

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

STATED MEETING

----- X

February 26, 2015
Start: 1:23 p.m.
Recess: 2:57 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: LETITIA JAMES
Public Advocate

MELISSA MARK-VIVERTIO
Speaker for the Council

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Maria Del Carmen Arroyo
Inez D. Barron
Fernando Cabrera
Margaret S. Chin
Andrew Cohen
Costa G. Constantinides
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
Elizabeth S. Crowley
Laurie A. Cumbo
Chaim M. Deutsch
Inez E. Dickens
Daniel Dromm
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.
Mathieu Eugene

Julissa Ferreras
Daniel R. Garodnick
Vincent J. Gentile
Vanessa L. Gibson
Daniel G. Greenfield
Vincent Ignizio
Corey D. Johnson
Ben Kallos
Andy L. King
Peter A. Koo
Karen Koslowitz
Rory I. Lancman
Brad S. Lander
Stephen T. Levin
Mark Levine
Alan N. Maisel
Steven Matteo
Darlene Mealy
Carlos Menchaca
Rosie Mendez
I. Daneek Miller
Annabel Palma
Antonio Reynoso
Donovan J. Richards
Ydanis A. Rodriguez
Deborah L. Rose
Helen K. Rosenthal
Ritchie J. Torres
Mark Treyger
Eric A. Ulrich
James Vacca
Paul A. Vallone
James G. Van Bramer
Mark S. Weprin
Jumaane D. Williams
Ruben Wills

1 STATED MEETING

3

2 [sound check, pause]

3 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I think we're
4 going to get started with ceremonials. We're starting
5 off with Council Member Cornegy who is-- And we'll
6 take our time as people are coming down. We have the
7 largest group together. It's probably the largest
8 ceremonial I've seen. Recognizing the Bedford-
9 Stuyvesant Volunteer Ambulance Corps [cheers] for
10 there quick response to shootings of Detectives Liu
11 and Ramos. Thank you very much. That's significant.
12 I didn't realize that was why you were honoring them,
13 but thank you so much, and I'll pass it onto Council
14 Member Cornegy.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Come on you
16 all, you're doing me proud, man. Come on Rocky.

17 [background conversation]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Vanessa, where's
19 Jumaane?

20 [background conversation]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: So, while we're
22 assembling, I just want to say a few quick words
23 about this fine, fine institution. So we're here
24 today to honor the Bedford-Stuyvesant Volunteer
25 Ambulance Corps for being the first responders to the

1 STATED MEETING

4

2 scene of the unfortunate killings of Detectives Ramos
3 and Liu in late December of last year. But I just
4 wanted you to know that that's why we're here. We
5 are honoring them today, but they are so much more.
6 They provided opportunities for young people in the
7 village of Bedford-Stuyvesant and Crown Heights for
8 decades and have been responsible for the training of
9 young people, and giving them an opportunity to live
10 a life that's fruitful, and to be productive members
11 of society. In addition, we're honoring them for the
12 great service they provide for the residents of
13 Bedford-Stuyvesant, a minority community faced with a
14 crisis in emergency medical services that afflicts
15 many of New York's minority communities.

16 Established in 1988 by Captain James
17 Rocky Robinson and Specialist Jose Perez, Bedford-
18 Stuy Volunteer Ambulance Corporation is the nation's
19 first minority run volunteer ambulance corp. It has
20 been serving Bedford-Stuyvesant proudly for decades.
21 It has changed-- [applause and cheers] They have
22 changed the lives of both those in need of its
23 emergency care in the lives of over 2,000 locals
24 residents who have been trained as first responders
25 through its many training initiatives. It is my

1 STATED MEETING

5

2 great pride as the council member representing
3 Bedford-Stuyvesant that I stand her today to honor
4 the work of these fine individuals who together make
5 up the Bedford-Stuyvesant Volunteer Ambulance Corps.
6 Thank you for your fine work and dedication to saving
7 lives.

8 [applause and cheers]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: And we're just
10 going to have the proclamation read, please.

11 CLERK: [off mic] Council City of New
12 York Proclamation.

13 Whereas--I have it.

14 CLERK: Council City of New York
15 Proclamation.

16 Whereas, the Council of the City of New
17 York is proud to recognize the Bedford-Stuyvesant
18 Volunteer Ambulance Corps for its quick response in
19 the wake of a most grievous incident on the evening
20 of December 28, 2014 in which NYPD Detectives Rafael
21 Ramos and Wenjian Liu were killed; and

22 Whereas, the Bedford-Stuyvesant Volunteer
23 Ambulance Corps, the nation's first minority run
24 volunteer ambulance corps was founded in 1988 by two
25 EMS workers, Captain James Rocky Robinson and

1 STATED MEETING

6

2 Specialist Joe Perez. Bedford-Stuyvesant Volunteer
3 Ambulance Corps was created in response to the crisis
4 in emergency medical service that afflicts New York's
5 minority communities including Bed-Stuy; and

6 Whereas, Bed-Stuy Volunteer Ambulance
7 Corps is the busiest volunteer ambulance service for
8 its size in the nation. It prides itself on its two-
9 fold mission of saving lives and building lives. By
10 training individuals to deliver emergency medical
11 care, Bed-Stuy supplies--supplies a steady stream of
12 volunteers able to operate ambulances. Bed-Stuy's
13 training opportunities offer people in the community
14 secure employment; and

15 Whereas, Bed-Stuy has played an important
16 role in reducing ambulance response times in Bedford-
17 Stuyvesant. Currently, Bed-Stuy responds to more
18 than 100 emergency calls a month with an average
19 response time of less than four minutes.

20 [applause and cheers]

21 Bed-Stuy has also established a
22 neighborhood first aid center and works to promote
23 preventive healthcare in the community; and

24 Whereas, Bed-Stuy has trained more than
25 2,000 local residents as first responders who can

1 STATED MEETING

7

2 save lives in emergencies. Developed a remarkable
3 youth corps program that provides CPR, first aid and
4 basic emergency training to teens and young adults
5 preparing them for full-time employment in emergency
6 medicine. And has created the Trauma Troopers, a
7 program for younger children that also provides CPR
8 and first aid training; and

9 Where, Bed-Stuy has received many honors
10 for its accomplishments and ongoing efforts including
11 the Robinhood Foundation Hero of the Year Award; New
12 York City Hero Awards; American Institute for Public
13 Service Jefferson Award; Points of Light Awards;
14 awarded by President George W. Bush; and the Maxwell
15 House Hero Search Award; and

16 Whereas, the volunteers of Bed-Stuy were
17 the first responders to the scene of the tragic
18 murder of Detectives Wenjian Liu and Rafael Ramos on
19 December 20, 2014, and fought valiantly to save the
20 lives of two of New York's finest. Their efforts
21 demonstrate the genuine concern and humanitarian
22 spirit that make Bed-Stuy, Brooklyn and all of New
23 York City such an extraordinary place to call home.

24 Now, therefore, be it known that the
25 Council of the City of New York gratefully honors the

1 STATED MEETING

8

2 Bedford-Stuyvesant Volunteer Ambulance Corps for its
3 dedication and excellent work as first responders.

4 Marissa Mark-Viverito, Speaker for the Entire
5 Council, Robert Cornegy, Council Member 36th
6 District, Brooklyn.

7 [applause and cheers]

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Who's going to--
9 who's going to say a few words in Manhattan? Okay,
10 Rocky. Rocky.

11 JAMES ROCKY ROBINSON: First of all, I'd
12 like to thank you. After 27 years, we started at the
13 bottom. Now, we're here. [laughter] I want to ask
14 my cadets, Who are we?

15 CADETS: [in unison] Family.

16 JAMES ROCKY ROBINSON: What are we?

17 CADETS: [in unison] The people's EMS.

18 JAMES ROCKY ROBINSON: What do we do?

19 CADETS: [in unison] We save lives.

20 JAMES ROCKY ROBINSON: What do we want?

21 CADETS: [in unison] Jobs.

22 JAMES ROCKY ROBINSON: How do you stop
23 the violence?

24 CADETS. [in unison] Jobs.

25 JAMES ROCKY ROBINSON: What is failure?

1 STATED MEETING

9

2 CADET: [in unison] Not an option. [sic]

3 JAMES ROCKY ROBINSON: The Bedford-
4 Stuyvesant Volunteer Ambulance Corps implore you to
5 help me save our young people by creating in your
6 neighborhood the same thing we created in our
7 neighborhood, and we will do that. We are
8 proliferating all over the world. Right now they're
9 running a 30 dollar--a 30 minute documentary on us in
10 Spain. They're also show us 30 minutes in Paris,
11 France. They're show us all over the world. But we
12 don't have resources. We have to get out in the
13 street. We have to get nickels and dimes, but we
14 have a few people that's coming on board that I
15 really, really love and you politicians you guys are
16 the--are the greatest. [applause and cheers] You
17 know, we was ignored for 27 years, but thank God we
18 got some politicians and a City Council that realized
19 what we do, and we thank you for that.

20 [applause and cheers]

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you for
22 your service. All right. Thank you guys. Thank
23 you, Robert. This is great. Thank you, guys very
24 much.

25 [background conversation and noise]

1 STATED MEETING

10

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Okay, we're
3 trying to--we're going to line up the next
4 ceremonial. We'll wait a couple of minutes because
5 it's a large group that we just honored. And to all
6 of you that are part of this volunteer corps, thank
7 you so much for your--for your service. Thank you.
8 All right, Council Member Williams has the next
9 ceremonial. I think the East Flatbush Village
10 Cheerleading Team. Do you want to come through to
11 the side if you can. They're being honored for
12 winning a national championship. Very exciting.
13 [applause] How are you? How are you?

14 YOUNG GIRL: I'm fine.

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Hi, oh, wow.
16 Nice. Again, this is the East Flatbush Village
17 Cheerleading Team, and Council Member Williams has
18 this ceremonial.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: East Flatbush
20 Village in the house? [applause and cheers] All
21 right, so I'm very proud to honor East Flatbush
22 Village. They're here today because they won. They
23 came first in a national stepping contest. That was
24 in Florida, right.

