CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

----- X

February 15, 2018 Start: 1:55 p.m. Recess: 2:57 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: LETITIA JAMES

Public Advocate

COREY D. JOHNSON

Speaker for the Council

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Adrienne Adams

Alan N. Maisel

Alicka Ampry-Samuel

Andrew Cohen Andy King

Antonio Reynoso

Barry S. Grodenchik

Ben Kallos Bill Perkins Brad S. Lander Carlina Rivera Carlos Menchaca

Chaim M. Deutsch

Costa G. Constantinides

Daniel Dromm Deborah L. Rose Diana Ayala

Donovan J. Richards Eric A. Ulrich Fernando Cabrera Francisco P. Moya Helen K. Rosenthal I. Daneek Miller Inez D. Barron James G. Van Bramer Joseph C. Borelli Jumaane D. Williams Justin L. Brannan Kalman Yeger Karen Koslowitz Keith Powers Laurie A. Cumbo Margaret S. Chin Mark Gjonaj Mark Levine Mark Treyger Mathieu Eugene Paul A. Vallone Peter A. Koo Rafael Espinal, Jr. Rafael Salamanca. Jr. Ritchie Torres Robert E. Cornegy, Jr. Robert F. Holden Roy I. Lancman Ruben Diaz, Jr. Stephen T. Levin Steven Matteo Vanessa Gibson Ydanis A. Rodriguez

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Invocation Delivered by: Reverend Cécé Alfred Salomon Loua, Trinity Church, 75 Broadway, New York, NY 10006

1	CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 4
2	[sound check, pause]
3	CLERK: Quiet please. At this time
4	please place all electronic devices to vibrate, all
5	electronic devices to vibrate. Will all non-Council
6	employees please leave the main floor of the Chamber.
7	Thank you.
8	PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All rise for the
9	Pledge of Allegiance.
10	SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: All rise. [Pledge of
11	Allegiance]
12	CLERK: Adams.
13	COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Present.
14	CLERK: Ampry-Samuel
15	COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Present.
16	CLERK: Ayala.
17	COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Present.
18	CLERK: Barron.
19	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Present.
20	CLERK: Borelli.
21	COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Happy to be
22	here.
23	CLERK: Thank you. Brannan.
24	COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Happy to be

here.

1	CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING	5
2	CLERK: Cabrera.	
3	COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Here.	
4	CLERK: Chin.	
5	COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.	
6	CLERK: Cohen.	
7	COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Here.	
8	CLERK: Constantinides.	
9	COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Here.	
10	CLERK: Cornegy. Deutsch.	
11	COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Here.	
12	CLERK: Diaz.	
13	COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Here.	
14	CLERK: Dromm.	
15	COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.	
16	CLERK: Espinal. Eugene.	
17	COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Here.	
18	CLERK: Gibson. Gjonaj.	
19	COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: I'm here.	
20	CLERK: Grodenchik. Holden.	
21	COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Here.	
22	CLERK: Kallos. King.	
23	COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Present.	
24	CLERK: Koo.	
	1	

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.

1	CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING	6
2	CLERK: Koslowitz.	
3	COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Present.	
4	CLERK: Lancman. Lander.	
5	COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here.	
6	CLERK: Levin. Levine.	
7	COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.	
8	CLERK: Maisel.	
9	COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Here.	
10	CLERK: Menchaca.	
11	COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Presente.	
12	CLERK: Miller.	
13	COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Present.	
14	CLERK: Moya.	
15	COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Present.	
16	CLERK: Perkins.	
17	COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Present.	
18	CLERK: Powers.	
19	COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Here.	
20	CLERK: Reynoso. Richards.	
21	COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.	
22	CLERK: Rivera.	
23	COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Present.	
24	CLERK: Rodriguez.	

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Here.

1	CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING	7
2	CLERK: Rose.	
3	COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Here.	
4	CLERK: Rosenthal.	
5	COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here.	
6	CLERK: Salamanca.	
7	COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Present.	
8	CLERK: Torres.	
9	COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: I'm here.	
10	CLERK: Treyger.	
11	COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Here.	
12	CLERK: Ulrich.	
13	COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Here.	
14	CLERK: Vallone. Eugene.	
15	COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Here.	
16	CLERK: Van Bramer.	
17	COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.	
18	CLERK: Williams.	
19	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Here.	
20	CLERK: Yeger.	
21	COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Here.	
22	CLERK: Matteo.	
23	COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Here.	
24	CLERK: Cumbo.	

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Present.

2.2

2.3

Chambers.

2 CLERK: Speaker Johnson.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: Here.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All quiet in the

All rise for the Invocation.

CLERK: All rise.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: The Invocation will be delivered by Reverend Cécé Alfred Salomon

Loua, the Priest for Pastoral Care and Community at

Trinity Church at 75 Broadway in the Borough of

Manhattan.

