
20 chambers. If you are seated upstairs in the balcony
21 there is no photography upstairs in the balcony.
22 Thank you. Mr. Public Advocate.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: [gavel] Good
24 afternoon. Welcome to the Stated Meeting of November
25 14, 2019. I am Public Advocate Jumaane Williams.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Would everyone please
3 stand for the Pledge of Allegiance.

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: All rise.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: We will now
6 have today's invocation, which will be delivered by
7 Reverend Kimberly L. Detheridge, the pastor of St.
8 Mark AME Church, located at 90, I am mistaken. We
9 will first have roll call.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Adams.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Present.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Ampy-Samuel. Ayala.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Present.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Barron.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Present.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Borelli. Brannan.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Here.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Cabrera.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Here.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Chin.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Cohen.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: I'm here.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Constantinides.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Present.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Cornegy.
3 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Here.
4 COUNCIL CLERK: Deutsch.
5 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Yes.
6 COUNCIL CLERK: Diaz. Dromm.
7 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.
8 COUNCIL CLERK: Espinal.
9 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Here.
10 COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene.
11 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Present.
12 COUNCIL CLERK: Gibson.
13 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: I'm here.
14 COUNCIL CLERK: Gjonaj.
15 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Present.
16 COUNCIL CLERK: Grodenchik.
17 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Here.
18 COUNCIL CLERK: Holden.
19 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Here.
20 COUNCIL CLERK: Kallos.
21 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.
22 COUNCIL CLERK: Koo.
23 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.
24 COUNCIL CLERK: Koslowitz.
25 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Lancman. Lander.
3 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here.
4 COUNCIL CLERK: Levin.
5 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.
6 COUNCIL CLERK: Levine.
7 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.
8 COUNCIL CLERK: Louis.
9 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Here.
10 COUNCIL CLERK: Maisel.
11 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Here.
12 COUNCIL CLERK: Menchaca.
13 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Presente.
14 COUNCIL CLERK: Miller.
15 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Present.
16 COUNCIL CLERK: Moya.
17 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Present.
18 COUNCIL CLERK: Perkins.
19 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Present.
20 COUNCIL CLERK: Powers.
21 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Here.
22 COUNCIL CLERK: Reynoso. Richards.
23 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye, I mean
24 here.
25 COUNCIL CLERK: Rivera.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Present.
3 COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez. Rose.
4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Here.
5 COUNCIL CLERK: Rosenthal.
6 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here.
7 COUNCIL CLERK: Salamanca.
8 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Present.
9 COUNCIL CLERK: Torres. Treyger.
10 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Here.
11 COUNCIL CLERK: Ulrich. Vallone.
12 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.
13 COUNCIL CLERK: Van Bramer.
14 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.
15 COUNCIL CLERK: Yeger.
16 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Here.
17 COUNCIL CLERK: Matteo.
18 MINORITY LEADER MATTEO: Here. Cumbo.
19 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Present.
20 COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Johnson.
21 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I'm here.
22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you.
23 And now we'll have today's invocation, which will be
24 delivered by Reverend Kimberly L. Detheridge, the
25

2 pastor of St. Mark AME Church, located at 9518
3 Northern Boulevard in Jackson Heights, Queens.

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: All rise.

5 REVEREND DETHERIDGE: Let us pray. Dear
6 most gracious and everlasting God, creator and
7 sustainer of the university, giver of life, we come
8 this afternoon to invoke your presence and to say
9 thank you. First of all, Lord, thank you for your
10 goodness, your grace, and your mercy. Thank you for
11 the members of the City Council. Thank you for their
12 servant leadership, their commitment and dedication
13 to the work that you have called them to do, and the
14 good work that they have already accomplished. Thank
15 you for the wonderful mosaic of people that live,
16 work, play, and visit this great city called New
17 York, whom they serve. Bless the speaker of the
18 council, the Honorable Corey Johnson, as he presides
19 over this Stated Meeting. Bless all the members of
20 the City Council and bless my own Council Member, the
21 Honorable Francisco Moya of the 21st Council
22 District. Lord, you have entrusted this city into
23 their hands. Give them wisdom, understanding, and
24 patience in determining what is best for all New
25 Yorkers. In these troubled times where powers and

2 principalities seek to divide and oppress, continue
3 to help them to understand and provide for the needs
4 of our city, the vulnerable, the lost, the poor, the
5 oppressed, and the issues that they deal with of
6 affordable housing and criminal justice and
7 educational reform and safety and security of our
8 people, sex trafficking, mental health, and what it
9 means to be neighbor. We are reminded in your word,
10 Lord, to love our neighborhoods as we love ourselves.
11 We are all each other's neighborhoods. And may they
12 listen and hear the concerns of this city. May their
13 decisions be tempered with justice and mercy as they
14 serve all the constituents of New York City. Thank
15 you for their vision. Thank you for their staff.
16 Continue to give them the moral fortitude of what is
17 right. Unify, encourage, uplift, strengthen, and
18 restore them. Watch over them and their families.
19 Bless them in all that they do to make New York a
20 better city for us all. In your name we pray. Amen.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you,
22 Pastor. We will now ask Council Member...

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Quiet on the floor,
24 please.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: We will now
3 ask Council Member to spread the invocation on the
4 record.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Thank you, Mr.
6 Public Advocate. I'd like to make a motion to spread
7 the invocation in full upon the record. It's also a
8 great honor to have and introduce Reverend Kimberly
9 Detheridge, Esq. of the St. Mark's African Methodist
10 Episcopal Church that has a rich and storied history.
11 Its leadership in faith and community and its
12 dedication to the Civil Rights Movement so that
13 justice and human rights issues are something I can
14 think humbles us all. So it's no feat to make
15 history in the AME Church, but it's exactly what
16 Reverend Detheridge has done. In 2010 she became the
17 church's first female pastor in its 184-year history
18 and has been a shining example of faith, love, and
19 service every day since. Among her many titles and
20 accolades, Reverend Detheridge is the president of
21 the Corona East Elmhurst Clergy Association and the
22 former chaplain of the NYPD Grandmothers' Love
23 Program, which helps grandmothers raising their
24 children. Reverend Detheridge is also the first
25 black female supervisor in the Legal Aid Society

2 Criminal Defense Division in the Brooklyn office.

3 There, she continues to work fighting for civil
4 rights and workers' rights. She is a spiritual
5 beacon, and I am so proud to have her here with us
6 today to make the invocation. Thank you and God
7 bless you, Reverend Detheridge.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you, and
9 I know Council Member Adams wants to say something.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Thank you very
11 much, Mr. Majority Leader. I had to add on to the
12 invocation, which was so graciously done by my
13 colleague, Council Member Moya, because Reverend
14 Detheridge happens to be the pastor of my home
15 church, St. Mark African Methodist Episcopal Church
16 in Jackson Heights, where my dad, Irvin Edy Still, is
17 a member for 40 years or so. So, Reverend Kim, we're
18 so blessed to have you today. A beautiful
19 invocation. God bless you and thank you.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you so
21 much. I just want to make sure that we understand we
22 have an awesome majority leader. That's Laurie
23 Cumbo. So we'll have now the adoption of minutes.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: None.
25

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Messages and
3 papers from the mayor.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Communication
6 from city, county, and borough offices.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Petitions and
9 communications.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Land use call-
12 ups.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: M194. Excuse me.

14 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I want to thank you,
15 and at this time I'm asking for a roll call vote on
16 today's land use call-up calendar. We're just voting
17 on the land use call-ups right now.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Adams.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: I vote aye.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Ampy-Samuel.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Aye.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Ayala.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Aye.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Barron.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I vote aye.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Borelli. Brannan.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Aye.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Cabrera.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Chin.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Cohen. Constantinides.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: I'd like
10 to vote yes on all land use call-ups and with your
11 permission I'd like to also vote yes on all coupled
12 on general orders and resolutions.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission
14 granted.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: I'd like
16 to vote aye. Thank you.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Cornegy.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Yes.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Deutsch.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Yes.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Diaz. Dromm.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Espinal.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Aye.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene.

2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I vote aye.
COUNCIL CLERK: Gibson.
COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: I vote aye.
COUNCIL CLERK: Gjonaj. Oh, thank you.
Grodenchik.
COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye.
COUNCIL CLERK: Holden.
COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Aye.
COUNCIL CLERK: Kallos.
COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye.
COUNCIL CLERK: Koo.
COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye.
COUNCIL CLERK: Koslowitz.
COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye.
COUNCIL CLERK: Lancman.
COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.
COUNCIL CLERK: Lander. Levin.
COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye.
COUNCIL CLERK: Levine.
COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye.
COUNCIL CLERK: Louis.
COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Aye.
COUNCIL CLERK: Maisel.

1 STATED MEETING

24

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: I would like to
3 vote yes on all land use call-ups and with your
4 permission I would like to also vote yes on all
5 coupled on general orders and resolutions.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission
7 granted.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Thank you.

9 UNIDENTIFIED: Yes.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Menchaca.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Aye.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Miller.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Aye.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Moya.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Aye.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Perkins.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Aye on all.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Powers.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Aye.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Reynoso.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Aye.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Richards.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Permission to
24 explain my vote?

25

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission
3 granted.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you. Oh,
5 oh, all these are call-ups, oh, forget it, oh, sorry.
6 I vote aye. I'm having a fun day today. [laughter]

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Rivera.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Aye.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Rose.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Aye.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Rosenthal.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Aye.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Salamanca.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: I vote aye on
17 all land use call-ups and with permission I would
18 like to vote aye on all items on the general order
19 calendar and all resolutions.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission
21 granted.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Thank you.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Cohen.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Torres.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Aye.

3 COUNCIL CLERK: Treyger.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Ulrich. Vallone.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Van Bramer.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Yeger.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Aye.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Matteo. Cumbo.

12 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Aye.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Johnson.

14 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I vote aye. But I'd

15 also like to say something before Council Member

16 Maisel leaves, which is I am very, very, very, very

17 happy that he's back. He is a good friend. He is a

18 great member of this body. [applause] And he has

19 been out, so I want to welcome back Alan Maisel.

20 [applause] And with that I vote aye on the land use

21 call-up calendar.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Today's, thank

23 you, and peace and blessings to Council Member

24 Maisel. Today's land use call-ups are adopted by a

25 vote of 46 in the affirmative and zero in the

2 negative. We will now have communication from
3 Speaker Corey Johnson. Before that, I just want to
4 say Mr. Speaker, as of a few weeks ago, this is my
5 first time back since the general election and I want
6 to tell the body and the city unfortunately is stuck
7 with me at least for the next two years.

8 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Boy, do we know it.