25 CHEERLEADERS: Yes.

1 STATED MEETING

11

2 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: And they came
3 third for dancing. They make us proud every single
4 day, but they're also one of the core groups that
5 helped me combat gun violence in East Flatbush
6 Village. Monique Waterman and her husband Mr.
7 Waterman found the organizations. They were the
8 dynamic duo, and now have expanded so much work and
9 they are--as we are expanding the Cure Violence
10 Crisis Management System, East Flatbush Village is a
11 primary partner in there. Their programs also enable
12 and extend to youth ages 3 through 18 years old to
13 express themselves. And created positive waves while
14 building their self-esteem through football,
15 swimming, soccer, dance, cheerleading or other
16 recreational activities. The activities provide
17 youth not only with resources with outlets. But also
18 with mentors such as coaches, volunteers who are
19 willing and able to guide them, building them a
20 strong foundation, which will carry them onto
21 adulthood. They do much of this work out of their
22 home. They have now expanded throughout East
23 Flatbush Village. And they do fantastic work not
24 just in my district, but in neighboring districts as

25

1 STATED MEETING

12

2 well. So we're very excited about the work that
3 they're doing.

4 I want to give a special shout out to
5 Georgia Graham, Kelly Rogers, Charmaine DeShong.
6 That sounds familiar. Juliani DeShong? [sic] What
7 was it? Okay. TS, Tyra Smith, and Charisma Jay who
8 are coaches also. I want to give a special shout out
9 to Officer Tonya Barry from the 67th Precinct. The
10 67th Precinct is very involved in a lot of the work
11 that they do here. So I just want to say thank you
12 so much to each Flatbush Village and congratulations
13 to the young people. Smile, man. You all look all--
14 Smile, man. Why--why you won't smile? You won't
15 small at all? Well, congratulations.
16 Congratulations. [cheers] All right. So can you
17 read the proc, please?

18 FEMALE SPEAKER: Council, City of New
19 York Proclamation.

20 Whereas, the Council of the City of New
21 York is proud to honor the East Flatbush Village All
22 Stars Youth Cheers Step and Dance Team for the
23 excellent teamwork and achievement at the 2014
24 American Youth Football and Cheer National
25 Championships; and

2 Whereas, East Flatbush Village is a not-
3 for-profit organization committed to providing
4 support and information to low-income and indigent
5 populations. Since it opened, it has worked to
6 strengthen the community with programs and activities
7 that empower all participants. It not only serves
8 young people, but provides great resources to the
9 entire family; and

10 Whereas, on December 14, 2014, East
11 Flatbush Village took 14 young women and men from
12 their cheer teams to compete in the 2014 American
13 Youth Football and Cheer National Championships in
14 Kissimmee, Florida. This was the second time the All
15 Stars had competed in Florida at the national level;
16 and

17 Whereas, East Flatbush Village has three
18 levels EFV All Stars, cheer, dance, step squads, but
19 only two levels were able to compete in nationals
20 against hundreds of other cheer, dance, step squads
21 from across the United States. The winning division
22 qualified for national competition in Florida this
23 year by competing and placing first in the local
24 competition at Queens College in Flushing, New York

1 STATED MEETING

14

2 and then in the Regional Competition at the Sun
3 National Bank Center in Trenton, New Jersey; and

4 Whereas, we are proud of the phenomenal
5 performance and teamwork of the EFV All Stars, and
6 confident that the dedication they have demonstrated
7 to these skills will benefit them greatly in all of
8 their future endeavors.

9 Now, therefore, be it known that the
10 Council of the City of New York honors and
11 congratulates the East Flatbush Village All Stars
12 Youth Cheer Step and Dance Team for their outstanding
13 teamwork at the 2014 American Youth Football and
14 Cheer National Championships.

15 Marissa Mark-Viverito Speaker for the
16 Entire Council; Jumaane Williams, Council Member,
17 45th District, Brooklyn.

18 [applause and cheers]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Yeah, I just
20 want to give a shout out to Officer Schneider from
21 the 67th Precinct also, and I think Monique Waterman
22 is going to be speaking on behalf of the group, who
23 loves to smile.

24 MONIQUE WATERMAN: All right, thank you.
25 At the organization we sincerely would like to thanks

1 STATED MEETING

15

2 to the Speaker, to the Council Member Jumaane D.

3 Williams for presenting our Cheer Step Dance Team and

4 coach and staff with this honor today. We also are

5 grateful for our partners in community that was

6 instrumental in assisting us with this achievement.

7 NYPD, thank you so much. [applause and cheers]

8 Everybody else thank you, thank you, thank you.

9 Abundance Arts Academy, thank you so much. Eugene?

10 [sic] Where are they? Eugene, thank you so much.

11 So we partner with the community just to make sure

12 that we are full service all the way around. And our

13 Executive Director Joan Macadeen [sic] with an EFV T-

14 Shirt because you are now part of the East Flatbush

15 Family.

16 [applause and cheers, background

17 comments]

18 MALE SPEAKER: Let's take a picture.

19 Let's take a picture.

20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Yes. Pictures.

21 Let him get behind you because he's too tall. Hi.

22 All right, this is exciting. Congratulations. Are

23 you going to make it this year, too.

24 CHEERLEADERS: [cheer]

25

1 STATED MEETING

16

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Yes. [applause
3 and cheers] Yes, thank you so much. All right, we
4 have one more ceremonial. This is very exciting.
5 It's Council Member Miller, and do we have Tasnim
6 Mollah [sic] here. Hope I'm pronouncing it right.
7 Tasnim? Oh, this is the protest. Okay. So, Tasnim
8 is a 19-year-old Hillcrest High School student. Hi,
9 how are you? She has received a full scholarship to
10 Yale [applause and cheers] as a bio-chemistry major.
11 That's scary. Congratulations. Tasnim only arrive
12 here in the United States from Bangladesh with her
13 family two years ago, and she is her school's
14 valedictorian with an average of not 100%, but
15 101.12%. [applause and cheers] Is it the AP courses?
16 Is that what it is? It's the best placement courses
17 that got her above 100%. But this is incredible.
18 You are such an inspiration. I'll hand it over to
19 Council Member Miller.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Wow, isn't that
21 exciting? [applause and cheers] Okay, so--
22 [laughter] So forget about my average was. That's
23 why we're here, right. We're bright enough to know
24 that we have all our young people here keeping in the
25 spirit of honoring our young people from the Bed-Stuy

1 STATED MEETING

17

2 Core and from the East Flatbush that we celebrate our
3 young people with all of their accomplishments today.

4 But obviously just from the precursor that the
5 Speaker gave you there that we see that this is an
6 exciting and dynamic young woman here that when she
7 was brought to our attention, and her story.

8 Obviously, so she transformed all the narratives
9 about our young people, and failing education. The
10 fact of the matter is that our young people as we
11 have seen today are thriving and continue to thrive.

12 And we want to highlight them whenever we can. And
13 so, she not only highlights the educational
14 experience, but the immigrant experience. And she
15 has just come here two years ago, and the Speaker
16 said with her family and her parents here. And often
17 having to take care of her sister. So, she's here
18 today along with her teacher, Mrs. Thomas.

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [off mic] And
20 the whole family.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: And her whole
22 family. Absolutely. And so we are just so excited,
23 and I have two Saint John students, Saint John
24 University students here with us as well. And so, we
25 were just here highlighting these young people, but

1 STATED MEETING

18

2 we're so proud and honored to have--to be able to
3 recognize Tasnim this afternoon with this
4 proclamation from the City Council. So thank you so
5 much.

6 [applause and cheers]

7 CLERK: Council City of New York
8 Proclamation.

9 Whereas the Council of the City of New
10 York is proud to honor Tasnim Mollah for her
11 outstanding and inspiring academic achievements; and

12 Whereas, Tasnim a senior at Hillcrest
13 High School in Eastern Queens grew up in Bangladesh
14 where here hardworking parents always encouraged her
15 and her sister to embrace every opportunity and to do
16 their best and pursue their highest goals. In 2013,
17 the family seized greater opportunities to further
18 their education by making a new home in the United
19 States. When her mother's Visa was detained leaving
20 her unable to accompany them at that time, Tasnim had
21 to assume her role and take responsibility for her
22 sister. Despite the incredible sacrifices made, and
23 the challenges they faced, their family persevered
24 and addressed them together; and

25

2 Whereas, Tasnim began to create a new
3 life in the United States, which seemed to be not
4 only new country, but a new universe. Suddenly, she
5 was a minority playing the critical role in
6 maintaining an impoverished household and assisting
7 all legal matters. And she was the only member of
8 the family fluent in English. Those demands were
9 equally matched by her adjustment to life as a high
10 schools sophomore, and

11 Whereas, since Tasnim's arrival two years
12 ago, she has demonstrated an unwavering commitment to
13 her studies, her family, and her community. Always
14 mindful of her studies, and the importance of
15 academic excellence. She has also been an active
16 member of the Muslim Students' Association as well as
17 the South Asian Youth Association at Hillcrest High
18 School, which offers valuable leadership programs and
19 service to the community; and

20 Whereas, now in her senior year, Tasnim
21 is the Valedictorian of Hillcrest High School.
22 [applause and cheers] While this achievement along
23 is worthy of applause, she has also been accepted to
24 Yale University as a bio-chemistry student with a
25 full scholarship. [applause and cheers] She is the

2 first Hillcrest High School student ever accepted
3 into this prestigious institution; and

4 Whereas, Tasnim as truly distinguished
5 herself in her achievements and as an inspiration to
6 New Yorkers of all ages. She is living proof that no
7 matter where is born, a commitment to education opens
8 up a new world of opportunities, builds character,
9 and empowers someone not only to choose their own
10 destiny but to create a better future for us all.

11 Now, therefore, be it known that the
12 Council of the City of New York proudly honors Tasnim
13 Mollah for her outstanding academic achievements and
14 wishes her continued success at Yale University.
15 Melissa Mark-Viverito, Speaker for the Entire
16 Council, I. Daneek Miller, Council Member, 27th
17 District, Queens.

