

## Testimony of Hillary Scrivani Senior Policy Council New York City Commission on Human Rights Before the Committee on Women and Gender Equity and the Committee on Governmental Operations, State & Federal Legislation May 2, 2024

## **Introduction**

Good afternoon Chair Louis, Chair Restler, and committee members. I am Hillary Scrivani, Senior Policy Counsel at the New York City Commission on Human Rights. Joining me today for questions is Michael Griffin, Policy Counsel. Thank you for convening today's hearing on the critical issue of sexual harassment. The Commission has been a leader in the fight against sexual harassment for decades. Our agency enforces the New York City Human Rights Law – one of the broadest anti-discrimination laws in the country. The New York City Human Rights has robust protections, and the Commission vigorously enforces the Law's gender-based harassment provisions. I will share a brief overview of the work of the Commission, the Human Rights Law's strong gender-based harassment protections, and our persistent efforts to prevent and address sexual harassment.

## The Commission on Human Rights

To fulfill the Commission's dual mandate of enforcement and education, the Commission's two largest units are the Community Relations and Law Enforcement bureaus. The Community Relations Bureau sits at the center of our prevention efforts, and is responsible for outreach, education, and training. This work is done through a wide array of partnerships with community groups, sibling agencies, and individual stakeholders. The Community Relations Bureau's outreach and education efforts are complemented by our communications campaigns and public facing resources, which distill the provisions of the Human Rights Law.

The Law Enforcement Bureau conducts testing, launches investigations, initiates complaints, enters settlements, and takes cases to trial to address violations of the Human Rights Law. Individuals in New York City who believe they have experienced discrimination or harassment and want to seek redress have two paths to vindicate their rights. The Human Rights Law specifies that individuals have the option to come to the Commission, or they can file a complaint in court.<sup>1</sup> When a report is made to the Commission, those claims are assessed by staff in the Law Enforcement Bureau.

Cases that are investigated by the Law Enforcement Bureau are often resolved by settlement agreements between the Commission and a covered entity. Matters that are not settled or mediated may be referred to trial at the Office of Administrative Trials and Hearings. New Yorkers who choose to file a complaint at the Commission may be entitled to emotional distress damages and compensatory damages. Settlements and final decisions after a trial can also require employers, housing providers, and businesses to undertake policy changes, agree to trainings, and take other steps that aim to prevent future discrimination and harassment. Covered entities may also have to pay civil penalties of up to \$250, 000 where the commission finds that an unlawful discriminatory practice was the result of the respondent's willful, wanton or malicious act.<sup>2</sup>

The Commission's settlements and Decisions and Orders demonstrate how the agency seeks to eliminate gender-based harassment and remedy the resulting harms. Before turning to those I will briefly discuss the Human Rights Law and several provisions that resulted from the 2018 Stop Sexual Harassment in NYC Act.

## The Human Rights Law and Gender-Based Harassment

The New York City Human Rights Law prohibits gender-based harassment in the areas of employment, housing, and places of public accommodation. The legal term gender-based harassment includes sexual harassment under the Human Rights Law. The Human Rights Law's provisions, including the prohibitions against gender-based harassment are designed to be interpreted expansively.<sup>3</sup>

## **CCHR's Focus on Combatting and Preventing Sexual Harassment**

The Commission has long been committed to combatting sexual harassment through education and robust enforcement. Implementation of the Stop Sexual Harassment in NYC Act reinforced and amplified these efforts, by making six amendments to the Human Rights Law. The Commission works diligently so that New Yorkers understand their rights and can vindicate them through implementation of these amendments. I will now turn to some of these efforts.

The Stop Sexual Harassment in NYC Act included several amendments to the Human Rights Law's anti-discrimination and harassment provisions by placing an emphasis on the pervasive challenge of gender-based harassment in the workplace. Local Law 99 added language underscoring that gender-based harassment threatens the terms, conditions, and privileges of employment. Local Law 98 extended the Human Rights Law's protections against gender-based harassment to all employees, regardless of the size of the employer, and Local Law 100 extended the statute of limitations for filing claims of gender-based harassment with the Commission from one year to three years. Each of these remain in effect.