9 Ah, thank you, Mr. Public Advocate. I am glad you're
10 back. I'm glad you're here. Congratulations. Good
11 afternoon. I want to thank everyone for being here
12 today on this important Stated Meeting. This morning
13 we had very tragic news coming out of southern
14 California. There was net another mass shooting, a
15 high school shooting. One person was killed, more
16 injured, two of them in critical condition, and it
17 was a shooting at Saugus High School in Santa
18 Clarita, California. This of course is horrific and
19 this senseless violence has to stop. How many more
20 tragedies do we have to endure to pass serious gun
21 control reform laws in this country? And I also want
22 to thank our veterans for their selfless service to
23 our country. Although Veterans Day was on Monday,
24 our gratitude for their service is endless and I
25 really want to thank all the veterans of New York

2 City, those who are currently serving, those who are
3 no longer serving but still proudly wear the uniform
4 and have dedicated their lives to supporting and
5 defending our country. As I do at each stated, want
6 to recognize some of the important vents that have
7 happened recently. Last week, as you mentioned, Mr.
8 Public Advocate, was Election Day and for the very
9 first time early voting was an option. I personally
10 took advantage of this to cast my vote early and I
11 know many New Yorkers who did the same. We need more
12 bold moves to strengthen our democracy. New Yorkers
13 voted on major changes to our city's constitution
14 thanks to the Charter Revision Commission. The
15 commission was created by the City Council with now
16 Attorney General Leticia James, who was then public
17 advocate, and Manhattan Borough President Gil Brewer.
18 And I want to all the members of the Charter Revision
19 Commission who worked for over a year as volunteers
20 to get this right. I'm grateful for their service
21 and how hard they listened to the public. I also
22 want to congratulate the winners in that election
23 last week and a few of them are our public advocate,
24 Jumaane Williams, our council member and colleague,
25 Farah Louis, and future district attorney Melinda

2 Katz as well. [applause] I want to congratulate
3 them. Congratulations, Farah. I feel like we've
4 congratulated you like nine times since you've joined
5 the body, so we are really, really grateful that
6 you're here. As I do at every Stated, I want to
7 recognize some of the major losses that our city has
8 faced recently. Last week, shhh, last week retired
9 FDNY firefighter Cecelia Cox died at the age of 68.
10 Cecelia was a true trailblazer and one of the first
11 women to join the department. She joined in 1982
12 after suing for discrimination and she served for
13 over 20 years in the FDNY. We are deeply, deeply,
14 grateful for her courage, for her trailblazing, and
15 for her service. The NYPD also suffered a loss.
16 Linda Mercer was a 9/11 first responder and traffic
17 enforcement agent who died, yet again, another victim
18 of 9/11-related cancer. She passed away on November
19 6th. She fought tirelessly for other first
20 responders, particularly non-uniform personnel who
21 suffered from 9/11-related diseases. All of New York
22 will be forever grateful for Linda's courage that
23 never took a day off. My condolences are with the
24 families of Cecelia Cox and Linda Mercer, and both
25 the FDNY and the NYPD. And I would ask us to all

2 stand for a moment of silence to honor Cecelia and
3 Linda. [moment of silence] Thank you. This month
4 we're also celebrating National American Indian
5 Heritage Month and this month is a reminder to our
6 nation's first people to honor the land that we are
7 standing on. We are also celebrating Puerto Rican
8 Heritage money and the many, many contributions of
9 Puerto Rican New Yorkers. We had a great ceremony
10 here last night in the chambers and I am really
11 grateful for the work that everyone has been doing,
12 and I especially want to say, I think I can speak for
13 all of us when I say that Puerto Rico is a special
14 place. Many of us were just there last weekend,
15 especially for our city which have so many ties to
16 the island. New York wouldn't be what it is today
17 without the contributions of both Puerto Ricans and
18 Native Americans and I'm happy to be honoring them
19 this month. This week also kicked off Transgender
20 Awareness Week, a week dedicated to raising the
21 visibility of trans people while also working to
22 address issues that members of the community face.
23 The LGBT Caucus, led by Chair Dromm, has been hosting
24 a trans day of awareness exhibit in the City Hall
25 rotunda. It's happening today in partnership with

2 the Laguardia and Wagner archives. And I want to
3 Danny for making this exhibit extra special by
4 sharing his collection of photos featuring many trans
5 leaders from Jackson Heights who are members of Make
6 the Road New York and are great New Yorkers. We must
7 continue to stand with the trans community and on
8 Trans Day of Remembrance, November 20th, we will
9 remember those who we have lost to violence. So
10 please, before you leave the building today check out
11 the exhibition in the rotunda. Last but not least,
12 it saddens me to announce that the council is losing
13 a legendary figure and a good friend to me. I don't
14 even want to read it. Rob Newman is retiring from
15 the council after almost 21 years of service to this
16 legislative body. He started on the General Welfare
17 Committee, where he exposed the city's failed
18 approach to poverty. Rob has served in so, so, so
19 many invaluable roles, helping all of us navigate the
20 laws that govern the city and the best ways to
21 improve or change them. He's overseen the drafting
22 and introduction of literally thousands of bills that
23 have become law in the city and shepherded so many of
24 them in working with all of us. His work has helped
25 expand opportunities for minority- and women-owned

2 businesses, created some of the most rigorous
3 campaign finance laws in the entire country, and he
4 proudly has limited local cooperation with
5 immigration and customs enforcement. He has truly
6 made New York greater and more equal, and on a
7 personal note I am so proud that Rob has been my
8 counsel for the last almost two years, someone who I
9 have talked to almost every single day, someone who I
10 have relied upon for wisdom and counsel, someone who
11 is always balancing 30 different things for me at a
12 time, and always gets the job done. The master plans
13 bill that we just passed, the master streets plan
14 bill that we just passed a couple of weeks ago, which
15 will revolutionize the way we move around and make
16 our city safer, would not have been possible without
17 Rob Newman's input and guidance. The State of the
18 City I gave earlier this year calling for municipal
19 control and the 104-page report that accompanied it
20 was led by Rob and his team and it is true of so much
21 of the work that we have done together has been done
22 in the spirit of service and the spirit of Rob's love
23 of New York City, but also his love of this body. I
24 will miss him terribly, but he has created a top-
25 notch legislative team. I'm really grateful for

2 Kelly Taylor and their entire team. He's created a
3 top-notch, so his legacy will live on. Rob, you will
4 be missed. [applause] [pause] Thanks, Rob. Now
5 let's dive into our legislative agenda. We will be
6 voting on the following land use items. Two
7 applications in Council Member Jimmy Van Bramer's
8 district - Hunter's Point South parcels F and G,
9 which will facilitate two mixed use buildings,
10 including 850 affordable housing units, and 4401
11 Northern Boulevard rezoning, a zoning to facilitate
12 the construction of a new mixed use building. The
13 application will be modified to include MIH option 1.
14 The Peninsula Hospital site redevelopment will
15 facilitate the development of over 2 million square
16 feet, including almost 2000 affordable units, 200
17 senior units, and new community facilities. I want
18 to congratulate Council Member Richards for his hard
19 work on this application. Finally, 4797 Third Avenue
20 is a technical change in Council Member Ritchie
21 Torres's district, and then there is the East Side
22 Coastal Resiliency Project. This is a critical
23 project about coastal resiliency and climate
24 resiliency for the east side of Manhattan. Council
25 Members Rivera, Powers, and Chin were tireless

2 advocates for their communities, but also have been
3 mindful about the project's central goal, which was
4 to realize much-needed infrastructure improvement to
5 reduce flood risk and improve access to the
6 waterfront, and I want to thank them for their hard work on
7 this. Out of the Finance Committee the council will
8 vote on the following pieces of legislation.

9 Introduction number 1780, sponsored by Chair Danny
10 Dromm and supported by the administration, will
11 extend the current rate of the additional tax on the
12 occupancy of hotel rooms at 5.78% through November
13 30, 2023. There are three preconsidered resolutions,
14 all sponsored by our finance chair, which together
15 will readopt the fiscal 2020 property tax rates to
16 provide tax relief to Class 1 and Class 2 homeowners.
17 Because of the council's action today Class 1 rates
18 will rise by only 1.2% over the 2019 rates instead of
19 6.3%, thereby saving typical homeowners about \$321
20 per year, and Class 2 rates will be the lowest
21 they've been since the fiscal 2009 budget. There is
22 J2, which is in Council Member Daneek Miller's
23 district in Queens, and it will receive a full 40-
24 year Article 11 property tax exemption to construct
25 543 units of affordable rental housing. Moving on,

2 the council will be voting on the follow pieces of
3 legislation. Our first piece of legislation is
4 related to the criminal justice work that the council
5 has been doing. Introduction number 1156-A,
6 sponsored by Council Member Steve Levin, would
7 require the Office of Night Life to report on the
8 frequency and effects of multiagency response to
9 community hotspot march operations across the city.
10 The NYPD would be required to provide written
11 notifications to establishment owners at least 30
12 days before their inclusion in a potential march
13 operation, which must outline the conditions that
14 need to be remedied. I want to thank from the staff
15 Maxwell Kamfer for his work on that bill. Now a few
16 health bills. Today we're celebrating World Diabetes
17 Day and what a timely way to raise awareness and
18 fight against this illness than through policy.
19 Introduction number 1361-B, sponsored by our health
20 committee chair, Mark Levine, would require the
21 Department of Health and Mental Hygiene to report
22 twice a year on the rate of diabetes-related health
23 problems in New York City and to compile a
24 comprehensive report and recommendations by 2021. I
25 want to Council Member Levine for his work on

2 spearheading this important piece of legislation, and
3 I want to acknowledge the tireless work of Chris
4 Norwood, the founder and executive director of Health
5 People and the entire Health People team, especially
6 their peer educators. This legislation would not
7 have been possible without her work and their work to
8 raise awareness of diabetes. When I was health
9 committee chair Chris Norwood would not leave me
10 alone about getting this done and I'm glad that her
11 advocacy, is she here today, is she up there, Health
12 People is here in the house. Where's Chris? There's
13 Chris. Chris, I want to thank you for your really,
14 really important work. Next is Introduction 1598-A,
15 sponsored by Council Member Robert Holden, which
16 would require the Department of Health and Mental
17 Hygiene to provide information regarding city
18 services available for the proper disposal of
19 deceased animals and to post information online. And
20 Introduction number 1496-A, sponsored by Council
21 Member Justin Brannan, would require an animal
22 shelter directed by a sheriff or a city marshall
23 executing a warrant of eviction or any order of
24 judgment granting legal possession to retrieve a
25 companion animal from such premises as expeditiously