Speaker, Corey Johnson, Public Advocate Patricia

James and Council Members for this opportunity to
offer the invocation for this meeting. I'm honored
and humbled. I'm conducing this invocation as a
clergy and a staff member of Trinity Church Wall
Street. My name is Cece Alfred Salomon Loua. Let us
pray. Holy and undivided Trinity one God, I thank you
for your presences among us, and in our hearts here
at this moment. Please look upon us. The city of
New York we are women and men with different sexual
orientations. We are students, immigrants documented
and to be documented. We are believers of different
faith traditions and non-believers. We are from

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

different horizons. We are people of color and white, we are of diverse opinions. But you have brought us together to live and work with you. All of us in this room have homes to return to where we can stay warm and relaxed after this meeting, but many of your children in New York lack that chance. We are at work in this room, but many of your-of our brothers and sisters as you're blessed, and they look food and a drink, and they count on the decisions that this Council is about to make. You love and each of us equally. I ask your blessing upon your trusted servant leaders, the Council Members of New York City as they gather to do the work you have given them to do. May their meeting be governed by your pastoral spirit of righteousness, in consideredness (sic) compassion for fair justice to worship. Assist them in their humanness. Give them your supreme wisdom to mend their differences, and be open to others' ideas and beliefs so they can find common ground when they reach agreement on what is best for our community and beyond, you who protected them, oh, mighty God when they return home. I pray in your holy name, amen.

2.2

2.3

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Amen. Please be seated. A motion Pastor? A motion to spread the invocation in full upon the record. Council Member Chin.

Public Advocate, and thank you Reverend Loua. Born in Guinea, West Africa Reverend Cece Alfred Solomon Loua is staff at the Trinity Church on Wall Street in Lower Manhattan. Reverend Loua studied philosophy and theology throughout Africa and France before he became a Jesuit in 1989, ordained Deacon in 1998 and then a priest in 1999. He was receives in the Episcopal Church in Detroit on July 6, 2006. Since September 2017, he has been preparing couples for weddings--

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing] [shushing for quiet]

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: --youth for baptism, and presiding over these services on behalf of Trinity Church. Reverend Loua has also made it his mission to visit parish-Parishioners and community members who are homebound, hospitalized, and in nursing homes throughout New York City. Thank you, Reverend Loua for all that you do for our

Communications.

2 CLERK: None.

3 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Land Use Call-

4 ups.

1

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

5 CLERK: None.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the Chambers as we now hear from the—as we now hear from the Speaker Corey Johnson.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: Good afternoon. Yesterday, shortly after we ended the Stated Meeting, news broke of yet another school shooting. This time at Marjory Stoneman Douglas High School in Parkland, Florida. Another senseless tragedy has occurred due to gun violence. This is now the 18th school shooting in 2018. The 18th. It is heartbreaking to see that this now the new normal. As always, of course, our thoughts and prayers are with the students, faculty, staff or Marjory Stoneman Douglas High School, the victims and their families, but thoughts and prayers are not enough. Now, we again call for the President of the United States and the Congress to do something and ensure that these tragedies are prevented. We also have sad news close to home. Felix Palacios, a former staff member of the Council's Community Engagement Division passed

2

3

4

6

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

away. Felix was born and raised in Brooklyn. calling to public service came in working for the Districting Commission in the early 1990s, and later joining the staff of Council Members Andrew Rodriguez and Sarah Gonzalez serving the communities of Council District 38, Council Member Menchaca's District. neighborhoods of Red Hook, Sunset Park, Greenwood Heights and portions of Windsor Terrace, Dyker Heights and Borough Park. For over 20 years he was committed to serving these neighborhoods and committed in services to the needs of this diverse constituency over that period of time. His wonderful smiling grin and knowledgeable input and social and political discourse will be sorely missed. Let us please take a moment of silence. If folks could stand in honor of Felix, in honor of all the victims yesterday, those we lost and those who will forever be traumatized by the events of yesterday. of silence] Thank you. Now, I'd like to wish my colleagues and all the-all of our Asian-American New Yorkers a very happy Lunar New Year as Council Members Koo and Chin talked about yesterday, the year of the dog, and I want to thank Council Members Margaret Chin and Peter Koo for providing us with an

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

2 amazing lunch. They even saved me a pork bun because 3 I was late.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yeah.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: So, I am happy. Also, I'd like to extend my well wishes to my Jewish colleagues and all Jewish New Yorkers on this happy Purim. Jumping into our docket for today, also-one thing and in the remarks but I want to acknowledge I'm really glad that the Legislature and the Governor are moving the primary this year because it coincides with September 11^{th} and also with Rosh Hashana, and I think it's important that we do that, and I'm glad that's being done from the 11th to the 13th. Jumping into our docket for today, we begin today by voting on a resolution calling on Congress and President Trump to sigh HR 4937, which provide Ravi Ragbir and opportunity to pursue immigration relief so that he is not separated from his family while his case goes through the court system. Ravi personifies the need for compassionate, fair and just immigration policies, and we, the New York City Council continue to do everything in our power to stand up for immigrant communities in our city and across the nation. We stand with Ravi and urge our federal

