

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS AND

DISPOSITIONS 1

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC
SITINGS AND DISPOSITIONS

----- X

February 14, 2024
Start: 11:07 a.m.
Recess: 12:28 p.m.

HELD AT: 250 BROADWAY - COMMITTEE ROOM, 16TH
FLOOR

B E F O R E: Kamillah Hanks, Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Justin L. Brannan
Amanda Farías
Oswald Feliz
Christopher Marte
Sandy Nurse
Yusef Salaam

A P P E A R A N C E S

Kate Lemos McHale, Director of Research at
Landmarks Preservation Committee

Steven Thomson, Director of Community and
Intergovernmental Affairs at Landmarks
Preservation Committee

Kate Lemos McHale, Director of Research at the
Department of Housing Preservation and
Development

Jorge Chang, architect with Urban Architectural
Initiatives

Michelle Ponce, Development Project Manager at
Mega Contracting Group

Alex Rawding, Director of New Construction
Finance at the Department of Housing Preservation
and Development

Dan Kent, CEO of Lantern Organization

Zach O'Farrill, community liaison with Belongo

Cynthia Stuart, Chief Operating Officer of the
Supportive Housing Network of New York

Julius Tajiddin, East Harlem resident

David Gillcrist, resident of Community Board 11

Alfredo Colon, former student of Afro Latin Jazz
Alliance

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Shams DaBaron, housing hero

Aurora Flores, producer of 100 years of Latin music in New York over YouTube

Brian Dickerson, clinical social worker

George Janes, Consulting Planner to Community Board 11

Doreen Burton

Lisa Jackson Foyle, co-owner of FTE Builders

Maulin Mehta, New York Director at Regional Plan Association

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS AND
DISPOSITIONS

4

2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: This is a microphone
3 check for the Subcommittee on Landmarks located in
4 the 16th Floor recorded by Patrick Kurzyna on
5 February the 14th.

6 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Good morning and
7 welcome to the New York City hybrid hearing on the
8 Subcommittee on Landmarks, Public Sitings, and
9 Dispositions.

10 Please silence all electronic devices.

11 Chair, we're ready to begin.

12 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: [GAVEL] Wow, good
13 morning. How are you? I am Council Member Kamillah
14 Hanks. I'm the Chair on the Subcommittee of
15 Landmarks, Public Sightings and Dispositions, and I
16 would like to welcome everyone on this fabulous
17 Valentine's Day, nothing says love like landmarks, on
18 this first meeting of the Subcommittee of this new
19 session.

20 Before we begin today's agenda, I will
21 remind everyone that this meeting is being held in a
22 hybrid format. For members of the public who wish to
23 testify remotely, we ask that you first register
24 online and you may do so by visiting
25 www.council.nyc.gov/landuse to sign up.

1
2 If you have already registered but not
3 have yet signed into Zoom, please do so now and
4 remain signed in until you have testified.

5 For anyone here today that's testifying
6 in person wishing to testify, if you have not already
7 done so, please see one of the Sergeants to fill out
8 a speaker's card, and we will call your name at the
9 appropriate time.

10 For anyone wishing to submit a written
11 testimony on the items being heard today, we ask that
12 you please send it via email to
13 landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov, and please indicate
14 the Land Use number and/or project name in the
15 subject line of your email.

16 On today's agenda, we will have four
17 public hearings for housing proposal in Council
18 Member Salaam's District in Manhattan as well as
19 three LPC designations in Districts represented by
20 Council Members Salamanca, Cabán, and Powers.

21 With that, we will hear three
22 preconsidered individual landmark designations
23 related to the Joseph Rodman Drake Park and Enslaved
24 Peoples Burial Ground in Chair Salamanca's District
25 in the Bronx, the Barkin, Levin, and Company Office,

2 Pavilion in Council Member Caban's District in
3 Queens, and the, I don't even know how to say this,
4 the Modulightor Building in Council Member Power's
5 District in Manhattan.

6 I now open these public hearings and
7 invite representatives to the Landmarks Preservation
8 Commission to make these three presentations, which
9 we will hear in succession in a combined joint
10 hearing for all three sites.

11 Appearing today at LPC are Director of
12 Research Kate Lemos McHale and Steven Thomson,
13 Director of Community and Intergovernmental Affairs.

14 I remind anyone wishing to testify
15 remotely, if you have not already done so, you must
16 register online, and you may do so now by visiting
17 the Council's website.

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Panelists, would you
19 please raise your right hand and state your name for
20 the record.

21 DIRECTOR LEMOS MCHALE: Kate Lemos McHale.

22 DIRECTOR THOMSON: Steven Thomson.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Do you affirm to tell
24 the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth
25

1
2 in your testimony before the Subcommittee and in
3 answer to all the Council Member questions?

4 DIRECTOR LEMOS MCHALE: I do.

5 DIRECTOR THOMSON: I do.

6 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you. Applicant
7 panelists, please begin and please let us know when
8 you are ready to share your presentation and our
9 Staff will display it on the screen.

10 DIRECTOR LEMOS MCHALE: Thank you and I'm
11 ready whenever you are for the presentation. Thank
12 you. Good morning, Chair Hanks, and welcome and
13 Subcommittee members. I'm Kate Lemos McHale, Director
14 of Research at LPC. I'm joined by Steven Thomson, our
15 Director of Community and Intergovernmental Affairs.

16 The first designation, we could go to the
17 next slide, please, is the designation of Joseph
18 Rodman Drake Park and Enslaved People's Burial
19 Grounds, which is a park in Hunts Point owned and
20 maintained by the New York City Parks Department. Its
21 designation as a landmark recognizes the history of
22 enslaved African and indigenous people in the Bronx
23 and New York City and memorializes the enslaved
24 people buried here. At LPC's public hearing on
25 November 14th, six people spoke in favor of

1 designation, including representatives of the Bronx
2 Borough President's Office, the New York City
3 Department of Parks and Recreation Hunts Point Slave
4 Burying Ground Project, Historic Districts Council,
5 New York Landmarks Conservancy, and Loving the Bronx.
6 The Commission also received 71 written submissions
7 in favor of designation, including 38 written by
8 students at nearby PS48 who have been actively
9 involved in researching the history here, and there
10 was no opposition to designation. Next slide, please.

11
12 Thank you. Drake Park is shown here,
13 bounded by Oak Point, Longfellow, and Hunts Point
14 Avenues, and Drake Park South. It was identified for
15 designation following a comprehensive survey of the
16 Bronx as well as part of our ongoing citywide survey
17 to identify sites of significant African American
18 history. The Hunt, Willett, Leggett Cemetery near the
19 Park Center contains burials associated with these
20 three families who established farms on Hunts Point
21 starting in the late 1600s. Just to its south is the
22 burial ground for the African and likely also the
23 indigenous people they enslaved. The designation
24 protects grave markers and other above ground
25 historic resources as well as burials and below

1
2 ground archaeological resources on the site. Next,
3 please.

4 Prior to European contact, Hunts Point
5 was the home of the Munsee speaking Siwanoy people.
6 Its geography was drastically different then,
7 consisting of two small peninsulas, Long Neck and
8 Planting Neck, surrounded by a small bay that has
9 been filled in. By the late 1600s, Thomas Hunt Jr.,
10 for whom Hunts Point is named, and Gabriel Leggett
11 acquired Hunts Point. During the 1700s, these two
12 families were joined by members of the Willett
13 family, and by the 1720s, they established a family
14 cemetery just to the north of Hunts Point Road, and
15 it's likely that the enslaved people's burial ground
16 on the south side of this road was also established
17 at that time. Next, please.