2 as possible after receiving such direction. And I
3 want to thank the staff from the health committee who
4 worked on this, Zemanuel Halu, Sarah Liss, and Emily
5 Balking. Next, we'll be voting on a package of
6 legislation aimed at increasing diversity in New York
7 City public schools and ensuring that all children
8 throughout each borough have access to equal
9 education opportunities. New York City prides itself
10 on its diversity but sadly our schools are the most
11 segregated in the United States of America. Equity
12 takes work. Desegregation takes work. Real
13 diversity in our schools takes work. It doesn't
14 happen by magic. And these bills I believe are a
15 major step I into right direction. We still have a
16 tremendous amount of work to do, but I am very proud
17 of this package and what it means for our students
18 and families. And I want to single out the chair of
19 our Education Committee, Chair Treyger, who has been
20 working so hard on this issue, shepherd these bills
21 through the committee, and he has a bill that I'll
22 speak about in a moment. But the first bill is
23 Introduction number 1547-A, sponsored by Council
24 Member Brad Lander, who has been a tireless champion
25 and advocate on these issues, which would require the

2 New York City Department of Education to expand its
3 current student demographic data reporting and to
4 provide data by grade level. DOE is already required
5 to report on the diversity of students in public
6 schools and its efforts to encourage diversity within
7 schools from grades kindergarten through 12th. The
8 bill also requires DOE to report on a side-by-side
9 comparison of the racial and ethnic demographics of
10 each school or special program with the racial and
11 ethnic demographics of the larger attendant zone and
12 community school district. This will make the
13 existing reporting requirement more robust and allow
14 the City Council, advocates, and others to drill down
15 deeper into the segregation that exists in our
16 schools and the department's efforts to remedy that.
17 Introduction number 1554-B, sponsored by our
18 education chair, Mark Treyger, would mandate the New
19 York City Department of Education to report on the
20 demographics of school staff, including leadership,
21 teaching staff, and other professional and
22 paraprofessional staff. Introduction number 1552-B,
23 sponsored by Council Member Carlina Rivera and
24 myself, would mandate the establishment of district
25 diversity working groups in each community school

2 district. These working groups would work to
3 facilitate the creation and publishing of public
4 input integration plans in every school district.

5 The working groups would be made up of Department of
6 Education staff, students, parents, teachers,
7 principals, administrators, and community advocates,
8 and each group may also choose to partner with a
9 community-based organization. We also have an
10 education bill and two pieces of housing legislation
11 sponsored by Public Advocate Jumaane Williams that
12 the council will be voting on today.

13 Congratulations, Jumaane. Introduction number 1550-
14 A, sponsored by the Public Advocate, would codify the
15 School Diversity Advisory Group. The SDAG was
16 established in 2017 by the mayor and by the New York
17 City Department of Education as part of their
18 Diversity in New York City Public Schools plan and it
19 was designed to make formal policy recommendations to
20 the mayor and chancellor relating to increasing
21 diversity in our schools. This bill would ensure
22 that the works continues in the future and the
23 membership of the advocacy group will now include
24 appointments from the speaker of the council and a
25 public advocate appointment in addition to the

2 mayoral appointments that already existed. And I
3 want to thank the staff that worked on this bill with
4 the public advocate, Malcolm Buttehorn, Jane Atwell,
5 and Kalima Johnson. Public Advocate Williams is also
6 sponsoring Introduction number 1716-A, which would
7 require the Department of Housing Preservation and
8 Development to annually report certain information
9 regarding the waiting lists of Mitchell-Lama Housing
10 developments, including the number who were skipped
11 and the number of complaints received about Mitchell-
12 Lama waiting lists, and I want to Audrey Sahn from
13 the staff for working on this bill. And finally the
14 public advocate is sponsoring Introduction number
15 720-C, which would allow not-for-profit organizations
16 with at least three years of construction-related
17 work force development or training experience to
18 apply to the Department of Buildings for approval as
19 a site safety training provider, and I want to Megan
20 Chen and Austin Brandford from the staff. And I
21 congratulate the public advocate on these three bills
22 that we're voting on today. Next, the council will
23 vote on two additional pieces of legislation related
24 to housing lotteries introduced by council members.
25 Introduction number 564-A, sponsored by Council

2 Member Mark Treyger, would require HPD to report on
3 housing lottery outcomes, including applicant race or
4 ethnicity and applicant preference category at the
5 citywide and borough-wide levels and on applicant
6 household size and applicant household income at the
7 citywide, borough, and community district levels.

8 And I want to thank from the staff Janon Zilka for
9 working on this, and she worked on the next bill as
10 well, which is Introduction number 550-A, sponsored
11 by Council Member Mark Levine, which would require
12 HPD to report on the housing lottery process,
13 including complaints about housing lotteries, planned
14 improvements to housing lotteries, and housing
15 lottery methodologies. The council will also be
16 voting on a very important piece of legislation aimed
17 at ensuring fair wages for workers. Introduction
18 number 1321-C, sponsored by Council Member Rafael
19 Espinal, would remove the current exemption in the
20 existing prevailing wage law, Local Law 27 of 2012,
21 for affordable housing projects and nonprofit
22 developers at residential projects. Local Law 27 of
23 2012 requires building service workers to be paid the
24 prevailing wage in buildings where the developer
25 receives at least a million dollars in discrepancy

2 financial assistance from the city or a city economic
3 development entity. Accordingly, building service
4 workers in most residential projects receiving
5 financial assistance of more than a million dollars
6 for new construction or preservation would be
7 required to pay the prevailing wage. This bill
8 exempts smaller residential projects with fewer than
9 120 units , certain supportive housing projects,
10 deeply affordable preservation projects, and NYCHA
11 projects financed through the Federal Rental
12 Assistance Demonstration Program. I really, really
13 want to thank 32BJ president Kyle Bragg and also
14 Candace Toliver from 32BJ. Kyle I believe is here
15 with us, where is he, there he is. I want to Kyle
16 and I see David from his team here as well. Because
17 this bill was very complicated. This bill was a bill
18 of us trying to do two things, which is to raise the
19 wages of workers through New York City because we
20 believe everyone should have a pathway to the middle
21 class while at the same time being thoughtful and
22 balanced on exempting projects that were providing
23 supportive housing or deeply affordable housing. And
24 I know that Council Member Espinal worked with 32BJ
25 and the staff here to strike that balance to ensure

2 that we are not having to make a trade-off or
3 subsidizing potential projects across New York City
4 that are not paying their workers a living wage, a
5 prevailing wage, which allows them to move into the
6 middle class. So I want to thank him for his work and
7 dedication in getting this legislation passed
8 responsibly and for continuing to fight for fair
9 wages and better working conditions for all New
10 Yorkers and from the staff I want to thank Michelle
11 Lee, Malcolm Buttehorn, and from my team Rob Newman
12 for his work on this, his swan song was this bill.
13 Finally, today the council is voting on a
14 revolutionary package of legislation that will make
15 what some may know as Hart Island and others know as
16 the city's potter's field a more respectful resting
17 place for those who are buried there. Since 1869
18 Hart Island has been used as New York City's public
19 burial ground. Located off the coast of City Island
20 in the Bronx, many estimations report that there are
21 over one million people buried there. In 2018 alone
22 1213 people were buried on Hart Island. I believe
23 that how we remember those who came before us says a
24 lot about our moral compass and about who we are as
25 people. The people who have been buried at Hart

2 Island were in many cases the folks who were most
3 marginalized in life. Many were immigrants with no
4 family here to claim them. Many could not afford
5 funerals. Many were AIDS victims, people who died at
6 the height of the AIDS epidemic, shunned by society
7 and often by their own families. I am happy to say
8 that there has been improved access to Hart Island
9 thanks to the work of advocates who lobbied for those
10 changes. And I specifically want to thank Melinda
11 Hunt, who is with us today, for her tireless advocacy
12 on this. But even with those changes, those visiting
13 Hart Island still feel as though they're visiting a
14 prison when they are going to the island. I visited
15 there December of last year, a little less than a
16 year ago. I went with Council Member Rodriguez, who
17 is sponsoring this bill, and it is a very moving
18 place. There is a section on the southern part of
19 the island separate from all the other plots where
20 people are buried just for people who died of AIDS,
21 and they were buried separate from everyone else,
22 even though once you die you can't give someone HIV
23 and AIDS. But it showed the level of hysteria that
24 was happening at the time. And they are buried in a
25 section with not many markers even showing where they

2 are. It's the largest, we believe, cemetery in the
3 world for people who have died from HIV and AIDS. So
4 today we are finally taking Hart Island back. A
5 resting place should not be a place that is run by
6 the Department of Corrections. We are transferring
7 the property to the Department of Parks and
8 Recreation. And that is what Introduction number
9 906-A, sponsored by Council Member Ydanis Rodriguez,
10 who has been a tireless advocate on this, would do,
11 it would transfer jurisdiction of the island from DOC
12 to the Department of Parks and Recreation. Burials
13 would be allowed to continue pursuant to rules and
14 regulations established by the Department of Social
15 Services and by the Department of Parks and
16 Recreation or any other agency designated by the
17 mayor in the case of a disagreement between DSS and
18 DPR. We have another bill from Council Member
19 Rodriguez on this issue, Introduction number 909-B,
20 which would require the Department of Transportation
21 or another agency designated by the mayor to develop
22 a transportation plan for public travel, including
23 ferry service to and from Hart Island. This bill
24 requires consideration of multiple departure
25 locations and factors such as changing conditions and

2 future uses of Hart Island. The agency would also
3 have to submit a report on its plan and post the
4 report on its website within one year of the bill's
5 effective date. Next, we have Introduction 1580-A,
6 sponsored by Council Member Debbie Rose, which would
7 require a public hearing on public burials to allow
8 the public the opportunity to discuss our public
9 burial laws, rules, regulations, policies, and
10 procedures relating to public burials. Though this
11 hearing the public would be able to, at this hearing
12 the public would be able to recommend changes to
13 these programs and consider the feasibility of
14 alternative programs. This bill would require the
15 Department of Social Services to submit a report
16 summarizing and responding to comments received at a
17 hearing by 2020. And lastly Introduction number
18 1559-A, sponsored by Council Member Diana Ayala,
19 would require the Department of Social Services to
20 establish an office to provide support and assistance
21 to individuals who have lost a loved one and need
22 information about how, about how, about and helping
23 access public burials, a burial allowance, or a
24 similar program. This office would provide services,
25 including explaining the option of public burials and

2 assistance in applying for a public burial allowance,
3 and I want to thank the staff who has worked so
4 passionately on this package of bills. I really,
5 really want to thank them and the great job they've
6 done on this. I want to thank Zemanuel Halu, Sarah
7 Liss, Emily Balkin, Chris Santori, ah, Chris Artori,
8 Patrick Mulvihill, and James Digiovanni. And Mr.
9 Public Advocate, that is our very brief short agenda
10 for today, and I want to all the council members for
11 their work in getting these bills to the place where
12 we can vote on them.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you.