The Stop Sexual Harassment in NYC Act was not only about changes to the law; it was also about raising awareness of individual rights and obligations. Several of the bills focused on ensuring that information about New Yorkers' rights and obligations is easily accessible, and that work is central to the Commission's mandate. Pursuant to Local Law 94, the Commission has built out an extensive website that has a multitude of free resources that explain that sexual harassment is a violation of the Human Rights Law, provide concrete examples of what behaviors constitute illegal harassment, and explain that retaliation against individuals that report discrimination or that cooperate in an investigation into such allegations is illegal. These resources highlight how to redress sexual harassment as well, providing information about bystander intervention, and steps to take if facing sexual harassment. Consistent with Local Law 95, the Commission created a downloadable poster and a fact sheet regarding workplace sexual harassment. These resources include specific examples, and information on the venues where individuals can file claims - at the federal, state and local levels. Employers are required to post the poster and disseminate the fact sheet in English and Spanish. The companion fact sheet is available in ten languages to ensure that employees know their rights regardless of the language they speak. These written resources are complemented by a free, interactive training, as required by Local Law 96. This Law requires most employers to provide their employees with this training or a training with similar components annually.

Our training is available on our website in eleven languages and satisfies New York State's sexual harassment prevention training requirements.<sup>4</sup> Thus far in Fiscal Year 2024, the training has already been downloaded or viewed over 1 million times.

The Commission's staunch efforts to eradicate sexual harassment have long included public engagement. Reflecting this, the agency launched an extensive City-wide campaign on workplace sexual harassment in print and on social media in April 2018. This included how to report to the Commission and messaged that any and all sexual harassment is against the law – there is no level that is tolerated in New York. The campaign had ads in bus shelters, and across community, ethnic, digital, and social media. The Commission worked with community-based organizations, lawyers, employee advocates and business associations, to expand the visibility and reach of the campaign.

The focus on sexual harassment prevention is not just part of written resources and our online training. Many of the Commission's live, facilitated trainings contain discussion of sexual harassment protections. This includes our fundamental Human Rights Law 101 training, our Human Rights Law in employment training, and our training on domestic workers' protections. These trainings are available to the public and all cover the Human Rights Law's anti-sexual harassment protections. In Fiscal Year 2023, our Community Relations Bureau conducted 313 trainings that include the Human Rights Law's anti-sexual harassment protections, and so far in Fiscal Year 2024, we have conducted 257.

CCHR also intentionally conducts direct outreach to small businesses, to make sure information on employee rights is available and accessible to all workplaces. For example, the Commission conducts business corridor outreach, and the Commission has made presentations to the Chamber of Commerce, Business Improvement Districts, and small business taskforces across the five boroughs.

#### Human Rights Law Enforcement

In addition to the specific efforts to implement the Stop Sexual Harassment in NYC Act, the Commission has reached strong settlements and issued a recent Decision and Order holding employers accountable for sexual harassment.

After receiving a complaint, the Law Enforcement Bureau's investigation into a multinational fashion company uncovered persistent sexual harassment, retaliation, and failure of the company to take any action when they were made aware of employee allegations. The settlement included \$330,000 in damages as well as penalties, revised policies that include clear definitions of sexual harassment, gender-based discrimination, and retaliation; and describe the internal complaint procedure. This settlement will be monitored by the Commission.

Another notable settlement resulted from a commission-initiated investigation of a large news network where reports alleged a culture of pervasive sexual harassment and retaliation. The network agreed to pay \$1,000,000 in civil penalties, and for a four-year period, waive forced arbitration in agreements executed with its employees, talent, and contributors for any claims brought under the New York City Human Rights Law. The agreement requires the network to

hold regular, Commission-approved sexual harassment prevention and bystander training for all its New York City employees, including executives, and to implement a new policy and complaint procedure for discrimination and harassment complaints that allows for multiples levels of reporting.