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

officials to stand with him as well. Moving on, we will vote on two finance items, and a few land use items. Beginning with Finance items, we'll vote on two Article Xi Property Tax resolutions. The first resolution would approve an exemption for a property located at 2524-26 Adam Clayton Powell Boulevard in Council Member Bill Perkins' district. This exemption would not-would support the preservation of 18 units of low-income rental housing. The second resolution for the property located at 147-18 Archer Avenue in Council Member Daneek Miller's district, it would approve a technical amendment to an exemption previously granted by the Council in November of 2015, which supported the new construction of 449 units of affordable rental housing. Next, we're voting on the following land use items. The first item is a landmark designation of Peter P. and Rose M. Huberty House located at 1019 Bushwick Avenue in Council Member Antonio Reynoso's district. The house was designed in 1900 and contributed to-to the development of Bushwick Avenue as one of Brooklyn's most prestigious residential streets. We'll also be voting for the approval of an Article XI property tax exemption for a project known as Hopkinson Park Place

Orders.

1	CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 17
2	CLERK: Preconsidered M 18 and Reso 193,
3	Transfer of City Funds.
4	SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
5	Orders.
6	CLERK: On the General Order Calendar, LU
7	7 and Res 194, Landmark Designation.
8	SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
9	Orders.
10	CLERK: Preconsidered LU 25 and Reso 195,
11	Tax Exemption.
12	SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
13	Orders.
14	CLERK: Resolution Appointing Various
15	Persons Commissioner of Deeds.
16	SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
17	Orders, and I would ask for a roll-call vote on all
18	of the items on today's General Order Calendar.
19	*
20	
21	CLERK:
22	
23	PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES:
24	CLERK:
25	PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES:

1	CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 18
2	CLERK: Adams.
3	COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Aye on all.
	_
4	CLERK: Ampry-Samuel
5	COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: With
6	permission to explain my vote.
7	PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: I just want
9	to quickly say that I've watched this particular
10	property many, many years, and I am just excited that
11	we will now be able to have new affordable
12	homeownership opportunities in the district and that
13	25 units I'm very excited and I'm pleased, and so I
14	invite-I vote aye on all.
15	PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Congratulations.
16	CLERK: Ayala.
17	COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Aye on all.
18	CLERK: Barron.
19	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Aye on all.
20	CLERK: Borelli.
21	COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye on all
22	except Land Use 7 and Reso 194.
23	CLERK: Brannan.
24	COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Aye on all.

CLERK: Cabrera.

1	
1	CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 19
2	COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye.
3	CLERK: Chin.
4	COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye on all.
5	CLERK: Cohen.
6	COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye.
7	CLERK: Constantinides.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye on
9	all.
10	CLERK: Cornegy. Deutsch.
11	COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye on all.
12	CLERK: Diaz.
13	COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Aye on all except
14	LU 7, Resolution 194 and Resolution 182.
15	CLERK: Dromm.
16	COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.
17	CLERK: Espinal. Eugene.
18	COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I vote aye.
19	CLERK: Gibson.
20	COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Aye on all.
21	CLERK: Gjonaj.
22	COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Permission to
23	explain my vote.
24	PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

	CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 20
2	COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: There's no
3	question that the Peter Paul Huberty House is a
4	structure of history value, but it's also the
5	family's home, and we must respect the rights of
6	private citizens and their property. And as a home
7	that has been well maintained by the same family for
8	over 90 years, I see no reason for the city to place
9	an undue burden on this family and override their
10	wishes. Homeowners should and can be trusted to make
11	informed decisions about their own property, which
12	for many is the single largest investment. So, I
13	vote yes on all except for Land Use 7 and Resolution
14	194.
15	PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
16	CLERK: Grodenchik. Holden.
17	COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Aye on all except
18	I'm voting no on LU 7 and Resolution 194, and
19	Resolution 182.
20	PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
21	CLERK: King.
22	COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Aye on all.
23	CLERK: Koo.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye on all.

CLERK: Koslowitz.

24

convictions, but this Council has demonstrated in the

CLERK: Rivera.

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Aye on all.

CLERK: Rodriguez.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: I'm very proud that we are voting on the resolution calling into allow Ravi to stay in our city. We cannot divide families. I believe that even though someone has made any error in their life, something that in the case of Ravi has not been decided yet because his case is still pending in New Jersey. It should bring us to believe and think that every human being deserves a second chance in their life. Many of us are examples of that. We have a second chance in many aspects in our life, and I think that someone such as Ravi that have been fighting not only for himself, but also for Amanda Morales, for the millions of undocumented that contribute with billions of dollars to our economy, but no one ask them for their immigration status when they go to Home Depot, to Target to Marshal's. However, we don't want to allow them to stay in our country. last immigration reform happened under Republican

speak on Reso 182. It's often morbidly amusing to

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

hear people speak about why they will not support this resolution or support-not deporting undocumented immigrants using crime, using law, using the rule of law and order as an excuse. Morality very often is not equal to that. So, the shooting that we spoke about just today was prejudiced legally, and we're not talking often enough on changing those laws. can go back in time whether it's the Japanese, whether it's Chinese, whether it's slaves. We can go back to Germany, go back to the Congo where people use nuggets of truth as an excuse, and many times they use rule of law and order to cover up what was victory. In this case, if you use the logic that people are using to its largest exclusion, at conclusion you are basically saying that for the crime that was committed the fullest extent of the law should be used. So, let's say for exam-example if Ravi was not undocumented and the law was you can get ten years, you are saying there should be ten There should be no other discussion about what the punishment should be. We are immediately saying that the fullest extent of the law is morally correct and should be applied here. That makes absolutely no sense. The reason we are saying it is