14 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Congratulations to you,
15 and I also, before we move on from speaker time I
16 want to give you as much opportunity as you need to
17 discuss the three exciting bills that you're passing
18 today.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you so
20 much for that apt description as well. I am, I'm
21 happy to speak on it, which I will. I want to give
22 my colleagues an opportunity first as we move into
23 discussion of general orders. First we have Council
24 Members Gjonaj, followed by Rivera, and Chin.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Thank you, Mr.
3 Public Advocate. First of all, on Veterans Day I
4 just want to reiterate that we can never do enough
5 for our veterans and we should strive to do more. To
6 my dear friend, Rob Newman, congratulations in your
7 endeavors. Mr. Public Advocate, Thank you for
8 allowing me to speak up on Hart Island. Hart Island
9 falls solely within my district and I want to
10 reiterate the concerns of Hart Island. The priority
11 should have been and should be focused on preserving
12 that island, preventing remains and bones from
13 washing out into the Long Island Sound, which have
14 been going on for decades. With that being said,
15 those that are buried there should be treated with
16 the utmost respect and dignity. The families that
17 have family members and loved ones buried there
18 should be treated with dignity and respect. Three of
19 the four bills being introduced leave too much
20 uncertainty. Hart Island means a great deal to many
21 people, not only the family members that have loved
22 ones buried there, but including the surrounding
23 neighborhoods and the community that is impacted. I
24 have heard from hundreds of residents with concerns
25 that have expressed strong desires to be a part of

2 and included in the decision-making process with
3 respect and possibly changing to visitation rights,
4 hours, burial alternatives, record-keeping, and
5 transportation, ah, transportation options.

6 Originally these bills created a task force, which
7 have been replaced instead and amended with a public
8 hearing. I have no faith that this administration
9 and its city agencies will rightfully listen to the
10 concerns of those who have loved ones buried on Hart
11 Island or that this administration will listen and
12 respect the concerns of the local community. Or that
13 resources that are needed...

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Council
15 Member...

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: I will wrap it
17 up.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Given the
19 amount of bills I'm going to just ask if you can wrap
20 up, please. Thanks.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Or that the
22 resources that are needed will be committed to the
23 future of the island. Simply, these bills in their
24 current form put the future of Hart Island on the
25 administration, the department, and the agencies it

2 controls. I'm not OK with that and nor should the
3 members in this room.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you.
5 Thank you, Council Member. Council Member Rivera,
6 followed by Council Members Chin and Powers.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you for
8 letting me speak briefly about the historic vote we
9 are taking today for climate change protections as we
10 deal with this very real and present danger,
11 undoubtedly one of the greatest threats of our
12 lifetimes and certainly this century. For the last
13 seven years I've watched my community's slow and
14 painful recovery from the physical and emotional
15 damage Superstorm Sandy has wreaked on all of us. We
16 are lucky that we haven't seen a storm as bad as
17 Sandy since, but it's inevitable, and we cannot let
18 our good fortune distract us from moving forward as
19 we face more intense storms, flooding, and
20 destruction. Today we have a chance with the East
21 Side Coastal Resiliency Project to not only approve
22 real protections, but also address decades of
23 environmental ignorance on the lower east side. I
24 move forward with negotiations thinking of injustices
25 we have faced as a community, the FDR Drive, built by

2 Robert Moses with no concept of its environmental
3 impact, lead line departments in our NYCHA campuses
4 that have still not been repaired, and of course the
5 mold that was exacerbated after Hurricane Sandy's
6 waters flooded our homes and our businesses. That is
7 why this agreement we reached this week for ESCR goes
8 beyond protections for the next one hundred years,
9 brings in a phased project design, a new amphitheater
10 of ball fields, tennis courts, and bridges, all of
11 what we fought for in this plan since 2012. With
12 this vote we are also bringing a long list of
13 community improvements to over 17 parks, six NYCHA
14 campuses, partnerships with community gardens,
15 extended hours at school recreation sites, and new
16 barbecue areas. We're voting to expand pedestrian-
17 focused infrastructure with commitments for new
18 protected bike lanes in Alphabet City and the
19 expansion of closed street programming that includes
20 pocket parks. And we're planning for the future with
21 a new disaster preparedness campaign for our front-
22 line residents and a commitment to study the future
23 of the FDR Drive that must include reduced vehicle
24 use and emissions. If I could just have a minute,
25 I've been working on this for a long time.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: There will be,
3 there's another opportunity when they vote, we just
4 have a lot, so if you can wrap up.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: All right, I
6 know, OK. But as this project spanning three council
7 districts moves forward it's clear that the
8 communities trust with the city surrounding this
9 project must continue to be prepared, ah, repaired.
10 I certainly understand the mistrust after decades of
11 neglect certain neighborhoods have experienced at the
12 hands of all levels of government, especially the
13 recovery process that NYCHA endorsed to this day. I
14 will say all of my thank yous when we vote, and this
15 is a really important personal project for me. I was
16 a principal organizer after Hurricane Sandy and to
17 finally bring protections to my community, I am
18 really, really proud of us all today. Thank you.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you,
20 Council Member. Ah, Council Member Chin, Powers,
21 followed by Rodriguez, and Menchaca.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Right, thank you,
23 Public Advocate. The serious threat that so many
24 fear about climate change is a painful reality
25 already felt by our waterfront community, especially

2 after Hurricane Sandy. Seven years later we're still
3 bouncing back. Our East Side community, especially
4 NYCHA resident, cannot afford to wait another seven
5 years for coastal protection and resiliency

6 improvement that they should have received long ago.

7 Today's vote on the East Side Coastal Resiliency

8 Agreement will deliver on the promise we made to act

9 so that their lives will not be uprooted when the

10 next storm hits. The road leading to today's vote

11 was not easy by any mean and we thank our constituent

12 for pushing us to fight for further open space

13 improvement, parks mitigation and NYCHA protection.

14 And I'm thankful to the leadership of our speaker and

15 especially my colleague, Council Member Rivera, and

16 our partner, Council Member Powers, and our wonderful

17 land use staff for persisting on greater

18 transparency, more engagement, and strong community

19 investment. This vote is a long time coming and I'm

20 grateful for the work that brought us here to this

21 point. This is win for resiliency for climate action

22 and for ensuring that our most vulnerable waterfront

23 community are given the attention that they deserve

24 and I urge all my colleagues to vote yes on this.

25 And I also wanted to take this time to thank the

2 administration for partnering and working with us,
3 the commissioner of DDC, Lorraine Grillo, Jamie
4 Torres Springer, Deputy Commissioner Parker,
5 Commissioner Silver, Alisa Cobb Colon, Alda Chan, the
6 Mayor's Office of Legislative Affairs, Joe Toronto,
7 Gavy Denayal, Sean Fitzpatrick, and our community
8 board, Community Board 3, Trevor Holland, Susan
9 Stetser, and Jane, and Jim Shelton. Thank you.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you,
11 Council Member. Council Members Powers, Rodriguez,
12 and Menchaca.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Thank you. I
14 will join Council Member Chin and Rivera to speak on
15 the East Side Coastal Resiliency Project, which to me
16 is a critical step in New York City's fight against
17 climate change. As any of us who live near the water
18 during Superstorm Sandy, including myself, can
19 attest, protecting our communities from flooding in
20 the next storm is absolutely vital. Seven years ago
21 as the river flooded and the water overtook all of
22 our waterfront parks, we lost power, the buildings
23 were flooded, services that residents rely on were
24 disrupted, and this is only our part of it. We have
25 a citywide impact on it when it comes to flooding.

2 Since we began discussing the new plan last fall my
3 colleagues and I have worked tirelessly to make sure
4 to maintain the balance between preparing for a
5 future where climate crisis is an everyday reality,
6 while also guaranteeing that our parks and our
7 communities would be restored and improved. To
8 reject this plan today, to vote no, would be putting
9 us on an uncertain path towards resiliency. It would
10 be jeopardizing hundreds of millions of dollars in
11 federal funding allocated for this specific project,
12 and set a precedent of throwing away a well-
13 developed, well-thought, and hard-fought plan out the
14 window for every community that's going to have to go
15 through this in the future. As I've sat here today,
16 I've talked to my colleagues about their needs and
17 their desires to have their communities in the outer
18 boroughs and other places that were affected also be
19 protected against a new super storm because we all
20 are in a new reality where climate change is the
21 reality and all of our communities still remain
22 unprotected against the next storm, which could
23 happen any day or any year in the future. It is our
24 responsibility as council members, in my view, is to
25 find that balance between protecting our communities

2 and doing what is right for the hundred and thousand
3 people who will be protected under this plan. Many
4 of you here represent other parts of the city that
5 were hit just as hard as my district and others here
6 today by Superstorm Sandy and it's my hope that we
7 have a plan today that was acknowledge the needs of
8 the community, has found the right balance between
9 resiliency and the community needs, and has made very
10 significant investments that will be both short-,
11 medium-, and long-term investments in our community.
12 I do support it. I hope you'll join us in the vote
13 to support it today. Thank you.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you,
15 Council Member. Council Members Rodriguez, Menchaca,
16 and Richards.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,
18 Public Advocate. First of all, thank you Speaker
19 Johnson. As I said at the previous Stated Meeting
20 what I have experienced in your leadership is that
21 we've been able to pass a number of bill that I was
22 told that city didn't have the authority to do it, or
23 that we couldn't do it. So this was one of those
24 type of bill that my previous colleague, Elizabeth
25 Crowley, she tried [inaudible] and unfortunately she

2 was told that the city couldn't do it. Same thing
3 happened for me with the transfer, ah, closing
4 Riker's Island and [inaudible] I was told the city
5 couldn't do it. Fair Fare, I was told that the city
6 couldn't do it. Establish UPK, I was told that the
7 city couldn't do it. And what we have seen is that
8 when we have a progressive body and we have a
9 leadership like you, like your, we are moving bills,
10 and I know that there are many other to come. When I
11 met with members of the Latino communities,
12 Dominican, Puerto Ricans, Garifuna, when I met and
13 talk to the African community from Nigeria and other
14 places, when I talk to anyone who has been an
15 immigrant like myself, what I had heard is one thing.
16 We have failed to one million family. One million
17 body has been buried in the largest public cemetery
18 in the whole United States of America. Who are those
19 people? Those people are black. They was buried
20 after the Civil War because some white people they
21 didn't want to be buried together with black people.
22 So they was brought to that location. They are
23 immigrants. They are the generation that we lost
24 during the HIV. They are hard-working individual.
25 But unfortunately we closed this, that place where we

2 want to be united. Giving the respect to them.