18 [applause and cheers]

19 TASNIM MOLLAH: I just want to say that
20 I'm very grateful for the support system that I've
21 had throughout all these years. It's very fortunate
22 that I have ended up in New York City, and this is
23 the state that my parents chose to bring me to. And
24 I've chosen Hillcrest High School as my school, and
25 I've been so grateful and so fortunate to find

1 STATED MEETING

21

2 inputting teachers and parents that are motivating me
3 everyday. They're always encouraging me to do the
4 best that I can possibly do. And they always ask me
5 to dream big, never to settle for mediocre or never
6 to settle for small dreams. But they've always asked
7 me to dream big, and to always improve myself upon
8 every opportunity that I get. And I'm very grateful
9 to have the support system that I have today. And I
10 really hope to shine wherever I go, and always keep
11 on inspiring my peers and my dreams as well.

12 [applause and cheers, background
13 comments]

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: And that ends
15 ceremonials. A great way to end ceremonials.

16 [pause]

17 SERGEANT-A-ARMS: Please have a seat,
18 please. Please have a seat. Could I have your
19 attention, please. Quiet place. [gavel] At this
20 time, please place all--all electronic devices to
21 vibrate. Will all non-Council employees, non-Council
22 employees please leave the main floor of the
23 Chambers. Thank you.

24 [gavel]

25

1 STATED MEETING

22

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Everyone please
3 have their seats. Please have your seats. Please
4 have your seats. May we have quiet in the Chambers?

5 [background discussion and noise]

6 SERGEANT-A-ARMS: [off mic] Quiet,
7 please. May we have quiet, please.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All rise for the
9 Pledge of Allegiance.

10 SERGEANT-A-ARMS: All rise.

11 [pause]

12 [background noise]

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: If you can't have
14 your seat on the main floor, there are seats in the
15 balcony. Please take your seats in the back. If
16 you're exiting, please exit quietly. Roll call.

17 CLERK: Arroyo.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Here.

19 CLERK: Barron. Cabrera.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Here.

21 CLERK: Chin.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.

23 CLERK: Cohen.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Here.

25 CLERK: Constantinides.

1 STATED MEETING

23

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Here.

3 CLERK: Cornegy.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Here.

5 CLERK: Crowley. Cumbo.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Present.

7 CLERK: Deutsch.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Present.

9 CLERK: Dickens.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: [off mic] Here.

11 CLERK: Dromm.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: [off mic] Here.

13 CLERK: Barron.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Present.

15 CLERK: Espinal.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: [off mic] Here.

17 CLERK: Eugene.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Present.

19 CLERK: Ferreras. Garodnick.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: [off mic]

21 Here.

22 CLERK: Gentile. Gibson.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: [off mic] Here.

24 CLERK: Greenfield. Johnson.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Here.

1 STATED MEETING

24

2 CLERK: Kallos.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.

4 CLERK: King.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: [off mic] Present.

6 CLERK: Koo.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.

8 CLERK: Koslowitz.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: [off mic]

10 Here.

11 CLERK: Lancman.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: [off mic]

13 Present.

14 CLERK: Lander.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: [off mic] Here.

16 CLERK: Levin.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.

18 CLERK: Levine.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.

20 CLERK: Maisel. Matteo. Mealy.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [off mic] Present.

22 CLERK: Menchaca. Mendez, Miller.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: [off mic] Present.

24 CLERK: Palma, Reynoso.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Present.

1 STATED MEETING

25

2 CLERK: Richards.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.

4 CLERK: Rodriguez.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: [off mic]

6 Here.

7 CLERK: Rose.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: [off mic] Here.

9 CLERK: Rosenthal.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here.

11 CLERK: Torres, Treyger.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Here.

13 CLERK: Ulrich, Vacca.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Here.

15 CLERK: Vallone.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.

17 CLERK: Weprin.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: [off mic] Here.

19 CLERK: Williams.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: [off mic] Yes,

21 I'm here.

22 CLERK: Thank you. Wills. Gentile.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: [off mic] Here.

24 [background comment]

25 CLERK: Ignizio. Van Bramer.

1 STATED MEETING

26

2 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: [off mic]

3 Here.

4 CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [off mic] Here.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
7 Chambers please. Please rise for the Invocation.
8 delivered by Reverend Vanessa Brown, Rivers at
9 Rehoboth Church at 263 West 86th Street in Manhattan.
10 Quiet in the chambers. Quiet in the Chambers.

11 SERGEANT-A-ARMS: All rise.

12 REVEREND VANESSA BROWN: Shall we pray.
13 Universal loving and all powerful God, we open this
14 meeting inviting your presence here on this
15 afternoon. Let your grace and your peace be evident
16 in this place. We are thankful that you, God, love
17 the people of New York City, and want what's best for
18 us as a community. We are grateful to the men and
19 women you have allowed to govern us. Give them
20 wisdom as the bear the privilege and responsibility
21 to lead the people of New York City knowing their
22 decisions impact many, many people. Please, bless
23 Mayor de Blasio, his family, the City Council
24 members, our Public Advocate, and their families.
25 And all other City officials represented here and

1 STATED MEETING

27

2 their families as they serve the citizens of New York
3 City. In the name of all that is righteous, just and
4 true, Amen.

5 COUNCIL MEMBERS: Amen.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please be seated.
7 Council Member Rosenthal.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you,
9 Public Advocate. I'd like to make a motion to spread
10 the invocation over the enter Council. And I'd like
11 to mention that Reverend Brown's church, Rivers at
12 Rehoboth Church is an inspirational church in my
13 district. It's open and welcoming especially to
14 those in the LGBT community, and it's housed in a
15 church that is similarly opening--open and welcoming,
16 and I am just so proud to have her here today. Thank
17 you.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
19 Chin.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: I want to make a
21 motion that the Minutes of the Stated Meeting of
22 January 22, 2015 be adopted as printed. Thank you.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
24 Messages and papers from the Mayor.

25

1 STATED MEETING

28

2 CLERK: [coughs] M2401, Preliminary
3 Mayor's Management Report.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Communication
5 from City, County and Borough Offices.

6 [background conversation]

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
8 Chambers, please.

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Received order,
10 printed and filed.

11 CLERK: No communications from City,
12 County and Borough offices.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Petitions and
14 communications?

15 CLERK: None.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Land Use Call-
17 Ups?

18 CLERK: M241.

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Roll call.

20 CLERK: Arroyo.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Aye.

22 CLERK: Barron. Levin.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I request

24 unanimous--unanimous consent to vote aye on all Land

25

1 STATED MEETING

29

2 Use Call-Ups, and items on the General Order
3 Calendar.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you.

6 CLERK: Barron.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Aye.

8 CLERK: Cabrera.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye.

10 CLERK: Chin.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye.

12 CLERK: Cohen.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye.

14 CLERK: Constantinides.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye.

16 CLERK: Cornegy.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye.

18 CLERK: Crowley. Cumbo.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Yes.

20 CLERK: Deutsch.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Yes.

22 CLERK: Dickens.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: [off mic] Yes.

24 CLERK: Dromm. Espinal.

25 CLERK: Espinal.

1 STATED MEETING

30

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: [off mic] Here,
3 yes..

4 CLERK: Eugene.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye.

6 CLERK: Garodnick.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: [off mic] Aye.

8 CLERK: Gentile.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: I ask permission
10 to vote aye on all Land Use Call-Ups and the General
11 Order Calendar?

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: I vote aye.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

15 CLERK: Gibson.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: I vote aye.

17 CLERK: Greenfield. Johnson.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Aye.

19 CLERK: Kallos.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye.

21 CLERK: King.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: [off mic] Aye.

23 CLERK: Koo.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye on all.

25 CLERK: Koslowitz.

1 STATED MEETING

31

2 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: [off mic]

3 Aye.

4 CLERK: Lancman.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: [off mic] Aye.

6 CLERK: Lander.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: [off mic] Aye.

8 CLERK: Levine.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye.

10 CLERK: Maisel.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Aye.

12 CLERK: Matteo, Mealy.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: How do you vote,

14 Council Member Mealy?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [off mic] Aye.

16 CLERK: Menchaca, Mendez, Miller.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: [off mic] Aye.

18 CLERK: Palma.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: [off mic] Aye.

20 CLERK: Reynoso.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Aye.

22 CLERK: Richards.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye.

24 CLERK: Rodriguez.

25

1 STATED MEETING

32

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: [off mic] I
3 ask permission to vote aye on all items on the
4 General Order Calendar? [sic]

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye on all.
7 [sic]

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

9 CLERK: Rose.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: [off mic] Aye.

11 CLERK: Rosenthal.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: [off mic] Aye.

13 CLERK: Menchaca.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Aye.

15 CLERK: Dromm.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: [off mic] Aye.

17 CLERK: Torres. Treyger.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye.

19 CLERK: Ulrich.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Yes.

21 CLERK: Vacca.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I vote aye and I'd
23 like to ask permission to vote aye on all general
24 order--

25

1 STATED MEETING

33

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

3 Yes.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: --calendar items.

5 Thank you.

6 CLERK: Vallone.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye.

8 CLERK: Weprin.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: [off mic] Aye.

10 CLERK: Williams.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: [off mic] Aye.

12 CLERK: Wills. Ignizio. Van Bramer.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye.

14 [background conversation]

15 CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [off mic] Aye.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the

18 Chambers. Today's Land Use Call-Ups were adopted by

19 a vote--by a vote of 42 in the affirmative, and 0 in

20 the negative. [gavel] Quiet as we hear

21 communication from the Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito.

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you, Madam

23 Public Advocate, and good afternoon. Buenas Tardes

24 to all of my colleagues, and all those in the

25 Chamber. Today, the Council is going to vote on a

2 package of bills aimed at improving services for
3 veterans in New York City. Intros 611-A and 619-A
4 sponsored by Council Members Eugene and Ulrich
5 respectively focus on reforms to the Veterans
6 Advisory Board. The Veterans Advisory Board serves
7 as a liaison between New York's veteran community and
8 the City's government. It's essential that this
9 board be diverse, transparent, and accessible for our
10 veterans to receive the services and benefits they
11 deserve. And that's what these bills will do.

12 Reforms include increasing the number of board
13 members from 9 to 11, requiring each board member to
14 have a publicly listed email address. Requiring the
15 board to meet at least five times per year,
16 including one meeting in each borough. Ensuring
17 advanced notice of each meeting is given, requiring
18 that each meeting be recorded and broadcast.