The Commission also resolved sexual harassment cases against a transportation company, a clothing manufacturer, and a real estate management company in this past year. In addition to payment of damages and fines, the businesses in each of these cases agreed to attend trainings and either create or update their policies.

Additionally, in a 2023 Decision and Order, the Commission held an employer liable for genderbased harassment in the form of continuous sexual harassment, as well as retaliation. After a trial, the complainant in that case was awarded \$275,000 in emotional distress damages, along with additional compensatory damages. The Commission also imposed a civil penalty of \$250,000 on the employer. The Commission further required the employer to undergo training on human rights and sexual harassment prevention, post notices of rights, and develop written policies consistent with the New York City Human Rights Law.

Those are just some examples of the Commission's enforcement.

## **Conclusion**

In closing, the Commission remains deeply committed to preventing and combating sexual harassment in New York City and ensuring that individuals who experience harassment know their rights and have venues for redress. We appreciate the Council's attention and commitment to addressing this issue, and we welcome your questions.

## Governmental Operations, State and Federal Legislation and Women and Gender Equity Committees Hearing: Update on Sexual Harassment Best Practices/Policies in New York City

## Introduction

Good afternoon, Chairs Louis and Restler and members of the committees on Women and Gender Equity and Governmental Operations, State and Federal Legislation. I am Silvia Montalban, Deputy Commissioner and Chief Citywide Equity and Inclusion Officer at the New York City Department of Citywide Administrative Services – commonly known as DCAS.

I am grateful for the opportunity to meet with you to discuss DCAS' citywide work to cultivate and sustain an equitable and diverse work environment that adheres to inclusive employment practices, including sexual harassment prevention.

The work of my entire office – Citywide Equity and Inclusion – has expanded and evolved for several years, including under this administration. We've concentrated our efforts on promoting inclusivity, driving recruitment and retention, boosting engagement, and improving the City's equal employment opportunity (EEO) and diversity, equity, and inclusion (DEI) training portfolios, including sexual harassment prevention. At our core, we are deeply invested in improving the quality of work experiences for all city employees by fostering a safe and inclusive environment where <u>all</u> employees are granted the protections they are due. More than that, our commitment to equity and access are integral parts of fulfilling our agency's mission – making city government work for all New Yorkers.

While we work closely with all city agencies, it is important to note that we do not have the authority of an enforcement agency, but we provide the structure and the tools to help agency heads comply with their New York City Charter mandate. This mandate dictates that agencies do not discriminate against covered persons as prohibited by federal, state, and local laws. DCAS has led the charge in our municipal workforce to consistently raise awareness about rights, responsibilities and resources to prevent all forms of discrimination, including sexual harassment, and to promote workplace civility, respect and belonging for all. In doing so, we do not merely design initiatives to operationalize legislation or compile reports to meet mandates, we meet and exceed requirements in the relevant local laws by considering citywide priorities and the needs of the workforce.

In accordance with the Stop Sexual Harassment in NYC Act, including Local Laws 92 and 97 of 2018, we issue reports annually that provide insights into how the mandated sexual harassment training is being conducted and provide a comprehensive accounting of sexual harassment complaints within city agencies. And, since 2019,

we've seen a promising trend overall in sexual harassment complaints as they decrease citywide. In fact, in FY 23, we saw the number of complaints decrease by 10%. DCAS has also been complying with Local Law 101 of 2018 by distributing a voluntary climate survey to all City agencies to ascertain the general awareness of the City's EEO policy, including sexual harassment prevention, knowledge of prohibited conduct and the ability to report it. DCAS has issued the Citywide Workplace Climate Survey twice since 2018 and we will do so again this summer. We will compile a corresponding report to share the findings.

In addition to sexual harassment prevention training, we actively promote agencies' completion of mandatory trainings that encourage inclusivity like *The Power of Inclusion*, which is especially designed to address matters related to LGBTQI+ identity in the workplace and Everybody Matters: EEO and Diversity & Inclusion Training for NYC Employees, which provides an overview of rights, responsibilities and protections against discrimination under the EEO Policy and the 25 protected categories under the New York City Human Rights Law. This training also focuses on principles of diversity and inclusion, the responsibility of managers and supervisors to report discrimination and harassment, including sexual harassment, bystander intervention and protection from retaliation for filing a complaint or participating in an investigation of harassment or discrimination. We also offer additional trainings such as bystander intervention, unconscious bias, microaggressions, and disability etiquette.