3 Being able to visit them. Before 2014 no one was

4 able to visit Riker's Island. Now we still have

5 restriction. But we transferred the island. What we

6 are saying is that we live progressive. That from

7 now on the largest public cemetery will be open to

8 everyone. [speaking in Spanish] Thank you.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you,

10 Council Member. Council Members Menchaca and

11 Richards.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you. I

13 would like to speak on Intro 720-C and really ask

14 everyone to support this bill. You know, in 19, ah,

15 sorry, in 2017 we passed what is now Local Law 196.

16 This really was a kind of first big move that brought

17 union workers and non-union workers together to

18 address something that's been happening and continues

19 to happen to this day, the deaths on construction

20 sites. Many of the workers that work on construction

21 sites are immigrant workers, those who are dying.

22 Many of them are Spanish-speaking. But they're

23 immigrants. The construction that we are seeing

24 continues to suffer from an insufficient safety

25 training and exploitation that happens by developers

2 in the construction industry. But we have a
3 solution. 720-C will allow for a new opportunity for
4 M/WBEs and day laborer organizations that we work
5 with every day in our neighborhoods to be able to be
6 on the ground training the men and women who are on
7 our construction sites. This law allows for that
8 access to happen in multiple languages, to include
9 Spanish and other languages in, in our communities,
10 specifically in immigrant communities. And M/WBE
11 opportunities. Intro 720-C would close that loop and
12 allow groups who serve the city's most vulnerable
13 construction workers to get the safety training
14 needed. I want to Jason Goldman and Speaker Johnson
15 for their support, but also the Progressive Caucus
16 and the BLEC, who came in, ah, this week and really
17 ensured that there was broad support across the
18 council. Thank you so much, and I look forward to
19 passing this. Finally, though, actually, in my 13
20 seconds, Jumaane, our public advocate, we were doing
21 this work last session and we needed to close this
22 loop and we did it, and I just want to say thank you.
23 You've been leading this from the beginning and I'm
24 just happy to call you my brother.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you. If
3 you want to keep talking me I might give you more.

4 [laughter]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: OK, can I

6 [laughter]

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Ah, thank you,
8 Council Member. Council Member Richards.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you. I
10 want to talk about the Peninsula Hospital rezoning.

11 What a great day for the people of the Rockaways.

12 But in particular, for the people who reside in both
13 Edgemere and [inaudible] and a neighborhood I

14 actually lived in right across the street from the

15 site. Ah, this neighborhood has always had the

16 potential to not only serve as a retail destination

17 for local residents, but a tourist attraction as

18 well. However, like many neighborhoods on the

19 eastern portion of the Rockaways, sorely needed

20 infrastructure, affordable housing, quality jobs, and

21 a lack of space for our young people to congregate

22 have been nonexistent. This vacuum created immense

23 challenges, such as the highest unemployed rate in

24 Queens, high rates of obesity due to a lack of access

25 to a supermarket in close proximity to thousands of

2 public housing residents and homeowners. But today
3 I'm happy to announce the Edgemere Commons Project
4 seeks to address these systematic issues. This
5 project will serve as a template for what a resilient
6 mixed use development should look like in the 21st
7 century. During a time when our city is facing one
8 of the largest housing crisis we have ever witnessed,
9 this project will produce over 2000 units of true
10 affordable housing, serving a healthy mix of incomes
11 as low as 30% AMI. The addition of much-needed
12 senior housing units are also a big win for those who
13 wish to age in place gracefully in the Rockaways. I
14 want my community to know we heard you loud and clear
15 on the need to ensure we just aren't building
16 housing, but addressing the needs of our community as
17 well. This is why I'm happy to announce the creation
18 of a new community center, healthcare facility,
19 supermarket, open space, and much-needed local and
20 destination retail as well. The combination of these
21 will enable us to stimulate the economy in Edgemere
22 and ensure our youth and their families will have a
23 safe space for activities. Lastly, I'm happy to
24 announce we've reached an agreement with the Arka
25 Companies and 32BJ and I want to thank Kyle Bragg for

2 all of his hard work to crossing, to getting us over
3 the line. This will ensure we aren't subsidizing
4 low-paying jobs. We also have an agreement with the
5 developer to, ah, for 35% local hiring and 30% M/WBE,
6 and also a fund to ensure youth and community
7 development and work force could be tracked properly.
8 I just want to close by thanking the amazing land use
9 staff, led by Raju Mann, John Douglas, Amy Levitton,
10 and Julie Luban, and both of our chairs, both
11 Salamanca and Moya, for their hard work on this
12 application as well. I urge my colleagues to vote
13 aye.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you very
15 much, Council Member. Truly briefly, I'd like to
16 encourage my colleagues to vote on three bills before
17 you today, first one 1550, School Diversity Advocacy
18 Group. I want to the staff, the speaker, and Council
19 Member Treyger to codify into the law the committee
20 that just finished their work in dealing with school
21 diversity. This will make sure that there is a
22 mixture of voices, from students to parents and
23 teachers, and of course wanted to make sure that the
24 council had some people appointed as well to provide
25 some balance, and the public advocate's office

2 because of course public advocates got to get some as
3 well. And I want to thank the speaker and a big
4 shout-out to Council Member Menchaca and Zirona Soft
5 from the Progressive Caucus, Brandon Clark from the
6 Black, Latino and Asian Caucus, of course Jason
7 Goldman around 720, and the rest of the staff. As
8 Council Member Menchaca mentioned, we've been working
9 on this for a very long time and it will make a lot
10 of groups happy who we assured them that when we
11 passed this bill a few years ago they would have
12 access to be able to provide this kind of training
13 and now they will. We'll be opening up the people
14 who can provide the training, which will be opening
15 up the people who can get the training so that we can
16 get to the deadline that everyone agreed to. Lastly,
17 716-A is the Mitchell-Lama bill. I'm very excited
18 about this. I've been working for a very long time.
19 People may have heard of, ah, the kind of things that
20 have been going on around Mitchell-Lama waiting
21 lists. In fact, early this year three people were
22 arrested for bribery. It was one of the hearings
23 that this council had where the administration
24 actually had nothing. They provided nothing. So
25 this will make these lists be transparent and public

1 STATED MEETING

64

2 so everyone could see, and I thank the Speaker, I
3 thank the Chair, Cornegy, for this, and I thank this
4 body for allowing me to get these bills passed.

5 Thank you so much. And report of special committees?

6 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Reports of
8 standing committees?

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
10 on Civil Service and Labor. Intro 1321-C, prevailing
11 wage law.

12 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
13 general orders.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
15 on Education, Intro 1547-A through Intro 1554-B, on
16 the same page, diversity in public schools.

17 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
18 general orders.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
20 on Finance, Intro 1780, hotel taxes.

21 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
22 orders.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Preconsidered Reso 1152
24 through preconsidered Reso 1154, on page 3, property
25 taxes.

1 STATED MEETING

65

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
3 orders.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Preconsidered Reso 1155,
5 organization of funding.

6 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
7 orders.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Preconsidered LU 577 and
9 Reso 1157, tax exemption.

10 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
11 orders.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
13 on Health, Intro 1361-B, diabetes reporting.

14 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
15 general orders.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Intro 1496-A, companion
17 animals.

18 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
19 general orders.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Intro 1559-A through
21 Intro 1598-A, on page 4, public burial and related
22 issues.

23 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I want to give a
24 special shout-out to Emily Balkin from the staff, who
25

1 STATED MEETING

66

2 has worked tirelessly on this issue, and amended and
3 coupled on general orders.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
5 on Housing and Buildings, Intro 550-A and 564-A,
6 housing lottery system.

7 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
8 general orders.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Intro 716-A, Mitchell-
10 Lama developments.

11 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
12 general orders.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Intro 720-C, site safety
14 training.

15 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
16 general orders.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
18 on Justice System, Intro 1156-A, community hotspots.

19 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
20 general orders.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
22 on Land Use, LU 548 through LU 554, on page 7,
23 various applications.

24 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Approved with
25 modifications and referred to the City Planning

1 STATED MEETING

67

2 Commission pursuant to Section 197-D of the New York
3 City Charter.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Excuse me. LU 558 and
5 Reso 1158, 25 Central Park West.

6 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled to be filed
7 pursuant to a letter of withdrawal.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: LU 559 and 560, Northern
9 Boulevard rezoning.

10 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Approved with
11 modifications and referred to the City Planning
12 Commission pursuant to Section 197-D of the New York
13 City Charter.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: LU 563 and Reso 1159,
15 Hunter's Point South.

16 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
17 orders.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: LU 571 and Reso 1160,
19 4797 Third Avenue.

20 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
21 orders.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Preconsidered LU 578 and
23 Reso 1161, and preconsidered LU 579 and Reso 1162,
24 Bronx special districts.

25

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled to be filed
3 pursuant to letter of withdrawal.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
5 on Parks and Recreation, Intro 906-A, Hart Island.

6 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
7 general orders.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
9 on Transportation, Intro 909-B, Hart Island travel
10 plan.

11 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Another shout-out to
12 Melinda Hunt. Amended and coupled on general orders.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: On the general order
14 calendar, LU 548 and Reso 1163 through LU 560 and
15 Reso 1171, on page 12, various applications, returned
16 from City Planning.

17 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
18 orders.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Resolution appointing
20 various persons, Commissioner of Deeds.

21 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
22 orders. And at this time I'm asking for a roll call
23 vote on all of the items on today's general order
24 calendar.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Levin.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I vote aye on all,
3 and I wanted just to thank on the march bill, the
4 Black Institute, New York City Artists Coalition,
5 Olympia Casse, Julia Friedenber, Jamie Burkhardt,
6 Otah Babble, Marva Babble, um, staff, Maxwell Camphor
7 Williams, Keshorn Denny, my colleague Rafael Espinal,
8 and Sarah Conklin, and everyone else that worked on
9 that bill. And with that I vote aye on all. Thank
10 you.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Adams.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Aye on all.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Ampry-Samuel.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Aye on all.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Ayala.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Aye on all.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Barron.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Aye on all, with
19 the exception of 563, on which I'm voting no. And I
20 am abstaining on 548 and 549 and the accompanying
21 resolutions.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Brannan.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: I vote aye on
24 all with the exception of 1780, 1152, 53, and 54.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Cabrera.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye on all.

3 COUNCIL CLERK: Matteo.

4 MINORITY LEADER MATTEO: I don't know if
5 he's still here, but I just want to wish Rob Newman
6 the best in his future endeavors and congratulations.
7 I thank you for your friendship. I thank you for the
8 work you did on our AED bills and how personal it was
9 for you and your son. I'm glad we can see those AED
10 bills through. And we're going to miss you here at
11 the council. With that, I'm voting no on 1152, 1153,
12 1154, 1156, 1321, 1547, 1550, 1552, 1552, 1554, and
13 1780, and aye on what's left.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Chin.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Congratulations to
16 all my colleagues on passing their great legislations
17 and I proudly vote aye on all.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Cohen.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Cornegy.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Permission to
22 explain my vote?

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission
24 granted.