2	because we're allowing the orange madness, and the
3	other madness that has occurred to permeate
4	throughout this country. There is no reason to be
5	targeting immigrants in 7/11 and other places,
6	targeting activists like Ravi to be deported when
7	they pose no public safety threat while we taught we
8	are almost silent when it comes to the imbalance.
9	Let's not make excuses here. This is bigotry and we
10	can replace ourselves in any part in history and use
11	those same excuse and people are going to look back
12	now [bell] and wonder why people didn't learn from
13	history. I'd like to vote aye on all. I also want
14	to point out the changes that's happening in—in the
15	budget mod, and I want to thank the Speaker, Carlos
16	Menchaca. We passed 1447 here. It was historic
17	dealing with the construction site safety. The
18	Administration promised there will be funding for
19	local groups to do that work that is happening today.
20	He doesn't like to get acknowledged, but I do want to
21	acknowledge Juan Martinez and Latonia McKinney for
22	helping the first step in getting this money to the
23	local groups on the ground who need to be trained.
24	With that, I vote aye no all.

escaped Nazi Europe, Nazi occupied Europe to China

where he and his classmate from Yeshiva lived for

24

2 several years before they were welcomed into this 3 country. From both sides of my family, I was 4 welcomed into this country and my family, an incredible opportunity, an incredible nation did this for us, and did this for all of us because most 6 7 likely very few of us have ancestors who came here on 8 the Mayflower. I vote no because as Error Louis mentioned yesterday, two days ago in his op-ed, thethe person who we're doing this resolution for is not 10 11 the right example of what's wrong with immigration in 12 Washington. The-the problem with immigration in Washington is that it's not recognizing our DREAMers. 13 14 It's not recognizing those who have come here who 15 have abided by the law who have done right by their 16 community and done right by America, and it's not 17 recognizing that we should put our arms around them 18 and welcome them in. I have utmost respect for my 19 colleagues, my brothers and sisters here in this 20 Council who support Mr. Ragbir, and who support his cause. I vote not because I do not believe that we 21 2.2 should be lending our name to his effort. 2.3 respect to LU 7 and Reso 194, I associated—that we associate my comments-myself with the comments of 24 Council Member Gjonaj. I don't believe that the 25

10

12

- Council should be enabling the big foot of government
 on the neck of a private individual who owns his or
 her house who's immaculately maintained that home for
 generations by the record of this body I believe
 since the 1930s. They've done well. They've done
 right [bell] and they should be entitled to do so in
 continuum without the foot of our government on their
 necks, and with that I vote no.
 - PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
- 11 CLERK: Matteo.
 - COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: No on LU 7 and accompany Reso 194, age on the rest.
- 14 CLERK: Cumbo.
- 15 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I vote aye on all.
- 16 CLERK: Speaker Johnson.
- 17 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I vote aye. [pause]
- 18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Okay. All items
- 19 on today's General Order Calendar were adopted by a
- 20 vote 43 in the affirmative, 0 negative and 0
- 21 abstentions with the exception of Land Use 7, and
- 22 accompanying Resolution 194, which was adopted by a
- 23 vote of 37 in the affirmative, 6 negative and 0
- 24 abstentions. And now, to Resolution 182, which reads
- 25 | as follows: A resolution calling upon the United

that he may be-so that he may stay in the country

lawfully. I will say that one of the core messages

her is about due process, and what we're allowing for

2.3

24

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

him to do is to go and continue to show up and check in as he's always done as a lawful resident of this country, and give him that opportunity for due This vote reminds us that whether you are process. an immigrant or you were born in this country, you have the right to due process. We all have that right to defend out cases in court without arbitrary intrusions from external sources including the White House, which is doing what it's doing causing fear and panic in our neighborhoods. The times in which we live require us to remain open to all viewpoints and ensure we have open spaces where people can voice their opinions and their concerns, [bell] and that's the most basic principle of civic engagement. thank the members of my committee that spoke out against his resolution. I hear you. Let's continue to talk. Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the Chambers, please. Council Member—Council Member Williams.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you. You know, I said most of what I had to say, but I didn't want—I don't want to leave lingering out there the thought that we are going to separate people who need