19 Requiring that the board's annual report include
20 policy and legislative recommendations if
21 appropriate. We owe it to our veterans to make this
22 board work for them, and through these reforms we can
23 work towards that goal. And with that, I'd like to
24 ask Council Members Eugene and the Council Members
25 Ulrich to say a few words.

2 [background conversation]

3 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please, quiet in
4 the Chambers, please.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Thank you very
6 much Madam Speaker and my colleagues. I stand to ask
7 you to support Intro 611. And before I do that, let
8 me thank the Speaker for her giving her steadfast
9 support to this legislation that will make a very
10 important impact on the lives of the veterans and
11 also the family members. This bill will bring about
12 positive and meaningful reform at the Veterans
13 Advisory Board. And I would like to congratulate
14 also the Chair, my colleague Council Member Ulrich.
15 And also, congratulate Council Member Vallone on the
16 voting of his first bill. It is our responsibility
17 as a city to ensure that all of the brave men and
18 women, who retired from active military duty are able
19 to carry on with the rest of their lives. Knowing
20 that their concern and the need fulfilled by the
21 government. It is the least that we can do for
22 people who so honorably risk everything for all of
23 us. And that is why this legislation that is coming
24 before the City Council is so very important. The
25 Veterans Advisory Board has a very important role in

1 STATED MEETING

36

2 our City Government. The Board not only advises the
3 Mayor's Office of Veteran Affairs on policy, but it
4 operates also as liaison between the city and the
5 veterans of all five boroughs. Therefore, it is
6 important, very important that the Veteran Advisory
7 Board is highly expected in its communication and
8 outreach to veterans in all the boroughs.

9 Intro 611, sponsored by me increases the
10 Veteran Advisory Board membership from 9 to 11
11 members to ensure that veterans of different military
12 conflicts and demographics have full representation
13 on the board. There will be also that this bill also
14 would also provide to each member an email address to
15 advance communication between the board and our
16 veterans. Our veterans are very special people, and
17 it has been my pleasure to work with the Speaker,
18 Chairman of the Committee [sic] and Member Vallone to
19 create legislation that will have a positive impact
20 on the lives of our veterans and also their loved
21 ones. Thank you very much.

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Council Member
23 Ulrich.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Thank you, Madam
25 Speaker and my colleagues. I rise to ask your

2 support today for a bill, Intro 619, which I am
3 sponsoring, which would significantly reform and
4 improve the operations at the Veterans Advisory
5 Board. This bill along with the legislation being
6 sponsored by my friend and colleague Council Member
7 Eugene is going to make the Veterans Advisory Board
8 more transparent, more accountable, and improve the
9 line of communication between the members of the
10 Veteran Advisory Board and the more than 200,000
11 veterans and their families who call New York City
12 home. We have more veterans living in New York City
13 than some states have in their entire state. And
14 yet, many of the programs and services that are
15 currently in place to serve those veterans and their
16 families, in my opinion and in the opinion of many of
17 this city is not up to bar, and not doing the job
18 that the veterans quite frankly deserve.

19 So today we are significantly reforming
20 the way the VAB does business by adding additional
21 members, by requiring that those members that are
22 appointed have email addresses. That the meetings
23 actually go out to each individual borough. That
24 people know when those meetings are taking place.
25 That we can broadcast those meetings so that people

2 can attend them in person, or people with
3 disabilities who can't get to that location can
4 physically watch at home on their computers or on
5 their Smart devices the proceedings of those
6 meetings. And also, giving the board members a
7 little clarity and direction as to what should be
8 contained in their annual report. Previously, the
9 annual report by the VAB was a synopsis of the
10 meetings of the minutes. Now, that report will
11 actually include specific policy recommendations for
12 the Administration, as well as legislative ideas and
13 proposals that the Council should consider.

14 I want to thank several people who really
15 were instrumental in bringing not only my bill and
16 Council Member Eugene's bill, but all of the veterans
17 legislation to fruition today. And let me start by
18 thanking the members of the central staff, Deputy
19 Chief of Staff of Legislation, Laura Popa; the
20 Legislative Director Matt Gewolb; the Deputy Director
21 for Human Services, Terza Nazar [sp?]. Human
22 Services Assistant Deputy Direct, Lyle Frank; the
23 Veterans Committee Counsel Eric Bernstein. He's
24 doing a phenomenal job and our newly hire Policy
25 Analyst Kevin Ryan. I also want to thank the

1 STATED MEETING

39

2 Administration, the newly appointed Commissioner of
3 the Mayor's of Veterans Affairs, Loree Sutton for her
4 help and her input and guidance, and their support
5 and cooperation for getting these bills passed. And
6 we look forward to their signing ceremony very soon.
7 And I urge all of my colleagues to vote aye, and I
8 thank you in advance.

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
10 Council Member Ulrich. Also in this package of
11 assisting veterans is Introduction 600-A sponsored by
12 Council Member Vallone, which would address data
13 transparency for the city's Veterans Services. As
14 has been mentioned, it is his first bill. So
15 congratulations to Council Member Vallone. [applause
16 and cheers]

17 As a result of their military service,
18 veterans in New York City are eligible for a number
19 of benefits in areas such as housing and employment.
20 However, the data remains unclear as to how many
21 veterans are applying for and receiving such
22 benefits. This information would enable the City to
23 identify where greater outreach and resources are
24 needed so that more veterans may utilize these
25 programs. This bill would make that data transparent

2 by providing the Council, the Mayor's Office of
3 Veterans Affairs, and the Veterans Advisory Board
4 with annual data about programs administered by city
5 agencies. And with that, Council Member Vallone will
6 say a few words about his bill.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Thank you, Madam
8 Speaker.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Can we have quite
10 for Council Member Vallone. It's his first bill.
11 Please.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: [laughter]
13 Thank you, Madam Public Advocate. I'm sure my dad
14 and family are all smiling right now. Thank you. I
15 couldn't be more proud to stand for my first bill to
16 bring it before my colleagues on behalf of our
17 veterans, over 200,000 veterans. And very simply
18 put, what this bill does is it finally allows City
19 agencies to report on the amount of veterans that are
20 receiving services. So that we can better deal with
21 the ones that are required to have services are maybe
22 not aware of them. So this will allow us to get that
23 critical data to help the veterans that are sometimes
24 too often caught on the sideline. They're not really
25 aware that what we as the greatest city in the world

1 STATED MEETING

41

2 can do for them. So now, we'll have that data
3 cording to us, and this is a bill I'm very proud of.
4 And thank you to our Chair Ulrich for allowing me to
5 bring it to this point to Madam Speaker. To the
6 staff that has been amazing Laura Popa, Lyle Frank,
7 Eric Bernstein. Eric and I will forever have our
8 first bill together, and my Chief of Staff Jonathan
9 Szott and my Policy Analyst Ahmed Nazaar. Thank you
10 everyone. I really appreciate it. God bless. Thank
11 you.

12 SERGEANT-A-ARMS: Quiet in the Chambers.

13 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Ulrich has done
14 it, but definitely the staff for all the veteran
15 bills Eric Bernstein, Laura Popa, Matt Gewolb, Tera
16 Nasser [sp?] and Lyle Frank. Thank you so much. We
17 also have legislation regarding worker cooperatives,
18 and their ability to have a fair chance at bidding
19 for contracts like any other business in this city.
20 Worker cooperatives are owned and controlled by their
21 employees. While cooperative management structure
22 provides opportunities for increased worker
23 engagement with a business, it also creates unique
24 obstacles for the business when competing for
25 government contracts. For this reason, Intro 423-A

2 sponsored by Council Member Helen Rosenthal would
3 require city agencies to identify those obstacles and
4 make recommendations on how worker cooperatives can
5 be more competitive in their attempts to do business
6 with the City.

7 I want to thank the staff--on the staff
8 side Matt Gewolb, Jeffrey Baker, Ed Atkins, Alex
9 Colanoff [sp?], Jose Conde, Jessica Ackerman, and
10 with that, Council Member Helen Rosenthal.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you so
12 much Madam Speaker. Worker co-ops rock. When we
13 talk about the economic divide between rich and poor,
14 we look to economic engines to close the divide.
15 Some look to the finance sector or technology. I
16 believe that the economic engine of New York City is
17 its workers. Worker cooperatives lift people from
18 dead-end jobs into the middle-class. These workers
19 enjoy higher wages, steady hours, and stable jobs.
20 I'm committed to finding ways for the City to support
21 and expand worker co-ops, and that starts with my
22 bill co-sponsored by Council Members Menchaca and
23 Arroyo, which the Council is voting on today. And
24 the bill requires, as the Speaker mentioned, the
25 Department of Small Business Services to report on

1 STATED MEETING

43

2 how it engages and supports worker cooperatives. I
3 want to thank my fellow sponsors for this--for
4 signing onto this bill, and for all their support.
5 Council Member Menchaca, by the way, in his district
6 there are seven worker co-ops including Si Se Puede.
7 I'd like to also thank the members of the New York
8 City Workers Cooperative Coalition, many of whom are
9 in the-- Oh, wow. [laughter] You all in the
10 balcony today. Thank you Speaker Mark-Viverito for
11 her continued leadership, the City Council staff,
12 Alex, Ed, Joseph, [sic] and Matt. You know who you
13 are. Also the Mayor's Legislative Office Reggie
14 Thomas and Salva Debassu [sp?], and my Legislative
15 Staff, Ahmed Tigani, Beth Newcomer and our team of
16 hard-working interns for their work on the bill.
17 Could I ask my colleagues could you please look on
18 your desk. You'll see this flyer. It's a flyer for
19 a Worker Cooperative Fair on March 3rd. Nineteen of
20 you have worker co-ops in your district. Please
21 come. Check out the worker co-ops, eat some great
22 food. Learn about organizations that are really
23 supporting the workers. Thank you very much.

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
25 Council Member.