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: So whether
3 you're a homeowner in Bedford Stuyvesant, Bay Ridge,
4 or Baychester, the burden of property taxes are too
5 much for all New Yorkers to bear, particularly for
6 lower- and middle-income individuals who are already,
7 who aren't well served by the outdated tax system.
8 Today we have the opportunity to support tax relief
9 for property owners in New York City, but it's not
10 enough. A state formula dictates the tax rates for
11 property owners in the city and New York City has
12 very little leverage to change the effective rates.
13 We requested that the state change one component in
14 the formula, which the governor has done. And this
15 will take the tax burden for tax Class 2 properties
16 to the lowest they've been since fiscal year 2009.
17 Additionally, Class 1 properties will see a slight
18 reduction in their tax burden, but it's still be a
19 higher rate than last year. I'm glad that we can do
20 this little bit today, but the real fix is in the
21 long term. The speaker and the mayor have called for
22 a reform commission and we expect a report from that
23 group at the end of this year. I look forward to
24 reading their findings and getting to work with my
25 colleagues to provide tax reliefs to all New Yorkers'

2 property and property owners. I must highlight that
3 this is an important issue in every part of the city
4 regardless of race and heritage. Meaningful change
5 for all New Yorkers means holistic change and I look
6 forward to getting that done one day. With that
7 being said, aye on everything except 1152, 53, and
8 54.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Deutsch.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye on all, with
11 the exception of 1580, 906, 909, 1780, and Resos
12 1152, 1153, and 1154.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Dromm.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Espinal.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Permission to
17 explain my vote?

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission
19 granted.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: It's no secret
21 that the cost of living in this city has dramatically
22 gone up while people's wages have stayed stagnant,
23 and because of that we are, one of the reasons is
24 that, one of those reasons, because of that we are in
25 affordable housing crisis. And we have been working

2 to build affordable housing across the city but, ah,
3 a lot of that affordable housing has workers that are
4 making minimum wage and what we're passing a bill
5 [inaudible] 21-B that would require affordable
6 housing to have workers being paid a prevailing wage.
7 We worked diligently to get this bill passed. We've
8 worked with all stakeholders from hearing stories
9 from the workers, worked with affordable housing
10 groups to figure out, to find the right balance that
11 we're building real affordable housing while also
12 making sure that people are getting paid a prevailing
13 wage to continue to be able to put food on their
14 table and pay their rent. So I am proud of this
15 bill. I want to 32BJ. I want to thank the Speaker.
16 I want to thank his staff. I want to Rob Newman.
17 We've put in a lot of hours to get this done. And I
18 want to thank my colleagues, who have all signed on
19 to get this passed. So with that said I vote aye on
20 all. Also, sorry, I want to congratulate Steve Levin
21 on passing the march bill. It's a bill that I was
22 super supportive of and it's going to be able to
23 support a lot of the marginalized communities that
24 continues to be over-policed upon in the nightlife
25 community. So I'm very proud of that bill being

2 passed, and a lot of congratulations to the New York
3 City Artists Coalition. Thank you.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Permission to
6 explain my vote?

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission
8 granted.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Thank you, Mr.
10 Public Advocate. I just want to thank and commend
11 Chair Levin, the chair of the Health Committee, for
12 this very important bill on diabetes, and, you know,
13 diabetes is a very serious disease affecting many
14 people in New York City and throughout the world.
15 And I think that we have to moral mandate to do
16 everything that we can do to ensure that we can keep
17 people healthy and to contribute the well-being, of
18 the well-being of the people. This is a wonderful
19 bill because we know that this disease affects all
20 the systems in the human body and can create other
21 disease, cardiovascular disease, neurology disease,
22 and affect the kidney, and I think this is a very,
23 very important step in trying to provide the best
24 quality of life to people that we are serving. And I
25 want to thank the speaker for his support of this

2 bill. And to conclude, let me thank also Rob Newman
3 for his excellent service to the New York City
4 Council. I had the privilege to go to him also for
5 assistance and I thank him for his service and to me
6 and to the City Council. So he was a great servant
7 of the City Council, but I'm proud to say that he is
8 a humble servant, because he is my constituent. He,
9 we will miss him, but I will see him in the district.
10 Rob, thank you very much for your outstanding
11 service. With this, I vote aye on all.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Gibson.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Permission to
14 explain?

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission
16 granted.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you, Mr.
18 Public Advocate. And good afternoon, colleagues.
19 Congratulations to everyone for passing incredibly
20 important legislation today. I just want to shout-
21 out a couple of our colleagues and recognizing their
22 incredible efforts in getting legislation passed
23 today. I want to thank our former colleague,
24 Elizabeth Crowley, for starting the conversation, and
25 Council Member Ydanis Rodriguez for making sure that

2 the legislation on today's agenda related to Hart's
3 Island is passed understanding the population of
4 residents and New Yorkers that are buried on Hart's
5 Island. I also want to recognize in addition to
6 those that have died of AIDS. We also have a
7 significant number of veterans who are buried on
8 Hart's Island. And many of the veteran organizations
9 have been advocating for this legislation. So I look
10 forward to working with our colleagues in the Parks
11 Department on the implementation to make sure we not
12 only preserve the island, restore dignity, but
13 provide enhanced transportation and access to the
14 island. I want to congratulate all of the healthcare
15 advocates from Health People and Chris Norwood and
16 her team. As someone who's been affected in my family
17 by diabetes, I am prediabetic myself. Certainly this
18 legislation is going to have a profound impact on
19 raising awareness around diabetes as well as offering
20 more education and awareness and promotion in many of
21 our communities, so I applaud that, and also want to
22 recognize Council Member Rafael Espinal and the
23 legislation related to prevailing wage for building
24 service employees at certain development projects.
25 Thank you for your leadership and to all the 32BJ

2 family, our president, Kyle Bragg, and many others
3 who really made sure that we continue to lift up our
4 working New Yorkers and we provide the dignity they
5 all deserve as well as the services that they provide
6 every single day in our communities. And also want
7 to congratulate Rob Newman on his incredible service
8 here at the City Council. May God bless you in your
9 new journey and new chapter of service. We will miss
10 you. And with that I vote aye on all. And
11 congratulations, Public Advocate.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Gjonaj.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Permission to
15 explain my vote?

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission
17 granted.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: I vote aye on all
19 except 1780, I will not be supporting the renewal of
20 the hotel tax. Resolutions 1152, 53, and 54, our
21 real estate tax system is broken. No matter how you
22 put it this is a real estate tax increase, which will
23 make it harder for renters, homeowners, and
24 businesses to survive and remain as residents in our
25 city. Outer borough residents already face the

2 higher effective rate and the 13th Council District
3 has the highest effective tax rate in the entire
4 city. So I vote no on those three resolutions and no
5 1580, 909, 906 pertaining to Hart Island, Potter's
6 Field, for the uncertainty and the future of Hart
7 Island because the bills do not go far enough to
8 ensure that those that are buried there and the
9 families that have loved ones buried there will be
10 treated with dignity and respect and assuring that
11 the money that's needed and resources that's needed
12 to maintain that cemetery, to maintain Hart Island
13 hasn't been streamlined and fully dedicated to the
14 necessity of its requirements. Thank you.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Grodenchik.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Mr. Public
17 Advocate, permission to briefly explain my vote.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission
19 granted.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Thank you.
21 Congratulations to you. I want to congratulate my
22 seat mate, Donovan Richards, on the Edgemere
23 redevelopment. This is something that literally has
24 been kicking around since before he was born. So
25 congratulations to you, Donovan. I want to echo my

2 colleague Rob Cornegy's remarks. I'm going to vote
3 yes on that property tax package because it does
4 represent a decline in the rate. But we really need
5 to do real property tax reform. The property tax
6 owners, mostly single-family homeowners in the city,
7 are getting clobbered, and the rates continue to go
8 up by about 6% a year. The revenue does, anyway, and
9 it has to stop because it's just unsustainable. With
10 that, I vote aye on all with the exception of Intro
11 906, from which I abstain. Thank you.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Holden.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: I vote aye on all
14 with the exception of 1547-A, 1550-A, 1552-B, 1554-B,
15 1556-A, 1780, and preconsidered Resos 1152, 1153, and
16 1154. I vote no. Thank you.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Kallos.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Permission to
19 explain my vote briefly?

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission
21 granted.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I just want to
23 speak in favor of Introduction 1321-C and making sure
24 that is the city subsidizes projects. We're not
25 actually making the affordable housing crisis worse

1 STATED MEETING

80

2 by paying people poverty wages. This legislation
3 will make sure that the people who are caring for our
4 buildings in our city that are receiving subsidies
5 will hopefully be able to afford to live in that
6 subsidized housing, if not market-rate housing. That
7 being said, I vote aye on all.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Koo.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: I want to
10 congratulate Rob Newman, our legislative director for
11 all the time, and I want to thank him for his
12 wonderful service to our City Council. And with that
13 I vote aye on all.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Koslowitz. Koslowitz.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Council Member
16 Koslowitz?

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Lancman.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Lander.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Request
21 permission to explain?

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission
23 granted.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you. I
25 want to thank my colleagues for your support on Intro

2 1547-A, which strengthens the School Diversity
3 Accountability Act. As James Baldwin taught, not
4 everything that is faced can be changed, but nothing
5 can be changed until it is faced. The work to look
6 honestly on segregation in our schools began in many
7 ways in this council five years ago when we had a 10-
8 hour hearing and out of that passed the School
9 Diversity Accountability Act that has provided us
10 with a lot of data. That data has not been easy to
11 look at, but it has been a platform for organizing.
12 We used it aggressively in district 15 to make
13 dramatic changes to our middle schools and where last
14 year three of the 11 middle schools were in any way
15 integrated and diverse because of those changes eight
16 of the 11 are now genuinely integrated and we're
17 going to get the other three next year, and that is
18 mostly because of organizing and courage, but it
19 would not have happened without the data that was
20 provided by that act. So I am very glad today that
21 we are strengthening that act, providing some
22 additional data, comparing schools to their school
23 attendance zones and their districts, looking at
24 special programs within schools so we can tell if a
25 school is internally segregated, even if everybody

2 going in the door is more diverse, and I'm pleased
3 that it's part of the broader package that includes
4 the set of bills from the chair and the public
5 advocate and other members that I believe can give us
6 the data and the courage to move boldly forward so
7 that someday we will not have one of the most
8 segregated school systems in the country. Also proud
9 to be a cosponsor of 1321-C and very glad we're
10 moving forward to make sure there's a living wage for
11 that set of workers who are working in our subsidized
12 affordable housing. I vote aye on all.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Levine.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Ah, permission to
15 my vote, Mr. Public Advocate?

