

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

----- X

March 7, 2024
Start: 11:15 a.m.
Recess: 11:24 a.m.

HELD AT: COMMITTEE ROOM - CITY HALL

B E F O R E: Amanda Farías, Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Alexa Avilés
Erik D. Bottcher
Jennifer Gutiérrez
Kevin C. Riley
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.

2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: This is a mic check on
3 Economic Development. Today's date is March 7, 2024,
4 in the Committee Room, recorded by Walter Lewis.

5 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Good morning and
6 welcome to the New York City Council's vote on
7 Economic Development.

8 At this time, we ask that you silence all
9 electronic devices.

10 At no time is anyone to approach the
11 dais.

12 Chair, we're ready to begin.

13 CHAIRPERSON FARIÁS: [GAVEL] Good morning
14 and welcome to this Committee vote by the New York
15 City Council's Committee on Economic Development. My
16 name is Amanda Fariás, and I have the privilege of
17 Chairing this Committee.

18 We are here today to consider a Proposed
19 Introduction number 4-A sponsored by Council Member
20 Alexa Avilés, which represents a significant step
21 forward in our City's efforts to promote cleaner air,
22 healthier neighborhoods, and a more sustainable
23 future for all New Yorkers. As Chair of the Committee
24 on Economic Development, I'm proud to support this
25 bill, which will require cruise ships docking at our

2 city's terminals to plug into shore power, reducing
3 harmful diesel emissions and improving air quality
4 for the communities that have long borne the brunt of
5 pollution from the cruise industry. This legislation
6 is a product of tireless advocacy from the residents
7 of Red Hook who have raised their voices for years to
8 demand action on this issue. It is also a testament
9 to the hard work and dedication of Council Member
10 Avilés who has been a champion for her constituents
11 and a driving force behind this bill from the very
12 beginning.

13 Proposed Intro. number 4-A makes several
14 critical improvements to the original legislation,
15 which will ensure its effectiveness and its impact.
16 First and foremost, it streamlines compliance and
17 enforcement mechanisms by placing the onus squarely
18 on the Economic Development Corporation to hold
19 terminal operators accountable for meeting our shore
20 power goals. This means that the EDC will be
21 responsible for monitoring shore power usage and
22 imposing penalties for noncompliance, creating a
23 powerful incentive for operators to prioritize
24 sustainable practices. Moreover, this bill makes a
25 major step forward in terms of community engagement.

2 It requires EDC to work hand-in-hand with impacted
3 neighborhoods to develop comprehensive traffic
4 mitigation plans that address the specific needs and
5 concerns of each community. This collaborative
6 approach will ensure that the voices of those most
7 affected by cruise ship traffic are heard and that
8 the solutions implemented are tailored to the unique
9 challenges facing each neighborhood. Perhaps most
10 importantly, Proposed Intro. number 4-A elevates
11 shore power requirements from a voluntary port policy
12 to a legally binding mandate. By codifying these
13 standards into law, we are sending a clear message
14 that reducing emissions and improving air quality
15 around our city's cruise terminals is not just a
16 suggestion but a non-negotiable priority. This will
17 have a profound impact on the health and well-being
18 of our communities surrounding the Brooklyn Cruise
19 Terminal in Red Hook and the Manhattan Cruise
20 Terminal on the West Side, which have long suffered
21 from the negative effects of cruise ship emissions.

22 With these enhancements, Proposed Intro.
23 number 4-A represents a comprehensive and effective
24 approach to the tackling of the environmental and
25 congestion challenges posed by cruise ships. Make no

2 mistake, this is a landmark piece of legislation that
3 will cement New York City's position as a leader in
4 the fight against climate change and environmental
5 injustice in its port operations.

6 I want to thank Council Member Avilés as
7 well as the advocates and community members who have
8 worked tirelessly to get to this point.