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

assistance. We will not separate the DREAMers from other undocumented immigrants and other people who are in this country. Everyone needs assistance. All of them should be treated as Human beings, and with respect. What we are saying now the only people who can make mistakes are those who have documents and American citizens. Ravi had a green card. He was here was here lately, and he made a mistake, and my parents came here form another country. At any point in time any of us can make a mistake. Most of us have. We didn't get caught. So, what we are saying is that are unworthy of redemption if you make a mistake. You are unworthy of any sympathy if you make a mistake, and again, why is it that Black and Brown immigrants should be prosecuted to the fullest extent of the law basically for this crime? I mean Ravi served two years in jail. He served two years at a detention center and two years house arrest. What else do you want him to do to pay for the crime that he committed? [bell] We were told by the Orange Madness that they focused on violent crimes. That's another conversation, but this wasn't that. We should be careful of the precedence that we set, and learn from history from those that were set

2.2

2.3

before. I'm very proud to stand with Ravi, and I'm

very proud that this body is going to vote for this

resolution. Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member Chin.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Today, I stand with my colleagues in support of Ravi Ragbir's continued and permanent presence in the United States. Some have claimed that his past precludes him from our support. Mr. Ragbir's identity is not defined by his past. He's a husband, he's a father and he has been an immigrant rights activist. He educates our communities and provides sanctuary for the most vulnerable immigrants among us. His past does not define him. His work educating diverse communities and providing sanctuary for the most vulnerable immigrants after his incarceration has more than earned our respect and support. As an immigrant and as an advocate, I stand with Ravi Ragbir. Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member Lander.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you, Madam

Public Advocate. Over the last couple of years I've

had the great good goof fortunate to get to know Ravi

Dromm.

Ragbir and see his extraordinary advocacy for making
our city a more loving and welcome and compassionate
place. I just want to underline what Council Member
Williams said. Let's remember President Trump took
the DREAMers hostage precisely to try to draw lines
that would harm other immigrants. That was his goal,
and that's the debate that is playing our right now,
but if you believe in compassion and in looking at
every individual individually and providing a path
for redemption, the resolution today is one to
support, and I would just add this. You know, Dr.
King-Ravi's work, if you're not familiar with it
Leading New Sanctuary NYC and opening up our
communities and our churches and our synagogues and
our mosques and even one Hindu Temple to be places of
sanctuary is quite extraordinary. Dr. King said that
love-justice is what love looks like in public.
Sanctuary is that love looks like in our place of
worship. Thank you.
PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker—Madam Public Advocate. I, too, also am supporting this resolution. I have know Ravi

2	Ragbir for the last eight years. I have written
3	letters of support for Ravi for all of the check-ins
4	that he's done over the last eight years. I have
5	worked with Ravi on immigration issues when I was the
6	Chair of the Immigration Committee. I have spoken at
7	forums with him. Ravi Ragbir is truly deserving of
8	the full rights and privileges, and Ravi Ragbir is an
9	asset to the United States of America and to the city
10	of New York. I vote in favor of this resolution.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All of those in favor of this resolution, please say aye.

COUNCIL MEMBERS: [in unison] Aye.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All of those opposed?

COUNCIL MEMBER: Today abstain.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All of those abstentions. If you oppose this resolution, please approach the desk and have your vote recorded accordingly, and now to General Discussions beginning with Council Member Koo.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you, Madam

Public Advocate. [off mic] Today, I join my

colleagues--

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
3 Council Member Koo, your—That's okay.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: I know. I join my colleagues in mourning those--[background comments]in mourning those lost at yesterday's shooting at Marjory Stoneman Douglas High School in Parkland, Florida. A member of my staff actually attended this school 23 years go. He spent the day yesterday like too others fanatically reaching out to old high school friends and other alumni desperately hoping for news that would not confirm his worst fears. This horrifying event happened in a wealthy, coast elite-coast elite community-in a community that was named—it was name for Florida's—let me see. my-that was named Florida's safest city last year, and it jus goes to show that gun violence can happen anywhere. And because gun violence can happen anywhere we must have stronger restrictions and who can buy those weapons of mass murder, heavy machine guns, AR15s. These are weapons of sport. These are military weapons designed to kill large numbers of people quickly and efficiently. So enough is enough. It's time to-it's time for meaningful gun control and mental health education monitory. My heart goes out

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

2 to all affected by this wildness. Let this be our 3 last lesson learned the hard way. Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

Council Member Cabrera.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so much, Madam Public Advocate. Today, I join those who are paying for those in Parkland High School. personally hit me at home when I received a call that the mother of my son-in-law who moved from the Bronx, New York is actually the Assistant Principal in that school. I had an opportunity to speak with her yesterday. She, as you can imagine, she was a bit shaken, traumatized by what took place. I just don't understand how we could in America still allow an 18year-old to legally purchase an AR15. I've been in the middle of shoot-outs. This stays with you for the rest of your life. When people begin to shoot you don't where to run. You see kids running all over the place. It stays with you. I can only imagine what these families are going through. must have a concert of voices coming together that at the very least is law that permits 18-year-olds to buy an AR15. Look, I lived down south for three I understand the culture of down south where