18 Slavery began in New York in 1625, when
19 the Dutch West India Company brought 11 enslaved
20 people of African descent to the city. In the 1700s,
21 New York's enslaved African population was the
22 largest in the North. Like New York City, Westchester
23 County, which Hunt's Point was then a part of, was a
24 slavery stronghold. The Hunt, Willett, and Leggett
25 families were enslavers, and shown here are documents

1 associated with them. The will of the Revolutionary
2 War hero, Thomas Hunt, directs the sale of the black
3 people he enslaved. A list of African males in the
4 1755 census of slaves in Westchester includes the
5 first names of some he enslaved, Abram, Titus, Toby,
6 Lily, and Gin, and a 1744 notice announces a reward
7 offered for the return of an enslaved man of African
8 and indigenous descent to Gabriel Leggett. These
9 documents show starkly how enslaved people were
10 treated as property but often are the only records we
11 have of who they were. They also reveal the
12 likelihood that both African and indigenous people
13 were buried in the Hunts Point Cemetery. Next,
14 please.

15
16 Surrounded by an iron fence, the Hunt,
17 Willett, Leggett Cemetery is the dominant visual
18 feature of Drake Park. It contains about 25
19 brownstone and marble headstones dating from around
20 the 1720s. Also buried in this cemetery was poet
21 Joseph Rodman Drake and it is for him that the park
22 was named when it opened in 1910. Next, please.

23 About 25 feet south of the Hunt, Willett,
24 Legate Cemetery was the burial ground for the
25 enslaved people who labored for these families.

1 Today, a park pathway runs in the approximate
2 location of the old Hunts Point Road, which
3 historically separated the two cemeteries. No markers
4 remain to memorialize the enslaved people buried
5 here. The siting of the enslaved people burial ground
6 close to, but separate from, that of their enslavers
7 was typical at the time, but the survival of this
8 historical arrangement within a New York City park is
9 very rare and remarkable. Next, please.
10

11 This undated photograph documents the
12 grave markings that once existed in the slave
13 people's burial ground, and numerous written accounts
14 described their survival into the early 20th century.
15 What became of them is not known. Around 2013, a
16 Department of Education official found this historic
17 photograph in the collection of the Museum of City of
18 New York and inspired him to research the site, and
19 so Philip Panaritis and Justin Zarka, a teacher at
20 nearby PS54, founded the Hunts Point Slave Burying
21 Ground Project and engaged the school's elementary
22 age students in their research. A state-funded grant
23 led to an archaeological study that was completed and
24 ground penetrating radar documented about four
25 potential burials in the site. Next, please.

1
2 The name of the park was changed to
3 recognize the history of this enslaved people's
4 burial ground, and in 2021, the Park's Department
5 installed new signage for Joseph Rodman Drake Park
6 and Enslaved African Burial Ground. Drake Park now
7 memorializes enslaved people whose history in the
8 area and final resting place within the park long
9 went unrecognized. Today, the park is a site of
10 historical importance and remembrance as well as a
11 vital green space in an industrial section of the
12 Bronx. This designation as a landmark further
13 recognizes and protects this significant history, and
14 I urge the Council to vote to uphold it. Thank you.

15 We're going through so we could go to the
16 next, please, and next again. Thank you.

17 This next designation is the Barkin,
18 Levin, and Company Office Pavilion, a distinguished
19 example of mid-20th century modern architecture
20 designed by Ulrich Franzen. Of particular interest is
21 the pavilion's unusual structural system, nine
22 concrete pillars that support umbrella-like ceiling
23 vaults that project beyond glass walls. It was
24 identified in a citywide survey of modern
25 architecture. At the Commission's public hearing on

1
2 November 28th, four people spoke in support of
3 designation, including representatives of the owner,
4 Docomomo U.S./New York Tri State, the Historic
5 Districts Council, and the New York Landmarks
6 Conservancy, and we also received support from Queens
7 Modern. There was no opposition to designation. At
8 the time of designation, this was in Council Member
9 Won's District, and we briefed her Staff on this
10 designation. Next, please.

11 The Barkin, Levin Office Pavilion is in
12 Long Island City in Queens, and it is now in District
13 22, Tiffany Cabán. It's at the northwest corner of a
14 large tax lot that includes the former Barkin, Levin
15 factory building, a windowless structure to the
16 south. The landmark site includes just the office
17 pavilion and the lawns surrounding it. The property
18 owner supported designation and informed the
19 Commission of plans to develop the site to the south
20 using air rights from the Barkin Levin pavilion, and
21 their plans for the pavilion site include preserving
22 it and the open space around it. Next, please.

23 The architect, Ulrich Franzen, designed
24 the pavilion as part of a factory complex for Barkin,
25 Levin, and Company, a successful New York City

1 manufacturer of women's coats. A German émigré who
2 became a significant architect, known especially for
3 his work in the Brutalist style, this was one of
4 Franzen's earliest commissions. The new factory was
5 conceived as the "first major plant in the garment
6 industry to incorporate all stages of production" and
7 more than 2,000 people attended the opening in 1958.
8 Next, please.
9

10 The graceful, minimalist structure was
11 the factory's architectural highlight. With a square
12 footprint, the glazed walls and floating cantilevered
13 roof expressed a stylish, modern sensibility that
14 reflected the company's concern for fashion and the
15 welfare of its employees. It was presented as an
16 exemplary design of an office pavilion in a range of
17 publications shown here. Next, please.

18 In November 1958, the Queen's Chamber of
19 Commerce awarded the Barkin Levin Factory first prize
20 in the industrial class, and it was featured in the
21 New York Times. It subsequently was leased to the
22 Structural Display Company and their ad shows it
23 holding up an elephant, and the AIA Guide to New York
24 City has consistently noted its importance. Next,
25 please.

1
2 The building's current owner sensitively
3 refurbished the pavilion in 2009 and it retains much
4 of its original design and form and architectural
5 significance. This little-known architectural gem was
6 designated on December 19th, and we hope the Council
7 will uphold the designation. Thank you, and we could
8 go to the next two slides actually. Thank you.

9 Our third designation is the Modulightor
10 Building, an important work by the innovative
11 American architect, Paul Rudolph. It was designed in
12 1988 to 89 and constructed in two distinct phases,
13 with the lower floors mostly completed in 1993 so
14 this is the city's youngest landmark. It has crossed
15 its 30-year birthday. At the public hearing on
16 November 28th, six people spoke in support of
17 designation, including representatives of the owner,
18 the Paul Rudolph Institute for Modern Architecture
19 Docomomo U.S. and Docomemo U.S./New York Tri State,
20 Historic Districts Council, New York Landmarks
21 Conservancy, and NYC LGBT Historic Sites Project. No
22 one spoke in opposition, and in addition, the
23 Commission received 30 written submissions in support
24 of designation. Next, please.

1
2 The Modulightor Building is in Manhattan
3 at 246 East 58th Street, just west of 2nd Avenue.
4 Next, please.

5 Paul Rudolph was a leading figure in
6 American architecture during the latter half of the
7 20th century. At the Harvard Graduate School of
8 Design, he developed a modern sculptural aesthetic
9 using industrial materials like concrete and steel.
10 He moved his thriving practice to Manhattan at the
11 height of his career in the mid-1960s, when he also
12 headed the Yale School of Architecture and designed
13 many important buildings, some shown here, including
14 what's known as the Paul Rudolph Building at Yale and
15 his penthouse and apartments 23 Beekman Place, which
16 is a landmark. Next, please.

17 Rudolph purchased the property in
18 February 1989, and he and Ernst Wagner co-founded the
19 Modulightor Lighting Company in 1976 and developed a
20 plan to rebuild the structure as a sales showroom
21 with apartments above. As you can see here, it
22 replaced an 1860s row house that had been
23 substantially remodeled at that time in the '60s. In
24 1990, Rudolph and Wagner moved their offices into the
25 unfinished building. The Department of Buildings

1 issued a Certificate of Occupancy in 1993. Next,
2 please.