1 STATED MEETING

44

2 [applause and cheers]

3 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: And finally--

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

5 Please refrain from clapping. Thank you. Have a

6 seat. Thank you. [laughs]

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: And finally,

8 Intro 74-A sponsored by Council Member Andy King

9 would require the Parks Department along with the

10 Office of Emergency Management and the Department of

11 Sanitation to work with local elected corporations to

12 develop a protocol for removing fallen trees that are

13 entangled with electric cables. This bill will

14 ensure safe and proper removal of potentially

15 hazardous debris after severe weather events. On the

16 staff side I want to thank Matt Gewolb, Jeffrey

17 Baker, Ed Adkin, Chris Sartori, Patrick Mulvihill,

18 Chima Obichere. And I would ask Council Member King

19 to say a few words about his legislation.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Thank you, Madam

21 Speaker and I rise to ask my colleagues to vote for

22 74-A. This bill as I always say that we as elected

23 officials create legislation a lot of times out of an

24 incident that has occurred. Prior to this bill, I'm

25 moving around in my district whether it was snow or a

1 STATED MEETING

45

2 strong rains and winds we would have trees down on
3 power lines. And what I experienced after Sandy, was
4 that going out with the Departments of Parks and
5 Sanitation to remove a tree after calling 311 it
6 would take too long. We would get out there and then
7 Parks would say well, we can move this tree because
8 there's a power line. We don't know if it's live.
9 Then we get Con Ed out there, and Con Ed would say,
10 well, we can't move this power line because there's a
11 tree on it. So we was going back like Abbott and
12 Costello conversation. So we said let's put
13 something in place that there would be a real
14 communication between all--everyone who is
15 responsible for creating safety for our communities
16 when it comes to power and trees. So out of that
17 bred Intro 74-A. So I'm looking forward to each and
18 everyone on that. I think it's smart legislation
19 that will help our communities get up and running at
20 the time during a weather crisis when our trees fall
21 down on power lines. So I ask you all to vote, and
22 thank you again. And Madam Speaker, thank you for
23 your leadership, and my Chair of the Parks Department
24 Mark Levine, thank you again for pushing this
25 legislation forward. God bless.

1 STATED MEETING

46

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
3 Council Member. A couple of last things. Attached
4 to the Agenda today is the final dates on the budget
5 hearings that are starting next Wednesday, the 4th of
6 March. Take a look. There have been some changes.
7 So Council Members take a look at those. Today's
8 meeting we will adjourn in memory of Kathleen Grimm,
9 the Deputy Chancellor of DOE who passed away
10 recently. Definitely someone that a lot of us
11 interacted with and respected. And so our thoughts
12 are with her and we will adjourn in her memory. And
13 lastly, Council Member Deutsch just reminded me that
14 we should all be reminded that this date in 1993, the
15 first World Trade Center bombing occurred in which
16 six individuals were killed and over 1,000
17 individuals injured. We have that to remember as
18 well. Obviously, lessons learned from that. A
19 horrific day along with September 11. And so, with
20 that we'll keep our thoughts and prayers to all those
21 impacted. Thank you Council Member Deutsch for
22 reminding us. And with that, I end communication
23 from the Speaker.

24

25

1 STATED MEETING 47

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

3 Discussions of General Orders. Seeing none, Reports
4 of Special Committees.

5 CLERK: None.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Reports of
7 Standing Committees.

8 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
9 Community Development, Intro 423-A, Worker
10 Cooperatives.

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
12 Coupled on General Orders.

13 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
14 Finance, Preconsidered Reso 590, Organization Funding

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
16 General Orders.

17 CLERK: Preconsidered 591, Meatpacking
18 Area BID.

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
20 General Orders.

21 CLERK: Preconsidered LU 179 and Reso
22 600.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
24 General Orders.

25

1 STATED MEETING 48

2 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Land
3 Use, LU 170 and Reso 601, Zoning Amendment.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
5 General Orders.

6 CLERK: LU 171 and Reso 602, Landmarks
7 Designation.

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
9 General Orders.

10 CLERK: LU 172 and Reso 603, Sidewalk
11 Cafe.

12 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
13 General Orders.

14 CLERK: LU 173 and Reso 604, Zoning
15 Amendment.

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled. To be
17 filed pursuant to letter of withdrawal.

18 CLERK: LU 175 and Reso 605 and LU 176
19 and Reso 606, Zoning Amendments.

20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
21 General Orders.

22 CLERK: LU 177 and Reso 607 and LU 178
23 and Reso 608, Landmark Designations.

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
25 General Orders.

1 STATED MEETING

49

2 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Parks
3 and Recreation, Intro 74-A, Tree Removal.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
5 coupled on General Orders.

6 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
7 Veterans, Intro 600-A, Veteran Services.

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
9 coupled on General Orders.

10 CLERK: Intro 611-A, Veterans Advisory
11 Board Electronic mail.

12 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
13 coupled on General Orders.

14 CLERK: Intro 619-A, Veterans Board
15 meetings.

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
17 coupled on General Orders.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [off mic]
19 General Order Calendar. [on mic] General Order
20 Calendar. Please quiet in the Chambers.

21 CLERK: Resolution appointing various
22 persons commissioner of deeds.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
24 General Orders, and at this time I ask for a roll

25

1 STATED MEETING

50

2 call on all items on the Coupled General Order
3 Calendar.

4 CLERK: Arroyo.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Aye.

6 CLERK: Barron.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Permission to
8 explain my vote.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. In
11 the Landmarks Committee meeting we had--we addressed
12 Land Use Item 177, which is the Central Ridgewood
13 Historic District. And in the report that was
14 presented by the agency there was a one-liner, which
15 said that the owners of the property historically
16 owned slaves. Further in the report it went on to
17 say that the family cleared the land and developed
18 the property. And what I would do is as that these
19 agencies once again be instructed to no marginalize
20 or put footnotes on the work that was done by
21 enslaved African-Americans that, in fact, cleared the
22 forest and developed the land and built the housing
23 the became significant moving forward. So I ask once
24 again that these agencies be instructed to not
25 marginalize us, and make us footnotes going forward.

1 STATED MEETING 51

2 But give us the full opportunity to understand the

3 contributions that were made. And I vote aye on all.

4 CLERK: Cabrera.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: [off mic] Aye.

6 CLERK: Chin.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Congratulations my

8 colleagues. Aye on all.

9 CLERK: Cohen.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye on all.

11 CLERK: Constantinides.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye on

13 all.

14 CLERK: Cornegy.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: I vote aye on

16 all.

17 CLERK: Cumbo.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Cumbo.

19 CLERK: Deutsch.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye on all.

21 CLERK: Dickens. Dromm. Espinal

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Aye on all.

23 CLERK: Eugene.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: [off mic] Aye on

25 all. [on mic] Aye.

2 CLERK: Garodnick.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

4 CLERK: Gibson.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Permission to
6 explain my vote.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you, Madam
9 Public Advocate. I want to congratulate all of our
10 colleagues for passing incredibly important bills
11 today; worker cooperatives, strengthening business
12 across the city--

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Excuse me,
14 Council Member. May we have quiet in the Chambers,
15 please?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: And it was all on
17 the clock. [sic] Okay. So I want to congratulate
18 all of our colleagues for passing incredibly
19 important legislation today, particular worker
20 cooperatives, and strengthening small business
21 opportunities for many of our families and New
22 Yorkers across the city. And as the Niece of a proud
23 Vietnam War veteran, always supportive of any
24 opportunities to further demonstrate our support, and
25 deep admiration for all of our veterans. So,

1 STATED MEETING

53

2 congratulations, colleagues. Keep up the good work,
3 and I proudly vote aye on all.

4 CLERK: Crowley.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Aye on all.

6 CLERK: Greenfield.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Can I explain
8 my vote?

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you. I
11 also want to congratulate my colleagues today
12 especially Council Members King and Eugene, and
13 Ulrich and Rosenthal and Vallone. I'm very excited
14 for you, and you have a very nice tan, by the way, if
15 I might add. And really some terrific bills, but
16 also would like to vote aye on the General Order
17 Calendar as well as all the Land Use Call-Ups.

18 CLERK: Johnson.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Permission to
20 explain my vote.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: I am proud to
23 vote aye on all today, and I want to congratulate my
24 colleagues. Particularly, I want to thank and
25 congratulate Council Members Ulrich, Eugene, and

1 STATED MEETING

54

2 Vallone on their package of bills supporting our
3 veterans. My father who passed away about three
4 years ago at the age of 54 years old, he was a young
5 man, he was a Vietnam Veteran. It was one of the
6 most important things in his life, his veteran
7 status. He talked about it all the time. And
8 anything we can do to support the veterans in New
9 York City we must do. So I am very proud to vote aye
10 today, and I'm really grateful that the Veterans
11 Committee has been so active in pushing forward
12 reforms to make our city better for veterans. With
13 that, aye on all. Thank you.

14 CLERK: Kallos.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Congratulations
16 to Council Member Vallone. Aye on all.

17 CLERK: King.

18 [background conversation]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Can I explain my
20 vote.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: No.

23 [laughter]

24

25

1 STATED MEETING

55

2 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: [off mic] Well, I
3 just want to say thank you to my colleagues,
4 especially--

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Is your
6 microphone on?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Thank you to my
8 colleagues and I want to say congratulations to
9 Council Member Vallone. As a son of a veteran, I
10 appreciate all the work, and all the commitment to
11 helping my dad. So there is special place in my
12 heart for what you've done today, and Council Member
13 Ulrich and everyone and Matthew. I appreciate you
14 all for today's legislation, and congratulations and
15 I vote aye on all.

16 CLERK: Koo.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye.

18 CLERK: Koslowitz.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: [off mic]
20 Aye.

21 CLERK: Lancman.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: [off mic] Aye.

23 CLERK: Lander.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Request
25 permission to explain my vote.

1 STATED MEETING

56

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: I want to add my
4 voice of thanks to the Council Members King and
5 Vallone and Eugene for your great work on behalf of
6 our veterans in the city. It's a good day to be a
7 member of the Council. And I also was looking at the
8 list that Council Member Rosenthal pointed out
9 before, and I'm proud to actually be a customer of
10 one of the worker co-ops on that list. So I urge
11 other people not only to come to the fair and support
12 them, but figure out where we can add our commerce to
13 their work as well. And I vote aye on all. Thank
14 you.

15 CLERK: Levine.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: With congrats to
17 all the sponsors today, I'm proud to vote aye on all.