2

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

people are raised with guns, children and so forth 3 but this is-this is unthinkable, baffling to me that 4 we still in the year 2018 allowing 18-year-olds to buy guns and resulting now in 18 incidents, and we

had 17 deaths and 14 that still are in the hospital. 6

7 My prayers continue, but let's put some feet to our 8 faith because faith without [bell] works is dead.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Council Member Menchaca.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you. So we just voted on the resolution, Transparency Resolution No. 8, which includes several organizations that will provide construction site safety training. Council Member Williams mentioned it in his speech. I want to underscore the sensitive needs of all construction workers that also include limited English proficiency. Over the last few years, New York City has experienced a surge in construction related accidents, injuries and fatalities affecting mostly Latino and immigrant workers. Responding to the alarming statistics, this Council has made it its priority to guarantee the safety of all construction workers. Last year we approved a comprehensive legislation package again

championed by Council Member Williams and this
Council 1447. This legislation sponsored also by
myself and 45 colleagues included an amendment to the
Administrative Code of the City of New York and the
New York City Building Code to include provisions
guaranteeing equal access to construction site safety
trainings addressing the needs of the individuals who
do not have equal access to such a training, and so
today now we are getting closer to that promise that
all safety can go to all construction workers, and so
I'm really excited to continued to do this work. I
will say that this is going to be part of our
conversations in the budget, but I'm really excited
that both the legislative pursuits of this—of this
goal is now being seen in our budget. Thank you so
much to our Speaker who continue to champion this
issue, and I know is dedicated to ensuring that we
all keep this in the front of our minds. Thank you.
PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
Council Member Williams.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you. I want especially myself and my colleague's remarks on this as well, and again thank the administration.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you. 3 want to especially myself have and my-my colleagues remarks on this as well, and again thank the 4 Administration for following through on what was said. I know this is just the beginning, and I did 6 7 want to thank Council Member Menchaca and the 8 speaker, Council Members Rodriguez, Richards, Cumbo and Espinal for the resolution that we voted on. Again, with Ravi his wife is a citizen, and his 10 11 daughter is a citizen. Just want to just reiterate 12 because I don't think people understand. 13 basically saying I expect the people who don't 14 support it every single person who is on trial needs 15 to receive the highest possible punishment that can 16 ever happen for every law, everywhere, anywhere. 17 That is the only way that your opposition makes any 18 kind of logical sense. I know it may sound like it 19 does, but we've heard it all before in different 20 times for different people. It is a frustrating 21 thing to hear it again as if we're hearing it for the first time, and have learned no lessons. Also, I'll 2.2 2.3 just leave what happened in Florida. I don't even know the words to describe the frustration to hear 24 25 this happen over and over again. The Orange

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

Gibson.

Man in the White House, the Republicans and those who continue to support him. The leadership of the NRA continue to say prayers of condolences, and I just want to make sure it is clear they apparently read from the Bible many of them, and it's a different book than I read from. As was said by my colleague, the one I read from says faith without works is dead, which means their prayers are hollow and meaningless. I don't have the authority, but I don't think God even respects the prayers that they are making. I would like to say if you are not going to do anything, guns are created to kill and maim. it period. Machine guns are created to do that expediently. That's it. If you're not going to do anything, at least shut the hell up. Thank you. PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: How do I follow that? Thank you, Madam Public Advocate. Good afternoon to all of my colleagues. I, too, want to join with all of you in expressing my sincerest condolences and prayers to all of the innocent victims in the horrific shooting that struck Florida.

 ${\tt I'm}$ certainly no stranger to mass shootings that 25

2

3

4

6

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

continue to happen in this country, but it's outright shameful that his federal administration refuses to enact comprehensive and sensible gun reform legislation. So, while the thoughts and prayers are great, certainly we all continue to call for action and making sure that we prevent these mass shootings as much as possible. I want to wish all of my colleagues and their constituents a very happy Lunar New Year, and I also want to call two-my colleagues' attention to in our agenda for today is the upcoming hearing schedule for our preliminary budget process that starts in March, and as the new Chair of the new Subcommittee on Capital Budget, I'm very honored that we will have our hearing on Tuesday March 6th jointly with the Finance Committee with Chair Dromm, and then if you look through the schedule for those committee chairs I have already spoken to, we will have separate hearings those five particular committees: The Committee on Transportation, Environmental Protection, Parks, Public Housing and Department of Correction. So, look forward to having those very critical conversations as it relates to the Capital Budget. I also want to express my thoughts and prayers to the family and friends of Bronx resident,

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

the late Deborah Danner. Unfortunately, the verdict was rendered by the judge this afternoon in Bronx County, and the sergeant involved in her murder was acquitted of all charges, and certainly it continues to underscore the need to work with medical professionals and crisis intervention teams and coresponse teams to make sure that we support first responders as they respond to New Yorkers in emotional distress. So, I want to continue to pray for Deborah Danner's family. Certainly, this is not a day that, you know, they are ever going to forget, but we want to continue to keep them in our thoughts and prayers, and I also want to remind everyone on behalf of our BLAC Co-Chairs we will see you this evening for the celebration of Black History Month here in the Council Chambers at 5:30. Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you. So, back in December I had a—a terrible tragedy in my district where a house caught on fire that left a mother and three young children dead and a father and three young children critical in the hospital. And also, over the last few months in Washington Heights, there was a fire that left 17 people injured, and as well as it was in the last few months in the Bronx,