3
4 The building has a remarkably lively and
5 intricate street facade with steel I-beams forming
6 jigsaw like overlaps. Rudolph died in 1997, and the
7 building was expanded vertically by architect Mark
8 Squeo who worked in Rudolph's office in the '90s and
9 drew inspiration from Rudolph's drawings in the
10 collection of the Library of Congress. This phase
11 added two floors and a roof deck. The Modulightor
12 Building contains a ground floor commercial space as
13 well as a duplex apartment and exhibition space. It's
14 owned and occupied by the Paul Rudolph Institute for
15 Modern Architecture. This was designated on December
16 19th, and we urge the Council to uphold the
17 designation. Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you very much.

19 I would like to recognize my Colleagues who have
20 joined us, Council Member Brannan and Council Member
21 Marte.

22 I would like to also recognize if my
23 Colleagues have any questions or remarks on this.

24 Having none, thank you. This appellant
25 panel is now excused.

1
2 Counsel, are there any members of the
3 public who wish to testify on these items?

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: If anyone in-person
5 who gave a speaker card is wishing to speak about
6 these, please let me know.

7 I'd also just like to take this time to
8 state that if anybody would like a copy of today's
9 testimony, they can send an email to
10 landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov.

11 Chair Hanks, there's nobody online or in
12 public who would like to testify.

13 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Okay. Committee would
14 now like to recognize Council Member Fariás who's
15 joined us.

16 Thank you for your patience. We're
17 waiting for our next hearing.

18 Thank you. With that, we're going to open
19 a public hearing on the Timbale Terrace proposal
20 relating to the property in Council Member Salaam's
21 District in Manhattan. The proposal consists of two
22 land use items under ULURP numbers C 240046 HAM and C
23 240047 PQM.

24 We are joined today by the project team
25 members including Agata Naklicka of HPD, Jorge Chang,

1 Project Architect, and Michelle Ponce of Mega. We
2 will also have, for additional questions if needed,
3 Arvind Sindhvani and Alex Rawding of HPD, and Dan
4 Kent of the Lantern Organization.
5

6 I'll remind anyone wishing to testify
7 remotely, if you have not done so already, you must
8 register online, and you may do so now by visiting
9 the Council's website at council.nyc.gov/landuse.

10 Counsel, would you please administer the
11 affirmation?

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Panelists, would you
13 please raise your right hand and state your name for
14 the record?

15 JORGE CHANG: Jorge Chang.

16 MICHELLE PONCE: Michelle Ponce.

17 AGATA NAKLICKA: Agata Naklicka

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Do you affirm to tell
19 the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth
20 in your testimony before the Subcommittee and in
21 answer to all Council Member questions?

22 PANEL: (INAUDIBLE)

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: And I think you could
24 put on the microphone.

25 AGATA NAKLICKA: Sorry. Yes, I do.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MICHELLE PONCE: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you, applicant panelists. Please begin and please let us know when you are ready to share your presentation and our Staff will display it on the screen.

AGATA NAKLICKA: I think we're ready.

Okay. Good morning, Chair Hanks and Council Members. My name is Agata Naklicka, and I'm a Manhattan Borough Planner at HPD with the Manhattan Planning Team. I'm excited to be here today presenting on the Timbale Terrace Project, an affordable housing project that will result in the construction of a new 19-story building containing approximately 341 affordable and permanent supportive housing units. The proposed development also includes ground floor community facility space, which will be home to the Afro Latin Jazz Alliance, and also NYPD replacement parking, which will be located on the ground and second floors of the proposed development.

I'm joined here by other representatives of HBD and the development team who will introduce themselves either later in the presentation or during questions as needed. Next slide, please.

1
2 The Timbale Terrace Project came to be as
3 a direct result of feedback received during the East
4 Harlem Neighborhood Plan, which was completed in 2016
5 and was developed to provide recommendations for
6 addressing key neighborhood issues, and a key
7 recommendation of the plan was to use public sites to
8 advance 100 percent affordable housing projects with
9 additional services for residents. In 2021, this
10 development team was selected by HPD via a
11 competitive RFP to redevelop the NYPD parking lot
12 located along Park Avenue between East 118th Street
13 and East 119th Street, and HPD is excited about this
14 unique opportunity to develop an underutilized City-
15 owned parking lot with much needed affordable and
16 supportive housing units. Next slide.

17 As part of the ULURP application, HPD
18 seeks approval for the following Land Use actions.
19 UDAAP designation and project approval and
20 disposition of the development site and an
21 acquisition of approximately 30,000 square feet on
22 the ground and second floors to provide space for 75
23 NYPD replacement parking spaces.

24 At this time, I turn over the
25 presentation to Michelle Ponce from the development

1 team to speak in more detail about the proposed
2 project. Thank you.

3
4 MICHELLE PONCE: Thank you. Thank you,
5 Agata.

6 Good morning, Chair Hanks and fellow
7 Council Members. My name is Michelle Ponce, and I'm
8 here on behalf of Mega, co-developer and general
9 contractor for the project. Mega is a full-service
10 general contracting, construction management, and
11 real estate development firm with a focus on
12 affordable housing and a long history of working with
13 community-based and not-for-profit organizations. I'm
14 joined by my colleagues from Lantern, co-developer.
15 Lantern is a non-profit developer and social services
16 provider with over 25 years of experience and has
17 been in the East Harlem community since the year
18 2000. I'm also joined by my colleagues from the Afro
19 Latin Jazz Alliance, who you will hear from during
20 the public testimony piece. Can we go to the next
21 slide?

22 Timbale Terrace will deliver on
23 affordability, maximize community benefits, and be
24 the highest and best use of publicly owned land. As
25 Agata mentioned, this site was specifically cited in

1 the East Harlem Neighborhood Plan as a publicly owned
2 site that should be transformed into 100 percent
3 affordable housing, and in 2023 and 2024, Community
4 Board 11's Statement of District Needs reaffirmed the
5 need for affordable and supportive housing in the
6 community board district. Timbale Terrace will be 100
7 percent affordable housing with replacement parking
8 for the NYPD's 25th precinct and approximately 21,000
9 square feet of community facility space that will be
10 the new permanent home of the Afro Latin Jazz
11 Alliance. In total, there will be 341 units,
12 including one super's unit and 99 permanent
13 supportive housing, and 30 percent of the units will
14 be sized for families. This building will be highly
15 amenitized with a 16th floor that will be exclusively
16 dedicated to residential amenities, and residents
17 will have access to panoramic views of the city. Next
18 slide, please.

20 Timbale Terrace will be financed through
21 HPD and HTC's Extremely Low and Low-Income
22 Affordability program, also known as ELLA, to deliver
23 an integrated residential community and target the
24 deepest levels of affordability. Timbale Terrace will
25 serve households earning as low as 30 percent of the

1 area median income and up to 80 percent of the area
2 median income. As you can see in the table here, we
3 have 88 units at 30 percent of AMI, 70 units at 50
4 percent of AMI, and 83 units at 80 percent of AMI,
5 and the 99 permanent supportive housing units.
6 Seventy-five percent of all units are targeting
7 households earning up to 50 percent of AMI and below.
8 The 99 permanent supportive housing units will
9 receive on site supportive services from Lantern.
10 Next slide.

12 All right, and now on this table, we can
13 see an updated proposed affordability distribution
14 that came about of the ULURP and UDAAP process.
15 Throughout the UDAAP process and throughout our
16 extensive community engagement, we heard from the
17 community the need for more family-sized units. Our
18 team took this feedback to heart, and we sat down and
19 evaluated the feasibility of adding additional
20 family-sized units, and we're happy to share that we
21 have been able to do that. We have significantly
22 increased the number of family-sized units, bringing
23 the total percentage to 35 percent, in response to
24 the feedback that we received from the community.
25 Next slide, please.