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission
17 granted.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: OK. I want to
19 thank my colleagues for supporting Intro 1361. Today
20 as we seek to force this city to confront the public
21 health crisis of diabetes, a fight in which we have
22 stalled a disease which has severely disparate
23 impacts on people of color in this city and we need
24 to force the city to confront this crisis. The bill
25 does that by requiring regular release of data on all

2 aspects of this disease, including the number of
3 amputations and by requiring that a robust plan be
4 developed for us to win this fight. I do want to
5 acknowledge the incredible leaders of Health People
6 for helping make this legislation possible. I'm also
7 pleased that today we'll be passing, and thank my
8 colleagues for support, of Intro 550, which would
9 bring fairness and transparency, consistency, to the
10 HPD lottery system, where the stakes couldn't be
11 higher. On average we had 70,000 people applying to
12 major affordable housing projects in this city and we
13 have got to give them a lottery process which is
14 absolutely beyond reproach. To do that our bill
15 would require that HPD regularly disclose all
16 policies related to how people qualify for lotteries,
17 how lotteries are conducted, how waiting lists are
18 populated and managed, how the transition to a fully
19 online system will be carried out, and much more.
20 And lastly I want to thank everyone who made it
21 possible for us today to make history in the way that
22 we treat the most marginalized in society in their
23 moment of death. For generations we have shamefully,
24 shamefully kept the poor, the indigent, the sick, on
25 an island that has been ignored and neglected and we

2 owe better to these one million New Yorkers and those
3 who every year are continued to be buried on Hart
4 Island. Thank you to the billion sponsors. Thank
5 you to Melinda Hunt, and thank you to Speaker Corey
6 Johnson for making this history possible. And I am
7 pleased to vote aye on all.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Louis.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Permission to
10 explain my vote?

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission
12 granted.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Thank you so much.
14 Congratulations, Public Advocate, on your success,
15 and Rob Newman, you will be dearly missed. I'm
16 voting aye on all except 1152, 1153, and 1154. A
17 large portion of my district and the ones that
18 surround Council District 45 encompass homeowners and
19 small businesses who feel overwhelmed and
20 overburdened and overtaxed. When we're seeking to
21 increase property taxes we need to implement better
22 measures to inform our homeowners and our small
23 businesses in a timely matter that enables them to
24 financially prepare for their anticipated changes
25 we're requesting while protecting us as this helps

2 and protects us as members to be transparent who seek
3 to support these recommendations and this helps us to
4 identify resources to ensure that the city can
5 continue to function and provide necessary services.
6 Thank you.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Menchaca.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Permission to
9 explain my vote?

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission
11 granted.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: I want to
13 finish the thank-yous for 720, Megan Chen and Jeff
14 Baker. Thank you so much for being in the room every
15 time we sat down and reviewed. This is why you have
16 720-C. C is the third version of this bill, and
17 thank you so much for that work. I also want to
18 thank the three members who negotiated the work
19 around the protection, the flood protection, Rivera,
20 Chin, and Powers. I look to them with a lot of envy.
21 I think about Red Hook and the work that we have to
22 do in Red Hook to do some integrated flood protection
23 there and so I can't wait to learn a little bit more
24 about how we can do that in other parts of the city.
25 And I also want to say thank you to 32BJ for their

2 hard work on the ground, thinking through a very
3 complicated piece of legislation, but also I think
4 it's going to be a very comprehensive impact to, um,
5 to many New Yorkers. And again a shout-out to my
6 brother, Jumaane Williams, our public advocate now,
7 and the work that we have to do to ensure that no
8 more people die on our construction sites. We do
9 that every day when we think about them. But this
10 bill is going to help ensure that everyone gets
11 trained. Thank you. I vote aye on all.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Miller.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Permission to
14 explain my vote, please?

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission
16 granted.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you, sir.
18 I'd first like to echo the sentiments of the speaker
19 and condolences to the family of Firefight Cecelia
20 Cox, and Traffic Enforcement Linda Mercer. These
21 young women were tireless public advocates,
22 superheroes that, that the work that they have done
23 will not be forgotten. I'd also like to congratulate
24 Council Member Espinal for his legislation being
25 passed here on prevailing wage. I think that we have

2 demonstrated here today that our mission to create
3 affordable housing and to value, respect, and bring
4 dignity and proper compensation to workers are not
5 mutually exclusive and by what we are doing here
6 today we demonstrate that. And I will be, I will
7 vote aye on all except for 563. I'll be abstaining
8 on that and its accompanying resolution, 1159. I'll
9 be voting no on 1152 and 1153.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Moya.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Permission to
12 explain my vote?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: I want to take this
14 opportunity to thank our esteemed colleague, Council
15 Member Espinal, for his leadership, to 32BJ members,
16 and to the president, Kyle Bragg, all the rank and
17 file members that have come out to support this Intro
18 1321-C. I'm a firm believer that taxpayer dollars
19 should not be creating poverty-wage jobs. We
20 desperately need affordable housing, but by paying
21 workers who maintain these properties less than
22 prevailing wage we're actually exacerbating the
23 problem. So I thank them for their leadership as
24 this fight continues. I will be vote aye on all,
25 with the exceptions of Intro 1780 and 720-C.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Perkins.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: I'm gonna vote
4 aye on all. I want to applaud the changes in
5 organizing of our schools and look forward to more of
6 reforms of the lingering segregated schools that have
7 yet to come to an end, in other words I vote aye on
8 all with [inaudible] concerns and hopefully taking
9 the forefront in terms of what we do next.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Powers.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Permission to
12 explain my vote?

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission
14 granted.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Thank you. I, in
16 my last comments didn't have an opportunity to say
17 some thank-yous to everybody who worked on the ESCR
18 land use application alongside of myself and the
19 other two members. I want to Chelsea Kelly and those
20 folks on the council land use staff. I want to
21 thank, we had worked very hard pushing this
22 administration into times where they were very
23 difficult conversations to have about getting this
24 plan to a better place. But I do want to thank the
25 Commissioner Grillo, Jimmy Torres Springer, the Parks

2 Department, the borough, Manhattan DOT, and others.

3 I also want to thank my staff, Ben Jacobs, Emily
4 Walsh, and Liz Peters for their work on this as well.

5 And I just want to say a thank you to Rob Newman. I
6 don't know if he's still here, but Rob has served
7 this institution in a very great way for years, and
8 I've had the opportunity to work alongside of him
9 with some unfinished legislation that we will as well
10 get to. With that being said, I'm vote aye on all
11 with the exception of 1780. Thank you.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Reynoso.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Permission to
14 explain my vote?

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission
16 granted.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you,
18 Public Advocate. Congratulations to the public
19 advocate, Jumaane Williams, for the great work. It
20 wasn't a surprise, but we are grateful that you are
21 the public advocate. If there was any position that
22 was better suited for you or the other way around, it
23 would be public advocate. I'm really excited that
24 you'll be doing that without having to run three
25 times in less than, what it is, six months? So

2 congratulations to you. I do want to say to my
3 colleagues in Manhattan, congratulations to that
4 work. I want to be very clear. That Brooklyn would
5 kill for that type of work to be done in our borough,
6 and we're actually very envious of the great work
7 that you guys were able to do and put together to
8 make that happen. In the Brooklyn delegation we will
9 be doing our part to try to match that and try to be
10 as successful as you are. You set the ground game
11 for it. So I just want to say thank you for being
12 bold, for being strong, and doing something that I
13 think for a long time we're gonna, you're gonna be
14 very happy about. So congratulations to you and to
15 my neighbor in the borough of Brooklyn, Council
16 Member Rafael Espinal, for the work that he did on
17 1321-C. For too long we had building service workers
18 in the City of New York that can't afford to live in
19 the buildings where they work and we, I think we got
20 this a little closer now, where that reality can be
21 true. So I want to thank him for the work that he
22 did there, congratulate him for the work that he did
23 there. And I would vote aye on all. Thank you.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Richards.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: I just wanted
3 to thank the speaker for acknowledging the life of
4 Cecelia Cox. You know, sometimes we have heroes
5 amongst us and we don't even know it. But I'm a
6 young man whose parents were best friends with her
7 and her husband, and you know, I have some fond
8 memories of playing in her house and watching a Tyson
9 fight even one time, and picked up the *Daily News*
10 this week and did not even know how much history she
11 made in the city. So with that I dedicate my vote to
12 her. I just had spoke to her about a month ago, but
13 didn't realize how sick she was. So with that I
14 dedicate my vote to her and I vote aye.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Rivera.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Permission to
17 explain my vote?

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission
19 granted.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: So while ESCR is
21 just the first project of many the city must complete
22 quickly [loud outburst in background]

23 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: We are going to
24 have clear out the chamber at this time. We are
25 going to clear the chamber at this time. We

2 apologize for all those that are going to have to
3 leave. But for the safety of this body we are not
4 going to compromise our members. If you do not sit
5 down at this time we are going to have to clear out
6 the entire chamber. We cannot compromise the safety of
7 this body and outbursts of that kind do exactly that.
8 Additional outbursts and we will clear the chamber.
9 We must respect the entire body.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you,
11 Majority Leader. You actually stuck to the coffee,
12 that was pretty cool actually, that was pretty new.
13 Thank you, Council Member Rivera, for your patience.
14 Up until now we're not bad. Yeah, that was the most
15 respectful protest I ever seen [laughs].

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Up until now.

18 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you. Quiet
19 in the chamber. We'll turn it back over to Public
20 Advocate Jumaane Williams and we will continue with
21 Council Member Carlina Rivera.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: So this is the
23 first project of many and my colleagues, Council
24 Member Mark Treyger, and as you heard from Council
25 Member Menchaca, Reynoso, and of course Donovan

2 Richards, we are always talking about how we can
3 bring resiliency projects and more sustainable
4 community development across the five boroughs, and I
5 do hope that we can learn from this project, and it
6 can be a model in many ways. I have to thank a lot
7 of people very, very quickly, including Manhattan
8 borough president, Gail Brewer, Congresswoman
9 Caroline Maloney, Nidia Velasquez, Assembly Members
10 Harvey Epstein and Yuh-Line Niou, State Senators Brad
11 Hoyleman and Brian Kavanaugh, and all of our
12 district. I have to thank the community
13 organizations that guided our negotiations. A
14 special, special thanks to my community boards,
15 Community Boards 3 and 6, and Susan Setser, the
16 district manager, and Megan Joy are here. Park users
17 such as Solar One, our local sports teams, especially
18 our Little League coaches, Tony, Danny, and Seth, the
19 Lower East Side Ecology Center, our Stye Town
20 tenants, and all the NYCHA residents at Baruch,
21 Reese, Wald, Vladik, Compost Two, LES2, LES3, and
22 Gompers Houses, all of the advocates and the
23 community organizations that have provided needed
24 expertise to this process, including Rebuild by
25 Design, Regional Plan Association, New York League of

2 Conversation Voters, New Yorkers for Parks, the Lower
3 East Side Center and Fab NYC. And I have to thank
4 the council land use division, Chelsea Kelly, Arthur
5 Ho, Raju Mann, Julie Lubin, Amy Levitton, and of
6 course Jason Goldman. And I have to thank my entire
7 staff, but particularly my chief of staff, Pedro
8 Carillo for shepherding this project through from day
9 one. Thank you for allowing me the opportunity to
10 speak. And I proudly vote aye on these historic land
11 use items.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Permission to
14 explain my vote?