2 and my colleague Council Member Ritchie Torres' 3 District, it left 13 people lead including their one-4 year-old child. So, at the request of the Bronx Borough President, today along with my colleague 5 Council Member Ritchie Torres, we have three bills: 6 7 Intro 609, which will mandate the Department of 8 Education to implement a comprehensive plan for educating both children and parents about fire safety prevention, and we're also looking to include all the 10 11 non-public schools, public schools as well. Intro 12 610 is also an intro today that we are introducing 13 and the fire that happened in the Bronx was a child 14 who turned on the knob of the stove and that caused 15 the fire. So, Intro 610 will require building owners 16 to put on a safety knob-safety toggles on all stove 17 knobs, and the third intro is Intro 6-which one is 18 that? Intro 603. Is that it? Alright, the third 19 intro is to [bell]—it's basically to educate 20 residents in the building to shut the door. The fire 21 that happened in the Bronx started in a room where 2.2 that door should have been shut. If that door was 2.3 shut, it would have contained the fire and the smoke within that room. Since that door was not closed, 24 the fire spread pretty quickly throughout the 25

Council Member Lander.

2.2

2.3

building that killed 13 people. So, this would berequire building owners to put up the signage in the
building to let residents know that if there is a
fire in a room, to shut that door. So, I—it's an
honor to have these three bills proposed with my
colleague Council Member Ritchie Torres, and at the
request of the Bronx Borough President Ruben Diaz and
looking for the passage of this bill, and I'm asking
all the members to please sign onto this critical—to
these three critical fire safety bills. Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

Public Advocate. With the 18th school shooting of just the young 2018, I find it hard not to get numb. So, one thing I want to do is just like call people's attention to Aaron Feis, the football coach and school security who threw himself in front of the shooter to save students in that school. Let's make sure we remember and pay attention to the victims and—and humanize them. Let's also remember even on those days, which are less and less rare, frequent that there isn't a school shooting, 96 Americans are killed with guns every single day, and this is a

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

political issue. The President's first act in office was to remove common sense gun laws preventing people with mental illness from getting guns. So, we just urge you if you have not already to sign up for either Moms Demand Action or Every Town for Gun Safety. We're just going to have to keep organizing if we don't want to be in this place day after day after day. On a lighter note, but still an important one, I'm proud to be joining the Speaker and Council Member Richards in two bills that are being introduced today calling on and compelling our city to move forward on issues of fair housing. Fifty years ago this year in the same month that Dr. King was killed, he won passage of the Fair Housing Act. President Obama took real steps to strengthen that act, and unfortunately, then Ben Carson and HUD and the president rolled that back just a couple of weeks ago. Intro 601 and 607 being introduced by the Speaker and by Council Member Richards will help make sure the city keeps moving forward on this critical issue even as the federal government tries to roll us backwards. Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member

25 Barron.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, Madam 3 Public Advocate. I just wanted to add my voice to 4 those who have expressed their condolences and offered their prayers to the victims of this horrible 5 shooting, their families and we just pray that they 6 7 will be comforted as they go through this difficult 8 time. And I also want to say that I've been asked to remind people that at 5:30 this afternoon we're going to have a fantastic program, and pay tribute some of 10 11 the heroes that exist among us in our communities in 12 terms of what their contributions have been, and I do 13 also want to say that as my colleague has noted, the 14 bench trial that was held for the killing of Deborah 15 Danner resulted in the judge finding that sergeant 16 not guilty. And, I say that as long as officers who 17 kill people get away and are not convicted, there is 18 always going to be that element and that undertone of 19 not trusting the officers that are charged with 20 protecting us because they are not protecting us. 21 They are violating the rules, they're violating their training. There's contradictory evidence that's 2.2 2.3 presented that says that they did such, but yet and still they are not convicted. They get away with 24 murder, and it's an issue that repeats itself over, 25

2.2

2.3

and over and over, and we've got to make sure that we continue to fight, and that we continue to raise the issue of a justice system that does not bring justice to victims of police violence. And, there was one other thing. I think I said you're invited to be with us this afternoon. We hope that you'll all come. Thank you.

ALBERT JOHNSON: Thank you. Council Member Yeger.

COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you, Madam
President. Madam Public Advocate. Sorry. I—I wish
to add my voice as well to my colleagues who spoke
about what happened in Florida. Council Member
Rodriguez and Council Member Perkins and my brother
from Brooklyn Council Member Williams were outside
this building earlier today speaking about it, and I
let go a little bit of what I said earlier. I, too,
am a parent, and I can't possibly imagine the feeling
of your child leaving to school in the morning, and
not knowing whether or not he's going to come home.
But for the grace of God, our children were not in
that building because we're here in a city that has
sensible gun laws. There is no reason that I can
possibly fathom that I understand why a private

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

citizen not in law enforcement, they're not in the military should have the ability to pick up an assault weapon in this country legally. It is-it is simply an unfathomable concept for me whether you are a strong Second Amendment proponent or whether you think nobody should ever have a gun any time, itthere can't be a place where in America we think it's okay that people are able to buy an assault weapon, but that's the America we have, and that's because of the Congress, and that's because of the president. And, there's very little we can do here in this Council other than be sad, offer our prayers, you know, hug a child tonight, hug each other here. But what we do know is that this problem is from Washington, and it is a cancer on our country created by people in Washington who just don't care. Whatever reason we attributed to them whether it's because of its political contributions or it's because they come from a place in America where it's okay to carry a gun, but it makes no sense. And we have to continue doing what we're doing, and people here have been doing it for far longer than I have. [bell] Thank you, Madam President.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

3 | Council Member Diaz.