1 All right. Now to quickly go over the
2 qualifying incomes and monthly rents that would be at
3 Timbale Terrace. The 99 permanent supportive housing
4 units, the individuals will pay no more than 30
5 percent of their income, and as you can see here on
6 the table, units at 30 percent of AMI will have
7 qualifying incomes ranging from 29,700 dollars up to
8 49,140 dollars per year with qualifying rents ranging
9 between 617 dollars and 830 dollars per month. These
10 ranges vary on household size and unit size. 50
11 percent of AMI-qualifying incomes will range between
12 49,450 dollars up to 81,900 dollars, and
13 corresponding rents will vary from 1,146 dollars to
14 1,564 dollars per month, and for the 80 percent AMI
15 tier, corresponding incomes will range between 79,120
16 dollars up to 131,040 dollars with corresponding
17 rents ranging between 1,941 dollars up to 2,665
18 dollars per month. Again, these rents will vary
19 depending on the household size and the unit size.
20 Next slide, please.

22 All right, the ALJA Music and Arts
23 Center. As I mentioned earlier, Timbale Terrace will
24 be the permanent home for the Afro Latin Jazz
25 Alliance and will house ALJA staff, performance, and

1 educational programs. The ALJA space will activate
2 the Park Avenue corridor with an active storefront
3 that will include performance and rehearsal spaces,
4 music educational facilities, meeting rooms, event
5 spaces, co-working spaces, a cafe and shop, and
6 you'll hear more about the programming from my
7 colleague, Zach, during the public testimony piece.

8
9 Now I'll pass it on to my colleague Jorge
10 Chang from UAI.

11 JORGE CHANG: Good morning, everyone. I'm
12 Jorge Chang from Urban Architectural Initiatives, and
13 I'm the architect for Timbale Terrace. Next slide.

14 With sustainable design and resiliency in
15 mind, Timbale Terrace is designed to be highly energy
16 efficient and reduce carbon emissions as an all-
17 electric building. Aside from meeting and exceeding
18 Enterprise Green Community's criteria, passive house
19 design and standards will be implemented throughout,
20 such as high performance, thermally broken,
21 insulated, and sound attenuating windows, super-
22 insulated walls and roof, an airtight building
23 envelope, and solar PV panels to be located on the
24 rooftop. There are several common outdoor amenity
25 spaces for resident and building staff use and

1
2 arrangement. These include residents will have access
3 to a third-floor landscaped rear court, an outdoor
4 jogging path, gathering areas and seating for active
5 and passive recreation and socializing. A rooftop
6 community garden on the eighth floor is also proposed
7 for lanterns, horticulture, health and nutrition
8 programming, and the 16th floor will have a dedicated
9 supportive services program office suite, large
10 community and meeting rooms, fitness rooms to promote
11 active living and access to a roof terrace with
12 panoramic views of Harlem.

13 I'll pass the presentation back to
14 Michelle.

15 MICHELLE PONCE: Thank you, Jorge. Can we
16 go to the next slide, please? All right. Lastly,
17 economic development. Our team will partner and
18 coordinate with community-based organizations,
19 Building Skills, and HireNYC to post the construction
20 job opportunities that be available for Timbale
21 Terrace. Our team will also provide priority for
22 local residents and will collaborate with the
23 community board and other local organizations to host
24 OSHA trainings free of charge to local residents.
25 OSHA certificate is great because it will definitely

1 open up job opportunities in the construction field
2 for those individuals that receive it. As you can see
3 here in the table, Mega has an excellent track record
4 of meeting local hiring and M/WBE goals for hiring.
5 You can see here that we've often exceeded our hiring
6 goals by 10, 20, 30 percent, and we will also be
7 committing to maximizing our M/WBE contracting goals
8 as well.
9

10 With that, that concludes our
11 presentation for Timbale Terrace. Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much. I'd
13 also like to recognize Council Member Nurse has
14 joined us.

15 I have some questions. Can you elaborate
16 on the target populations for the supportive housing
17 units and how the two will interact?

18 AGATA NAKLICKA: Yes, and for that, we'll
19 pass it to our colleague, Dan Kent from Lantern.

20 DAN KENT: Morning, everyone. Dan Kent,
21 CEO of Lantern Organization. The proposal includes 97
22 studio apartments which would be reserved for
23 individuals from the 15/15 program, specifically the
24 single adult population.
25

2 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you. Has Lantern
3 successfully combined adult and youth populations in
4 the same building and in other locations?

5 DAN KENT: Absolutely. In fact, right next
6 door at Schafer Hall, we serve both young adults and
7 single adults, and we serve a wide range of
8 populations. We have over 1,400 units of affordable
9 and supportive housing throughout New York City, most
10 of which serve a mix of populations.

11 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much, and
12 lastly, could you explain how supportive and
13 affordable units will be distributed through the
14 building?

15 DAN KENT: Yes, as per regulations,
16 they're distributed randomly.

17 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Okay, sorry. One more
18 question. Thank you What was the rationale for
19 increasing the number of larger units in the building
20 at a higher number of smaller units? Were there any
21 trade-offs in making those decisions?

22 DAN KENT: The rationale was community
23 input. That's why we increased the percentage of
24 family units. The primary trade-off is it makes the
25 project a little more expensive.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much.

3 Now I'd like to recognize any of my
4 Colleagues if anyone had any questions or remarks.
5 Council Member Farías.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER FARÍAS: Thank you so much,
7 Chair.

8 Just a quick question on the economic
9 development piece. You've listed here CBOs, building
10 trades, and Hire NYC. Do we know the percentage of
11 people in the local area that we can pull to hire
12 from? Do we know if there's 10 percent, 15 percent,
13 20 percent are in construction skills or in a union
14 or have some sort of trade, certification, or
15 credential that we'll be utilizing to hire on this
16 project.

17 MICHELLE PONCE: We will definitely work
18 with the community board and other local
19 organizations to post these jobs. Our target is that
20 30 percent of the new hires be local residents from
21 the community board.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER FARÍAS: Okay, so the
23 target goal is 30 percent but we haven't initially
24 had any conversations yet to see what the percentage

25

1
2 of people in the locality are within the union or
3 have been credentialed.

4 MICHELLE PONCE: Not yet, but we've
5 started those conversations a bit as we've gone
6 through this ULURP bringing you that process.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIÁS: Okay, great. I
8 obviously, as someone that's worked in job training
9 prior, I always love to see when folks are going to
10 add more people to the OSHA training and having
11 recruitment sessions. As many of us know, job
12 training programs, apprenticeship programs are longer
13 than potentially how long this is going to take to be
14 built, and so I'd, one, like to say, please consider
15 as early as you possibly can to start that process to
16 make sure people from the locality can actually
17 benefit from being on this project. Secondly,
18 working with the unions is super critical in going
19 beyond these bare minimum credentials and making sure
20 people can work. I was just in a Transportation and
21 Contracts hearing as I ran over here talking about
22 M/WBEs. Again, do we know the percentage of M/WBE
23 subcontractors that are in this local area that could
24 potentially be on the project?

2 MICHELLE PONCE: We haven't identified
3 them yet, but that is an exercise that we can
4 definitely start doing as early as possible. MEGA
5 frequently exceeds the goals that HPD and agencies
6 require so we feel comfortable about maximizing the
7 M/WBE contracting opportunities here as well.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIÁS: Okay, great. Thank
9 you, folks, for answering my questions. Thank you,
10 Chair.

11 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you, Madam
12 Majority Leader. Okay. Anyone else? Council Member
13 Nurse.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: Just a quick
15 question. It's great to see the passive house
16 elements being used here, and I love that it's being
17 used more, but on the post-construction side, when
18 people are moving in my community, I've noticed a lot
19 of problems with mold, water leaks, people not
20 understanding that these types of windows are hard to
21 get and so just wondering if you're planning on doing
22 any education about what this type of unit means for
23 tenants, lack of screens, just that they have to
24 change the filters often because I think a lot of
25 people are very unfamiliar with this and don't

1 realize just how much maintenance they need to do
2 annually to make sure that the unit itself is
3 healthy. Not really a question, but just a comment
4 that we've been seeing this in the post-construction
5 period, and it would be good to just let people know
6 and build in a plan for regularly changing the
7 filters and making sure those things don't become an
8 issue.
9

10 MICHELLE PONCE: No, Council Member,
11 that's a great point, and our intent too is to
12 provide that training. It's good for the tenants to
13 know, but it's also great for the longevity of each
14 unit. Duly noted, and we'll definitely be
15 incorporating that.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: Thanks.