18 CLERK: Maisel.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: [off mic] Aye on
20 all.

21 CLERK: Matteo.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Permission to
23 vote on Land Use Call-Ups.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

25

1 STATED MEETING

57

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: I vote yes and
3 vote no on Land Use 171 and Reso 602 because the
4 owner is against the landmarking. Aye on all--on the
5 rest.

6 CLERK: Mealy.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Can I explain my
8 vote?

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I want to say
11 kudos to Vallone for his legislation, and Mathieu
12 Eugene and Andy King because veterans is the heart
13 beat of America, and I vote aye on all.

14 CLERK: Menchaca.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Permission to
16 explain my vote.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you,
19 Public Advocate. Today's list of bills actually are
20 kind of personal to me. Both my brother a veteran
21 form Afghanistan, went to Afghanistan and then toured
22 in Iraq. And my mother who was a domestic worker who
23 didn't have the privilege and the honor and ability
24 to start her own co-op in Texas. Today, we send some
25 really strong messages about the government that is

1 STATED MEETING

58

2 opening the doors not only to opportunity like
3 participatory budgeting, but to economic power. That
4 power comes back to our communities with the co-ops.
5 And the many that we have in Sunset Park, and thank
6 you Sunset Park for being here today. The power is
7 growing and they're already growing co-ops in Red
8 Hood. This is--this is our moment here as we try to
9 drive the message of equality and equity. These are
10 the kinds of things that are going to make that
11 happen. Thank you to Council Member Helen Rosenthal.
12 We have the fiercest advocate with some of the
13 smartest scalpels that will make this contract
14 business available for us. So thank you, Helen, and
15 I vote aye on all. Thank you.

16 CLERK: Mendez.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Permission to
18 vote on all Land Use Call-Ups.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: I vote aye on the
21 Land Call-Ups and on the General Order Calendar.

22 CLERK: Miller.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: [off mic] Aye on
24 all.

25 CLERK: Reynoso.

1 STATED MEETING

59

2 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Permission to
3 explain my vote.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I'm going to
6 vote aye on all, but I also want to say that tomorrow
7 is Dominican Independence Day. Have a good time
8 doing something rad, eat some good Dominican food,
9 and enjoy yourselves. Thank you very much.

10 CLERK: Rodriguez.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Rodriguez.

12 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: He had voted
13 already.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: He voted.

15 CLERK: Richards.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER Richards. Aye.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

18 CLERK: Rose.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: [off mic] Aye on
20 all.

21 CLERK: Rosenthal.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: [off mic] Aye.

23 CLERK: Torres.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Aye on all.

25 CLERK: Treyger.

1 STATED MEETING

60

2 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Permission to
3 briefly explain my vote.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: I just want to
6 first congratulate Council Members Rosenthal,
7 Menchaca and Arroyo on the bill for worker co-ops. I
8 think that's something that certainly should be
9 further explored and further supported. So I thank
10 them for that. I want to congratulate Council Member
11 Eric Ulrich, Council Members Eugene and Vallone for
12 getting us the data--

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Excuse me Council
14 Member. Quiet in the Chambers, please.

15 SERGEANT-A-ARMS: [off mic] Please quiet
16 down.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
18 back.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you,
20 Public Advocate. For getting us the data that we
21 desperately need to see where there are gaps in
22 servicing our veterans. Because we've heard from the
23 Veterans Committee time and time again how they keep
24 being told that they don't have information available
25 at the hearings. It's unacceptable. So the

1 STATED MEETING

61

2 information that these bills will require, the
3 structure that they will require will enlighten us as
4 the Council as a body on what we need to do to
5 further help our veterans. So I congratulate
6 everyone and Council Member Andy King as well on this
7 bill, and I vote aye on all. Thank you.

8 CLERK: Ulrich.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Yes. [laughter]

10 CLERK: Vallone.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Thank you to all
12 my colleagues for your vey kind words and proudly aye
13 on all.

14 CLERK: Weprin.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
16 Chambers, please.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: I vote aye on
18 all.

19 CLERK: Williams.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Congratulations
21 to all of my colleagues, particularly Council Member
22 Vallone for his first bill, and I want to attach my
23 name to the words of Council Member Barron in which
24 slavery is often brushed aside as a Southern issue.
25 But New York City had, for lack of a better word, a

1 STATED MEETING

62

2 rich history in slave trade and slavery. With that,
3 I vote aye on all.

4 CLERK: Wills.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: [off mic] Aye on
6 all.

7 CLERK: Cabrera.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Permission to
9 explain my vote.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you, Madam
12 Public Advocate. I want to congratulate Council
13 Member Peter Vallone and all of the other sponsors.
14 My grandfather fought in World War II in the U.S.
15 Navy, and also my father was a U.S. airman and I know
16 they're looking down now with pride to all the
17 council members who sponsored this bill, and
18 appreciate what they're doing. And also the Chairman
19 who is leading this fight. Thank you so much.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: How do you vote.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: I vote aye on
22 all.

23 CLERK: Cumbo.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission to
25 explain my vote.

1 STATED MEETING

63

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I just want to
4 join in with all of my other colleagues in
5 celebrating Council Members King, Eugene, Ulrich,
6 Rosenthal and Vallone. I had an opportunity to sit
7 on the Veterans Committee, and I recognized how
8 important it was to so many. When you looked into
9 their eyes how important this legislation was to our
10 veterans. So I thank you all for your leadership,
11 and I congratulate all of you, and special
12 congratulations to Council Member Vallone. It's an
13 incredible feeling to pass your first piece of
14 legislation, and I'm so happy and proud for you.

15 CLERK: Ignizio.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: Permission to
17 vote on Land Use Call-Ups.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes, sir.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: I vote aye and I
20 just want to commend my colleagues as well. As the
21 grandson of a World War II veteran and as the son of
22 a Vietnam War era Army veteran, I'm really thrilled
23 that we're passing these bills today. And I want to
24 particularly pay my respects to my friend Council
25 Member Ulrich who ran a great hearing. And continues

1 STATED MEETING

64

2 to be at the forefront of the veterans in the City.
3 With that I vote aye on all with the exception of
4 Land Use 171, and Reso 602. Thank you.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Quiet
6 in the Chambers, please. We're still in session.

7 CLERK: Van Bramer.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Permission to
9 briefly explain my vote. I would like to
10 congratulate everyone on their bills today. I
11 particularly thank my good friend Council Member Eric
12 Ulrich and congratulate him for shepherding this very
13 important piece of--package of legislation as it
14 relates to veterans. Everyone has related their
15 story. I am married to a veteran. My husband is a
16 veteran of the U.S. Navy and I certainly on behalf of
17 him appreciate our colleagues' work, Council Members
18 Ulrich and Eugene and, of course, our good friend
19 Council Member Vallone on his first piece of
20 legislation. He is not the first member of the
21 Vallone family to pass a piece of legislation, but
22 he is a terrific, terrific council member. And I
23 wholeheartedly congratulate him, as well as our
24 colleagues King and Rosenthal. And with that, I
25 proudly vote aye on all.

1 STATED MEETING

65

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you

3 CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [off mic] I vote
5 aye.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. All
7 items on today's General Order Calendar were adopted
8 by a vote to 49 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative
9 and 0 abstentions, with the exception of Land Use 171
10 and Resolution 602, which was adopted by a vote of 47
11 in the affirmative, 2 in the negative, and 0
12 abstentions. And the Revised Land Use Call-Ups were
13 adopted by a vote of 49 in the affirmative, 0 in the
14 negative. Introduction and reading of bills.

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: All bills are
16 referred to committees as indicated on the Agenda.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. There
18 are no resolutions today. We will begin with general
19 discussions. Leading off, Council Member Kallos.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I would like to
21 rise and say thank you to the FCC for passing Net
22 Neutrality. That's a big deal. I rise on
23 Introduction 686. Imagine arriving at your parking
24 spot to find its gone, not knowing if it's stolen or
25 towed, and not being able to find out where it is

1 STATED MEETING

66

2 unless the time to walk around the neighborhood and
3 search every block for your call. This legislation
4 required every time a car is parked--is towed because
5 of a temporary parking change that it be placed
6 online as well as on 311. I would also like to
7 commend our Public Advocate Tish James for her
8 Private Pensions Bill No. 692 being introduced today.

9 Our nation faces a \$6.8 trillion
10 retirement deficit according to the National
11 Institutes of Retirement Security, which this
12 legislation seeks to solve. Erosions of pensions in
13 the public sector and retirement benefits in the
14 private sector have left our working families without
15 a way to save a nest egg for retirement. Providing
16 small businesses and the private sector with tools
17 they need to offer their employees better retirement
18 benefits will go a long way towards filling--filling
19 the retirement deficit, and providing workers the
20 retirements they deserve. It's been a pleasure to
21 work with effective New York founder Bill Samuels on
22 this big idea. And thank you again to Public
23 Advocate Tish James for her leadership on this and
24 other issues of income inequality and security.

25

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you,
3 Council Member Kallos. Thank you for recognizing
4 that the vast majority of New Yorkers have no access
5 to a pension or a 401k. More than half of New York
6 workers are projected to be poor or near poor once
7 they retire. The bill that I have established--the
8 bill that I'm creating is a commission of experts to
9 study the establishment of a pension fund for private
10 sector workers. I urge all of my colleagues to sign
11 on. The next speaker is Council Member Barron.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, Madam
13 Public Advocate. I rise to ask my colleagues to sign
14 onto Intro 674, which I'm introducing along with
15 Council Member Ferreras. And it calls for the
16 adoption of the City and adaptations-- I'm sorry. Of
17 the City Environmental Quality Review process to re-
18 examine how we are looking at those areas that are
19 being re-zoned. We know that there's been a 40%
20 increase in re-zoning between 2002 and 2014. I do
21 cal your attention to the memo, which I sent and
22 invite you to sign on.