9 Finally, I'd like to thank the Economic
10 Development Team here at the Council, Senior Counsel
11 Alex Paulenoff, Senior Policy Analyst William
12 Hongach, and Finance Analyst Glenn Martelloni for all
13 their hard work in ensuring this bill made it to a
14 vote.

15 With that, I urge my Colleagues to
16 support Proposed Intro. number 4-A, and I look
17 forward to seeing the positive impacts of this
18 legislation for years to come.

19 I will now turn the floor over to Council
20 Member Avilés to say a few words about her bill.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Good morning.
22 Thank you, Chair. You took all my comments away and
23 made them even more elegant than I would have, but
24 first and foremost, I want to thank you, Majority
25 Leader, for helping shepherd this legislation

2 through, for the hearing, and for being a champion
3 alongside me. I also want to thank Council Member
4 Bottcher who has been with us every step of the way,
5 who is also deeply impacted by this legislation, but
6 most importantly, I have to thank the community
7 members of Red Hook who long before my time as
8 Council Member championed getting shore power in Red
9 Hook, the first on the East Coast. That was directly
10 evolved from their work as advocates so we are at our
11 best as legislators when bills we write reflect the
12 residents' wants and desires and needs, and so while
13 this measure is far from perfect, it does begin to
14 address an environmental impact and traffic
15 mitigation concerns that long have gone unaddressed.
16 As you mentioned, this is a climate justice win for
17 our communities but for our city. As people know,
18 idling cruise ship emissions are equal to 34,000
19 tractor trailer idling trucks and, in a more recent
20 study, a million idling cars. This will have a huge
21 impact so I just want to thank everyone. I urge my
22 Colleagues to vote aye and look forward to continuing
23 to decarbonize our city, prioritize the health and
24 wellness of our residents, and make sure that we are

1 COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

7

2 protecting our air and our water so thank you so
3 much. I vote aye.

4 CHAIRPERSON FARIÁS: I'll now call on the
5 Committee Clerk to call the roll.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Good
7 morning. William Martin, Committee Clerk. Roll call
8 vote, Committee on Economic Development, Proposed
9 Introduction 4-A. Chair Farías.

10 CHAIRPERSON FARIÁS: I proudly vote aye
11 and congratulations, Council Member Avilés.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN:
13 Salamanca.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye on all.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank
16 you. Riley.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: Aye and
18 congratulations, Council Member Avilés.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Avilés.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Now I get to
21 proudly vote aye, and I want to thank the Economic
22 Development Task Force Committee Members for all your
23 hard work. Deeply appreciate it.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank
25 you. Bottcher.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: Permission to
3 explain my vote.

4 CHAIRPERSON FARIÁS: Permission granted.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: I really want to
6 thank Council Member Alexa Avilés for her leadership
7 on behalf of not just her constituents at Red Hook
8 but our constituents on the West Side of Manhattan.
9 This is such a great example of government being
10 responsive to what's going on out there in the world,
11 and it's an example of the laws catching up with
12 what's happening out there in the world. It's the
13 same kind of thing we're seeing with lithium-ion
14 batteries. Policies that were behind the curve
15 catching up to get a handle on that problem. Here we
16 have the laws catching up to get a handle on the
17 problem of cruise ship emissions at port. Each cruise
18 ship at port emits the same kind of emissions as
19 34,000 diesel trucks per day. That has been ignored
20 for too long by government. This bill by turning the
21 electrification at port from a voluntary program to a
22 legally binding one will have incredible benefits for
23 our constituents for decades to come. I want to thank
24 everyone who is part of this. I vote aye.

1 COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

9

2 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN:

3 Gutiérrez.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: I vote aye and
5 felicidades.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank
7 you. Vernikov.

8 With a vote of six in the affirmative,
9 zero in the negative, and no abstentions, item is
10 adopted by the Committee.

11 CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Thank you so much
12 everyone. This Committee vote is now adjourned.

13 [GAVEL]

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date March 13, 2024