17 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much. The
18 applicant panel is now excused.

19 Counsel, are there any members of the
20 public who wish to testify on this item?

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes. We're going to
22 call up the first three that I have cards for, Julius
23 Tajiddin, Zachary O'Farrill, and Cynthia Stuart.

24 If you are a member of the public signed
25 up to testify on the proposal, please stand by when

1
2 you hear your name being called and prepare to speak
3 when the Chair says that you may begin.

4 As a reminder in the event that Council
5 Members have questions, witnesses are asked to remain
6 online or to stay seated here at the microphone after
7 their testimony until excused by the Chair.

8 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: You may begin.

9 ZACHARY O'FARRILL: Thanks. Thank you,
10 Committee. My name is Zach O'Farrill. I am the
11 community liaison with Belongo, formerly known as the
12 Afro Latin Jazz Alliance. I just first want to say
13 that we are very proud to have called various parts
14 of Harlem home for a long time from when we had our
15 offices at Harlem School of the Arts to when we had
16 our offices at the Minisink Townhouse with the
17 Mission Society then to the one-bedroom apartment
18 that we turned into an office at 20 West 125th Street
19 between Malcolm X and 5th, and now we're at Artspace
20 El Barrio on 99th between 2nd and 3rd so we feel a
21 deep connection to the area and are very proud to be
22 a part of this project and that our forever home can
23 be on Park Avenue between 118th and 119th. I just
24 want to talk about the activation of Park Avenue and
25 all the activities, all that we'll be able to offer

1
2 to the community up there. Whether it's our
3 performance spaces where we'll be presenting artists
4 and performances that are diverse and culturally
5 relevant to people in the community that reflect the
6 incredible diversity of the community to the smaller
7 venue that we'll have as part of our cafe, which we
8 can treat as like a jazz club which can be an
9 opportunity for local artists to meet each other and
10 perform together and have opportunities to make music
11 and build community almost every night of the week.
12 We have educational spaces where we are plan, oh my
13 god, I'm already almost done, where we want to be the
14 community music school in East Harlem. We want to be
15 where young people can come and take classes that are
16 affordable. We want to use our co-working spaces as
17 places where people can get English classes, or as is
18 becoming increasingly important, Spanish classes,
19 personal finance classes. That's my time. Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you. Thank you
21 so much.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Sorry. We did not
23 announce that the public will be given two minutes to
24 speak. I apologize.

25

1
2 CYNTHIA STUART: Okay. Hi, I'm Cynthia
3 Stuart. I'm the Chief Operating Officer of the
4 Supportive Housing Network of New York, and we're a
5 membership organization representing 200 non-profits
6 statewide that collectively run 60,000 units of
7 supportive housing. I've been doing this for good
8 long time. I've been in the supportive housing field
9 for 30 years. I can wholeheartedly attest to the
10 safety and effectiveness of supportive housing, which
11 has been built in New York City for the past 40
12 years. It has a sterling reputation for being both
13 the premier intervention for helping our most
14 vulnerable neighbors live stably in the community as
15 well as being an excellent and responsive neighbor.
16 There are dozens of studies that prove the
17 effectiveness of supportive housing and ending
18 homelessness. There was even an NYU study that proved
19 that supportive housing actually increases property
20 values. That's good. And, as you know, property
21 values is a reflection of safety and neighborhood,
22 but even though I've worked in supportive housing for
23 a really long time, and I'm a diehard supporter of it
24 I'm here to point out to the Committee that it's a
25 small part of this fantastic project, which I have to

1 say, is a fantastic project. It's probably the most
2 fantastic I've ever seen in 30 years in New York City
3 because it has 250 affordable units in East Harlem
4 that is gentrifying, because it has the Afro Latin
5 Jazz Center and it supports East Harlem's sense of
6 pride and culture. I can't believe how fantastic it
7 is. While I was listening to Jorge speak about all
8 the other things, I was like, wow, this is even
9 better than I thought. Of all the three components of
10 this gorgeous project, I very much hope the
11 Subcommittee supports the building of it. Thanks. I
12 made it.
13

14 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you. Did Julius
15 Tajiddin want to speak?

16 JULIUS TAJIDDIN: Yeah. Julius Tajiddin.
17 I'm an East Harlem resident, and I like the project,
18 but these are the problems with it. According to the
19 latest NYU Furman report, 60 percent of East Harlem
20 households earn at or below 30,000 a year, 33 percent
21 are at or below the federal poverty level, which is
22 approximately 14,000 a year. The developer in this
23 project touts that the residential units are 100
24 percent affordable, yet they don't tap into this 60
25 percent group, let alone the 33 percent group. I find

1
2 it very appalling that this city can house migrants
3 in luxury housing, no less, but far too often don't
4 allow housing for our less fortunate residents, in
5 this case, who have probably been here their entire
6 lives or for a very long time. The way the ecosystem
7 and housing should work is that when new housing is
8 built, some of the people living in such communities
9 should go into that housing then the landlords of
10 these dilapidated buildings can renovate them and let
11 some new transplants occupy them. Many of the East
12 Harlem residents in that 60 percent group as well as
13 the 33 percent group live in overcrowded and
14 deplorable apartments. As far as the AMI goes, the
15 use of it is a convenience for developers. Even if a
16 developer was shooting for a federal benefit, which
17 would require the use of the AMI, that has nothing to
18 do with us. By the time of this closing, the AMI
19 could be 10,000 to 15,000 more than the 127,000 that
20 it is currently so it's a system where the goal post
21 is always moving. But if we use the method of income
22 targeted housing, it is what it is. We want housing
23 that protects a certain income class, and that will
24 not change. What the developer presents today could
25 change by the time of the closing. Lastly, this

1 developer said nothing about guaranteeing
2 construction jobs for our U.S. citizen residents in
3 the Harlem area. I travel all over the country, and
4 in the South, black people work in every job sector.
5 Yet here, there are too many job industries, such as
6 construction, where you don't see black construction
7 workers. Why is that? I can tell you, it's not the
8 black citizens' doing. It's the government's doing.
9 You, the Committee, and hopefully the City Council,
10 have an opportunity to fix this. So that's what's
11 wrong with this project. Everything else about it is
12 good.
13

14 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much.

15 JULIUS TAJIDDIN: Any questions? Mr.
16 Salaam, any questions?

17 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Are there any
18 questions? Firstly, I'd like to recognize Council
19 Member Yousef Salaam has joined us.

20 Anyone have questions? Council Member
21 Marte.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTE: Hello. Just a quick
23 comment. Many of the migrants aren't staying in
24 luxury housing, and I understand what you're trying
25 to fight for, many of us try to fight for the same

1
2 thing in our communities, but you can't pit one
3 community against another.

4 JULIUS TAJIDDIN: No, but we can protect
5 our residents, our U.S. citizen residents. I believe
6 I said, yeah, I didn't put a number like many or a
7 little, but that's what they're doing, and yet in our
8 communities, in the black and brown, people that have
9 been here for a while, they're not looking out for
10 them. They're just totally, they're missing that
11 number, the 60 percent number earning 30 percent and
12 below, and then 33 percent earning below the poverty
13 level, and yet you say we're offering, everything's
14 affordable, but yet you stop short of that number and
15 you can't do that. That has to stop.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAAM: I actually I do
17 have a question and it might be to this particular
18 project. As I was understanding AMI and correct me if
19 I'm wrong, is the correct description of AMI up to
20 meaning like zero to 30 percent for that particular
21 category, 0 to 50 percent, and..

22 JULIUS TAJIDDIN: No, let me explain it to
23 you.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAAM: And 0 to 80
25 because when I hear up to..