Pursuant to Section 814.1 of the City Charter, we provide uniformed procedures and standards to agencies so they can effectively meet the needs of the municipal workforce. For instance, we work closely with the Law Department to host information sessions for City leaders to discuss their obligations under the City Charter and the City's EEO policy.

We also:

- Provide guidance and compliance tools to bolster transparency about the discrimination complaint process including creating documents such as the *EEO Complaint Process at a Glance* and *Reasonable Accommodations at a Glance*.
- Host bi-monthly best practices meetings with agency EEO professionals to reinforce consistency in the application of the EEO policy, discuss industry developments, new legislation, complaint trends, investigation and reasonable accommodation principles and agencies' mandated training completion status.
- Develop trainings for the EEO practitioner to hone their skills, including on intersectionality in EEO investigations, and an upcoming trauma-informed investigations.
- Make periodic updates to the EEO Policy, relevant guidelines and accompanying trainings.
- Provide ongoing citywide guidance on accessibility matters and equity issues through consultations with agencies, and we review and approve the annual diversity and EEO plans submitted by agency heads covering the agency's goals

and strategies to advance diversity, equity, and inclusion in the areas of workforce, workplace, community, and race relations.

 Produce and host a bi-annual weeklong HR/EEO Conference – providing innovative resources to HR and EEO professionals on equitable and inclusive workplace practices. It is one of the first municipal conferences of its kind in the nation.

Together, all these innovative initiatives help inform our approach to building and maintaining an equitable and inclusive workforce. We know that at the heart of city government are the people. We want all employees to know that as an employer, the City of New York is committed to fostering a work environment where employees can thrive while feeling protected, valued, and respected. With that, we welcome continued engagement and support from the Council to further our goals and to help ensure that the City of New York reflects the values that make us an employer of choice.

Thank you, and at this time, I welcome any questions you may have.



## Girls for Gender Equity Testimony to the New York City Council Committee on Women and Gender Equity - Update on Sexual Harassment Best Practices/Policies in New York City

## Delivered by: Eman Gad May 2, 2024

Good afternoon Chair Louis, Chair Restler, and Members of the Committee on Women and Gender Equity and the Committee on Governmental Operations, State and Federal Legislation. My name is Eman Gad, and I am the Policy Coordinator at Girls for Gender Equity (GGE).

GGE is a Brooklyn-based organization, which works intergenerationally, through a Black feminist lens, to center the leadership of Black girls and gender-expansive young people of color in reshaping culture and policy to achieve gender and racial justice. GGE challenges structural forces, including racism, sexism, gender-based violence, transphobia, homophobia, and economic inequity, which constrict the freedom, full expression, and rights of transgender and cisgender girls and young women of color, and gender non-conforming youth of color. We do this work through direct service, advocacy, and narrative shift. GGE has been a leader in the conversation around gender-based violence, including sexual harassment and sexual abuse for close to two decades. We are offering testimony today because education is empowerment. **That is why we urge City Council to co-sponsor and pass Resolution 0094-2024 in support of New York State Assembly Bill 4604, also known as the Comprehensive Sex Ed bill, which calls for the implementation of comprehensive sexual education in all New York City schools as a tenet in the prevention of sexual harassment.** 

As written, the Comprehensive Sex Ed bill would amend NYS Education Law to require comprehensive sexuality instruction for students in grades K-12 that is age appropriate, medically accurate, and inclusive of all students. For earlier grades, this curriculum would look like lessons about friendship and communication, which would provide students with the building blocks they need to address issues of consent and personal safety. As students develop, the curriculum would evolve with them to educate on topics, such as intimate partner relationships, intimate partner violence and sexual and reproductive health. At all ages, comprehensive sexuality



education would seek to dispel stigmas around sexuality and facilitate the development of skills to communicate effectively and make informed decisions, which ultimately aid in combating discrimination, bullying, and harassment.