23 Secondly, I ask you to sign onto Reso
24 585, which is being offered in conjunction with the
25 Speaker, with Council Member Kallos, Williams and

2 Crowley. Which calls on the Congress to pass and the
3 President to sign the Americans College Promise,
4 which as we know would make two years of community
5 college free to anyone who maintains a 2.5 average.
6 And it's important that this legislation requires
7 states to maintain their existing support of higher
8 ed. And it would especially benefit under-
9 represented communities. And finally, I want to call
10 your attention to Carter G. Woodson. We know that
11 the month of February has been designated--has been
12 designated as Black History Month. And it's an
13 observation that started with Carter G. Woodson. He
14 was self-taught and he was able to go to high school,
15 and complete four years in two years. He went on to
16 represent the U.S. as an educator superintendent in
17 the Philippines. He returned and he went to the
18 University of Chicago where he retained--where he
19 gained his bachelors as well as his masters. And he
20 became the second African-American to graduate from
21 Harvard. He went on to found the Association for the
22 Study of Negro Life and History. He wrote an
23 important book called the Mis-Education of the Negro.
24 And one of the main quotes of that book is, When you
25 control a man's thinking, you don't have to worry

1 STATED MEETING

69

2 about his actions. You do not have to tell him where
3 to stand and where to go. He will find his own
4 place, and will stay in it.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member,
6 please bring you comments to a close.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: That's it. Thank
8 you.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
10 Levin--Levine.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you, Madam
12 Public Advocate. I'm pleased to call my colleague's
13 attention to Reso 592, which call on the State of New
14 York to live up to its court mandated obligations
15 under the Campaign for Fiscal Equity. As my
16 colleagues know, our State Constitution--

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Excuse me,
18 Council Member. Quiet in the Chambers, please.

19 SERGEANT-A-ARMS: Quiet down.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. I
21 apologize for that.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: No problem. Our
23 Constitution requires that the State offer a sound,
24 basic education to all children in New York. And in
25 2006 in a landmark ruling of *Campaign for Fiscal*

2 *Equity v. the State of New York*, the highest court in
3 our state ruled that we had failed that
4 constitutional obligation. And an agreement reached
5 between the Governor and the legislature determined
6 that determined that funding would be increased in
7 New York City by billions. Sadly, those promises,
8 those court-mandated obligations have been neglected.
9 And, in recent years despite the return of fiscal
10 health in our state, New York State is owed now over
11 \$3 billion and counting. The sum, which is
12 accumulating every year. This has real consequences
13 for our students. It affects class size. It affects
14 the pace of new construction. It affects technology
15 in the classroom, and much else that has a real
16 impact on the lives of our students. And frankly,
17 I'm tired of Upstate legislatures in districts, where
18 they're spending far more than New York City spends
19 for a child, lecturing us under the concept that
20 money does matter to education. There is no avoiding
21 the need for resources in our schools. We're owed
22 this money. This budget year is in its final lap.
23 We're just weeks away from a budget. So now is the
24 time for this body to take a stand and demand that

1 STATED MEETING

71

2 New York State live up to its constitutional
3 obligation. Thank you.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
5 Council Member Gibson.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you, Madam
7 Public Advocate. I want to remind my colleagues that
8 today is--marks three years of the day in which
9 Trayvon Martin was tragically killed in Florida, a
10 17-year-old teenager. So I just ask my colleagues to
11 continue to keep his parents, family and friends in
12 our continued thoughts and prayers. And I'd also
13 like to call my colleagues' attention to the intro of
14 Reso 586 that I am introducing with Council Member
15 Cumbo, which asks the State Legislature to pass and
16 the Governor to sign legislation, which would allow
17 women who give birth while incarcerated a three-week
18 leave to care for their child. We all know the bond
19 between a mother and child is truly precious. The
20 Federal Bureau of Justice has found the rate of
21 incarcerated women has gone up by 800% in the last 30
22 years, and that most are mothers. Sadly, the
23 National Sentencing Project has estimated in 2011
24 that one in--

25

1 STATED MEETING

72

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Excuse me Council
3 Member. May we have quiet in the Chambers, please.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you.

6 SERGEANT-A-ARMS: [interposing] Quiet
7 down, please. Quiet down.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

9 Sorry.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Has estimated
11 that 1 in 25 women in State prison and one in 33
12 women in federal prison are expecting. In all other
13 instances where our government does all it can to
14 keep mothers and children united, unfortunately in
15 the prison system children are ripped away from their
16 mothers. Repeated studies over the past several
17 years have shown how the child's emotional health and
18 intellectual development is negatively impacted if
19 they are without a loving caretaker in their earliest
20 years of their life. Whether they are foster care
21 parents, grandparents raising their children. It is
22 truly unfair to deny the child the experience of its
23 mother. And this shortcoming potentially has the
24 impact of that child's future. Prison sentences are
25 meant to be placed on the adult, and not the child.

2 Less than three women's prisons in this state have a
3 program right now that allow mothers to stay with
4 their children during the earliest months of their
5 lives. This Reso 586 would apply to certain inmates
6 a discretion of the correctional authority. And
7 would allow incarcerated new mothers all over our
8 state the opportunity to keep a prison sentence from
9 encroaching on their long-term physical and wellbeing
10 of their child. I ask my colleagues to please
11 consider supporting this important resolution. Thank
12 you.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
14 Council Member Deutsch.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Yeah, thank you,
16 Public Advocate. Good afternoon. I'm speaking today
17 to request your support for Intro 676, a bill that
18 will require the New York City Taxi and Limousine
19 Commission to consider community impact when
20 reviewing all license applications. Currently,
21 community input is only required for a livery base
22 station license, but not for black car or luxury limo
23 bases. Frequently, companies whose livery base
24 station licenses are denied, subsequently apply for
25 black car or limo base licenses. Often times while

1 STATED MEETING

74

2 still operating as a livery base. This is a maneuver
3 designed to circumvent the law, and prevent the
4 community from having a voice in the process. This
5 legislation seeks to remedy the subterfuge by
6 requiring the TLC to submit copies of all base
7 station applicants, not just livery base applicants
8 to their effective council member and community board
9 and consider any comments submitted by them. The
10 negative impact on quality of life in our community
11 including the potential impact on traffic congestion,
12 parking and noise of all livery services would have
13 to be considered by the TLC before granting these
14 licenses. So I ask all my colleagues to please grab
15 your pen, and don't ask--don't make me beg and support
16 Intro 676, which will prevent circumvention, and give
17 local communities a voice in the TLC's decision
18 making process. Thank you so much.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
20 Council Member Garodnick.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank you very
22 much. I want to draw my colleague's attention to
23 Intro 682, a bill that I had a pleasure of
24 introducing with Housing Committee Chairman Jumaane
25 Williams, which protects tenants from harassment. We

2 have heard far too many stories of building owners
3 hiring what is known as relocation specialists for
4 enormous sums of money with one goal in mind, the
5 entice rent stabilized tenants out of their homes.
6 But the enticement is not always benign. These re-
7 locaters have used harassment, false offers, and
8 intimidation to get tenants from their homes, mostly
9 rent stabilized so that the owners can financially
10 benefits. These methods are completely unacceptable.
11 We have stood up on this issue in the Council before
12 on behalf of tenants facing harassment. With the
13 Speaker I was pleased to introduce a bill a number of
14 years ago. Council Chin supplemented it more
15 recently. And this bill will require that every
16 tenant re-locater specialist, and agency obtain a
17 license and operate under strict rules. If
18 specialists harass tenants at their home or work, use
19 profane language, or do anything illegal, they will
20 be subject to steep fines and a possible revocation
21 of their license. Tenants should feel safe and
22 secure in their homes, and this impossible if they
23 are being pursued relentlessly by someone who is
24 determined to push them out. This gives--this bill
25 will give the City strong tenant protection tools,

2 and I encourage my colleagues to take a look at it,
3 to support it. And I very much hope that this
4 Council will pass it into my law. In my final ten
5 seconds I will mention Intro 683, which creates the
6 same standards for city websites as we have for
7 federal websites when it comes to access for people
8 with disabilities. Thank you very much.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
10 Council Member Johnson.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you, Madam
12 Public Advocate. I rise today to ask my colleagues
13 to join me in supporting Introduction 684, which is a
14 piece of legislation, which would expand eligibility
15 for people living with HIV and AIDS in New York City;
16 low-income New Yorkers who need benefits like housing
17 assistance, who are living in poverty. And we know
18 that HIV is an epidemic that--

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Excuse me,
20 Council Member. Quiet in the Chambers, please.
21 Quiet in the Chambers.

22 SERGEANT-A-ARMS: Quiet down.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: We apologize.

24 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: We know that HIV is
25 an epidemic that thrives on inequality. To fight it,

2 we must keep our focus on the socio-economic factors
3 that have been allowed to continue for all these
4 years. Poverty, homelessness, lack of access to
5 healthcare, these are the conditions that drive the
6 epidemic. That's why we need to invest in housing
7 assistance; nutritional programs; transportation and
8 other basic subsistence benefits that lift our
9 neighbors out of poverty and enable them to access
10 the care they need. This is not just a compassionate
11 approach. It is also the smart approach, and the
12 cost-effective approach. It is how we will keep
13 people living with HIV and AIDS healthy, and how we
14 will decrease transmission rates. This bill is very
15 important and it has been talked about and fought for
16 years. I want to thank Council Member Palma, who
17 championed this a long time ago, Chair Levin, and the
18 entire LGBT Caucus who have signed on. This is a
19 very important bill the Governor put together ending
20 the AIDS Epidemic Task Force. This has been put
21 together by all the advocates. And so I ask my
22 colleagues please sign on to Introduction 684.

23 In my remaining seconds, I want to
24 mention that today I'm introducing legislation
25 related to New York City's Rent Regulation Laws with

1 STATED MEETING

78

2 Council Members Rosenthal and Williams. New York
3 City continues to face a housing crisis. Vacancy
4 rates are roughly 3.5%. The City needs to declare a
5 public emergency, which will allow our Rent
6 Stabilization Laws to be extended. Today, the
7 Council will use its authority to extend Rent
8 Regulations to protect 2.5 million New Yorkers
9 against excessive rent increase and evictions. I ask
10 my colleagues to sign onto this. Thank you very
11 much.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
13 Council Member King. Yes.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: I announce the BLAC
15 [sic] meeting right after today in the Committee
16 Room.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: So thank you.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
20 Williams.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you,
22 Madam Public Advocate. I want to call my colleagues'
23 attention to three pieces of legislation. First is
24 Reso 597, sponsored by myself, Johnson and Rosenthal,
25 which will declare a rent emergency in the five

2 boroughs. A requirement that is needed to remove the
3 City's rent protections. Since we cannot build our
4 way out of the crisis, the next resolution will help
5 our city preserve its affordability. It's Reso 596,
6 sponsored by myself and it calls for Albany to appeal
7 vacancy decontrol as way to preserve existing units
8 across the City. As we know, we will be dealing with
9 rent regulation very soon. We cannot just remove the
10 rent laws. We have to strengthen them, and I believe
11 that if we do not have a strengthening of our rent
12 laws, it will be a loss to the City. It is not a win
13 just to renew what is already existing.