1
2 JULIUS TAJIDDIN: No, it's the area median
3 income, and the developers, they use the federal
4 area. They don't have to do it. They do it out of
5 convenience because if you're going, for example, the
6 low-income housing tax credit, a developer, right? So
7 HUD would require them to offer 80 percent, like so
8 many units at 80 percent of the AMI or lower, it
9 still gives the developer an opportunity to offer it
10 at even 10 percent.

11 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Sir, thank you so
12 much. I think that Council Member would like to ask
13 the question of the panel that gave the presentation
14 and we can do that at a later date, but we want to
15 thank, being no more questions on this panel, the
16 witnesses are now excused. Thank you so much.

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We're going to be
18 calling up the next panel, Diane Louard-Michel, David
19 Gillcrist, Alfredo Colon.

20 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: We'll now hear from
21 the next panel.

22 DAVID GILLCRIST: Hello. Hi, my name is
23 David Gillcrist. I'm a resident of Community Board 11
24 since 1999 and the former Director of Development at
25 Hope Community from 1991 to 1995 where I helped build

1 senior and low-income family housing. Subsequently, I
2 have worked for the Corporation for Supportive
3 Housing, and for the last 20 years, served as the
4 Executive Director of Project FINE, an elder services
5 organization based in Manhattan, Community Boards 4,
6 5, and 7. I'd like to express my strong support for
7 the Timbale Terrace for the following reasons.
8

9 First, the extreme shortage of affordable
10 housing is one of the most critical challenges facing
11 East Harlem as it dramatically affects the
12 demographic composition of this historically working-
13 class neighborhood and thus its very future. Without
14 a doubt, it has become increasingly difficult for
15 working-class community members to find superior
16 accommodations to them in this neighborhood. The
17 Lantern Group's proposal will produce 340 units of
18 permanent affordable housing to households earning
19 between 30 and 80 percent of area median income. The
20 project will contain one-, two-, and even three-
21 bedroom units, making it relevant to households of a
22 variety of sizes, and East Harlemites will receive
23 key advantages over other applicants. The Lantern
24 Group has negotiated with HPD a community preference
25 for 50 percent of the affordable units.

1
2 Secondly, Timbale Terrace will transform
3 long-standing vacant lots into a vital hub of urban
4 life that will reinforce other development efforts
5 along Park Avenue. The site has been vacant for
6 years, making that stretch of Park Avenue more of a
7 no man's land to be avoided than a community asset.
8 The Lantern Group has a sound plan to reverse this
9 dynamic. For starters, once fully occupied, Timbale
10 Terrace will house up to 600 people. Multiplying this
11 effect will be the inclusion of a cultural
12 powerhouse, the Afro Latin Jazz Alliance, which
13 brings its commitment to performance in public
14 education. It's a huge win for East Harlem. This
15 program will seed a new generation of music... That was
16 fast.

17 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much.

18 ALFREDO COLON: Hi everybody, my name is
19 Alfredo Colon. I'm a saxophonist, composer, music
20 curator, New Yorker. I grew up in public housing in
21 Harlem and was a student of the Afro Latin Jazz
22 Alliance's Fat Afro Latin Jazz Cats program where
23 they would teach us how to perform every Sunday at
24 Fat Cat Jazz Club. This program has changed my life
25 for the better. There I received free music education

1
2 at a time when my family could not afford to put me
3 in lessons. I've met lifelong friends of mine, Zach
4 being one of them, and it's changed my life in so
5 many ways. I'm now a professional musician with a
6 robust touring schedule. I've won multiple awards. I
7 have many endorsements under my belt. None of it
8 would have been possible without the Afro Latin Jazz
9 Alliance. Being a Harlem resident myself, or someone
10 who grew up in Harlem, this is something that hits
11 very close to home and someone who's worked with them
12 and been a part of the community, I can attest to all
13 that they've done for the community, and I can see
14 how much they brighten everything in the community.
15 So I breezed through that, but that's all I have to
16 say. If they could do that for me, I can only imagine
17 what they can do for an entire community with a
18 building so thank you all.

19 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you for that
20 powerful testimony. Congratulations. Thank you very
21 much. This panel is now excused.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Calling up the next
23 group, confirming that Diane Louard Michel does not
24 want to testify at this time. Shams DaBaron, and I'm
25

1 not sure if Melissa Auton wants to speak at this time
2 so Shams DaBaron.

3
4 SHAMS DABARON: How's everybody?

5 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Great. You may begin.

6 SHAMS DABARON: As a product of Harlem, my
7 family originated in East...

8 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Sorry, what's your
9 name?

10 SHAMS DABARON: Shams DaBaron. As a
11 product of Harlem, as someone whose family originates
12 in East Harlem, I'm obviously concerned at what goes
13 on in Harlem and so one of my objectives in what I do
14 now as the housing hero, is to ensure that
15 communities like Harlem that are having developments
16 are having developments that not only benefit the
17 developers, the non-profit partners, the residents,
18 but also the overall community, and I support Timbale
19 Terrace because this is one of those projects that is
20 unique to the community that offers not just the
21 supportive services that address communities like,
22 those that are experiencing homelessness, etc., but
23 also workforce housing, and we've seen so much
24 through gentrification and other means of our people
25 from Harlem have to leave Harlem and go out of state

1
2 in different places so we lose our local workforce,
3 which are, many of them are city workers, many of
4 them are law enforcement. I deal with these people
5 all the time who, they're processing the application
6 for someone who's facing eviction or someone who's
7 exiting a shelter, but they themselves are facing
8 homelessness. They themselves are saying, I don't got
9 long on this job because I can't afford to live in my
10 apartment in Harlem. Shams, can you help me? Because
11 I can't access a voucher. So it's a lot of different
12 reasons why I have to support projects like this, and
13 the fact that half of its residents are going to be
14 under the 30 percent of the AMI is important, the
15 fact that it maintains its cultural integrity,
16 specifically in East Harlem through an Afro Latino
17 cultural center is important to me, the fact that
18 they have heard the community and there are certain
19 things that they had to change because the community
20 wanted it and they did that is why I have to support
21 it. Last thing, we can't continue to build shelters
22 as the alternative for people that can't afford to
23 live in the communities. We have to center housing
24 over shelters. Harlem is saturated, oversaturated
25 with shelters. They keep building them because it's

2 easier to build shelters. You build them within a
3 year, two years. With housing, it's taken three,
4 four, five years, and especially affordable housing.
5 The fact that we have to struggle to get affordable
6 housing in Harlem is crazy to me so we need to change
7 this and I hope all of you can support that and do a
8 development that could actually show the rest of the
9 city and the rest of the world how we need to
10 properly address affordable housing in communities
11 like Harlem. Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much.
13 Well done, everyone.

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Is there anyone else
15 in person who would like to speak now?

16 Just as a reminder, anyone can send
17 written testimony to our email address,
18 landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov.

19 We're going to be moving now to our
20 virtual panel. The first three that will be called up
21 are Aurora Flores, Brian Dickerson, and George Janes.

22 AURORA FLORES: Hello, can you hear me?
23 Can you hear me?

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Now we can. Thank you.
25 You may begin.

1
2 AURORA FLORES: Hi, how are you? My name
3 is Aurora Flores, and I'm an author, artist, and
4 Latin music educator, producer of 100 years of Latin
5 music in New York over YouTube, and what I want to
6 say is affordable housing can save lives while music
7 can heal the soul, the body, and the mind, bringing
8 communities together. East Harlem, El Barrio, as we
9 know it, has always been a community of Puerto
10 Ricans, African Americans, immigrants, and many of
11 that diverse ethnic groups living here today, and it
12 has always been a poor working-class community that
13 brought its music, art, and poetry to these streets.
14 In fact, the history of Latin music in New York
15 begins and can be traced to the opening of the first
16 Latin music record shop at Almacenes Hernandez in
17 1927 on 114th Street and Park Avenue. For the past
18 hundred years, these streets have been steeped in our
19 syncopated rhythms, drums, chants, and songs from
20 classical to pop popular music. The Timbale Building
21 is a direct partnership with this community. It is a
22 united effort between affordable housing and music
23 education and presentation that will directly impact
24 not only youth but many families also here and coming
25 to Spanish Harlem who need and deserve affordable

1
2 housing. Reaganomics took music out of our public
3 schools back in the 1980s, leaving this huge gap in
4 the instruction of children and the building of
5 character to a few patchy and inconsistent
6 organizations scattered throughout the city. Here we
7 have an opportunity to bring a cohesive and
8 consistent stream of music, history, and education
9 back to this diverse community alongside affordable
10 housing for youth and families. As a lifelong
11 resident of El Barrio, an author, an artist, an
12 activist, I am for and appeal, especially on this
13 significant day of love, to approve the building and
14 creation of this musical center within this complex
15 of affordable housing to raise our pride and cohesion
16 as a community and...