1

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Thank you, Madam President. What happened in Florida affects all of I hear people here today talking about prayer and saying shut up. You know, the nation we could pass all the laws that we-that we could pass and that is good, and there should be laws. But ladies and gentlemen, let me assure you that it is not the gun the one that kills. It is the evil in people's heart, and we should pass laws, and laws should be there to prevent whatever, but ladies and gentlemen, don't ever remember-don't ever forget that the evil in people's hearts there's no one, there is no president, there is no human being that could take that evil out. That evil is the only way that that even comes out is with the power of prayer. I know you don't believe in the power of prayer. I know you don't-sometimes you don't believe, and you might be laughing at what I said, but ladies-ladies and gentlemen, I'm pressing all of you believe me, the only thing that could help is the power of prayers. Like in Jesus they did the Bible always. We don't believe in anybody, and then we come here, oh, they

2.2

2.3

pass laws, they come here and pass all the laws you want, and I assure you the only thing that could help to take the evil out of people's hearts is the power of prayer. You don't have to agree with me, but even though you do not agree with me, I do believe in the prayer, the power of prayer. Thank you very much, Madam. [bell]

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member King.

Public Advocate. Happy Purim to my Jewish brothers, and for those who celebrate the Lunar New Year, enjoy. I rise today to just offer my condolences to the families in Florida, and we are going through a terrible ordeal, but as well as we are here in the Bronx again, we insisted then as murder will set free again. I remind us again that in November 2016, we passed a resolution calling on Congress to amend the United States Constitution, which clearly stated that the Black at that time was consider three-fifths of a human being. We've also designated March 5th Three-fifths Clause Awareness Day, which is coming up on us in a couple of weeks. Not only do I urge us to be in the room at the National—National Black Theater that

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

evening, but being there to hear the conversation that's going to take place, which is there are reasons that a Deborah Danner gets killed, and a murderer goes off. There's reason that the injustice and fairness-unfairness that happens in this country. And, sometimes while we pass legislation in this body, sometimes we forget the root of all evil, which our good Council Member Reverend Diaz just mentioned because prayer means so much to us all. And when we're outside of these walls and halls and even when we start the day, we offer up prayers and words of inspiration, and then we forget that moment when got to go through trials and tribulations. So, I say to us all, I remind us all our history has been such as that injustice and bigotry lends to the country and moves this country each and every day. Forty-five is an example of it, but what are we going to do in the city of New York? When do we stand up and fight and stand together to fight the causes of injustice and bigotry. So, to the Danner family, to all those in Florida, I offer my condolences and support, and my daddy and my mama raised me to be a gentleman and a happy person in the spirit love. It's put happiness in my heart. If I have offended anybody by being

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

happy in this place, I will pray for you because God in charge. With that being said, blessings and prayers to each and every one of us. God bless.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And lastly, Council Member Rodriguez.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: I pray everyday hoping that our President open his heart and stop the message of hate that has spread throughout the whole nation. The hate that has a role in the attack that took the lives away of those beautiful lives in Florida. Eighteen shootings is too much, and I believe with the Reverend-as the Reverend said that as a person of faith, we have to keep praying, but at the same time we also have to be proud and redefining our American bills buy-in for immigrants. The Americans that this President and the Right Wing of this nation is trying to take it backwards. think that the shooting that happened yesterday is also a reminder to our city: Let's be prepared. Just a matter of time when the black market that is selling those weapons throughout the nation are also coming to our city. We have so many young people dealing with mental health issues with enough social workers, guidance counselors, and psychology in our

this conversation.

2.2

2.3

schools. I don't want to advocate to change our schools as a state police in our city, but also I think it is time for our city to put together a plan on improving safety and advocating for a small detector—a small detector in our—in our schools, but I'm pretty sure that every single private school they send the letter or email or test today to the parents because today there's 1.1 million students discussing what happened in Florida. I'm not too sure that our parents in New York City public schools got a letter [bell] encouraging the parents to be part of this conversation and offering support on how to guiding

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: It is an amended tally with regards to Land Use 7 and accompanying Resolution 194. It was adopted by a vote of 36 in the affirmative and 7 in the negative, and now to close, the Speaker Corey Johnson.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: I want to thank
everyone for being here, of course, two days in a row
for stated meetings. Again, I wish everyone a nice
holiday weekend. I hope to see many of you in Albany
at BLAC weekend, and I want to just flag for folks
that our Preliminary Budget hearings on the Mayor's

1	CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 55
2	Preliminary Budget begin in the beginning of March.
3	That schedule is attached to today's agenda. It can
4	also be found on the Council's website. This meeting
5	is now adjourned. [gavel]
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date February 27, 2018