14 And finally, Intro 700, which is the
15 second part to what we've heard from Council Member
16 Garodnick. It is a bill I sponsored with Council
17 Member Garodnick and Espinal, which makes harassment
18 an offense for tenant re-locaters to make a buyout
19 offer if they do not disclose that tenant may refuse
20 the buy-out offer. And that the tenant re-locater is
21 an agent of the landlord. I urge my colleagues to
22 sign onto this legislation so that we can address--
23 begin to address our affordable housing crisis before
24 Albany's June 15th deadline. Thank you.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
3 Council Member Mealy.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I rise today to
5 ask my colleagues to sign on two civil rights bills
6 that I'm introduction today, Intro 690 establishes an
7 employment discrimination program that would be
8 administered by the City's Commission on Human
9 Rights. Such investigation should include, but not
10 limited to sending out matched pairs of testers who
11 share parts of the same job and who shall present
12 similar credentials. But who shall not present the
13 same actual, or perceived age, race, creed, color,
14 nationality, gender, disability, marital status,
15 partnership status, sexual orientation or citizenship
16 status, or other protected characteristics. And I
17 hope you can sign onto our other Intro 689, which I
18 am co-sponsoring with Council Member Lander,
19 Garodnick will created a housing discrimination
20 testing program. These programs will help our Human
21 Rights Commissioner root out discrimination in the
22 sector that most affects the lives of New Yorkers:
23 jobs and housing. It is imperative that we do all
24 that we can to ensure that no one in the city faces

1 STATED MEETING

81

2 discrimination when seeking a job or a home. Please
3 sign onto these legislations and thank you.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
5 Council Member Richards.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Good afternoon.
7 I want to draw my colleagues' attention to two Intros
8 today, Intro 693, which will require all city-owned
9 and city-controlled spaces to reduce unnecessary
10 illumination by 2030. Moreover, it will require
11 periodic reporting concerning energy savings
12 resulting from occupancy sensor requirements.
13 Occupancy sensors are an easy solution to saving
14 energy and reducing or electricity costs.

15 Also, Intro 694, which would require 40%
16 of parking spaces in new parking garages and open
17 parking lots be capable of supporting electrical
18 vehicles charging stations by January 1st, 2030. The
19 existing lots would also be required to expand
20 electrical vehicle charging capabilities as they
21 upgrade their electrical capacity. In 2013, the
22 Council passed a Local Law requiring that 20% of
23 parking spaces in new parking garages and open
24 parking lots be capable of supporting electrical
25 vehicle charging stations. Increasing these stations

1 STATED MEETING

82

2 throughout the city will put us on a path towards a
3 greater energy independence. I would like to thank
4 my staff members Mercedes Buchanan; Jerrel Birney;
5 and also the counselors in committee Samara Swanson
6 and Laura Popa for getting these bills done. Thank
7 you.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
9 Council Member Dromm.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you very
11 much. Why is the NYPD using 19th Century technology
12 to solve 21st Century crimes? When I realized the
13 NYPD still uses typewriters, yes, typewriters, I was
14 shocked. The continuing use of typewriters and other
15 obsolete technology means that the NYPD is operating
16 at a severe disadvantage. Out of all government
17 functions, law enforcement should be using the most
18 advanced and secure technology. Having easily
19 accessible data is critical to solving crimes as well
20 as a host of other tasks. In addition, members of
21 the public who come in contact with the police to
22 request incidents reports, permits and so on deserve
23 to have such information entered, stored, and
24 delivered electronically.

25

2 Crime victims especially should never
3 have to fear that the information they provide the
4 provide will be lost, as has been reported to me by
5 my constituents. I recognize Commissioner Bratton's
6 efforts to focus on upgrading technology, but the
7 completed end and the use of typewriters is long
8 overdue. I ask my colleagues to join me in signing
9 onto 678, which is not just about typewriters, but
10 about requiring the NYPD to publish its comprehensive
11 technology plan. Thank you.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
13 Council Member Cumbo.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you. This
15 Sunday I look forward to presenting my Inaugural
16 State of the District Address at 3:00 p.m. in the
17 Brooklyn Museum one of the oldest and largest fine
18 arts collections in the nation, and also where I
19 received my first job. On such a momentous occasion,
20 I will recognize leaders that have made an incredible
21 impact to the arts community that are also retiring.
22 Including Arnold Lehman, Director of the Brooklyn
23 Museum; Ella Weiss, President of the Brooklyn Arts
24 Council; Kwayera Archer, Ifetayo Cultural Arts
25 Academy; as well as Karen Brooks Hopkins. I will

1 STATED MEETING

84

2 also have the honor and privilege to honor Chief
3 Gerald Nelson of Patrol Borough Brooklyn North, and
4 Assistant Chief Owen Jay Monaghan of Patrol Brooklyn
5 Borough Park South after 42 and 34 years of service
6 respectively within the New York City Police
7 Department.

8 I also am very excited to join with my
9 colleague Vanessa Gibson. On Monday morning August
10 13th, my staff and I traveled to Rikers Island to
11 tour the Rose M. Singer Center, which is the facility
12 for female detainees, and sentenced inmates. We had
13 an illuminating experience because we were given a
14 rare opportunity to sit down with the mothers and
15 pregnant inmates to share in each other's company.
16 As a result of that, of the tour, we visited the
17 nursery housed within the center. The nursery is
18 said to be the nation's first jail-based baby
19 nursery. The vast majority of inmates who give birth
20 in jails and prisons are separated from their babies
21 shortly after birth. In New York City at Rikers we
22 are fortunate that moms have the opportunities to
23 keep their newborns with them. With this is an
24 incredible prospect for mothers to be with their
25 babies. The reality is that within 24 hours after

2 birth, many women leave the hospital and return to
3 jail without their newborn. Or, are unable to keep
4 their newborn with them separated from the love their
5 family and friends. I am proud to introduce this
6 resolution along with Council Member Gibson that will
7 call on the New York State Legislature to pass and
8 the governor to sign legislation to give correctional
9 facilities the discretion to allow incarcerated women
10 who give birth while in custody to return home on
11 temporary supervised release for the first three
12 weeks after they give birth.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you,
14 Council member.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: And I hope you all
16 will support me on this. Thank you.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
18 Council Member Greenfield.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you,
20 Madam Public Advocate. I just would like to note on
21 the record my strong disappointment at the
22 announcement over this past week for the very minor
23 concessions that the Administration has made for non-
24 public schools in relation to accessing Universal
25 Pre-K. And the reason I'm disappointed is because

2 when we--all of us supported Universal Pre-K, the key
3 word was "universal." And we were promised that, in
4 fact, accommodations would be made to ensure that
5 every aspect of the city would be able to participate
6 in this very important program for our children.
7 Unfortunately, that has not come to pass. And
8 despite our many conversations and objections and
9 letters from the Jewish Caucus, and I want to thank
10 the Chair of the Jewish Caucus, Mark Levine for his
11 support on this as well. But, unfortunately, the
12 Administration has chosen to not make the necessary
13 accommodations to allow the community to participate.
14 And quite frankly, at this point approximately only
15 10% of those in the non-public school Yeshiva
16 students are participating. Where the rate of
17 participation in the entire city is closer to 80%.
18 And so, I want to note this, and not my
19 dissatisfaction. And call on the Administration to
20 make true changes so that Universal Pre-K is truly
21 universal.

22 And I would also just like to note, a
23 happier note that next week we are celebrating the
24 holiday of Purim. In the Jewish community Purim, of
25 course, is the great holiday dating back to 46 B.C.

1 STATED MEETING

87

2 It was in the Persian Empire when Haman tried to
3 destroy the Jewish people, and through a miracle
4 brought about by a strong Jewish woman, Queen Esther,
5 we were able thanks to her and God's graces to save
6 the Jewish people and be here 2-1/2 thousand years
7 later. So my wish for all who are celebrating it, a
8 very, very happy Purim.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. And
10 lastly, let me again invite my colleagues to sign
11 onto Intro 692, a bill that would establish a task
12 force to study the establishment of a private pension
13 for New Yorkers. As many of us in this Chamber know,
14 there is an imminent retirement crisis not only in
15 the United States but in New York City. More than
16 half of New York City workers are projected to be
17 poor or near poor once they retire. And no one
18 deserves to live their golden years in poverty. And
19 so this legislation will create a commission of
20 experts to study the establishment of a pension fund
21 for private sector workers. We will utilize
22 business, labor and academic leaders to create an
23 inclusive substantive process that would provide New
24 Yorkers the best possible opportunity at solving this
25 problem. The vast majority of workers in this city,

1 STATED MEETING

88

2 unfortunately do not have a pension. And if all of
3 us are concerned about income and equality, we really
4 need to focus on retirement security. I'm looking to
5 working with many of you to address this very dire
6 issue, and welcome all of my colleagues to sign onto
7 Intro 692. And as close--

8 SERGEANT-A-ARMS: [interposing] Quiet,
9 please.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: May we have quiet
11 in the Chambers? For closing remarks, for the
12 Speaker for closing remarks. For the Speaker Melissa
13 Mark-Viverito.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you Madam
15 Public Advocate. Again, to my colleagues thank you
16 all. I know we are having some-- I'm sorry I
17 couldn't be at the Chinese New Year last night,
18 Margaret. I know it was a great one, but then again,
19 the celebration on Monday. But there was--I
20 appreciate that we have these events this weekend,
21 but I wasn't able to. [sic] Thank you to my
22 colleagues. Hope everyone has a great rest of the
23 afternoon. Thank you, Madam Public Advocate.

24 [gavel]

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date March 13, 2015