17 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time has expired.

18 AURORA FLORES: In honor of our music
19 artistic legacy. Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Brian
22 Dickerson.

23 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: I would also like to
24 recognize Council Member Feliz is joining us online
25 virtually.

1
2 BRIAN DICKERSON: Hello, I'm Brian
3 Dickerson. I'm a clinical social worker, a son of
4 Harlem. I've been working with Lantern for over 15
5 years, and I feel like I'm in a really blessed
6 situation because I'm one of the guys that work
7 directly with the folks that move in, and I've been
8 able to experience them coming in with the trauma of
9 being unhoused and seeing them achieve and overcome
10 obstacles and incrementally arriving at greater and
11 greater success. I've had people who have come in and
12 been able to finish college, to find partners, to
13 have children, to become a major force in our
14 community and to give back. I have a young person
15 that became a social worker and came back one day and
16 said, Brian, do you remember me? I was like, yeah,
17 and she told me her name and then she was like I
18 lived here, I went to Hunter, I'm a social worker,
19 and you helped inspire that, and I say that with
20 humility, and she was bringing someone else so the
21 importance, I know someone said I want to take what's
22 good about Lantern and about (INAUDIBLE) any
23 vulnerable person who's unhoused needs a place to
24 live to start their life, whether it's migrant
25 populations, our asylum seekers, our unhoused

1 neighbors, whoever it is, singles, young adults. The
2 impact that this beautiful space will have when a
3 person walks in and is able to say I'm going to live
4 here. This is the beginning. It tells people their
5 self-worth, that this place is beautiful, and someone
6 cares, and there's this incredible team that I work
7 with, social workers, case managers, that are there
8 because they have great empathy, and they're
9 authentically there because of their commitment to
10 the mission of helping all people, specifically
11 people in our community, part of the African Diaspora
12 and beyond so this is a great project. I support it
13 wholeheartedly. I support it whether I'm volunteering
14 or whether, it's not the money that brings you,
15 obviously, social workers don't make a lot of money,
16 so it's not about that.

18 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much.

19 BRIAN DICKERSON: It's about the mission
20 so I'm really happy to be able to support Timbale
21 Terrace.

22 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you.

23 BRIAN DICKERSON: (INAUDIBLE) I look
24 forward to meeting you.

25 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: George Janes.

1
2 GEORGE JANES: Thank you. My name is
3 George Janes. I've been the Consulting Planner to
4 Community Board 11 for the past 10 years. Today I'm
5 here on my own time to offer support for Timbale
6 Terrace. Timbale Terrace and other projects that are
7 in the pipeline are a testament to the effectiveness
8 of community-based planning and the East Harlem
9 Neighborhood Plan. Compared to other Manhattan
10 community districts since 2014, East Harlem has
11 produced the most new-construction affordable
12 housing, produced the most new-construction
13 affordable housing serving the lowest income bands,
14 and preserved the most existing affordable housing
15 units by far. East Harlem has not produced the most
16 total new housing, but it has produced the most
17 affordable housing, and affordability was the focus
18 of the neighborhood plan. Projects like Timbale
19 Terrace with 100 percent affordable housing are
20 critical to the plan's implementation. Now I came
21 here today because, to my surprise, this project had
22 substantial community opposition. I've been to nearly
23 every Community Board 11 Land Use meeting over the
24 past 10 years, and I've never seen anything like it.
25 As someone who believes we must listen to neighbors

1
2 when they speak, I remind everyone that the
3 Neighborhood Plan called for development that
4 prioritizes not only affordable housing but also
5 housing for the homeless and supportive housing.
6 Opposition to Timbale concerned the supportive
7 housing component. Neighbors see the crime and
8 disorder in the streets, and they believe that
9 supportive housing will bring more of that to the
10 neighborhood. Let me be clear, the concerns that the
11 neighbors have about crime and disorder are
12 completely legitimate, and we should be doing more to
13 find solutions to these problems, but Timbale, with
14 the housing it brings, is not part of that problem.
15 It's part of the solution. Timbale Terrace helps to
16 realize Neighborhood Plan deserves your support.
17 Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much.
19 Are there any Council Members with questions for this
20 panel? Thank you. Next.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Okay. We will now call
22 the next three panelists online, Doreen Burton, Lisa
23 Jackson Foyle and Maulin Mehta.

24 DOREEN BURTON: Hi, good afternoon. My
25 name is Doreen Burton. About 10 years ago, I was

1 living with my father when he suddenly passed away.
2 Because I was not on his lease, I became homeless. I
3 went into the shelter system, but I felt like I was
4 in jail because I knew many people that was having
5 problems. Also, while I was in the shelter system, we
6 would have to move to a new shelter every few months,
7 which meant I had to find a new doctor or dentist
8 each time. This was so frustrating to have to find
9 new providers. My health was very poor. Then one day
10 I met a program director from Lantern who told me
11 that if I could possibly just hold on for a few more
12 months, that they were opening a new building called
13 Prospero Hall that I possibly could move into so I
14 held on until it opened. I was one of the first
15 tenants to move into Prospero Hall, and my life has
16 never been the same. Now I'm able to see a doctor on
17 a regular basis without worrying that I will have to
18 relocate, find a new doctor, and tell my story over
19 again. This was so frustrating to have to find new
20 providers. Supportive Housing has done me a big
21 favor. I appreciate all case managers and program
22 directors for all that they do for me. My health is
23 better because I don't have to stress anymore of
24 worrying about belongings being taken and everything
25

2 else, especially when I'm going to lay my head at
3 night. I was under constant stress. Here at Prospero,
4 I can always contact a case manager.

5 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time expired.

6 DOREEN BURTON: Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: I just want to say
8 thank you for that and sharing your powerful
9 testimony. I really appreciate it. Thank you.

10 DOREEN BURTON: You're welcome.

11 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Lisa Jackson Foyle.

12 LISA JACKSON FOYLE: Hey, can you hear me?

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes.

14 LISA JACKSON FOYLE: Okay. Good afternoon.

15 My name is Lisa Jackson Foyle, and I am one of the
16 owners of FTE Builders. We are a certified M/WBE
17 subcontractor, and we specialize in interior rough
18 and finish carpentry, and I am here to attest that
19 Mega Contracting does fulfill the need to hire M/WBEs
20 on a lot of their projects. One in particular was the
21 first, one of the first projects that we worked on
22 was Randolph houses in Harlem, and we were in phase
23 one and phase two where there was a total gut
24 renovation on some tenement houses on that block, a
25 well-known block, historical block, and what we did

1 for the community, I believe, was to hire local hire
2 as well as I believe we were signed up with Hire NYC,
3 but we had young men from that neighborhood that
4 really didn't have a lot of skills in the
5 construction industry and they came on board and they
6 started as laborers, and we were there for a few
7 years and they were able to increase their skills and
8 move into different trades, starting off as labor men
9 and then moving along the ladder to number one,
10 increase their pay and so on by learning new skills.
11 I am sure that Mega will continue their reputation of
12 hiring M/WBES especially, which we are one of. I
13 believe that this Timbale project is going to be a
14 great project. I'm strictly an arts girl as well.

15
16 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Time expired.