It is common knowledge that the sexual harassment of minors is prevalent because of young people's lack of knowledge of what sexual harassment is and what it looks like. While we can list countless high profile cases of sexual abuse of young people, such as those of R. Kelly and Jeffrey Epstein, many cases of sexual harassment of minors go undetected for years and many never come forward. Just three days ago, a group of 154 people filed lawsuits against New York City over sexual abuse they experienced under the juvenile detention system as minors as far back as 1970.<sup>1</sup> One of the survivors in this case stated, "I was naive and impressionable and was taken advantage of," a sentiment that emphasizes why sex ed is imperative in preventing sexual harassment for young folks. In response to the case, Council Member Althea Stevens said that the system needs safeguards that could prevent "a culture of secrecy,"<sup>2</sup> to which we remind her and the rest of City Council that eradicating the overall silence around sexual harassment means tackling the culture of taboo and secrecy of sex ed.

Comprehensive sex ed is policy that accounts for young people in the fight against sexual harassment and addresses the issue at the root. By teaching students about healthy relationships, consent, and personal boundaries early on, young people can learn to identify what sexual harassment looks like and be empowered to speak on it to stop it in its tracks. This is especially crucial for young people on the margins, such as Black girls and trans or gender non-conforming folks who are not usually empowered to speak about their experiences. However, investing in the sexual education of our young people will ensure that sexual harassment does not continue to look the same in NYC and beyond.

Given the insurmountable evidence demonstrating the benefits of teaching comprehensive sex ed in schools, **we call upon the members of today's committees to co-sponsor and urge their fellow colleagues to sign on to Resolution 0094-2024** in support of Bill A.4604, the Comprehensive Sex Ed bill, at the state level.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Parrot, M. (2024, April 30). NYC sees 154 new lawsuits alleging sexual abuse in city juvenile detention centers. amNY. https://www.amny.com/news/sexual-abuse-lawsuits-nyc/

# RIGHT TO BE

## Testimony: Update on Sexual Harassment Best Practices/Policies in New York City

## Thursday May 2, 2024

Good afternoon, my name is Gabriela Mejia, I'm the Movement Building and Communications Manager at Right To Be. Emily May, Right To Be's President and Co-Founder, and member of the Street Harassment Advisory Board, sends her regrets for not attending today. I want to thank you for the opportunity to provide testimony.

Founded in Brooklyn in 2005 - Right To Be works address all forms of harassment including public space harassment, online harassment, and workplace harassment.<sup>1</sup> We also work to address harassment against all protected classes, including race, religion, gender, and ability.

Our work focuses on turning the care we have for each other into simple, creative, effective action. Every day, we train hundreds of people to respond to, intervene in and heal from harassment. We hold space for people experiencing harassment to share their stories for affirmation and support. And we prepare new leaders to create workplaces, schools and communities around our city and around the world that are filled with humanity.

In 2018, we worked with legislators to pass the "Stop Sexual Harassment in NYC Act" and advised the council to include in the mandated training for employees "information concerning bystander intervention, including but not limited to any resources that explain how to engage in bystander intervention." Since then, through partnerships with the NYC Commission on Gender Equity we've trained over 50,000 New Yorkers in bystander intervention strategies. With our partners around the world, we've trained over 2 million people worldwide in the same strategies.

Today we would like to offer the following recommendation to improve NYC's Mandated Sexual Harassment Training:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> For information on our programs visit <u>https://www.righttobe.org</u>

For information on our Hate and Hope Trackers, our program which provides support to people experiencing online harassment, visit <u>https://righttobe.org/</u>stories.