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission
16 granted.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: So, yes,
18 following up what I was explaining about Hart Island,
19 I would like to add that, you know, as we were
20 talking about the historical part of Hart Island when
21 the city purchased the island for \$75,000 in 1968
22 from the Hunter family, then today 150 years after
23 Hart Island is continuing bury the immigrants and the
24 poorest and the homeless. No wealthy families ever
25 in that location. Just the poorest one. Those

2 people who live in communities such as northern
3 Manhattan, they can live in the South Bronx, they can
4 live in Brooklyn and Queens and other places where
5 New Yorkers make close to 40%, New Yorkers living in
6 poverty. Those New Yorker that apply for financial
7 support to bury their loved one, however, the City of
8 New York only provide \$1200 of financial assistant to
9 help to cover the cost of a cemetery and the funeral.
10 So I believe that as we are making this transition on
11 transferring the control of Hart Island from
12 correctional to park we also need to call the City of
13 New York to lobby at Albany so that we can increase
14 the financial support that we provide to family from
15 \$1200 that we do today, amount of dollar that
16 everyone know is not enough to cover for the cemetery
17 and the funeral. [speaking in Spanish] With that I
18 vote aye.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Rose.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I vote aye on all
21 except for 1152, 1153, and 1154.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Rosenthal.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: With
24 congratulations to my colleagues, I vote aye on all.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Torres.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Aye on all.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Permission to
4 explain my vote?

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Permission
6 granted.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Yes, thank you
8 Public Advocate and congratulations to you again on
9 your well-deserved victory. I just want to
10 definitely commend my colleagues, Council Members
11 Rivera, Powers, Chin, and others who I do think
12 deserve a lot of credit for what they've been able to
13 negotiate. But I just want to point out the mayor's
14 score card on this issue when it comes to city
15 capital spending on resiliency in the five boroughs.
16 I represent Coney Island, one of the hardest hit
17 areas from Superstorm Sandy, certainly lower AMI
18 levels than parts of the east side of Manhattan.
19 Here's the score card. City capital spending - east
20 side of Manhattan 1.4 billion dollars, southern
21 Brooklyn - 32 million. This is with knowledge that
22 the Army Corps of Engineers said that Brooklyn and
23 Queens are the most vulnerable boroughs to climate
24 change and storms. So one billion, over a billion,
25 to 32 million. We have an inequality problem here

2 and so Mr. Mayor you need to align your resources and
3 your actions with your words and your pledges. Let
4 me just speak about my bills that we're voting on
5 today as well. With the passage of Introduction 564-
6 A we will finally know exactly who qualifies for
7 affordable housing and who does not and why. This
8 bill will help shed light on the demand for
9 affordable housing units in New York City and create
10 transparency for residents who apply to the
11 affordable housing lottery and the number of
12 applicants who sign leases for affordable housing
13 units in the city. My colleagues and I heard from
14 many who are being rejected for unclear reasons than
15 those who are winning the lottery. We'd like to know
16 what is working, what's not working, and to finally
17 answer the question, affordable for who.

18 Additionally, Intro 1554-B will require the DOE to
19 report on the demographics of all school staff in all
20 city schools. This will include teachers, leadership
21 staff, paras, counselors, psychologists. We need a
22 culture-responsive curricula in our school system,
23 and I just, I want to thank all the staff that helped
24 me on the bill, and Public Advocate, just a few more
25 seconds. Speaking of schools, we had another school

2 shooting in America today in Santa Clarita,
3 California. I believe at least two students have
4 been shot killed, five seriously wounded. We have a
5 crisis in this country. This government must pass
6 gun reform legislation immediately. But I also want
7 to note we desperately need to hire more social
8 workers and counselors in our schools.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you,
10 Council Member.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: That to me is
12 something we must address in the city and across this
13 country and our prayers and thoughts are there, but
14 not sufficient in terms of addressing this crisis
15 that we're facing in America. And with that I vote
16 aye on all.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you,
18 Council Member.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Ulrich.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: I vote aye on all
21 with the exception of preconsidered Reso 1152, 1153,
22 1154, and I'm also voting against 1547-A, 1550-A,
23 1552-B, 1554-B, 1156-A, and 1780. And
24 congratulations to our newly reelected public
25 advocate, Jumaane Williams. Congratulations, sir.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Vallone.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Mr. Public
4 Advocate, I'd like to officially amend my name to add
5 my middle initial to my last name, so I will
6 henceforth be Avallone to be at the front of the list
7 for voting. What do you think? Can we do that, is
8 it possible?

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: I'm not sure.
10 [laughter] You have to speak to the Majority Leader.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: [laughs] I was
12 just thinking it might be a way to go. I would like
13 to vote aye on all with the exception of 1780, Resos
14 1152, 1153, 1154. With that, congratulations and
15 Godspeed to Rob. Thank you, everyone.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Van Bramer.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye on all.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Yeger.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: I vote aye on all
20 with the exception of Resolution 1152, 1153, 1154,
21 Intro 1780, 1156. I abstain on Intros 1547, 1150,
22 1552, 1554, and 909. Thank you.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Cumbo.

24 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: I vote aye on
25 all.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you very
3 much for your patience. All items on today's general
4 order calendar are adopted by a vote of 40 in the
5 affirmative, zero in the negative, and zero in the
6 abstentions, with the exception of Land Use 548 and
7 549 with accompany Resos, which was adopted by a vote
8 of 47 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative, and 1
9 abstention, and Land Use 563 and Reso 1159, which was
10 adopted by a vote of 46 in the affirmative, 1 in the
11 negative, 1 in the abstention, and Intro 906-A which
12 was adopted by a vote of 45 in the affirmative, 2 in
13 the negative, and 1 abstentions, and Intro 909-B,
14 which was adopted by a vote of 45 in the affirmative,
15 2 in the negative, and 1 abstention, and Intro 1156-A
16 which was adopted by a vote of 44 in the affirmative,
17 4 in the negative and 0 abstentions, and Intro 1321-C
18 which was adopted by a vote of 47 in the affirmative,
19 1 in the negative, and 0 abstentions, and Intro 1547-
20 A, which was adopted by a vote of 44 in the
21 affirmative, 3 in the negative, and 1 abstention, and
22 Intro 1550-A which was adopted by a vote of 44 in the
23 affirmative, 3 in the negative, and 1 abstention, and
24 Intro 1552-A which was adopted by a vote of 44 in the
25 affirmative, 3 in the negative, and 1 abstention, and

2 Intro 1554-B, which was adopted by a vote of 44 in
3 the affirmative, 3 in the negative, and 1 abstention,
4 and Intro 1580-A, which was adopted by a vote of 46
5 in the affirmative, 2 in the negative, and 0
6 abstentions, and Intro 1780-A which was adopted by a
7 vote of 30 in the affirmative, 10 in the negative, 0
8 abstentions, and Resolutions 1152 and 1153, which was
9 adopted by a vote of 36 in the affirmative, 12 in the
10 negative, and 0 abstentions, and Resolution 1154,
11 which was adopted by a vote of 37 in the affirmative,
12 11 in the negative, and 0 abstentions, and Intro 720-
13 C which was adopted by a vote of 47 in the
14 affirmative, 1 in the negative, and 0 abstentions.
15 The revised land use call-ups now are 40 in the
16 affirmative and 0 in the negative. Introduction and
17 reading of the bills.

18 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: All bills have
19 been referred to committee as indicated on the
20 agenda.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Resolutions?

22 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Seeing none.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: All right. We
24 will now move to general discussions. So far we have
25 no council members signed up to speak. I did want to

2 thank the body again for passing my piece of
3 legislation. I did want to thank the body again for
4 passing my piece of legislation. I did want to say
5 congratulations to Rob Newman on his excellent
6 career. He has helped pass a number of bills,
7 including the Community Safety Act, which was a
8 landmark legislation this body has passed, and just
9 lastly, she thought she was going to get away, but my
10 press secretary, Leticia Taylor Green's birthday is
11 today and I want to wish her a very happy birthday.
12 She's here today. Thank you very much. And I'll now
13 call on Majority Leader Cumbo to close the meeting
14 today.

15 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you. The
16 Stated Meeting of November 14, 2019, is hereby
17 adjourned. Thank you. [gavel]

18
19
20
21 [Transcriber's Note:

22 Revised Vote:

23
24 Land-Use Call-Up vote was 48-0. All items on the
25 General Order Calendar were

1 STATED MEETING

103

2 adopted by a vote of 47-0-0, except for the
3 following items that were
4 adopted by votes of:

5
6 Int 720-C

7 46 affirmative

8 1 negative

9 0 abstentions

10

11 Int 906-A

12 44 affirmative

13 2 negative

14 1 abstention

15

16 Int 909-B

17 44 affirmative

18 2 negative

19 1 abstention

20

21 Int 1156-A

22 43 affirmative

23 4 negative

24 0 abstentions

25

1 STATED MEETING
2 Int 1321-C
3 46 affirmative
4 1 negative
5 0 abstentions
6
7 Int 1547-A
8 43 affirmative
9 3 negative
10 1 abstention
11
12 Int 1550-A
13 43 affirmative
14 3 negative
15 1 abstention
16
17 Int 1552-B
18 43 affirmative
19 3 negative
20 1 abstention
21
22 Int 1554-B
23 43 affirmative
24 3 negative
25 1 abstention

1 STATED MEETING

105

2

3 Int 1580-A

4 45 affirmative

5 2 negative

6 0 abstentions

7

8 Int 1780

9 37 affirmative

10 10 negative

11 0 abstentions

12

13 Preconsidered Res 1152

14 35 affirmative

15 12 negative

16 0 abstentions

17

18 Preconsidered Res 1153

19 35 affirmative

20 12 negative

21 0 abstentions

22

23 Preconsidered Res 1154

24 36 affirmative

25 11 negative

1 STATED MEETING
2 0 abstentions
3
4 L.U. 548 & Res 1163
5 46 affirmative
6 0 negative
7 1 abstention
8
9 L.U. 549 & Res 1164
10 46 affirmative
11 0 negative
12 1 abstentions
13
14 L.U. 563 & Res 1159
15 45 affirmative
16 1 negative
17 1 abstention]
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

107

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

108

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date December 3, 2019