17 LISA JACKSON FOYLE: My daughter is a
18 vocal arts teacher so I'm for the project and for
19 hiring MBEs.

20 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Maulin Mehta.

22 MAULIN MEHTA: Hi there. Can you hear me?

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes.

24 MAULIN MEHTA: Good afternoon. My name is
25 Maulin Mehta, and I am New York Director at Regional

1 Plan Association. Thank you to Chair Hanks and all
2 the Members of the Subcommittee for the opportunity
3 to testify today in support of the Timbale Terrace
4 project.
5

6 The recently released 2023 Housing and
7 Vacancy Survey shows that our city has a 1 percent
8 vacancy rate for affordable units across the city,
9 which is the lowest vacancy rate in half a century.
10 Moreover, we've estimated that our city and state
11 will require over 800,000 new units of housing in the
12 next decade to meet current and future demand. While
13 Timbale Terrace is a fraction of the need, it
14 provides an incredible model of creating a
15 sustainable mixed-use and mixed-income development
16 that delivers on housing and community needs. East
17 Harlem is in real need of new affordable housing.
18 Real median gross rent has increased over 50 percent
19 since 2006 and nearly half of all new development
20 over the last decade was market rates. The Timbale
21 Terrace Project creates tremendous opportunities by
22 providing a 100 percent affordable housing
23 development that will be accessible for households
24 and families earning 30 to 80 percent AMI, and it
25 does this at a time when the community is seeing

1
2 major investments, helping to ensure that some of the
3 most vulnerable New Yorkers are able to securely take
4 advantage of these new opportunities. More
5 importantly, this project realizes goals from the
6 East Harlem Neighborhood Plan to prioritize public
7 sites for the creation of more affordable housing.
8 Too many communities work through exhaustive planning
9 processes only to see few benefits realized. Timbale
10 Terrace puts the community's vision into action and
11 demonstrates to New Yorkers that the time and effort
12 invested in community planning can deliver results.
13 By building this project on an NYPD parking lot, we
14 can provide sustainable infill development, give
15 housing and resources to vulnerable New Yorkers, and
16 ensure they take advantage of the investment and
17 opportunities that will be created in the years to
18 come. Model projects like this that serve vulnerable
19 populations are really vital to moving our region
20 forward. Too many communities have enacted
21 exclusionary policies, which has led to our current
22 housing deficit. We hope you'll approve this project
23 and encourage more communities to do their part in
24 supporting New Yorkers in need of affordable housing.
25 Thank you for your time.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much.
3 Are there any questions from my Council Members that
4 are still here? No?

5 Okay, so this panel is now excused.

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We have one more
7 person signed up to speak in-person to answer the AMI
8 question. Alex Rawding from HPD.

9 DIRECTOR RAWDING: Thank you. I'm Alex
10 Rawding. I'm the Director of New Construction Finance
11 at HPD, and I wanted to respond to Council Member
12 Salaam's AMI question. The area median income is the
13 tool that HPD uses to set the maximum income
14 qualifying households in our units. In direct
15 response to your question, a tenant in a 30 percent
16 AMI unit will earn no more than 30 percent of AMI.
17 The lowest qualifying income for that tenant is set
18 so that an applicant pays no more than 35 percent of
19 their income on rent. That exact amount is
20 highlighted in the chart. It's 29,700, I believe it's
21 page 3, and could shift depending on the household
22 size. That's for a tenant that's paying rent. Great
23 HPD projects and affordable housing projects in
24 general are also a great resource for tenants that
25 have a federal, state, or city rental assistance

1 voucher in that a tenant with a rental assistance
2 voucher, there are no minimum income qualifications.
3 They could be earning zero dollars so long as they
4 have a voucher that pays the qualifying rent of the
5 building. Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you. I have one
8 quick question. If a project is locked in at a
9 certain AMI, and I believe that's an average that
10 could be up to three different levels so in this
11 project it's 30, 50, and 80. By the time the project
12 is built, which is always like a two-year gap, what
13 happens to incomes and levels that have shifted?

14 ALEX RAWDING: Great. Thank you for that
15 question. The maximum qualifying income will shift to
16 the year of when the project is marketing or leasing
17 up. Let's say we're, maybe I can go through a
18 specific example so a project begins construction
19 today and it's ready for tenants to move in two
20 years. The maximum qualifying income for a 30 percent
21 AMI unit will be 30 percent of 2026 AMI. The minimum
22 qualifying income will remain the same because that
23 is set so that no tenant pays more than 35 percent of
24 their income on rent, and rents have not changed even
25 though the income limits have increased with AMIs.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: I say that to say that
3 there are many folks who want to support these
4 projects and they are looking at where they are right
5 now and then when the project is done, it's shifting.
6 We just want to keep an eye on that or at least
7 incorporate that in our presentations. Thank you.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAAM: I got a question
9 that you may be able to help me with too. Since I'm
10 probably maybe the newest Member, not necessarily to
11 the Council, but to the political space as well, my
12 question is maybe just a question out of curiosity,
13 why use the AMI model in the first place, meaning is
14 that the only model that can be used? Are we
15 restricted to AMI or are there other opportunities,
16 because as we heard earlier, I was particularly
17 concerned when I not just walked around the community
18 as a person that was campaigning for office, but also
19 as we reheard again, the testimony from Julius
20 Tajiddin, 60 percent of the community is earning far
21 below what that AMI is, and I'm just wondering
22 because that community, if that's the majority, but
23 then we're saying we want the median of the area, but
24 the majority in this particular area specifically is
25 earning far lower than that. I'm just wondering, is

1
2 AMI the only model that can be used? And if it's not,
3 then are there other things that might be able to be
4 used in projects like these?

5 ALEX RAWDING: Yeah, I appreciate that
6 question, and I'd say that's probably the start of a
7 longer conversation that I'm sure HPD would be happy
8 to have with you and other Members of the Council.

9 I'll give the short answer, and that is
10 AMIs are the established tool for the affordable
11 housing industry across the nation, and they are set
12 based on a broad area for New York City so they're
13 not necessarily linked to the smaller Districts in
14 which you serve, and so the discrepancy you pointed
15 out is accurate. HPD and the City, while we're bound
16 to use that tool to comply with other financing
17 sources at our disposal, we don't necessarily need
18 to, we're still able to size rents and AMIs to serve
19 the community as best as possible, and so what I mean
20 by that is not every project proposes the same AMI
21 distribution, and developers and HPD work to identify
22 AMIs that will ensure the long-term financial
23 viability of the building while also serving
24 community members.

1
2 DAN KENT: If I could just add quickly to
3 that for your question, Councilman Salaam. I just
4 wanted to add that the reason why we prioritized
5 units at 30 percent of the area median income is
6 because of the point you just made. Because in East
7 Harlem, 60 percent of AMI is not low-income housing.
8 That's the typical definition for the federal
9 government to get funding for a project like this,
10 but thanks to the City's Extremely Low-Income
11 Affordability program, we're able to provide a
12 significant number of units that are at 30 percent of
13 the area median income, which is affordable to East
14 Harlem residents generally.

15 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much.

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We just ask that if
17 HPD and the applicant team could submit this
18 information in a followup, that would be helpful.

19 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much.
20 This panel is excused.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: There being no more
22 remote public participants or participants in person
23 who wish to testify at this time.

24 If anyone would like to send in written
25 comments, that is landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov.

2 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much.

3 There being no other members of the public wishing to
4 testify on the Timbale Terrace proposal under
5 application numbers C 240046 HAM and C 240047 PQM,
6 the public hearing is now closed.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Just adding for the
8 record that the public hearings for the Landmark
9 Preservation Committee designations are also closed.

10 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: That concludes today's
11 business.

12 I would like to thank the members of the
13 public and my Colleagues and Subcommittee on Land Use
14 Staff and the Sergeant-at-Arms for your participation
15 today.

16 This meeting is hereby adjourned.

17 [GAVEL]

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date February 20, 2024