- **Issue training length requirements.** The length of the training directly contributes to the quality of learning and information retention in adult learning. We suggest requiring the training is one hour for all employees and two hours for supervisors, consistent with the sexual harassment training that is mandated in California.
- Expanding harassment training to address all protected classes. Sexual harassment is only one form of harassment people can experience at work, and yet it is the only form of harassment that employees experience training on. We recommended the training be expanded to include information on all protected classes. The Equal Employment Opportunity Commission, or EEOC guidelines, or "Enforcement Guidance on Harassment in the Workplace" were recently expanded to include enforcement guidance for intersectional harassment based on multiple protected characteristics.
- Expanding the training to address harassment on work commutes and online. We recommend the policies extend to address the complete experience of employees including harassment online and on their commute. The EEOC guidelines were recently expanded to include online harassment in the workplace and remote work.

As an addendum, we will be including additional research on the online and public space harassment workers face.

Thank you for the opportunity to testify today, and for your commitment to making New York City a great place to work for all New Yorkers.

## ADDENDUM:

#### Street Harassment: Trauma in Online Work Spaces and on the Workplace Commute

Public space harassment is an essential consideration for workplace sexual harassment. First, most of us commute through public space, and what happens in public space can impact the workplace. Second, while someone is at work, they may still be accessing public space whether it is physical public space or online public space. Third, separate traumas may compound each other - for example, a separate public space harassment and an additional workplace sexual harassment can together create trauma for workers. And ultimately, harassment in public space and private space share similarities, including frequency among marginalized communities, abuse of power dynamics, and harmful effects. It can sound the same, and feel the same too. As the New York City government

+1 347 889 5510

considers policies that address workplace sexual harassment, it should carefully consider public space harassment.

In 2012, Right To Be and Cornell partnered for a study of street harassment experiences of workers.<sup>2</sup> Reported emotional responses included anger, fear, and helplessness - lasting PTSD is an additional effect.<sup>3</sup> Street harassment caused employees to arrive at their job feeling anxious and distracted.<sup>4</sup> This can lead to situations where an employee's overall well-being is affected, potentially impacting punctuality, attendance, productivity, health care costs, morale and sense of safety.<sup>5</sup>

Some street harassment may be within the employer's control, and may therefore also be considered workplace sexual harassment. Additionally, all street harassment can impact any subsequent workplace sexual harassment, by affecting employee response or willingness to report a compound trauma of workplace harassment. Policies should consider that when someone experiences workplace sexual harassment, they may simultaneously be processing trauma from street harassment.

We recommend that the expansion of training to address sexual harassment, to include discussions on work commutes and online.

<sup>&</sup>lt;u>https://www.issuelab.org/resource/when-street-harassment-comes-indoors-a-sample-of-new-york-city-service-agency-and-union-responses-to-street-harassment.html</u>; and summary page available at <a href="https://righttobe.info/wp-content/uploads/2022/02/fact-sheet-when-street-harassment-comes-indoors-fact-sheet.docx.pdf">https://righttobe.info/wp-content/uploads/2022/02/fact-sheet-when-street-harassment-comes-indoors-a-sample-of-new-york-city-service-agency-and-union-responses-to-street-harassment.html</a>; and summary page available at <a href="https://righttobe.info/wp-content/uploads/2022/02/fact-sheet-when-street-harassment-comes-indoors-fact-sheet.docx.pdf">https://righttobe.info/wp-content/uploads/2022/02/fact-sheet-when-street-harassment-comes-indoors-fact-sheet.docx.pdf</a>.





<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> See The Worker Institute at Cornell. (2012) *The Experience of Being Targets of Street Harassment in NYC: Preliminary Findings from a Qualitative Study of a Sample of 223 Voices who Hollaback!* New York, NY: Wagner, K.C., Livingston, B., Diaz, S.T. Cornell ILR School and Right To Be, report available at <a href="https://righttobe.info/wp-content/uploads/2022/02/fact-sheet-the-experience-of-being-targets-of-street-harassment-in-nyc-fact-sheet.docx.pdf">https://righttobe.info/wp-content/uploads/2022/02/fact-sheet-the-experience-of-being-targets-of-street-harassment-in-nyc-fact-sheet.docx.pdf</a>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> See The Experience of Being Targets report, at page 3, full citation at footnote 3 herein. "any type of harassment (i.e. verbal, groping, assault) could produce extreme feelings of fear, anger, shame, etc. This indicates that it may be the violation of being harassed, rather than the specific behavior, that is one of the main drivers of a target's emotional response. Thus an "outsider" might deem the situation "minor" or "not a threat" but the reaction of the target is likely to be just as severe because of the experience of vulnerability and the latent threat of escalation." Id. at page 4.

See also, Right To Be (2013) *An Employer, Union & Service Provider's Guide to Ending Street Harassment* at pages 10-11 and footnotes 10-12, available at

https://righttobe.info/wp-content/uploads/2022/02/fact-sheet-when-street-harassment-comes-indoors-fact-sheet.docx.pdf .

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> For research on street harassment, see our reports available at <u>https://righttobe.org/research/</u>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> See An Employer, Union & Service Provider's Guide to Ending Street Harassment at page 11.

In a separate study of service agencies and unions, more than 86 percent of respondents had received a report of street harassment in the past two years from a client, while 96 percent reported that they or a colleague had been street harassed. See The Worker Institute at Cornell. (2012). *When Street Harassment Comes Indoors: A Sample of New York City Service Agency and Union Responses to Street Harassment*. New York, NY: Livingston, B., Wagner, K.C., Diaz, S.T. Cornell ILR School and Right To Be, report available at

## Online Harassment

For many, work online is professionally required. Online spaces are public spaces that present unique security and safety challenges for workers experiencing online harassment, as the harassment can feel invasive and leverage personal information. Online harassment can include behaviors like rape/death threats, doxxing, and defamation, and causes emotional trauma. Online harassment also disproportionately targets women, people of color, and LGBTQ+ individuals. The majority of targets are women, and the bombardment discourages women from "writing and earning a living online."<sup>6</sup> Online harassment often "stakes out the internet as a male space in the same way that sexual harassment does in the workplace[,] and excludes women from professional activities online."<sup>7</sup> Women writers, especially women of color, are giving up writing online a result.<sup>8</sup> A poll of TIME writers found that 80% avoided topics because they feared the online response, and that "half the women on staff considered quitting journalism because of hatred they've faced online, although none of the men had."<sup>9</sup> Many civil society organizations are ill-prepared to respond to the harassment of their staff, leading to unsafe working conditions and a lack of dialogue on digital safety and literacy. Research shows that the systems and policies of organizations and online platforms can have a major impact - "labeling content as harassment is critical for surfacing community norms around appropriate user behavior."<sup>10</sup>

Right To Be worked in depth with Buzzfeed to address this issue, and developed a set of open-source resources for civil society organizations to better protect their staff from online harassment in collaboration with the Mozilla Foundation and Kairos Fellowship.<sup>11</sup> This includes staff safety plans in the event of harassment and/or digital security threats, a

https://www.washingtonpost.com/opinions/online-feminists-increasingly-ask-are-the-psychic-costs-too-mu ch-to-bear/2015/02/19/3dc4ca6c-b7dd-11e4-a200-c008a01a6692\_story.html?utm\_term=.ddde931dba3d. <sup>9</sup> Joel Stein, *How Trolls are Ruining the Internet*, TIME Magazine, Aug. 18, 2016, available at

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Danielle Keats Citron, *Law's Expressive Value in Combatting Cyber Gender Harassment*, 108 Michigan Law Review 373 (2009) at 375, 379, available at

https://repository.law.umich.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?referer=https://www.google.com/&httpsredir=1&articl e=1300&context=mlr. The online harassment also "brands them as incompetent workers [as well as] rais[ing] their vulnerability to offline sexual violence." Id. at 375.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Law's Expressive Value at 391.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Michelle Goldberg, *Feminist Writers are so Besieged by Online Abuse that Some have Begun to Retire*, The Washington Post, Feb. 20, 2015, available at

<sup>&</sup>lt;u>http://time.com/4457110/internet-trolls/</u>. Additionally, 80% "consider online harassment a regular part of their jobs." Id.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> See Blackwell, L., Dimond, J., Shoenebeck, S., & Lampe, C., *Classification and Its Consequences for Online Harassment: Design Insights from HeartMob*, Journal of Proceedings of the ACM on Human-Computer Interaction, 2017 Nov.(Vol: 1)(Article 24), available at <a href="https://dl.acm.org/citation.cfm?id=3134659">https://dl.acm.org/citation.cfm?id=3134659</a>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> See Right To Be's *Prepare Your Organization Against Online Harassment* available at <u>https://righttobe.org/guides/fortify-your-organization-against-online-harassment/</u>. These materials were created in partnership with the Kairos Fellowship and Mozilla.

digital safety how-to guide, how to be an effective ally and bystander online, and leadership support infrastructures guidelines for staff facing online harassment.<sup>12</sup>

We recommend that discussion of the impacts of online harassment be included in any mandatory anti-harassment training.





	and the second	1
	THE COUNCIL	
	THE CITY OF NEW YORK	
	Appearance Card	
	I intend to appear and speak on Int. No Res. No	
	🗌 in favor 🔲 in opposition	
	(PLEASE PRINT)	
	Name: Saloni Sethi, compissioner	
	Address:	
	I represent: ENDGBV	
	Address:	
	THE COUNCIL	
	THE CITY OF NEW YORK	
а		
	Appearance Card	
	I intend to appear and speak on Int. No Res. No	
	in favor Date:	
	(PLEASE PRINT)	
	Name: Fric Eichenholtz, managing Attorney	
	Address:	
	I represent: Law Department	
	Address:	
	THE COUNCIL	
	THE CITY OF NEW YORK	
	Appearance Card	
	I intend to appear and speak on Int. No Res. No	
	in favor in opposition	
	Date: 5 2 24 (PLEASE PRINT)	
	Name: SILVIA MONTALBAN	
	Address: CHUEF CITYWIDE EQUITY + INCLUSION DFC.	
	I represent: DCAS, DEPUTY COMMISSIONER	
	Address: I CENTRE ST.	
	Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms	

THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK
Appearance Card
I intend to appear and speak on Int. No Res. No in favor in opposition
Date:
(PLEASE PRINT)
Name: Hillary Scrivani, senior Policy counsel
Address:
I represent: <u>CCHR</u>
Address:
THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK
Appearance Card
I intend to appear and speak on Int. No Res. No in favor in opposition
Date:
(PLEASE PRINT)
Name: Michael & Griffia, Policy coursel
Address:
I represent: <u>CCHR</u>
Address :
THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK
Appearance Card
I intend to appear and speak on Int. No Res. No
in favor in opposition
Date: 5/2/24
(PLEASE PRINT) Name: MELISSA O'NEILL
Address: DIRECTOR, INVESTIGATIONS AND
COMPLIANCE PCAS, GITYWIDE EQUITY +
Address: INCLUSION I CENTRE ST.
Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms

THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK
THE CITI OF NEW TURK
Appearance Card
LAMP 7 (BM
I intend to appear and speak on Int. No Res. No. 0094-202
in favor in opposition
Date:
(PLEASE PRINT)
Name: EMan Gad
Address:
I represent: CINS For Gender Equity
Address: 25 Charper St, 10th FL, Brook Lin, NY
1 Dempediate
Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms
THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK
THE CITY OF NEW YORK
THE CITY OF NEW YORK         Appearance Card
THE CITY OF NEW YORK
THE CITY OF NEW YORK         Appearance Card
I intend to appear and speak on Int. No.       Res. No.         I in favor       in opposition
I intend to appear and speak on Int. No.       Res. No.         I in favor       in opposition
THE CITY OF NEW YORK         Appearance Card
THE CITY OF NEW YORK         Appearance Card
Intend to appear and speak on Int. No.       Res. No.         In favor       in opposition         Image:       Image:         Image:       Image:
THE CITY OF NEW YORK         Appearance Card
Intend to appear and speak on Int. No.       Res. No.         In favor       in opposition         Image:       Image:         Image:       Image: